Proceedings of the 38th Annual Macromarketing Conference

THE MACROMARKETING SOCIETY INC.
Examining the varied interactions between markets, marketing, and society
Proceedings of the 38th Annual Macromarketing Conference

Toronto, ON, Canada
June 4-7, 2013

Program Chairs & Proceedings Editors
Detlev Zwick, York University
Sammy Bonsu, York University

Chair of the Doctoral Colloquium
Russ Belk, York University

Sponsored by:
The Macromarketing Society, Inc.
Schulich School of Business, York University
&
The Journal of Macromarketing
Copyright Statement

The Macromarketing Society and York University do not take copyright for papers appearing in the proceedings. The copyright of each abstract or paper in the proceedings belongs to the paper’s author(s).
Published by the Macromarketing Society, Inc. in 2013
ISSN 2168-1481
Editors’ Notes

Special thanks for all those who contributed their time and energy serving as track chairs for the conference. Their suggestions, cooperation, and diligence played a pivotal role in the creation of an academically exciting program for the 38th Annual Macromarketing Conference. We would like to commend them all for their efforts.

Conference Chairs
Detlev Zwick, York University
Sammy Bonsu, York University

Track Chairs

Markets, Ethics, and CSR
Andrew Crane & Dirk Matten, Schulich School of Business, York University

Marketing Systems and Corporate Dealings (Business-to-Business Markets)
William Redmond, Indiana State University

Quality of Life
Alexandra Ganglmair-Wooliscroft, University of Otago

Servants, Servitude and the Philosophy of Service
Norah Campbell, Trinity College Dublin

Arts and Culture
Alan Bradshaw, Royal Holloway

Sustainable Business Models
Pierre McDonagh, Dublin City University Business School

Markets and Individualization, Insecuritization And Depoliticization
Olga Kravets, Bilkent University

Macromarketing and Asia
Detlev Zwick, York University

The Violence of Marketing Systems
Yikun Zhao & Mandy Earley, York University
Market Making and Marketing in Emergent Economies / Developing Countries
Sammy Bonsu, Schulich School of Business, York University

Exploring the Performativity of Marketing: Theories, Practices And Devices
Johan Hagberg, University of Gothenburg, Sweden; Hans Kjellberg, Stockholm School of Economics, Sweden; Katy Mason, Lancaster University Management School

The Nature of Relationships in Market Processes
Deniz Atik, Izmir University of Economics

Internationalization and Macromarketing
Detlev Zwick, York University

Humanistic Marketing
Ben Wooliscroft, University of Otago & Richard Varey, University of Waikato

Marketing and psychoanalysis
John Desmond & Robert Cluely

The History of Markets and Macromarketing
Mark Tadajewski, University of Durham

Market Logic(s) and the (Re)production of Precariousness
Eleftheria Lekakis, Goldsmiths College, University of London & Yesim Ozalp, York University

The Politics of Markets and Marketing Systems
Aliakbar Jafari, University of Strathclyde

Panels:

An Analysis of Kristofian Perspectives on Iran’s Marketing System
Clifford J. Shultz, II, Loyola University Chicago

The Life and Works of Roger Dickinson
Mark Peterson, University of Wyoming

Teaching Sustainable Enterprise
Mark Peterson, University of Wyoming

Vulnerable Consumer Segments & Developing Markets: Emerging Issues & Future Directions
Thomas Klein, University of Toledo

Critical Perspectives on Markets and Society
Mark Peacock & Kean Birch, York University
Ad Hoc Reviewers
In addition to the track chairs, others have contributed their time and effort as reviewers for the many papers that were submitted.

Bernard Acquah Obeng, Ghana Institute of Management and Public Administration
Deniz Atik, Izmir University of Economics
George Balabanis, City University
Fleura Bardhi, Northeastern University
Kean Birch, York University
Stefania Borghini, Bocconi University
Alan Bradshaw, Royal Holloway, University of London
Norah Campbell, Trinity College Dublin
Marylyn Carrigan, Coventry University
Warren Carter, University College London
Robert Caruana, University of Nottingham
Seung-Ho Cho, Soongsil University
Robert Cluley, University of Nottingham
Cormac Deane, Institute of Art, Design and Technology, Dublin
John Desmond, University of St Andrews
Maiia Deutschmann, European University Viadrina, Frankfurt (Oder)
Michael Dorsch, Clemson University
Jingyi Duan, University of Rhode Island
Mandy Earley, York University
James Fitchett, University of Leicester
Alexandra Ganglmair-Wooliscroft, University of Otago
Johan Hagberg, University of Gothenburg
Sabrina V. Helm, University of Arizona
Djavlonbek Kadirov, Eastern Institute of Technology
Hans Kjellberg, Stockholm School of Economics
Olga Kravets, Bilkent University
Alev Kuruoglu, Bilkent University
Roger Layton, University of New South Wales
Wen-Ling Liu, University of Hull
Chong Hang Loo, Limkokwing University
Katy Mason, Lancaster University
Pierre McDonagh, Dublin City University
Miho Miyauchi, Chukyo University
Robert A. Mittelstaedt, University of Nebraska - Lincoln
Fiona Murphy, Dublin City University
Andrew Murray, University College London
Anna Niedermeier, Ludwig-Maximilians-Universität München
Yesim Ozalp, York University
Mark Peacock, York University
Andrea Prothero, University College Dublin
Morten Rask, Aarhus University
Kojo Saffu, Brock University
Ebru Ulusoy, University of Maine
Bertrand Urien, Universités à l'IAE de Bretagne Occidentale
Handan Vicdan, EMLYON Business School
Ben Wooliscroft, University of Otago
Yikun Zhao, York University
Detlev Zwick, York University
### Conference Schedule

#### Opening Reception
**Tuesday June 4, 2013**
6:00p - 8:00 p  
Churchill Ballroom (Delta Chelsea)

---

#### Day 1: Wednesday June 5, 2013

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Concurrent Session I</th>
<th>Concurrent Session II</th>
<th>Concurrent Session III</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>8:00a-8:30a</td>
<td>Rossetti Room</td>
<td>Opening Session</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8:30a-10:00a</td>
<td>Markets, Ethics and CSR I</td>
<td>Marketing Systems and Corporate Dealings I</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10:00a-10:30a</td>
<td></td>
<td>Coffee Break</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10:30a-11:30a</td>
<td>Markets, Ethics and CSR II</td>
<td>Quality of Life I</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11:30a-12:30p</td>
<td>Servants, Servitude, and the Philosophy of Service</td>
<td>Quality of Life II</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12:30p-1:30p</td>
<td></td>
<td>Lunch Break</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1:30p-2:30p</td>
<td>Rossetti Room</td>
<td>Arts and Culture I</td>
<td>Teaching Sustainable Enterprise (PANEL)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2:30p-3:30p</td>
<td>Rossetti Room</td>
<td>Arts and Culture II</td>
<td>Sustainable Business Models I</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3:30p-4:00p</td>
<td>Rossetti Room</td>
<td></td>
<td>Vulnerable Consumer Segments and Developing Markets (PANEL)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4:00p-5:30p</td>
<td>Rossetti Room</td>
<td>Markets and Individualization, Insecuritization and Depoliticization</td>
<td>Sustainable Business Models II (PANEL)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6:00p</td>
<td>Rossetti Room</td>
<td>Meet in the Front Lobby of Delta Chelsea for transportation to Schulich School of Business</td>
<td>Marketing Systems and Corporate Dealings II</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7:00p-</td>
<td>Rossetti Room</td>
<td>Gala Dinner at the Schulich School of Business Dining Room</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Day 2: Thursday June 6, 2013

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Concurrent Session I Rossetti Room</th>
<th>Concurrent Session II Wren Room</th>
<th>Concurrent Session III Seymour Room</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>8:30a-10:00a</td>
<td>Macromarketing and Asia</td>
<td>The Violence of Marketing Systems I</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10:00a-10:30a</td>
<td>Coffee Break</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10:30a-11:30a</td>
<td>Market Making and Marketing in Emergent Economies I</td>
<td>The Violence of Marketing Systems II</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11:30a-12:30p</td>
<td>Market Making and Marketing in Emergent Economies II</td>
<td>Exploring the Performativity of Marketing I</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12:30p-2:00p</td>
<td><strong>Lunch Break and Keynote Address</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2:00p-3:30p</td>
<td>The Nature of Relationships in Market Processes</td>
<td>Exploring the Performativity of Marketing II</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3:30p-4:00p</td>
<td>Coffee Break</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4:00p-5:00p</td>
<td>Internationalization and Macromarketing</td>
<td>An Analysis of Kristofarian Perspectives on Iran's Marketing System (PANEL)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5:30p-7:30p</td>
<td><strong>Board Meeting</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7:30p</td>
<td>Meet in the Front Lobby of Delta Chelsea to walk to Rosewater Room</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8:00p</td>
<td><strong>Dinner at the Rosewater Room</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## Day 3: Friday June 7, 2013

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Concurrent Session I Rossetti Room</th>
<th>Concurrent Session II Wren Room</th>
<th>Concurrent Session III Seymour Room</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>8:30a-10:00a</td>
<td>Critical Perspectives on Markets and Society (PANEL)</td>
<td>Humanistic Marketing</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10:00a-10:30a</td>
<td>Coffee Break</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10:30a-11:30a</td>
<td>Marketing and Psychoanalysis I</td>
<td>Sustainable Business Models III (PANEL)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11:30a-12:30p</td>
<td>Marketing and Psychoanalysis II</td>
<td>The Life and Works of Roger Dickinson (PANEL)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12:30p-</td>
<td><strong>Conference Ends – No Lunch</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Opening Reception
**Tuesday June 4, 2013**
*6:00p - 8:00 p*
**Churchill Ballroom (Delta Chelsea)**

---

### Day 1: Wednesday June 5, 2013

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Session</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>8:00a-</td>
<td><strong>Opening Session</strong></td>
<td><strong>Markets, Ethics and CSR I</strong>&lt;br&gt;Chair: Dirk Matten, York University, Canada&lt;br&gt;Exploring tourists’ accounts of responsible tourism&lt;br&gt;Robert Caruana, University of Nottingham, UK&lt;br&gt;Sarah Glozer, University of Nottingham, UK&lt;br&gt;Andrew Crane, York University, Canada&lt;br&gt;Scott McCabe, University of Nottingham, UK&lt;br&gt;Growing the “certified” food market: An analysis of how information flows influence consumer understanding of ethical food choices&lt;br&gt;Julie V. Stanton, Pennsylvania State University - Media, USA&lt;br&gt;Laurel A. Cook, The University of Arkansas - Fayetteville, USA&lt;br&gt;Are diamonds forever? Exploring the creation and maintenance of a market for ethical diamond engagement rings&lt;br&gt;Hana Sethi, York University, Canada&lt;br&gt;Sarah Glozer, University of Nottingham, UK</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8:30a-</td>
<td>Concurrent Session I</td>
<td><strong>Marketing Systems and Corporate Dealings I</strong>&lt;br&gt;Chair: Roger Layton, University of New South Wales, Australia&lt;br&gt;Consumption behavior and energy consumption: A marketing systems perspective&lt;br&gt;John D. Mittelstaedt, University of Wyoming - Laramie, USA&lt;br&gt;Robert A. Mittelstaedt, University of Nebraska - Lincoln, USA&lt;br&gt;Marketing systems and market failure: A consideration of side effects&lt;br&gt;William Redmond, Indiana State University - Terre Haute, USA&lt;br&gt;How do marketing systems respond to constraints? An exploration of sustainability as a barrier to growth within the tourist marketing system of Ningaloo Marine Park, Western Australia&lt;br&gt;Sarah Duffy, University of New South Wales, Australia&lt;br&gt;Roger Layton, University of New South Wales, Australia&lt;br&gt;Growth and adaptation in marketing systems&lt;br&gt;Roger Layton, University of New South Wales, Australia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10:00a</td>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Closing Session</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Time</td>
<td>Session</td>
<td>Chair/Presenter</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10:00a-10:30a</td>
<td><strong>Coffee Break</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10:30a-11:30a</td>
<td><strong>Markets, Ethics, and CSR II</strong></td>
<td>Chair: Andrew Crane, York University, Canada</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| Rossetti Room   | The myth of CSR 2.0: A big data approach | Adam Arvidsson, University of Milan, Italy
|                 |                                  | Stefania Barina, Centro Studi Etnografia Digitale, Italy                        |
|                 | Manufacturing status in the global knowledge economy: Analysing CSR practice through language and communication | Annette Cerne, Lund University, Sweden
|                 | A macro (Bayesian network) analysis of ethical behavior | Ahmet Eki, Bilkent University, Turkey
|                 |                                  | Sule Onsel-Eki, Dogus University, Turkey                                        |
| 10:30a-11:30a   | **Quality of Life I**            | Chair: Alexandra Ganglmair-Wooliscroft, University of Otago, New Zealand       |
| Wren Room       | High-density housing: Lifestyle and sustainability | G. Scott Erickson, Ithaca College, USA
|                 | Experiencing vulnerability “everyday”: Food choice | Miranda Mirosa, University of Otago, New Zealand
|                 |                                  | Ben Wooliscroft, University of Otago, New Zealand                             |
|                 | Behaving ethically on holidays: An overview of topics discussed in academic and popular literature | Alexandra Ganglmair-Wooliscroft, University of Otago, New Zealand |
| 11:30a-12:30p   | **Servants, Servitude and the Philosophy of Service** | Chair: James Fitchett, University of Leicester, UK |
| Rossetti Room   | A Re-examination of value co-creation in the age of interactive service robots: A service dominant logic perspective | Willy Barnett, University of Manchester, UK
|                 |                                  | Adrienne Foos, University of Manchester, UK                                    |
|                 |                                  | Thorsten Gruber, Loughborough University, UK                                    |
|                 |                                  | Debbie Keeling, Loughborough University, UK                                     |
|                 |                                  | Kathleen Keeling, University of Manchester, UK                                 |
|                 |                                  | Linda Nasr, University of Manchester, UK                                        |
|                 | Servicing the body: Power, service systems and consumer wellbeing | Anna Fyrberg Yngfalk, Stockholm University, Sweden
|                 |                                  | Carl Yngfalk, Stockholm University, Sweden                                      |
### Quality of Life II
**Chair:** Alexandra Ganglmair-Wooliscroft, University of Otago, New Zealand

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Concurrent Session II</th>
<th>Wren Room</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>11:30a-12:30p</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Shopping ill-being, its measurement and relation to shopping well-being and overall life satisfaction</strong></td>
<td>Ahmet Ekici, Bilkent University, Turkey</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>M. Joseph Sirgy, Virginia Polytechnic Institute and State University, USA</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Dong-Jin Lee, Yonsei University, South Korea</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The impact of consumption deprivation and materialism on perceived quality of life</td>
<td>Dwight Merunka, Cergam, IAE Aix en Provence &amp; Euromed School of Management, France</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Boris Bartikowski, Euromed School of Management, France</td>
<td>M. Joseph Sirgy, Virginia Polytechnic Institute and State University, USA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Validating a customer well-being index related to natural wildlife tourism</td>
<td>Stefan Kruger, North-West University, South Africa</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Dong-Jin Lee, Yonsei University, South Korea</td>
<td>Mee-Jin Whang, Yonsei University, South Korea</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Muzaffer Uysal, Virginia Polytechnic Institute and State University, USA</td>
<td>M. Joseph Sirgy, Virginia Polytechnic Institute and State University, USA</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| 12:30p-1:30p  | Lunch Break          |           |

### Arts and Culture I
**Chair:** Terrence H. Witkowski, California State University - Long Beach, USA

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Concurrent Session I</th>
<th>Rossetti Room</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1:30p-2:30p</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>The financialization of art as passion investment</strong></td>
<td>Derrick Chong, Royal Holloway, University of London, UK</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Swimming against the current: Examining political influence on artistic practice</td>
<td>Victoria L. Rodner, King’s College London, UK</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Visual social media and transformation of marketing communication systems: A curatorial perspective</td>
<td>Chloe Preece, University of Kent, UK</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Gema Vinuales, University of Rhode Island, USA</td>
<td>Nikhillesh Dholakia, University of Rhode Island, USA</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Teaching Sustainable Enterprise Panel
**Chair:** Mark Peterson, University of Wyoming - Laramie, USA

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Concurrent Session II</th>
<th>Wren Room</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1:30p-2:30p</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Panelists</strong></td>
<td>John D. Mittelstaedt, University of Wyoming - Laramie, USA</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>M. Joseph Sirgy, Virginia Polytechnic Institute and State University, USA</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Alex E. Reppel, Royal Holloway, University of London, UK</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Stanley J. Shapiro, Simon Fraser University, Canada</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Time</td>
<td>Session</td>
<td>Room</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>------------------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| 2:30p-3:30p  | Concurrent       | Arts and Culture II | Technology and the marketer: Utopian and dystopian perspectives on digital innovation | Darryn Mitussis, University of Nottingham, UK
          | Session I        | Room        |                                                        | Alexander Reppel, Royal Holloway, University of London, UK              |
          |                  | Rossetti     |                                                        | Thorsten Gruber, Loughborough University, UK                               |
          |                  | Room        |                                                        | Isabelle Szmigin, University of Birmingham, UK                           |
|              |                  |             | Exoticising, eroticising and exorcising the feminine: Visual representations of violent women in advertising | Yuko Minowa, Long Island University, USA                                   |
|              |                  |             |                                                        | Pauline Maclaran, Royal Holloway, University of London, UK              |
|              |                  |             |                                                        | Lorna Stevens, University of the West of Scotland, UK                   |
| 2:30p-3:30p  | Concurrent       | Sustainable Business Models I | A case study on sustainable business models: The association of Seferihisar tangerine producers | Isik Ozge Yumurtaci, Izmir University of Economics, Turkey              |
          | Session II       | Room        |                                                        | Tugba Orten Tugrul, Izmir University of Economics, Turkey                |
          |                  | Wren        |                                                        | Bengu Sevil Oflac, Izmir University of Economics, Turkey                |
|              |                  | Room        | Exploring some enablers of behaviors towards sustainability: A netnographic approach | Bipul Kumar, Indian Institute of Management - Ahmedabad, India           |
|              |                  |             |                                                        | Nikhilesh Dholakia, University of Rhode Island, USA                      |
|              |                  |             | The institutional foundations of materialism in Japan: A replicated empirical test | Miho Miyauchi, Chukyo University, Japan                                  |
|              |                  |             |                                                        | Pierre McDonagh, Dublin City University, Ireland                       |
|              |                  |             |                                                        | William Kilbourne, Clemson University, USA                               |
|              |                  |             |                                                        | Masae Takimoto, Osaka University of Economics and Law, Japan           |
|              |                  |             |                                                        | Masaaki Takemura, Meiji University, Japan                               |
|              |                  |             | Creating more with less: Exploring the role of service innovation in organizations' sustainability efforts | Sarah J. S. Wilner, Wilfred Laurier University, Canada                  |
|              |                  |             |                                                        | Marius Claudy, University College Dublin, Ireland                      |
|              |                  |             |                                                        | Rosanna Garcia, Northeastern University, USA                             |
|              |                  |             |                                                        | Scott Dacko, University of Warwick, UK                                   |
Concurrent Session III
Seymour Room

2:30p - 3:30p

**Vulnerable Consumer Segments and Developing Markets: Emerging Issues and Future Directions**

**Panel**
Chair: Thomas Klein, University of Toledo, USA

Panelists:
Operationalizing the constructs of the Integrative Justice Model
Tina Facca, John Carroll University, USA

Santo Domingo: Subsistence marketplace and institutional changes
Kyle McDonough, Loyola University - Chicago, USA
Steven Brinks, Loyola University - Chicago, USA
Clifford Shultz, II, Loyola University - Chicago, USA
Raymond Benton, Jr., Loyola University - Chicago, USA

3:30p - 4:00p

**Coffee Break**

Concurrent Session I
Rossetti Room

4:00p - 5:30p

**Markets and Individualization, Insecuritization and Depoliticization**
Chair: Raymond Benton, Jr., Loyola University - Chicago, USA

Individualising the Gospel: Neo-liberalism in mega-church practice
Jeaney Yip, University of Sydney, Australia
Susan Ainsworth, University of Melbourne, Australia

A tale of two food systems: Rescripting neoliberal discourse on the food gap in America
Kim McKeage, Hamline University, USA
Emma Schroeder, Hamline University, USA

No more happy subjects? Approaches to reshaping the labour market and neoliberal politics of work
Mikko Laamanen, Hanken School of Economics, Finland

Our neoliberal sentiment: Macromarketing and Consumer Culture Theory
James Fitchett, University of Leicester, UK
Georgios Patsiaouras, University of Leicester, UK
Per Østergaard, University of Southern Denmark, Denmark
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Concurrent Session II</th>
<th>Concurrent Session III</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>4:00p-5:30p</td>
<td><strong>Sustainable Business Models II</strong>&lt;br&gt;Sustainable Fashion: An Oxymoron or a Possibility? Panel&lt;br&gt;Chair: Terri Rittenburg, University of Wyoming - Laramie, USA&lt;br&gt;The need for sustainable fashion and investigation as to its feasibility&lt;br&gt;James W. Gentry, University of Nebraska - Lincoln, NE, USA&lt;br&gt;Shipra Gupta, University of Nebraska - Lincoln, NE, USA&lt;br&gt;Exit from High Street: An exploratory study of sustainable fashion pioneers&lt;br&gt;Sarah Bly, Copenhagen Business School, Denmark&lt;br&gt;Wencke Gwozdz, Copenhagen Business School, Denmark&lt;br&gt;Lucia Reisch, Copenhagen Business School, Denmark&lt;br&gt;Collaborative consumption: Business model opportunities and barriers for the fashion industry&lt;br&gt;Esben Rahbek Gjerdrum Pedersen, Copenhagen Business School, Denmark</td>
<td>Marketing Systems and Corporate Dealings II&lt;br&gt;Chair: John D. Mittelstaedt, University of Wyoming - Laramie, USA&lt;br&gt;Shopping in the digital environment: The sorting function in an Internet-based marketing system&lt;br&gt;Robert A. Mittelstaedt, University of Nebraska - Lincoln, NE, USA&lt;br&gt;John D. Mittelstaedt, University of Wyoming - Laramie, USA&lt;br&gt;Say What You Want About It But Corporations Can Say What They Want&lt;br&gt;Steven W. Kopp, University of Arkansas - Fayetteville, USA&lt;br&gt;Corporate philanthropy and channel impact in food security&lt;br&gt;Sylvain Charlebois, University of Guelph, Canada&lt;br&gt;Julia Christensen Hughes, University of Guelph, Canada</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6:00p</td>
<td>Meet in the Front Lobby of Delta Chelsea for transportation to Schulich School of Business</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7:00p-</td>
<td><strong>Gala Dinner at the Schulich School of Business Dining Room</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
**Day 2: Thursday June 6, 2013**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Session</th>
<th>Topic</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>8:30a-10:00a</td>
<td>Concurrent Session I</td>
<td><em>Macromarketing and Asia</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rossetti Room</td>
<td>Chair: Clifford Shultz, II, Loyola University - Chicago, USA</td>
<td>The effect of individual and organizational factors on unethical viral marketing: The case of power bloggers use in viral marketing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Seung-Ho Cho, Soongsil University, South Korea</td>
<td>From Japanese ingenuity to Chinese ambition: Could China change as the World gets flatter?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>A. Coskun Samli, University of North Florida, USA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Michael Czinkota, University of Birmingham, UK, and Georgetown University, USA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Svetla Marinova, University of Birmingham, UK</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Shared ethnicity effects on advertising effectiveness in Malaysia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Chong Hang Loo, Limkokwing University, Malaysia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Wen-Ling Liu, University of Hull, UK</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>The reshaping of Chinese consumer values in the social media era: Exploring the impact of Weibo</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Jingyi Duan, University of Rhode Island, USA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Nikhilesh Dholakia, University of Rhode Island, USA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8:30a-10:00a</td>
<td>Concurrent Session II</td>
<td><em>The Violence of Marketing Systems I</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wren Room</td>
<td>Chair: Yikun Zhao, York University, Canada</td>
<td>Violence and exchange: Premodern lessons for the postmodern world</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>John Desmond, University of St Andrews, UK</td>
<td>Neoliberalism and structural violence in developing countries: the case of the Cambodian education market</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Paul Henry, University of Sydney, Australia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Marylouise Caldwell, University of Sydney, Australia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>On the violence of the new branded university of circulation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Alison Hearn, University of Western Ontario, Canada</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10:00a-10:30a</td>
<td></td>
<td><em>Coffee Break</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Time</td>
<td>Session</td>
<td>Room</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------</td>
<td>------------</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| 10:30a-11:30a | Concurrent Session I              | Rossetti Room | **Market Making and Marketing in Emergent Economies I**               | **Chair:** Sammy Bonsu, York University, Canada | Melissa Aronczyk, Carleton University, Canada  
                   |                                   |            | Changing the mind of a nation: The role of cultural adjustment in the  |                              | Himadri Roy Chaudhuri, IMI-Kolkata, India  
                   |                                   |            | marketing-as-development model                                         |                              | James W. Gentry, University of Nebraska - Lincoln, USA  
                   |                                   |            | The self, space, and marketing: Examining the promises of ideal        |                              | Nikhilesh Dholakia, University of Rhode Island, USA  
                   |                                   |            | existence in the gated communities of Indian metros                   |                              | Marie-Laure Baron, Université du Havre, France  
                   |                                   |            | Resistance to multinational retailing: Towards a framework              |                              | Ruby Roy Dholakia, University of Rhode Island, USA  
| 10:30a-11:30a | Concurrent Session II             | Wren Room  | **The Violence of Marketing Systems II**                             | **Chair:** Yikun Zhao, York University, Canada | Rodrigo Castilhos, Universidade Federal do Rio Grande do Sul, Brazil  
                   |                                   |            | Production and consumption of space in the neoliberal city: the case   |                              | Narimasa Yokoyama, Nihon University, Japan  
                   |                                   |            | of a 'planned district' in the south of Brazil                         |                              | Masae Takimoto, Osaka University of Economics and Law, Japan  
                   |                                   |            | Small and medium-sized retailers compete against global giants by       |                              | Masaaki Takemura, Meiji University, Japan  
                   |                                   |            | local adaptation: Market structure of grocery distribution in Japan    |                              |                                                                 |
| 11:30a-12:30p | Concurrent Session I              | Rossetti Room | **Market Making and Marketing in Emergent Economies II**             | **Chair:** Sammy Bonsu, York University, Canada | Hossain Mohammed, University of Western Sydney, Australia  
                   |                                   |            | Emerging nature of assortments and market making: A marketing system   |                              | Ann Veeck, Western Michigan University, USA  
                   |                                   |            | approach                                                               |                              | Hongyan Yu, Sun Yat-Sen University, P.R. China  
                   |                                   |            | New market systems, aspirations, and consumption patterns: Daily food   |                              | Fang Yu, Brock University, Canada  
                   |                                   |            | choices of Chinese teenagers                                           |                              | Hong Zhu, Northeast Normal University, P.R. China  
                   |                                   |            | Market Making at the Bottom-of-the-Pyramid                            |                              | Gregory Veeck, Western Michigan University, USA  
                   |                                   |            | Ronika Chakrabarti, Lancaster University, UK                           |                              | Kay M. Palan, Western Michigan University, USA  
                   |                                   |            | Katy Mason, Lancaster University, UK                                   |                              |                                                                 |
## Exploring the Performativity of Marketing I
Chair: Johan Hagberg, University of Gothenburg, Sweden

- **Putting consumers’ bodies to work: The role of consumer biometrics and measurement devices in the performance of markets for advertising communications**
  - Stefan Schwarzkopf, Copenhagen Business School, Denmark

- **Constructing the retail investor: performativity and power in the market for investment services**
  - Philip Roscoe, University of St. Andrews, UK

- **Is non-profit marketing really non-profit? The possibility of performativity**
  - Kosuke Mizukoshi, Tokyo Metropolitan University, Japan
  - Yuichiro Hidaka, Yamanashi Gakuin University, Japan
  - Masaaki Takemura, Meiji University, Japan

## Lunch Break

## The Nature of Relationships in Market Processes
Chair: Deniz Atik, Izmir University of Economics, Turkey

The relevance of male breadwinner ideology for the analysis and design of Marketing systems
- Michaela Haase, Freie Universität Berlin & Friedrich-Alexander Universität Erlangen-Nürnberg, Germany
- Ingrid Becker, Friedrich-Alexander Universität Erlangen-Nürnberg, Germany
- Alexander Nill, University of Nevada - Las Vegas, USA
- Clifford J. Shultz, II, Loyola University - Chicago, USA
- James W. Gentry, University of Nebraska - Lincoln, USA

Towards a sustainable fashion system: Slow fashion movement
- Zeynep Ozdamar Ertekin, Izmir University of Economics, Turkey
- Deniz Atik, Izmir University of Economics, Turkey

Indigenous business development from a network identity perspective
- Daniel Schepis, University of Western Australia, Australia
- Sharon Purchase, University of Western Australia, Australia
- Nick Ellis, Durham University, UK
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Session</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Chair</th>
<th>Discussants</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2:00p-3:30p</td>
<td>Concurrent Session II</td>
<td>Exploring the Performativity of Marketing II</td>
<td>Chair: Stefan Schwarzkopf, Copenhagen Business School, Denmark</td>
<td>The digitalized consumer: the new mask of the consumer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Robert Cluley, University of Nottingham, UK</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Exploring the performativity of privately-driven sustainability statements in the agro-food sector</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Annmarie Ryan, University of Limerick, Ireland</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Exploring the performativity of price representation practices in retailing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Hans Kjellberg, Stockholm School of Economics, Sweden</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3:30p-4:00p</td>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Coffee Break</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4:00p-5:00p</td>
<td>Concurrent Session I</td>
<td>Internationalization and Macromarketing</td>
<td>Chair: Sarah J. S. Wilnner, Wilfred Laurier University, Canada</td>
<td>International business models: Four electric vehicles cases</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Morten Rask, Aarhus University, Denmark</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>The innovation challenge: Achieving market superiority through new product development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4:00p-5:00p</td>
<td>Concurrent Session II</td>
<td>An Analysis of Kristofian Perspectives on Iran’s Marketing System</td>
<td>Chair: Clifford J. Shultz, II, Loyola University - Chicago, USA</td>
<td>Panelists:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Panel:</td>
<td></td>
<td>Mark Peterson, University of Wyoming - Laramie, USA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Detlev Zwick, York University, Canada</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Deniz Atik, Izmir University of Economics, Turkey</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5:30p-7:30p</td>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Board Meeting</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7:30p</td>
<td></td>
<td>Meet in the Front Lobby of Delta Chelsea to walk to Rosewater Room</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8:00p</td>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Dinner at the Rosewater Room</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Time</td>
<td>Concurrent Session I</td>
<td>Concurrent Session II</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------</td>
<td>----------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8:30a-10:00a</td>
<td>Critical Perspectives on Markets and Society Panel</td>
<td>Humanistic Marketing</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
|            | Chairs: Kean Birch, York University, Canada  
Mark Peacock, York University, Canada | Chair: Ben Wooliscroft, University of Otago, New Zealand |
|            | Accounting for intangible assets and intangible value in neoliberal markets  
Kean Birch, York University, Canada | Promoting cycling in urban environments: Implications for social marketing and public policy |
|            | Ethical consumption and market processes  
Mark Peacock, York University, Canada | Marius Cludy, University College Dublin, Ireland  
Mark Peterson, University of Wyoming - Laramie, USA  
Aidan O’Driscoll, Dublin Institute of Technology, Ireland |
|            | Public interest groups, counter-advertising and the social responsibility of the Tobacco Industry  
Alberto R. Salazar V., York University, Canada | Authenticity: Macro-marketing perspective  
Djavlonbek Kadirov, Eastern Institute of Technology, New Zealand  
Richard J. Varey, University of Waikato, New Zealand  
Ben Wooliscroft, University of Otago, New Zealand |
|            | Open content in Academia: Balancing the Market and the Commons  
Richard Wellen, York University, Canada | Reconstructing Macromarketing Management: The building blocks  
Christine Domegan, National University of Ireland Galway, Ireland  
Stanley J. Shapiro, Simon Fraser University, Canada |
| 10:00a-10:30a | Coffee Break | Trends in recent sustainable marketing research: Progress, gaps and research opportunities  
Robert Mitchell, University of Otago, New Zealand  
Ben Wooliscroft, University of Otago, New Zealand |
|            |  | Aldersonian sustainability  
Ben Wooliscroft, University of Otago, New Zealand |
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Session</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Chair</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>10:30a-11:30a</td>
<td>Concurrent Session I</td>
<td><strong>Marketing and Psychoanalysis I</strong></td>
<td>John Desmond, UK</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Rossetti Room</td>
<td>A typology of shopping behaviour based on the personality continuum</td>
<td>Paul J. Albanese, USA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Robert D. Jewell, USA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>50 shades of mobile: The fetishism of mobile devices in contemporary consumptionscapes</td>
<td>Ian Reyes, USA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Nikhilesh Dholakia, USA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Jennifer Bonoff, USA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10:30a-11:30a</td>
<td>Concurrent Session II</td>
<td><strong>Sustainable Business Models III</strong></td>
<td>G. Scott Erickson, USA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Wren Room</td>
<td>A Wider View of Sustainability Panel</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Chair: G. Scott Erickson, Ithaca College, USA</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Raymond Benton, Jr., Loyola University - Chicago, USA</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Meryl Gardner, University of Delaware - Newark, USA</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Pamela Laughland, Network for Business Sustainability, Canada</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>G. Scott Erickson, Ithaca College, USA</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11:30a-12:30p</td>
<td>Concurrent Session I</td>
<td><strong>Marketing and psychoanalysis II</strong></td>
<td>Robert Cluley, UK</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Rossetti Room</td>
<td>Books, minds and desires: Theorizing consumer behaviour through a psychoanalytic study of the Great Gatsby and Death of a Salesman</td>
<td>Georgios Patsiaouras, UK</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>James Fitchett, UK</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Marketing on the couch: How can Psychoanalysis contribute to Macromarketing challenges?</td>
<td>John Desmond, UK</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Robert Cluley, UK</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11:30a-12:30p</td>
<td>Concurrent Session II</td>
<td><strong>The Life and Works of Roger Dickinson Panel</strong></td>
<td>Mark Peterson, USA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Wren Room</td>
<td>Chair: Mark Peterson, University of Wyoming - Laramie, USA</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Ann Veeck, Western Michigan University, USA</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Richard Vann, University of Wyoming - Laramie, USA</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Melissa Bishop, University of New Hampshire, USA</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Roger Layton, University of New South Wales, Australia</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>John O'Shaughnessy, Columbia University, USA</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Clifford J. Shultz, II, Loyola University - Chicago, USA</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12:30p</td>
<td></td>
<td>Conference ends – No lunch</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# Table of Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Growing the “certified” food market: An analysis of how information flows influence consumer understanding of ethical food choices</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Julie V. Stanton &amp; Laurel A. Cook</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Are diamonds forever? Exploring the creation and maintenance of a market for ethical diamond engagement rings</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hana Sethi &amp; Sarah Glozer</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Consumption behavior and energy consumption: A marketing systems perspective</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>John D. Mittelstaedt &amp; Robert A. Mittelstaedt</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marketing systems and market failure: A consideration of side effects</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>William Redmond</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>How do marketing systems respond to constraints? An exploration of sustainability as a barrier to growth within the tourist marketing system of Ningaloo Marine Park, Western Australia</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sarah Duffy &amp; Roger Layton</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Growth and adaptation in marketing systems</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Roger Layton</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A macro (Bayesian network) analysis of ethical behavior</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ahmet Ekici &amp; Sule Onsel-Ekici</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>High-density housing: Lifestyle and sustainability</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G. Scott Erickson</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Experiencing vulnerability “everyday”: Food choice</td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Miranda Mirosa &amp; Ben Wooliscroft</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Behaving ethically on holidays: An overview of topics discussed in academic and popular literature</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alexandra Ganglmair-Wooliscrof</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A Re-examination of value co-creation in the age of interactive service robots: A service dominant logic perspective</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Willy Barnett, Adrienne Foos, Thorsten Gruber, Debbie Keeling, Kathleen Keeling, and Linda Nasr</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Servicing the body: Power, service systems and consumer wellbeing</td>
<td>52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anna Fyrberg Yngfalk and Carl Yngfalk</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shopping ill-being, its measurement and relation to shopping well-being and overall life satisfaction</td>
<td>55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ahmet Ekici, M. Joseph Sirgy, and Dong-Jin Lee</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The impact of consumption deprivation and materialism on perceived quality of life</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dwight Merunka, Boris Bartikowski, and M. Joseph Sirgy</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Validating a customer well-being index related to natural wildlife tourism</td>
<td>66</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stefan Kruger, Dong-Jin Lee, Mee-Jin Whang, Muzaffer Uysal, and M. Joseph Sirgy</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The financialization of art as passion investment</td>
<td>75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Derrick Chong</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Swimming against the current: Examining political influence on artistic practice</td>
<td>76</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Victoria L. Rodner and Chloe Preece</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Title</td>
<td>Page</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teaching Sustainable Enterprise Panel</td>
<td>78</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mark Peterson, John D. Mittelstaedt, M. Joseph Sirgy, Alex E. Reppel, and Stanley J. Shapiro</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Technology and the marketer: Utopian and dystopian perspectives on digital innovation</td>
<td>82</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Darryn Mitussis, Alexander Reppel, Thorsten Gruber, and Isabelle Szmig</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Exoticising, eroticising and exorcising the feminine: Visual representations of violent women in advertising</td>
<td>83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yuko Minowa, Pauline Maclaran, and Lorna Stevens</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A case study on sustainable business models: The association of Seferihisar tangerine producers</td>
<td>90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Isik Ozge Yumurtaci, Tugba Orten Tugrul, and Bengu Sevil Oflac</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Exploring some enablers of behaviors towards sustainability: A netnographic approach</td>
<td>99</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bipul Kumar and Nikhilesh Dholakia</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The institutional foundations of materialism in Japan: A replicated empirical test</td>
<td>104</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Miho Miyauchi, Pierre McDonagh, William Kilbourne, Masae Takimoto, and Masaaki Takemura</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vulnerable Consumer Segments and Developing Markets: Emerging Issues and Future Directions Panel</td>
<td>121</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Thomas Klein, Tina Facca, Kyle McDonough, Steven Brinks, Clifford Shultz, II, and Raymond Benton, Jr.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Individualising the Gospel: Neo-liberalism in mega-church practice</td>
<td>124</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jeaney Yip and Susan Ainsworth</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A tale of two food systems: Rescripting neoliberal discourse on the food gap in America</td>
<td>129</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kim McKeage and Emma Schroeder</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No more happy subjects? Approaches to reshaping the labour market and neoliberal politics of work</td>
<td>142</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mikko Laamanen</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Our neoliberal sentiment: Macromarketing and Consumer Culture Theory</td>
<td>154</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>James Fitchett, Georgios Patsiaouras, and Per Ostergaard,</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sustainable Fashion: An Oxymoron or a Possibility? Panel</td>
<td>156</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Terri Rittenburg, James W. Gentry, Shipra Gupta, Wencke Gwozdz, Lucia Reisch, and Esben Rahbek Gjerdrum Pedersen</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shopping in the digital environment: The sorting function in an Internet-based marketing system</td>
<td>160</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Robert A. Mittelstaedt and John D. Mittelstaedt</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Say What You Want About It But Corporations Can Say What They Want</td>
<td>171</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Steven W. Kopp</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Corporate philanthropy and channel impact in food security</td>
<td>172</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sylvain Charlebois and Julia Christensen Hughes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>From Japanese ingenuity to Chinese ambition: Could China change as the World gets flatter?</td>
<td>189</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Coskun Samli, Michael Czinkota, and Svetla Marinova</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Title</td>
<td>Page</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shared ethnicity effects on advertising effectiveness in Malaysia</td>
<td>198</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chong Hang Loo and Wen-Ling Liu</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The reshaping of Chinese consumer values in the social media era: Exploring the impact of Weibo</td>
<td>200</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jingyi Duan and Nikhilesh Dholakia</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Violence and exchange: Premodern lessons for the postmodern world</td>
<td>204</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>John Desmond</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Neoliberalism and structural violence in developing countries: the case of the Cambodian education market</td>
<td>211</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Paul Henry and Marylouise Caldwell</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The self, space, and marketing: Examining the promises of ideal existence in the gated communities of Indian metros</td>
<td>220</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Himadri Roy Chaudhuri and James W. Gentry</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Small and medium-sized retailers compete against global giants by local adaptation: Market structure of grocery distribution in Japan</td>
<td>224</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Narimasa Yokoyama, Masae Takimoto, and Masaaki Takemura</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emerging nature of assortments and market making: A marketing system approach</td>
<td>237</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hossain Mohammed</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New market systems, aspirations, and consumption patterns: Daily food choices of Chinese teenagers</td>
<td>242</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ann Veeck, Hongyan Yu, Fang Yu, Hong Zhu, Gregory Veeck, and Kay M. Palan</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Market Making at the Bottom-of-the-Pyramid</td>
<td>243</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ronika Chakrabarti and Katy Mason</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Putting consumers’ bodies to work: The role of consumer biometrics and measurement devices in the performance of markets for advertising communications</td>
<td>245</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stefan Schwarzkopf</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Is non-profit marketing really non-profit? The possibility of performativity</td>
<td>268</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kosuke Mizukoshi, Yuichiro Hidaka, and Masaaki Takemura</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The relevance of male breadwinner ideology for the analysis and design of Marketing systems</td>
<td>278</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Michaela Haase, Ingrid Becker, Alexander Nill, Clifford J. Shultz, II, and James W. Gentry</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Towards a sustainable fashion system: Slow fashion movement</td>
<td>306</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zeynep Ozdamar Ertekin and Deniz Atik</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indigenous business development from a network identity perspective</td>
<td>310</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Daniel Schepis, Sharon Purchase, and Nick Ellis</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Exploring the performativity of price representation practices in retailing</td>
<td>315</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Johan Hagberg and Hans Kjellberg</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>International business models: Four electric vehicles cases</td>
<td>317</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Morten Rask</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The innovation challenge: Achieving market superiority through new product development</td>
<td>322</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Coskun Samli</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>An Analysis of Kristofian Perspectives on Iran’s Marketing System</td>
<td>335</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Panel</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Clifford J. Shultz, II, Mark Peterson, Detlev Zwick, and Deniz Atik</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# Critical Perspectives on Markets and Society

**Panel**
Kean Birch, Mark Peacock, Alberto R. Salazar V., and Richard Wellen

**Promoting cycling in urban environments: Implications for social marketing and public policy**
Marius Claudy, Mark Peterson, and Aidan O’Driscoll

**Authenticity: Macro-marketing perspective**
Djavlonbek Kadirov, Richard J. Varey, and Ben Wooliscroft

**Reconstructing Macromarketing Management: The building blocks**
Christine Domegan and Stanley J. Shapiro

**Trends in recent sustainable marketing research: Progress, gaps and research opportunities**
Robert Mitchell and Ben Wooliscroft

**Aldersonian sustainability**
Ben Wooliscroft

**A typology of shopping behaviour based on the personality continuum**
Paul J. Albanese and Robert D. Jewell

**50 shades of mobile: The fetishism of mobile devices in contemporary consumptionscapes**
Ian Reyes, Nikhilesh Dholakia, and Jennifer Bonoff

**A Wider View of Sustainability**
Panel
G. Scott Erickson, Raymond Benton, Jr., Meryl Gardner, and Pamela Laughland

**Books, minds and desires: Theorizing consumer behaviour through a psychoanalytic study of the Great Gatsby and Death of a Salesman**
Georgios Patsiaouras and James Fitchett

**The Life and Works of Roger Dickinson**
Panel
Mark Peterson, Ann Veeck, Richard Vann, Melissa Bishop, Roger Layton, John O’Shaughnessy, and Clifford J. Shultz, II

**List of Contributors**
Wednesday June 5, 2013
8:30a-10:00a
Concurrent Session I

Markets, Ethics and CSR I

Abstract/Papers Included

Growing the “certified” food market: An analysis of how information flows influence consumer understanding of ethical food choices
Julie V. Stanton, Pennsylvania State University - Media, USA
Laurel A. Cook, The University of Arkansas - Fayetteville, USA

Are diamonds forever? Exploring the creation and maintenance of a market for ethical diamond engagement rings
Hana Sethi, York University, Canada
Sarah Glozer, University of Nottingham, UK
Growing the “Certified” Food Market:  
An Analysis of How Information Flows Influence Consumer Understanding of Ethical Food Choices

Julie V. Stanton, The Pennsylvania State University, Media, PA, USA  
Laurel A. Cook, The University of Arkansas, Fayetteville, AR, USA

Brief Abstract

In this study, we examine how consumers react to information about food choices, with special focus on the amount of information they receive and how they cope with it. Understanding whether they feel overwhelmed and/or how individuals cope with information is then linked to their perceptions of organic and GMO-free labels on food choices. Withdrawal from information processing can inhibit (accurate) understanding of food options and thus result in inferior personal choices. Our hypotheses are tested against survey data of American consumers.

Extended Abstract

As the conference theme suggests, there is considerable movement to better understand the role that individuals can play in improving the functioning of our market system, especially when the humanistic impact of that system is considered. Yet, as the literature attests (e.g. Devinney, Auger, and Eckhardt, 2010), the notion that consumers can achieve a fully ethics-driven set of consumption behaviors is largely idealistic. As much as consumers are expected to vote with their dollars for the goods that meet their functional and ethical needs, they are constrained by what firms make available to them and must sensibly differentiate those options as to how they fit functional and ethical needs.

Given the complexity of the consumer goods market, a deeper understanding of the psychological side of ethical consumption is a challenge. Such an understanding could reveal where consumers feel empowered to make decisions that reflect their values and beliefs, where they believe they must settle for what is available, and where they have little interest in ethics-related attributes of goods. These insights would afford policymakers the ability to encourage changes in production and distribution of goods that might support a broader set of ethical goals, and possibly increase consumer welfare.

One angle from which to view the psychological processes of ethical decision making is by exploring the role that information flow has on choices consumers make. That is, in highly competitive markets with substantial advertising and in contexts where use of a product has engendered considerable public discourse on its attributes, consumers may reach a point of saturation of information, and as a result develop coping mechanisms to control the volume they must assess. It would be easy to imagine that the typical consumer in this case has little certainty of the ethical origins of the products they encounter and, indeed, may not even tune into the information available regarding ethical attributes of products.
In this study, we explore the connections between information flow and attitudes toward ethically-driven product choices, using food as a context. Not only is the food industry highly competitive and heavily advertised, but the variety of ethical sub-categories in food is broad. Foods may be organic, GMO-free, fair trade, kosher, halal, vegan, cage-free, hormone-free, wildlife friendly, or locally grown, among many socially conscious adjectives. Evaluating a consumer’s willingness to expend the effort to differentiate such labels, and correlating that with their attitudes toward and knowledge about them may offer the insight needed to better understand actual consumption behaviors. For simplicity, this study is focused on “organic” and “GMO-free” foods. The first represents a food choice with more than a decade of federally backed information tools and market presence, while the second has had less public discourse regarding its definition or merits. The contrast will provide insight on both the effects of information flow on food choices and the prospects for a “newer” category to break through.

**Literature**

The notion that individuals can be overloaded with information began arguably with Miller (1956) who found that individuals can generally process about seven items before short-term memory is overwhelmed. Once past that item count, individuals find methods to cope with the amount of information available to them, and such methods can result in lost information (Bruce et al., 2004). Indeed, one consequence of needing to cope with information volume is the potential that consumers make decisions on goods only at the moment of purchase without prior consideration, essentially creating the risk that they have not actually selected the good that is best for them. This can also result in lower consumer confidence (Bettman, 1975).

In addition, the number of alternatives available to a consumer is viewed as another burden in terms of processing information. Determining the difference between brands or between products with subtle feature differences is expected to tax consumers and create consumer confusion (Fasolo et al., 2007; Jacoby, Speller and Kohn, 1974). Confusion is not expected to result in optimal decision-making (Mitchell and Papavassiliou, 1999).

The coping mechanisms that consumers develop can be broadly categorized as “push” in nature – limiting the sources that you will allow to reach you – or “pull” – using search techniques to find just the information desired (Savolainen, 2007). Both can be used rationally, but unfortunately with the potential consequence that the information used by a consumer may be a poor match for what he/she really needs or wants to know. Of course, one of the potential coping strategies is to do nothing at all – to disengage from the purchase decision (Mitchell and Papavassiliou, 1999). This particular strategy has obvious impacts on market potential of the goods in question.

For any good, therefore, the degree to which a consumer experiences information overload can influence their perceptions of the good itself. In the present study, we assess how the presence of information overload helps explain differences in attitudes toward two categories of foods that require consumers to be able to differentiate their alternatives. Organic food was federally regulated beginning with the National Organic Program enacted in 2002. The list of requirements for a farmer or processor to label foods as “organic” is considerable and complex, suggesting that a consumer who does not engage (fully) with available information could easily disregard organic food or judge it inaccurately. By
contrast, foods free of genetically modified organisms – usually shortened to “GMO-free” – are definitionally simpler but conceptually challenging given the laboratory origins of the seed, thus also having implications for the consumer’s efforts to process available information.

In this context, we propose and test two sets of complementary hypotheses. The first regards attitude toward the foods: a) consumers who exhibit characteristics of information overload will be more indifferent (mid-scale ratings) regarding organic and GMO-free foods, largely as a result of not understanding them and not putting effort into it, while b) consumers who are less overwhelmed by information will have stronger (positive or negative) opinions of organic and GMO-free foods, as the information they have processed has helped shape their perspectives. The second set of hypotheses is similar, but regards level of knowledge of the individual food categories: a) consumers who feel information overload will have relatively low (accurate) knowledge of organic and GMO-free foods, while b) consumers who are less overwhelmed will have improved understanding of the certifications.

Methodology

The literature (e.g. Stanton and Paolo, 2012) provides scales that allow capture of consumer perceptions of information flow (e.g. overwhelmed, passive gatherers, active gatherers), and coping mechanisms (e.g. avoidance, postponement, get expert help) in the context of food choices. These scales, along with scales on attitude toward organic and GMO-free foods, the multidimensional ethics scale (Reidenbach and Robin, 1988) to control for general ethical perspective, and measures of choice across food products (Morwitz, 1997), are folded into a survey instrument (along with demographic and purchase questions). Definitional statements for each food type are also included to assess the degree of detail knowledge consumers hold.

Amazon’s online crowdsourcing market, Mechanical Turk (MTurk), provides the mechanism for acquiring participants. Our screening criteria resulted in participants that are U.S. adults over the age of 18 who indicate some participation in the purchase of foods for themselves or their families.

Analytically, once the full data set is collected, we will conduct confirmatory factor analysis for the scales. Cluster analysis will provide groupings of consumers regarding their perceptions of information flow and coping strategies, and the attitudes and knowledge of those groupings toward the two food types are contrasted. Preliminary results using averages and groupings are hinting at confirmation of our hypotheses.

Expected Impact

Having a stronger understanding of how the food consumer relates to the information available about foods can allow us to assess the strategies needed for greater market growth. “Certified” organic food has been available on the market for over a decade, while GMO-free is a relatively new label. If consumers feel a level of overload such that their efforts to understand organic have been affected, it is likely that entirely different tactics for similar certification efforts will be needed.

Theoretically, the research also has the potential to reveal how the supposed attitude-behavior gap with ethical goods is a failure to understand one’s choices. This is not simply or only about a desire
or lack of desire to learn, but instead the natural emergence of coping mechanisms that prevent information processing. This speaks to a market system trait that makes it more difficult for ethical goods to find their audience – an oxymoron of sorts in that the means through which an improvement in production/consumption choices might be delivered is ignored or judged poorly simply because the receiver cannot handle the additional information processing that it requires.

References


Are Diamonds Forever?
Exploring the Creation and Maintenance of a Market for Ethical Diamond Engagement Rings

Hana Sethi, Schulich School of Business, York University, Toronto, Ontario, Canada
Sarah Glozer, Nottingham University Business School, University of Nottingham, UK

Theoretical Framing

Scholars have recently noted that, “the process of market evolution is central to marketing, and yet it is surprising to find such a paucity of empirical research addressing it,” (Giesler 2008, 739). Previous literature on market creation, and evolution houses only a handful of studies (Giesler 2008, Humphreys 2010a, 2010b, Karababa and Ger 2011). Our goal is to understand how an ethical market is created, and the challenges and strategies used to sustain it. The characteristics which define the ‘market for virtue’ (Vogel 2005) have remained obtuse and the notion of an ‘ethical market’ is still a nebulous one (Crane 2005). In this study, we thus analyze the complex, global diamond engagement ring industry. The goals of this article are to analyze (1) the drivers of the creation of an ethical market, (2) the challenges of gaining legitimacy as an ethical market, and (3) the strategies stakeholders use to gain legitimacy as an ethical market.

Theory and Methods

We study the diamond engagement ring industry through a socio-historical lens and interpret our findings through key tenants of institutional theory (Parsons 1954, Zucker 1987, DiMaggio 1988, Suchman 1995, Thornton 2004). Given its influential role as a provider of news content, the media is a key stakeholder in shaping discourse, and common conceptions of what it means to be ‘ethical’ (see Caruana and Crane 2008). We conduct a thematic analysis of articles and adverts from three mainstream U.S. newspaper publications: The LA Times, The Washington Post and the New York Times.

Research Contribution

Our research offers three key contributions. First, we complement prior work that has studied the formation markets in marketing and consumer literature (Humphreys 2010a, 2010b, Karababa and Ger 2011). These studies have focused on how new markets are created from a state of nonexistence. In our context, the diamond engagement ring was well established for almost 100 years before its evolution to encompass more ethical characteristics. We examine the drivers and process of change through which a new ethical market is legitimized, illuminating the tensions that underpin the transition. Specifically, we find that competing institutional logics are formed through contestations from marketplace actors and institutional entrepreneurs. As these competing logics are reconciled, the marketplace moves towards ethical behaviours and standards. We believe that this approach will address significant conceptual gaps in relation to market creation from established marketplaces, and enhance the literature through offering an ethical contextualization.
Second, we extend prior research that has identified consumer and managerial strategies to bring changes to the market (Geisler 2008, Humphreys 2010a, 2010b, Karababa and Ger 2011, Scaraboto and Fischer 2013). The diamond engagement ring industry provides a context rich with diverse stakeholder interests, shifting power dynamics and emotive underpinnings, marking it out as an excellent case for analyzing the strategies institutional actors (e.g. NGOs) evoke, and the influence of key events in shifting dominant cultural values and beliefs over time to gain marketplace legitimacy. Last, while Giesler (2008) looked at the evolution of a market, he studied a sub-market that was created through the de- institutionalization of a main market. In our study, despite the challenges to the diamond industry, we surmise that the industry has been able to remain cohesive, maintaining its symbolic meaning as it continues to grow.

References


## Marketing Systems and Corporate Dealings I

### Abstract/Papers Included

**Consumption behavior and energy consumption: A marketing systems perspective**
John D. Mittelstaedt, University of Wyoming - Laramie, USA  
Robert A. Mittelstaedt, University of Nebraska - Lincoln, USA

**Marketing systems and market failure: A consideration of side effects**
William Redmond, Indiana State University - Terre Haute, USA

**How do marketing systems respond to constraints? An exploration of sustainability as a barrier to growth within the tourist marketing system of Ningaloo Marine Park, Western Australia**
Sarah Duffy, University of New South Wales, Australia  
Roger Layton, University of New South Wales, Australia

**Growth and adaptation in marketing systems**
Roger Layton, University of New South Wales, Australia
Consumption Behavior as Energy Consumption: A Marketing Systems Perspective
An Extended Abstract

John D. Mittelstaedt, University of Wyoming, Laramie, WY, USA
Robert A. Mittelstaedt, University of Nebraska, Lincoln, NE, USA

Alderson (1964) argues that the goal of marketing systems is to maximize assortment (Layton 2007). Assortment leads to choice, and fulfills heterogeneous demand. In a well-run marketing system, assortment should balance variety in demand with the marginal return of producing and delivering one more alternative. But Kilbourne (2004) argues that this model is not sustainable in the long run, since it only accounts for the costs incurred directly by producers. What of the costs incurred external to the firm (Meade and Nason 1991)? To account for these externalities, Kilbourne and Mittelstaedt (2012) argue that each of us must consume fewer goods and services, or consume differently.

The purpose of this paper is to offer the perspective that we consume neither goods nor services, but instead bundles of accumulated energy needed to harvest, process, transport, store, and exchange the goods and services that serve as solutions to the problems of the human condition. Rather than focusing on how we reduce consumption of goods or services, we should focus on how we reduce the energy necessary to produce end-user solutions, through the marketing system. This paper offers a theoretical context for such an argument.

Almost all energy usage is the result of consumption choices, either directly or indirectly. Energy is used in all phases of the production, distribution, selling and use of products – that is, in all aspects of a marketing system. For example, our ability to consume food relies on the prior consumption of energy in production, distribution and selling of foodstuffs, in the household energy needed to store, refrigerate and cook, and the industrial energy needed to produce, distribute and sell the appliances needed to make food edible and presentable. Put another way, marketing system behaviors can be viewed as energy consumption behaviors.

This perspective is important, because energy efficiency represents one of the largest sources of untapped energy. Energy efficiency is as an effective source of new energy as anything that can be extracted, and can extend the useful life of all other energy sources. The challenge facing marketing systems is the willingness of system members to adopt more energy efficient patterns of behavior. The solution to more energy efficient consumption lies in our ability to maximize energy efficiency in production, distribution, use and disposal of goods and services, with the minimum necessary (involuntary) behavioral adaption on the part of end users.

The purpose of this paper is to understand the processes by which energy is directly and indirectly consumed in provision of solutions to the basic challenges faced by the human condition – our needs for food, shelter, clothing, for ways to move and express ourselves. This is done by (1) accounting
for energy use through the production and consumption process; (2) identifying energy consumption elasticities; and (3) proscribing business, consumption and public policy strategies that maximize energy efficiency with the least impact on end-user consumption behavior.

Energy Efficiency as a Marketing System Model

There are important arguments for framing sustainable consumption behavior in terms of energy efficiency. First, energy efficiency represents the largest source of untapped energy. Patrick Mulva, VP and Controller of Exxon-Mobil, argues that energy efficiency is the single largest source of untapped energy. Exxon-Mobil estimates that energy efficiency represents 170 million barrel equivalents of energy per day, in a forecast need of 310 million barrel equivalents per day by 2030. This represents more than 2½ times the energy Exxon-Mobil forecasts globally from all non-carbon based energy sources (Mulva 2009).

Second, as humans we face the same basic set of needs that our ancestors have faced for thousands of years (food, shelter, clothing, etc.), and that our descendants will face thousands of years from now. Different civilizations have formed different approaches to solving these problems; our approach to almost all of them is market-mediated exchange, also called consumption. Kilbourne and Mittelstaedt (2012) refer to this as the ideology of consumption – our belief about the necessity of consumption in our lives and our culture. We either need to find more energy efficient ways to address these needs within the context of this ideology, or we need to be prepared to see it replaced by a new ideological framework (i.e., a different civilization).

Third, the only way to compare differing phenomena is to find a common underlying unit of analysis. Historically, the common element has been goods, but in the last decades we have moved from a goods dominant logic to a service dominant logic (Lusch and Vargo 2006). Debate continues – which is a better common unit of analysis, a good or a service? Energy consumed can serve as unifying construct that makes distinction between goods and services moot. All goods and services – in their extraction, production, storage, distribution, retailing, use, maintenance, and disposal – represent past, present or future energy consumption.

Humans Challenges and Forms of Consumption

To begin, let us accept for the moment that the basic needs of humanity have endured for most of recorded history. Like our ancestors, we face a basic set of challenges that we must address, individually or collectively. We need food to eat. We need shelter to protect us from the elements. We need clothing to protect our bodies, and to express our affiliation. We need ways to move. We need to communicate. We need to recreate and be entertained. We need to learn. And we need to stay safe and healthy. While our solutions to these eight basic challenges have evolved over time, the challenges themselves have endured.

Each of these basic problems has been addressed by a series of innovations, over time. For example, the problem of hunger has been solved by hunting, gathering, agrarianism, animal husbandry, and most recently industrial food (Pollan 2006). Each solution was appropriate in its larger social context, where different civilizations throughout history organized themselves around different institutions. We have organized ourselves into tribes, families, city-states and nations in attempts to
provide systems of provision. Contemporary civilization relies most heavily on market-mediated exchange as the basic provisioning system of society (Fisk 1967). Under our dominant social paradigm (Kilbourne, McDonagh and Prothero 1997), consumption is the primary social mechanism by which we solve the challenges of food, shelter, transportation, and the like. We have developed elaborate marketing systems to connect production with consumption. Table One summarizes the solutions and provisioning systems on which we rely to address the eight basic challenges of society.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Human Challenge</th>
<th>Solution</th>
<th>Provisioning System</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The need to eat</td>
<td>Food</td>
<td>Food marketing systems</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The need for shelter</td>
<td>Built environment</td>
<td>Real Estate systems</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The need to cover ourselves</td>
<td>Clothing</td>
<td>Fashion marketing systems</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The need to move</td>
<td>Vehicles</td>
<td>Auto and related industries</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The need to communicate</td>
<td>Telecommunications</td>
<td>Communications marketing systems</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The need to recreate</td>
<td>Entertainment</td>
<td>Entertainment marketing system</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The need to learn</td>
<td>Education</td>
<td>Education marketing system</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The need to for survival</td>
<td>healthcare</td>
<td>Healthcare marketing system</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

A civilization’s choice of provisioning systems reflects many things. Mittelstaedt, Kilbourne and Mittelstaedt (2006) argue that formal, informal and philosophic institutions shape provisioning systems. In addition, we argue that the structure of a system reflects the available sources of energy. The cheapest sources of useful energy tend to have the greatest influence. Throughout human history, we have used biomass, solar and wind power, domesticated animals, and the energy of other humans (e.g., slavery) to generate solve our problems, and to shape contextually appropriate provisioning systems. Today, we rely heavily on carbon-based energy sources to fuel the production, distribution, retailing, use, maintenance and disposal of our solutions. Because energy is entwined with the other the antecedents to a provisioning system, it is likely that changes in energy sourcing will have implications for the nature of the preferred provisioning system.

Consumption Behavior and Energy

In this paper, we develop a model for identifying the direct and indirect energy costs associated with marketing provisioning systems; develop techniques for measuring the energy consumption elasticity of system behaviors – the sensitivity of marketing systems to the source and amount of energy consumed to execute the provisioning functions of the system (Kreith 2012); and use this to identify those points in a marketing system that allow for the greatest reductions in energy consumption with the smallest behavioral change required of end users to marketing systems. We will develop this in the context of a single product, frozen vegetables (Green and Foster 2005), and consider its applicability to other marketing systems.

References


Marketing Systems and Market Failure: A Consideration of Side Effects

William Redmond, Indiana State University, Terre Haute, IN, USA

Marketing systems play an increasingly prominent role in economic activity and, correspondingly, in academic research. In this light Layton (2007) explains that marketing systems are a central concept in the field of macromarketing. The systems concept draws attention to relational aspects of market exchange, implying shared participation and predictability of exchange partners. This stands in contrast with the neoclassical assumption of markets which are characterized by atomistic, arms-length, one-off transactions. The concept (and practice) of networked marketing systems emphasizes a stable network of actors, resulting in a “domesticated” market (Arndt 1979). The domestication concept draws attention to planning and cooperation, and the avoidance of competition. Domesticated markets are an example of noncompetition in marketing systems (Layton and Grossbart 2006).

If the systems approach is increasingly displacing the transactional approach to marketing, what are macro-level effects of this shift? This area has been the subject of broad-scale assessments (Layton and Grossbart 2006; Layton 2007). In contrast the present paper is narrowly focused on the issue of market failures and, more specifically, with one type of market failure: side effects. The question is whether networked marketing systems, qua systems, are more prone to produce side effects than are transactional markets. That is, do the properties which characterize closely-coupled, sequential systems make side effects more or less common; more or less severe?

Jim Carman and Robert Harris developed a three part analysis of the interaction between exchange (ie markets) and authority (ie regulation) in the organization of economic activity. As with other researchers the premise is that voluntary exchange is the preferred mode, except in cases of market failure. There are several types of market failures, including imperfect competition, imperfect information, (de)merit goods, as well as side effects (Harris and Carman 1983). Carman and Harris developed the failures framework in the 1980’s, based partly on economic theory and partly on a pragmatic understanding of market behaviors. While it continues to be a powerful tool for understanding markets, developments since that time indicate that the framework might benefit from some renewed attention.

Side effects represent a situation in which certain consequences of exchange have not been anticipated by the transaction parties and thus have not been incorporated into the terms of exchange. There are two basic categories of side effects, externalities in which third parties (ie non-transacting parties) are affected and internalities in which transacting parties are affected (Harris and Carman 1983). Each type may be positive or negative; however the focus of the present paper is on negative side effects.

Internalities

While macromarketing studies have typically focused on externalities, internalities also merit discussion because of their effects on the operation of marketing systems. Internalities are costs which are born by exchange parties but which are not anticipated and thus not factored into the terms of exchange. (Somewhat confusingly, some macromarketers refer to unanticipated effects on transaction parties as externalities [eg Nason 1986] but internalities appears to be the more common usage.) To the
extent that negative internalities result in unanticipated costs, they may be more disruptive to networked marketing systems than to transactional exchange markets.

The root causes of internalities are of two basic kinds—bounded rationality and incomplete information. Both are examples of uninformed exchange, which is an instance of market failure (Harris and Carman 1983). The issue in question is whether networked systems make the problem worse, as compared with transactional exchange. At first glance the answer would appear to be no: members of networked systems engage in joint planning, which should serve to mitigate problems of lack of information and individual cognitive limitations. Planning requires gathering and sharing information, anticipating future conditions, weighing alternatives, and coordinating decisions.

However these same activities also expose the participants to other cognitive traps, such as group think. That is, sharing of information and planning tends to produce sets of common assumptions and beliefs about what will transpire in the future. This may lead to lack of preparation and readiness for unanticipated eventualities. Networking can also result in over-reliance on the performance of other network members and create a lack of flexibility in adapting to disruptions or environmental change.

Instances of internalities due to poor anticipation include breakdowns in JIT supply chains and excessive reliance on a small number of system partners. Such internalities may be exacerbated by the geographic clustering of suppliers in the event of natural (or otherwise) disasters. For example, the 2011 flooding in Thailand revealed that a sizeable portion of the world’s supply of hard-disk drives originates in a smallish area near Bangkok (Economist 2012). Over-reliance may produce several modes of negative internalities. Entire systems may falter due to the failure of downstream members to compete effectively, or falter due to the failure of system members to adopt new technologies and procedures in a timely fashion. In addition, opportunistic behavior or fraud by system members can harm others in the system.

Externalities

More familiar in the macromarketing literature is the problem of negative externalities. The actions of market actors may impose costs on third parties. Because these costs are not incorporated in market prices, markets tend to produce too much of the product/service in question (Mittelstaedt, Kilbourne and Mittelstaedt 2006). The question again is: does the sequential patterning of exchange relations exacerbate negative side effects as compared with arms-length, transactional exchange?

This seems likely under three general circumstances. First, firms embedded in networked systems may gain a competitive advantage over transactional firms. Assuming problems of group think are not severe, networked firms may achieve efficiencies due to greater coordination and better information flows. In consequence, the networked firms may enjoy relatively higher market share. If the production and logistical operations of networked firms are more prone to generate externalities, say pollution, then networked systems will generate more of the negative externality in question.

Second, interconnectivity can transmit negative effects from upstream parts of the network to downstream, in which third parties may be more exposed. Durable relationships are based, in part, on trust. A relationship of trust might, for example, allow a faulty auto braking component to pass through a networked system, whereas greater vigilance in a transactional market might involve more frequent or thorough quality inspections. If so, a traffic accident resulting in injury to a non-transacting party would be more likely in a networked system.

Third, through coordinated adaptation to changing environmental conditions, networked systems may have a great capacity for evolutionary change. In general this seems a desirable attribute, but sometimes may be less so. An instance is when this involves a system making new connections to a
previously separated market system. In this way, new flows may occur and new outputs may be created. This can result in unanticipated consequences for third parties.

A prime example of this phenomenon is the US housing market crisis and subsequent mortgage securities disaster (Redmond 2013). Prior to the house price bubble, mortgages were generally provided by local banks and saving and loan associations. During the bubble, investment banks (who were previously unconnected with the housing market) organized a new financing channel which funneled unprecedented amounts of money into the housing market via the issuance of subprime mortgage securities to institutional investors (also not previously involved in housing). When the mortgages underlying the securities faltered, banks failed, economies entered recession and individuals lost jobs and homes around the world. This was, by some reckonings, the most massive level of negative externalities on record. Absent a highly effective market network in place to issue, package and distribute subprime securities, it is doubtful that the market for the securities could have reached anywhere near the volume that it did. Consequently the scale of externalities would have been considerably smaller had the network not existed.

Less clear is whether this effect is a general property of networked market systems, or whether this particular case has aspects which make it less generalizable. One aspect in particular limits generalizability to some other marketing systems: the centrality of finance and banking in the subprime crisis. The financial system is intricately interconnected among financial firms and is connected to many other businesses. It is therefore prone to cause extensive externalities (Frankel 1991; Lerner and Tufano 2011; Allen and Gale 1994; Stiglitz 2010). In the housing crisis, trillions of dollars in risky mortgages became embedded in the global financial system (Financial Crisis Inquiry Commission 2011).

Calculation of externalities would require both anticipation and valuation (Mundt and Houston 1996). Such effects are virtually never the subject of cost/benefit modeling in finance: “The particular challenge associated with assessing the social impact of financial innovation lies in the fact that so many of its consequences are in the form of externalities,” (Lerner and Tufano 2011,12). Networked marketing systems which evolve to incorporate financing as a major aspect of the operation may indeed serve to amplify and propagate externalities.

Internal/External

Consumer welfare is impacted by the competitiveness of markets, and more competition is thought to be better for consumers. There is not a clear consensus on whether the consumer should be regarded as part of the network or not, this being a matter of system specification (Layton 2007). In other words, do effects on consumers count as internalities or externalities? As it could be either, the present paper employs a separate internal/external category.

Networked marketing systems are created to achieve multiple objectives, some tactical in nature and some strategic. Arndt drew attention to the strategic: “It is argued that the competitive, open market is in the process of being tamed, regulated and closed. To an increasing degree, transactions are occurring in ‘internal’ markets within the framework of long-term relationships, not on an ad hoc basis,” (1979, 69). Domestication seeks to replace unrestrained competition and ad-hoc transactions with restrained competition and planned exchanges. Important objectives include stability and predictability of operations, achieved through long-term relations, planning, control and suppression of active competition.

Efforts to avoid or reduce competition may themselves have unintended consequences (Layton and Grossbart 2006). From the standpoint of consumer welfare, the suppression of active competition may result in lower levels of innovation or in higher prices. But open acknowledgement of this would carry real political risks for marketers. This irony was not lost on Arndt: “Hence, a paradox of capitalism
is the fact that the individual market actor may reap substantial benefits from eliminating competition, while at the same time professing to be a true believer in free competition,” (1981, 42).

Harris and Carman (1983) categorize imperfect competition as one type of market failure and side effects as another. The present paper suggests they may be related.

Conclusion
The paper has discussed negative side-effects as instances of market failure. In cases of market failure, the imposition of authority (ie, regulation) must be considered (Harris and Carman 1984). Unclear, at this point, is whether extant regulatory approaches are adequate or appropriate for application to networked marketing systems. Regulatory and legal approaches to market failure are often grounded in transactional economic notions, and focus on information remedies or product standards or taxes. Fewer focus on the systemic nature of marketing networks. Newer approaches might concentrate on market competitiveness as well as the interconnectivity aspect of networks, especially the tendency for side-effects to be transmitted from one part of the system to others.

References
How do marketing systems respond to constraints? An exploration of sustainability as a barrier to growth within the tourist marketing system of Ningaloo Marine Park, Western Australia.

Sarah Duffy, University of New South Wales
Roger Layton, University of New South Wales

Abstract

Management of our natural resources is a pressing issue for governments and citizens globally. It has become increasingly clear that linear approaches to understand complex systems which treat each aspect of the system as independent and each manipulation in isolation are inadequate, as non-linear transactions within linked natural and socioeconomic systems require a sophisticated approach that seeks to explain complexity (Norberg & Cumming, 2008). A macromarketing perspective has been applied to similar issues to understand the complex nature of the simultaneous pursuit of economic growth and sustainability (Layton, 2009; Press & Arnould, 2009; Phipps & Brace-Govan, 2011, Kennedy & Parsons, 2012). The IAD Framework developed by Elinor Ostrom (1990) combined with Marketing Systems theory extends a macromarketing perspective by adding design principles to test and sharpen the focus on interaction within the system. The tourist marketing system of Ningaloo Marine Park, Western Australia tests the appropriateness of this approach. The purpose of this paper is to extend the conceptualization of marketing systems as they respond to sustainability as a barrier to growth.

Keywords: Marketing systems, macromarketing, Institutional Analysis and Development Framework, sustainability, tourism marketing, coral reefs.
Introduction

This paper investigates the relationship between sustainability and socio-economic development within a marketing system that must use, interact with and preserve a renewable natural resource to ensure future economic survival and prosperity. To examine how the marketing system responds to an imperative that requires foregoing current growth to secure future growth, this work intends to examine the tourist marketing system dependent on the world heritage listed Ningaloo Marine Park (hereafter referred to as NMP), Western Australia. Limiting the growth of marketing systems to ensure future sustainability is a microcosm of a global challenge to divide a finite number of resources amongst a sharply increasing population (Wilk, 2002; Shultz II & Holbrook, 1999).

Marketing Systems and The Institutional Analysis and Development Framework

Marketing systems theory in conjunction with the Institutional Analysis and Development Framework (hereafter referred to as the IAD Framework) provides a framework for understanding the relationship between growth and sustainability. The IAD Framework (Ostrom, 1990) is a theory developed across economics and public policy to study the non-linear interactions between renewable natural resources and the institutions that form the socio-economic system around these resources. A set of design principles (see Appendix 1) has been developed from the scrutiny of hundreds of case studies, fieldwork studies and experiments concerning access to common pool resources and are the core factors that were found to determine the success or failure of the system (Ostrom, 2011). This paper explores the conceptual fit between the IAD Framework and Marketing System theory, however, it is intended a case study of NMP will be developed to examine the practical fit, specifically, the consequences of adherence to, or deviations from the design principles and if further design principles are required.

A definition of marketing systems was first introduced by Hunt (1977) and refined by Layton (2007) which describes marketing systems as complex, adaptive, social networks whereby structure and function are central and purpose stems from an active matching of goods and needs. The tourist marketing system of NMP is centred on the towns Coral Bay and Exmouth. The ‘goods’ consist of the experiences offered to tourists delivered by tour operators, hoteliers and so forth. Diving, camping, or the idea of a remote coastal location, are examples of the experiences sought by tourists and represent the ‘needs’. There is a dynamic social network operating to facilitate the matching between the goods and the needs.

Layton (2007) conceptualizes four categories of a Marketing System (shown in Appendix 2): first ‘environments, boundaries, inputs, and initial conditions’, second ‘components’, third ‘attributes’, and fourth ‘outcomes’. Due to limitations of space, each category will be briefly explained and linked with the IAD Framework, specifically the relevant design principle and the action situation. The action situation is defined as the social space where individuals meet, trade, solve problems, cooperate or disagree (Ostrom, 1990). Appendix 3 shows the internal structure of an action situation, which demonstrates the working parts one needs to detail to comprehend the whole system. Individuals within the system will be referred to as ‘key actors’ and will include (but are not limited to), customers, key tourist operators, Jingudera (traditional owners), developers, the local council, state government, commonwealth government, local business council, media and environmental groups.
Marketing Systems Categories and IAD Framework Design Principles

Category One: Environment, boundaries, inputs, and initial conditions

To understand the tourist system of NMP, the first category of Marketing Systems analysis details the external variables of the action situation, specifically the physical environment, institutional settings and cultural context. The physical environment forms part of ‘the goods’, additionally it equips the system with resources, sets the stage for its operation, attracts and repels key actors and has larger implications for the institutions that emerge. The IAD Framework, design principles 1A & 1B emphasize the need for users and non-users to understand the resource boundaries. Boundaries pose a complicated (but not impossible) situation for the key actors of the tourist marketing system to negotiate a resource extends over 300km along the Western Australian Coast.

The institutional settings bring attention to the role of government, laws, finance, risk and regulatory context and their role in shaping the actions available to actors at different nodes within the system and the opportunities and threats resulting from these. Design principles 2A & 2B examine the rules of provision, appropriation and their congruence with the socio-ecological system. The Ningaloo Coastal Strategy executed by the state government is intended to conserve the natural environment whilst promoting incremental economic development. The institutional framework within which marketing systems emerge and grow, and within which knowledge develops or is restricted, plays a central role in determining the overall outcome (Layton, 2009).

The cultural environment considers the social structures at play, their impacts on individuals, groups and the wider values, norms and rules shared by the collective. The collective rules are critical for design principle 3. The cultural environment is significant since the local citizens have actively demonstrated passion for the preservation of their home and a willingness to unite and make a stand for its protection. In 2003 the local citizens successfully agitated for the State Government to overturn a $200 million tourist resort proposed for the area. A further consequence of the protest was the creation of the Ningaloo Coastal Strategy to govern all future development (ABC News Corp, 2003). The IAD Framework has found that many successfully managed resource systems are governed by rules or norms established from the ‘bottom-up’ rather than a ‘top down’ approach (Ostrom, 1990). This finding challenges the belief exemplified in Hardin’s seminal work (“The Tragedy of the Commons”, first published in 1968 then reprised in 2009), which suggested that externally imposed management is the optimal solution for resource management.

Category Two: Components

The second category of marketing systems theory involves components (see Appendix 2) and it details the functions of the system that also form the structure of the action situation (Appendix 3). Specifically, this category explores the actors and actions that lead to transactions at nodes within the system and the subsequent outcomes. Commercial transactions and the associated operations that bring them to bear may be pivotal in determining the sustainability (or not) of the system. This will inform the testing of design principles 4A, 4B and 5, which are interested in how the users and the resource are monitored and the role of sanctions. Detailing the roles (or ‘positions’) of key actors will contextualize the transactions and explicate the activities occurring within the system.
Design principle 6 brings attention to interaction between the key actors and how they relate to one another in order to resolve conflict. The action situation posits that information is a key influence of potential outcomes. Trust is decisive for relationships, since belief in the information received will have a bearing on the resulting actions and interactions within the system. Communication within NMP is necessary for: day-to-day management, future planning and conflict resolution, the system and relies on accurate information about the resource system, human interaction and their effects. The marketing system of NMP, involves actors who seldom directly interact and cannot observe the actions and thus possess limited information, or rely on information from other sources about those within their sphere of influence. Understanding trust in both action and information, at all levels of the system will be key to understand how frequency of interaction and unobservable actions affects the relationships and activities of key actors.

**Category Three: Attributes**

The third category of marketing systems theory brings the focus “outward looking in” in order to examine the attributes of the system, specifically complex adaptive system attributes, emergent characteristics and the degree of innovation. Complex adaptive system attributes are concerned with how or how not the system is structured with the capacity to be self-organizing, chaotic or evolving, the system may manifest one or more of these characteristics at any one time. Complex adaptive system attributes influence the action situation (the space where key actors interact) in particular their positions and how much control and information key actors have about and over desired and potential outcomes. The protest of 2003 is an example of how the system can self-organize, that is the state government responded to local residents collective demand by institutionalizing local incremental development in the Ningaloo Coastal Strategy.

The IAD Framework suggests that self-organizing systems (rather than those organized by an external top-down approach) are more successful at managing a resource (Ostrom, 1990). Knowledge from the first category is essential as changes in the environment (physical, institutional and cultural) can demonstrate system adaptiveness. However, change may be endogenous as well as exogenous. Thus an understanding of the second category will establish how the system responds to internal influences. Emergent characteristics explore actions, stress points or fractures, which are likely to occur in response to activity identified in Category 1 or Category 2.

The degree of innovation with which the system responds to environmental constraints may indicate how the system will respond to other changes. For instance, seventy seven per cent of total visitors to NMP during 2007 to 2009 were domestic (The Department of Local Government and Regional Development, 2012). In 2011 Chinese tourists were the number one nationality to visit Australia (Tourism Research Australia, 2012). It may be relevant to consider whether the system would respond smoothly if Chinese tourists increased in number? This change is likely to require innovation from key actors (local tour operators, restaurants and accommodation) to respond to a different set of ‘needs’ and have significant consequences not the least of which is for the type of ‘goods’ available. For example, research of current NMP tourists indicates snorkeling as the number one activity. If Chinese tourists increase significantly the system may innovate and match a new ‘need’ that is, to experience the reef without swimming, with a new ‘good’, perhaps glass-bottomed boat tours (The Department of Local Government and Regional Development, 2013).
Category Four: Outcomes

Outcomes are the fourth and final category relevant to the study of Marketing Systems, the action situation and the final design principle. The consequences of marketing systems are of interest to, management, communities, scholars and policy makers alike as systems may by virtue of their own operations produce negative externalities that threaten their own and others existence (Layton, 2007). “Success or failure of the system can be determined by the quality of life of the participants and by extension the communities of which they are a part, specifically this is a consequence of the affordability, quality, relevance, and accessibility of the assortments created by the marketing system (Layton, 2009 p. 359)”. The IAD Framework facilitates focus on the net costs and benefits assigned to potential outcomes that will differ based on the actors, their positions and the avenues they pursue to reach their expected outcomes. The final design principle links the tourist marketing system of NMP to society more broadly by conceptualizing the system discussed as one layer within multiple nested layers. This study intends to consider how the actions within the system affect the local community within the tourist system is embedded.

Conclusion

This paper explains how marketing systems theory is augmented by the IAD Framework to understand the non-linear transactions occurring within a linked socioeconomic and natural system. Marketing systems theory provides a clear structure to examine the tourist marketing system of NMP and the IAD Framework adds expertise from other disciplines and stipulates a set of design principles to appraise NMP against. This paper contributes theoretically by outlining a framework to extend conceptualisation of marketing systems to study how they evolve in response to sustainability as a limitation to growth.
Appendix 1: Design Principles of the IAD Framework developed by Cox, Arnold, and Villamayor-Tomás (2009), cited by Ostrom (2011):

1A. User Boundaries: Clear and locally understood boundaries between legitimate users and nonusers are present.

1B. Resource Boundaries: Clear boundaries that separate a specific common-pool resource from a larger social-ecological system are present.

2A. Congruence with Local Conditions: Appropriation and provision rules are congruent with local social and environmental conditions.

2B. Appropriation and Provision: Appropriation rules are congruent with provision rules; the distribution of costs is proportional to the distribution of benefits.

3. Collective-Choice Arrangements: Most individuals affected by a resource regime are authorized to participate in making and modifying its rules.

4A. Monitoring Users: Individuals who are accountable to or are the users monitor the appropriation and provision levels of the users.

4B. Monitoring the Resource: Individuals who are accountable to or are the users monitor the condition of the resource.

5. Graduated Sanctions: Sanctions for rule violations start very low but become stronger if a user repeatedly violates a rule.

6. Conflict-Resolution Mechanisms: Rapid, low-cost, local arenas exist for resolving conflicts among users or with officials.

7. Minimal Recognition of Rights: The rights of local users to make their own rules are recognized by the government.

8. Nested Enterprises: When a common-pool resource is closely connected to a larger social-ecological system, governance activities are organized in multiple nested layers.
Appendix 2 – Traits of Marketing Systems adapted from Layton (2007)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category 1. Environment, boundaries, inputs, and initial conditions</th>
<th>Category 2. Components</th>
<th>Category 3. Attributes</th>
<th>Category 4. Outcomes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>E1 Physical Environment</td>
<td>C1 Exchange Elements</td>
<td>A1 Complex adaptive system attributes</td>
<td>O1 Economic outcomes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E2 Institutional Settings</td>
<td>C2 Relationships (Trust)</td>
<td>A2 Emergent Characteristics</td>
<td>O2 Customer Satisfaction/Dissatisfaction</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E3 Cultural Environment</td>
<td>C3 Flows (information, goods, risk, finance, possession)</td>
<td>A3 Degree of innovation</td>
<td>O3 Quality of life measures</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Appendix 3 – The Internal Structure of an Action Situation Ostrom (2011)
References


Growth and Adaptation in Marketing Systems

Roger A. Layton, University of New South Wales

This paper explores the “why” and “how” of formation, growth, adaptation and possible renewal in marketing systems, using as an example, a “natural experiment” drawn from an account of one of the changes initiated under China’s economic reform in the 1970’s and 1980’s.

“The market is the result of human action but not of human design”
F.A.Hayek

Why and how do marketing systems form, grow, adapt and renew? This paper explores these processes, using as an example, a “natural experiment” drawn from an account of one of the changes initiated under China’s economic reform in the 1970’s and 1980’s. It builds on the work of many scholars from America and Europe, and notably Scandinavia, who over the last 100 years have contributed to the development of marketing theory, and especially to the commodity, institutional and functional schools of marketing thought. These scholars include Alderson, Arndt, Breyer, Cassady, Cox, Dickinson, Dixon, Grether, Hunt, Kjær-Hansen, Mattsson, McGarry, Shapiro, Shaw and many others. The paper by Alderson and Cox (1948), “Towards a theory of marketing”, reprinted in Wooliscroft et al (2006), is particularly significant, as one of the first to point the way to a theory of marketing which integrates ideas drawn, not just from marketing, but from many different disciplines. This paper is in that tradition.

It sketches an evolutionary theory of marketing system formation and growth that is based on several fast growing streams of research. The first, drawing primarily on work in the mathematics of game theory, computer modelling, and network economics, with extensions to ethics and natural justice, is concerned with the growth of trust and cooperation amongst self interested, rational individuals; the second, building on the generalised Darwinian models of co-evolution found in human biology, ecology, and culture studies, is concerned with the co-evolution of evoked behaviors, acquired knowledge and the limits to action imposed by institutions, both formal and informal; the third looking at the development of specialization and the emergence of trade networks, uses research from archaeology, anthropology, economics, economic sociology, historical analysis, and marketing; and the fourth draws on work in archaeology and ecological science together with the economics of institutions to explore issues including resilience, sustainability and possible collapse in multi-level complex adaptive systems.

A common thread that runs through each of these research streams is a reliance on the theory of complex adaptive systems that has emerged in the last two decades. These systems are in Mitchell’s terms (Mitchell 2009:13) “systems that exhibit non-trivial emergent and self-organizing behaviors”. Alternatively, she defines them as “system(s) in which large networks of components with no central control and simple rules of operation give rise to complex collective behavior, sophisticated information processing, and adaptation via learning or evolution.” Both definitions express ideas that are central to the evolutionary logic of marketing systems that follows.
While dealing broadly with evolutionary change in human culture and society, each of these four research streams can be narrowed to focus on the formation and growth of the self-organized emergent patterns of trade, known as marketing systems, which are integral to the everyday functioning of human communities. These are systems that self-evidently do exhibit non-trivial emergent and self-organizing behavior, and while sometimes purposeful, usually lack central control, with action outcomes that are always subject to flows of information, and the whims of internal and external innovation and change. As Frederick Hayek might have said, “Marketing systems, and thus markets, are the result of human action but not of human design.”

The theory of marketing system formation and growth outlined here is concerned with how and why these complex social systems have come to play such an important role in human communities. The suggested answer turns on the concept of a social mechanism (Hedstrom 2005), defined as “a constellation of entities and activities that are linked to one another in such a way that they regularly bring about a particular type of outcome” (p11). In this context, the streams of research point to three central social mechanisms combining to bring about the formation and growth of marketing systems. The first works at a micro or individual level, and is concerned with the activities and linkages required for the formation of trust and then cooperation based on a set of shared understandings amongst the otherwise self-interested individuals that form the starting core of participants in a marketing system. This same mechanism then leads to the discovery of specialization, initiating an exchange of ideas and of economic value as the benefits of specialization are better understood, and ultimately for the emergence of networks and social groups that become part of the fabric of a marketing system. The second mechanism works at a meso level, and centers on Darwinian models of the co-evolution of behaviors, ideas and institutional practices, interacting to drive innovation and invention in both technologies and institutions. The third mechanism, working at a macro level, is concerned with the dynamics of system change where marketing systems experience both continuous and discontinuous change, resulting in states ranging from growth to collapse. The interaction of these three mechanisms in the workings of any specific marketing system provides a basis for understanding the formation of a core participant set initiating the actions that characterize the marketing system, the inherent dynamics of the system, the settings and logics that develop for the choices made by system participants, and for the impacts of possible interventions in system outcomes.

The interaction over time in a multi-level community of these three social mechanisms suggests four important, overlapping developmental phases in the formation, growth and adaptation of any marketing system. These four phases are:-

1. **Formation.** If a marketing system is to form the beliefs, norms and values that are part of the institutional setting for a community must be favorable. This is necessary as the first essential step in the emergence or formation of a marketing system is an acceptance of a shared set of cultural and/or specific understandings (forming part of a social contract) amongst the initial participants. These shared understandings establish the trust needed if trade is to occur between the participants, many of whom may be strangers to each other. While some of these shared understandings may be common to most if not all marketing systems found in a community, this is not always the case, as some understandings will be specific to particular marketing systems. An example might be the very different sets of shared understandings often found in the informal and formal sectors of a developing economy. As the set of marketing system participants widens and deepens, the shared understandings needed for economic exchange will also widen and deepen, responding to increased volume and diversity of trade,
to evolutionary shifts in behaviors, ideas and institutions, as well as to external changes in the economic, social, political and natural environments.

(2) **Specialization.** With this set of understandings in place, as individuals discover the benefits of specialization, and the economic logic of division of labor, they generate ever more complex patterns in the exchanges taking place within a community. Where these emergent, self-organized patterns persist and grow over time, they will often take on the structure and functionality of marketing systems, forming in specific cost-effective locations or settings, generating networks of specialized individuals and entities that fill critical roles in managing the necessary flows. Increasing volume and diversity of trade within and between emergent marketing systems, stems from the heterogeneity of capabilities and preferences on the part of both sellers and buyers and from the dynamics of evolutionary change in marketing system structure and functionality. As volume and diversity continue to increase there are yet more opportunities for self-organised, specialised marketing systems to form, leading to the vertical, horizontal and integrative marketing systems, competing or cooperating with each other, that are found in most economies today.

(3) **Evolution.** Changes in structure and functionality are initiated by new ideas, innovations and inventions, tested by exchanges in the core of a marketing system, and diffused when successful, within and between marketing systems; they are also initiated by shifts in social norms, beliefs, and values that lead to new sets of shared understandings, and by the artifacts or material devices that are used by marketing system participants, by the physical infrastructure channeling system flows, and perhaps most of all by the institutional changes that respond to and are found to be successful in prescribing or limiting behaviors in and by marketing system participants. In this way, evolutionary change in marketing systems impacts and is impacted by the immediate and distal institutional settings.

(4) **Limits.** Often, but not always, the growth in volume and diversity that characterizes a marketing system will run into increasing internal and external limitations placed on activities taking place within a marketing system. These might result from the overuse of one or more critical resources, often identified as the “tragedy of the commons”, from increasing network rigidities or instabilities or major environmental shifts or traumas. In the long run, these challenges have to be
met, and evolutionary adaptations occur as marketing systems search for increased resilience in the face of environmental or unexpected turbulence. The cycles of growth, fragmentation, collapse and renewal found in ecological and other social systems are examples of the dynamics that might then arise.

The formation and growth of a marketing system is illustrated in Figure 1, where the basic cyclical pattern of formation, specialization, evolution and limits that generates path dependence, is made more complex and unpredictable by the presence of feedback linkages between evolution and the formation of trust, and between specialization and limits. As the initial marketing system begins to form and grow, Figure 1 highlights the spinoff of embryonic marketing systems that can occur in each and every phase. These processes, repeated often in many different settings, generate the complexity in exchange networks found in many human societies.

Action within each of these four broad developmental phases in a marketing system will influence and be influenced by marketing systems at higher, equal or lower levels of aggregation. This will also occur as marketing systems interface with other broader social systems, such as those centering on politics, values, regulation (formal and informal), health, welfare and environmental concerns. In general, the marketing systems that can be found at all levels in the micro, meso and macro social structures of human communities are, in the end, complex adaptive systems, displaying non-trivial, often unpredictable, emergent and self-organizing behaviors. As such, they are likely to respond in unexpected, often unsatisfying ways to policy and managerial initiatives.

Markets, including those associated with a single commodity set, arise from the interaction of many marketing systems. It is the dynamics of these interacting marketing systems that determines market dynamics. Rather than markets, it is the marketing systems that are present and active in a market that should be central to any assessment of market performance and outcomes.

The development of each of these four phases and the problems arising from internal and external linkages can be seen in an account of the transformation of Longlake freshwater fishing following rural economic reforms in China (Wang 2005). The story illustrates the importance of, and changes in, an overarching social contract; the dynamics of self organization in evolving marketing systems; the unexpected outcomes often arising from path dependency; the changing balance of cooperation and competition in and between marketing systems; the possibility of violence arising from clashes between marketing systems; the need to consider interaction with higher and lower level systems; and the changes in marketing system structure and function that occur as growth challenges a critical resource barrier.

The paper suggests another possible way of looking at some of the issues raised in the call for papers at the Toronto meeting. It emphasizes the importance of the cultural understandings embodied in both general and system specific social contracts in facilitating the emergence of marketing systems, and in particular, those focused on human services; the possibility of conflict, competition and cooperation arising from the actions of marketing systems operating at similar and/or different levels; it argues for the importance of context in considering marketing phenomena; it questions whether it is possible to design and implement desirable change in a marketing system; and explores the interaction of technology and institutional change in the evolution and operation of a marketing system. In each of these important questions, much depends on a specific understanding of markets, and thus marketing systems, as self-organizing, sometimes chaotic, often unpredictable complex adaptive
systems. In a wider context, the evolutionary theory suggested here and the case studies provided by transitional experience in China and other developing states, combine to suggest that marketing systems at all levels resist order, absorb uncertainty, and thrive on randomness. This highlights the importance of thinking through “bottom up” as well as or instead of “top down” initiatives in social and economic reform. Hopefully, Alderson and Cox would approve.

References:


Wednesday June 5, 2013
10:30a-11:30a
Concurrent Session I

**Markets, Ethics and CSR II**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abstract/Papers Included</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| A macro (Bayesian network) analysis of ethical behavior  
Ahmet Ekici, Bilkent University, Turkey  
Sule Onsel-Ekici, Dogus University, Turkey |
A Macro (Bayesian Network) Analysis of Ethical Behavior

Ahmet Ekici, Bilkent University, Ankara, Turkey
Sule Onsel-Ekici, Dogus University, Istanbul, Turkey

Extended Abstract

Macromarketing scholars have long voiced the need for (particularly mezzo and macro-level) empirical investigation of ethical behavior. One of the earlier calls on this issue is made by Murphy and Laczniak (1981). More than ten years later, Laczniak (1993), once again, points out the need for “developing empirical traditions” in business/marketing ethics (p.93). The comprehensive review by Nill and Schibrowsky (2007) also suggests “more research to shed further light” on the ethical frameworks and theories developed over the decades (p. 271). In addition, the authors point out that the existing research has particularly taken a “micro/positive” perspective and macro and normative perspectives of ethics have received little attention. Finally, the authors made a special call for the need for macro level ethics studies by stating “we believe that macro articles provide an integral part in the development of marketing ethics field.” (p. 272)

The micro/macro dichotomy is related to the level of aggregation (Nill and Schibrowsky 2007). Whereas micro level aggregation deals with “individual unites, normally individual organizations (firms) and consumers or households” (Hunt 1976, 20), macro involves a higher level aggregation and focuses on “big, complex, and systemic issues, the interplay of marketing and society, and ultimately, improvements to life quality for large numbers of stakeholders affected by marketing systems (Shultz 2005, 3). As elaborated by Nill and Schibrowsky (2007), the role of ethics in free enterprise, competition, property systems, the interactions between law and ethics can be considered under the “macro” category (p. 259).

Another important observation made by Nill and Schibrowsky (2007) is the preoccupation with “positive ethics” questions. In other words, the authors argue that the “positive” work has dominated the literature and “normative ethics” has been underpresented. The positive/normative dichotomy is mainly “based on whether the focus of the analysis is primarily descriptive or prescriptive” (Hunt 1976, 20). The descriptive ethics involves describing, explaining, understanding, and possibly predicting ethically relevant activities, processes and phenomenon (Nill and Schibrowsky 2007, 259). The normative ethics, on the other hand, takes a rather prescriptive perspective and attempts to prescribe what organizations/individuals ought to do or what kinds of systems a society out to have (Hunt 1976). Based on their content analysis of the fifty eight marketing, management, and business journals, Nill and Schibrowsky (2007) report that a great majority of the articles published in these journals are “positive” in nature. In addition, the authors observe that, since 1985, the positive/normative ratio has been growing and the normative articles have almost vanished (p. 263).

The objective of this paper is to respond to calls made by Murphy and Laczniak (1981), Laczniak (1993), and Nill and Schibrowsky (2007). More specifically, we aim to contribute to the ethics literature by providing a rather macro analysis of the political, legal, and other environmental factors surrounding managers’ ethical decision making. In addition, this paper takes both “positive” and “normative” perspectives and aims to both explain and predict ethical behavior and make recommendations as to
“what kind of a system a society out to have” (Hunt 1976, 20) to have a clean and ethical business environment.

Using the World Economic Forum (WEF) data, collected from 13,000 executives in 148 countries in the world, and through Bayesian Networks (BN) methodology, we demonstrate how various structural (e.g. economic, political, legislative, competitive) factors are in relation to ethical behavior of firms (EBOF). Moreover, the unique design of our study allows us to compare these relationships based on the country classification (stages of development) identified by WEF. This way, we are able to demonstrate how issues related to legal and political environments of business are linked to ethical behaviors of firms operating in countries with different stages of development.

Methodology

The Bayesian Network (BN) methodology was used in this study. Initially, the factors that are related to “Ethical Behavior of Firms” (EBOF) variable were determined by a panel of business ethics experts. The identified variables are: Intellectual property protection (IPP), Irregular payments and bribes (IPAB), Judicial independence (JI), Favoritism in decisions of government officials (FIDOGO), Transparency of government policymaking (TOGP), Strength of auditing and reporting standards (SOARS), Efficacy of corporate boards (EOCP), Strength of investor protection (SOIP). As a second step, a BN is developed through structural learning using the tool WinMine (Heckerman et al., 2000). In the last step, a number of scenario and sensitivity analyses are conducted in order to guide managers and policy makers in their attempts to understand and improve ethical business climate in their countries.

Findings

Overall Model

The overall results (i.e. based on the entire data set coming from 148 countries) suggest that executives around the world generally believe that Ethical Behavior of Firms (EBOF) in the world is generally low. In other words, based on the existing variables and the BN relationships, there is a 62.1% (low: 44.7%+ very low: 17.4%) probability that managers perceive the behavior of other managers all around the globe as relatively ‘low’ in ethics. Furthermore, the managers in the world believe that issues related to bribery, favoritism in government decisions, judicial independence, and intellectual property protection are all problematic (i.e. all receiving “low” probabilities”) aspects of business ethics. The overall model (Figure 1) was used to conduct a series of scenario analyses to demonstrate the changes (improvements) that are needed in the system of business ethics to improve business ethics related perceptions of executives in the world to a “high” level.
Sensitivity Analysis on the Overall Model

The results of the sensitivity analysis (i.e. the identification of the most influential factors) suggest that “Irregular Payments and Bribes (IPAB)” is the leading indicator of that explains the level of EBOF (i.e. the ethical climate) in the world, followed by “Judicial Independence (JI)” and “Intellectual Property Protection (IPP).” More specifically, changes in EBOF are explained by IPAB by about 54%, by JI by about 49 %, and by IPP by about 48%.

Country Group (Cluster) Analysis

The results also suggest that EBOF is explained by the development stage of the particular country (i.e. the “Cluster” variable) by about 23%. Since one of the objectives of this study is to analyze the “business ethics” system based on country/economic groups, we conducted additional analyses for each of three main cluster groups identified by WEF: Stage 1 (Factor Driven), Stage 2 (Efficiency-Driven), and Stage 3 (Innovation-Driven) economies. The results indicate that probability of EBOF perceived by executives as being medium or higher increases as we move from relatively worse economies to better economies. More specifically, while the probability of having a medium or higher (medium, high, and very high) EBOF value is 7% in Stage 1 (less advanced) economies, the same probability becomes 23% (22.2%+0.83%+0%) in Stage 2 economies and 89% in Stage 3 (economically advanced) countries.

Next, we conducted sensitivity analysis for each country group. The results suggest that the main factor that explains the level of EBOF is different in each of the three country groups. Whereas IPP is the leading factor in Stage 1 countries, JI and IPAB are the most influential indicators of EBOF in Stage 2 and Stage 3 countries, respectively.

Conclusion

We believe that our results may offer important insights for macromarketers, policy makers as well as for managers across the world. The overall model suggests that the ethical conduct in the world is currently perceived by executives to be low. Implications of this perception can ranges from not conducting business at all or in certain parts of the world (and therefore reducing the amount and type
of assortment for consumers) to an increase in the cost of business by engaging in illegal business conduct which may create a wishes circle further lowering the level of perceptions of business ethics in the long run. On the brighter side, our analyses point out what needs to be done in the perceptions of managers regarding various political, legal, and other market-related factors to improve their perceptions of business ethics in the world in general and in particular type of economies in which they may be doing business.

The country/cluster analysis suggests that even though perceptions of the “business ethics” system appears to be different in each country group, it is evident that countries that are less tolerant to bribery activities, foster a judicial environment that is free from political and/or private influence, and pay particular attention to the protection of intellectual property are more likely to be perceived to have “cleaner” ethical environment. These findings, along with various “what-if” scenarios may offer managers and policy makers valuable insights.

References


### Quality of Life I

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abstract/Papers Included</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| **High-density housing: Lifestyle and sustainability**  
G. Scott Erickson, Ithaca College, USA |
| **Experiencing vulnerability “everyday”: Food choice**  
Miranda Mirosa, University of Otago, New Zealand  
Ben Wooliscroft, University of Otago, New Zealand |
| **Behaving ethically on holidays: An overview of topics discussed in academic and popular literature**  
Alexandra Ganglmair-Wooliscroft, University of Otago, New Zealand |
High-Density Housing: Lifestyle and Sustainability

G. Scott Erickson, Ithaca College, Ithaca, NY, USA

High-density housing solutions such as ecovillages promise a more sustainable lifestyle but they market themselves as considerably more than that. Ecovillages promise a package of benefits, ecological, community, spiritual, and economic often marketed as a lifestyle. This is very appealing to at least one segment of the population, but can it be extended to others? Does a sustainability commitment require a lifestyle change as well?

This presentation brings together several disparate topics to try to assess the potential of extending the ecovillage high-density housing principle beyond its traditional target segment. Ecovillages typically market themselves not just as more sustainable living options but also as more social communities, more spiritual communities, and places where members are encouraged to keep resources within the immediate or wider local area for economic benefits.

This model is extremely appealing to some parts of the population. But with efforts being undertaken to look at installing the concept on a wider basis, it seems practical to think about the actual offering on a more structured basis. In particular, by taking a marketing approach that considers what we know about target segments, combined with a social marketing approach to gaining desired behavior (move to a high-density housing community) we can better assess what we should study before taking that step.

This presentation looks at ecovillages in general and one in particular, at some literature on segmentation of the population based on attitudes toward climate change, and at some social marketing concepts that can help us better understand the nature of the offering. A conceptual discussion follows addressing the question of whether the current marketing appeal of ecovillages has potential beyond its core target segment. Should the entire lifestyle be marketed or could that be adjusted in order to better appeal to other segments?
Experiencing Vulnerability “Everyday”: Food Choice

Miranda Mirosa, University of Otago, New Zealand
Ben Wooliscroft, University of Otago, New Zealand

Abstract

A focus on exceptional circumstances (e.g. natural disasters) rather than mundane experiences and contexts has dominated much of the (macro) marketing literature on consumer vulnerability. To counter this, we consider the criteria for vulnerability and apply this to the everyday practice of buying food groceries. We argue a cornucopia of internal and external triggers lead to widespread experiences of vulnerably within this consumption context: over-complex nutritional information, hidden food ingredients, misleading and deceptive food labels, missing information (e.g. about products’ origins, production methods and sustainability credentials), confusing pricing structures, false illusions of real choice, unsafe products, cheap unhealthy options (and unaffordable healthy alternatives), and manipulative atmospherics and advertising campaigns. Accepting the argument that many food shoppers are vulnerable to the exploitative forces of the major players of the global neo-liberal food system requires a significant shift away from the dominate myth of ‘consumer as king’ and requires that public policy makers adopt a different duty of care. In this presentation we outline the above argument and implications of this for public policy.
Behaving ethically on holidays: An overview of topics discussed in academic and popular literature

Alexandra Ganglmair-Wooliscroft, University of Otago, New Zealand

Abstract

Ethical tourist behavior is a complex topic including environmental, social and political considerations. Tourists should take into account when going on a holiday. This research represents a first step towards the development of a hierarchy of ethical tourist behavior, investigating aspects of ethical tourist behavior discussed in academic papers and the popular media. Aspects of ethical tourist behavior are categorized into four groups relating to pre-trip behavior and ethical behavior while on holiday, as well as environmental and social aspects of ethical behavior. It is found that environmental aspects relating to ethical behavior during a holiday are investigated most often. The range of ethical tourist behavior spans a broad continuum, from relatively generic terms that are extensions of everyday behavior, to specific aspects of ethical travel that have considerable influence on the basic characteristics of a holiday.

Introduction

Ethical consumption is a topic of considerable interest in the popular media where websites offer advice on how to consume ethically, provide information about the importance and growth of ethical consumption within an economy, or where online versions of popular newspapers dedicate sections to ethical and green living (see for example: [http://www.goodwithmoney.co.uk/ethicalconsumerismreport/](http://www.goodwithmoney.co.uk/ethicalconsumerismreport/), [http://www.ethicalconsumer.org/](http://www.ethicalconsumer.org/), [http://www.guardian.co.uk/environment/ethical-living](http://www.guardian.co.uk/environment/ethical-living)). In the academic literature, one finds a range of headings referring to studies that investigate aspects of ethical consumption including green-consumption (Shaw and Shiu, 2003); voluntary simplicity (Etzioni, 1998; McDonald et al., 2006), mindful consumption (Sheth, Sethia & Srinivas, 2006), virtuous consumers (Chatzidakis et al, 2004) or conscious consumers (Szmigin, Carrigan, & McEachern, 2009). The majority of articles investigates specific areas within ethical consumption like voluntary simplicity (McDonald et al., 2006) or fair trade purchase (Shaw & Shiu, 2003; DePelsmacker, Driesen, & Rayp, 2005), often using a distinctive and self-selected sub-group in the population.

The current project contributes to the small line of research that takes a broad view of ethical consumption behavior as “consumer ethics concerns the issues that arise when ordinary consumers ... acquire, use and dispose of conventional consumer products” (Holbrook, 1994, 569). Being part of a larger study investigating ethical consumption, this paper concentrates on one specific context - consumers’ ethical holiday behavior. Tourism literature, like literature dealing with aspects of ethical consumption in general, is characterized by diverse approaches, a widespread and often inconsistent use of terminology, and a tendency to concentrate on specific (small) segments within the tourism market. In contrast, the current research takes an inclusive approach, viewing ethics as a concept that “should not be confined to an expensive niche market of ego-tourists” (Cleverdon & Kalish 2000, 182),
but researched within the entire population of holiday makers. Constituting a first step towards developing a hierarchy of ethical tourist behavior, this paper provides an overview of topics, fields of interest and specific activities of ethical tourist behavior discussed in the academic and the popular literature.

**Literature Background**

A growing shift from traditional sun, sand and sea holidays towards more experimental holidays, and a general awareness of sustainability issues relating to general consumption in many western countries (Goodwin & Francis, 2003; Miller, 2003), is reflected in an interest in different forms of travel that are discussed under headings like new moral tourists, justice tourists, eco-tourists or sustainable tourists (Rokka & Mosiander, 2009) or ethical tourist (WTO, [http://ethics.unwto.org/en/content/global-code-ethics-tourism](http://ethics.unwto.org/en/content/global-code-ethics-tourism)).

Table 1 provides a snap-shot of research available on Google Scholar and its terminology. As can be seen, eco-tourism (both spellings) and eco-tourists (both spellings) are the most frequently found terms, followed by sustainable tourism/tourist, responsible tourism/tourist, and ethical tourism/tourist. Other terms such as justice tourism or new moral tourism refer to very specific inquiries relating for example to enlightened tourists (Davina, 2008) and tourism initiatives in (former) war torn areas (e.g. Palestine, Bosina) and volunteering respectively.

**Table 1: Snapshot of Terminology used within Eco-, Sustainable-, Ethical- Tourism & Tourist Research**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Industry Related</th>
<th>Google Scholar Hits*</th>
<th>Tourist Related</th>
<th>Google Scholar Hits*</th>
<th>Google Scholar Hits Overall</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ecotourism / eco-tourism</td>
<td>108,400</td>
<td>ecotourist / eco-tourist</td>
<td>5,500</td>
<td>113,900</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>sustainable tourism</td>
<td>61,900</td>
<td>sustainable tourist</td>
<td>1,230</td>
<td>63,130</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>responsible tourism</td>
<td>5,320</td>
<td>responsible tourist</td>
<td>289</td>
<td>5,609</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ethical tourism</td>
<td>739</td>
<td>ethical tourist</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>780</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>environmentally friendly tourism</td>
<td>468</td>
<td>environmentally friendly tourist</td>
<td>77</td>
<td>545</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>justice tourism</td>
<td>208</td>
<td>justice tourist</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>213</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>new moral tourism</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>new moral tourist</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>74</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>177,085</td>
<td></td>
<td>7,166</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* accessed, February, 2013

Looking at Table 1, ethical tourism/tourist and responsible tourism/tourist are the broadest terms of inquiry, with the former being used by the World Tourism Organization who promotes a *Global Code of Ethics for Tourism* that “aims to help maximise the sector’s benefits while minimizing its potentially negative impact on the environment, cultural heritage and societies across the globe” ([http://ethics.unwto.org/en/content/global-code-ethics-tourism](http://ethics.unwto.org/en/content/global-code-ethics-tourism)). While the following review will investigate research relating to the five most frequently found categories, the research project focuses...
on ethical tourist behavior as a broad, inclusive, and well established term, that is – as will be seen in the latter part of this paper – also frequently found in popular media.

As shown in Table 1 studies relating to industry and management issues dominate the research stream. Dolnicar and her colleagues (Dolnicar, Crouch, & Long, 2008; Dolnicar, Laesser & Matus, 2010; Dolnicar & Leisch, 2008), who work in the area of eco-tourists state that existing research mainly focuses on the supply side, including the management of destinations and businesses and investigations of industry regulations. Other studies investigate market segmentations of eco- or green-tourists. While that research focus on tourists, it is characterized as a demand side action taken by management (Bergin-Seers & Mair, 2009; Dolnicar, Laesser & Matus, 2010; Weaver & Lawton, 2007). Our understanding of environmentally friendly tourists is not only limited in the area of eco-tourists, (Dolnicar, Laesser & Matus, 2010) “tourists are under-represented in the study of responsible tourism” (Stanford, 2008, page 260) in general.

However, in recent years knowledge, particularly about eco- or environmentally friendly tourists, has increased. Tourism’s impact on climate change has been investigated for more than three decades (McKercher & Prideaux, 2011) with estimates suggesting that tourism contributes up to 14% of all greenhouse gases, approximately three-quarters through air travel (McKercher, Prideaux, Cheung & Law, 2010). As tourism’s contribution to greenhouses gases is high, governments have set goals aiming to lower the environmental impact of tourists - for example by promoting domestic holidays (e.g. DEFRA, 2008; Miller, et al., 2010) - and encourage research into this subset of ethical tourism behavior (Barr, et al., 2010).

Eco-tourism has been the subject of academic inquiry since the late 1980s, leading to hundreds of articles written on the subject (Weaver, Lawton, 2007). Nature based, or eco-tourism is primarily concerned with the enjoyment and closeness to nature in relative undisturbed settings, and does not necessarily relate to environmentally friendly behavior (Andereck, 2009; Dolnicar, et al., 2010), with research projects including a variety of components in their conceptualization. In a comprehensive literature review, Dolnicar et al (2008) found 17 different factors used to describe eco-tourism, mostly focusing on natural locations but also learning about nature, conservation and the appreciation of nature.

Almost all available studies focus on existing eco-tourists with “virtually no research ... undertaken to identify environmentally friendly tourists among the general population of tourists (Dolnicar, et al., 2008, page 207; see Dolnicar’s research for an exception). Reviews of studies further show that the attitude–behavior gap relating to environmental issues and holiday taking is particularly large (Miller, 2003). Research suggests that only one in 20 people act upon their positive attitudes towards (environmentally) sustainable behavior (Budeanu, 2007). One explanation is that tourists do not appear willing to change their travel behavior to lessen their environmental impact as they do not see a direct impact between their individual behavior and, for example, climate change (McKercher & Prideaux, 2011; Miller, et al., 2010). In this context, macro-concepts like climate change have been described as amorphous term without a clear link between contributors, outcomes and actions (McKercher, et al., 2010). Another explanation for the lack of environmental sustainable behavior exhibited while on holiday has been found with tourists claiming to earn environmental credits during their everyday life – for example by recycling weekly - balancing out their environmental impact while on holiday (Miller, et al., 2010). The perceived loss of comfort and convenience has been found to be a major inhibitor of ethical tourist behavior (Budeanu, 2007).
Other research suggests that there is a spill-over effect between contexts (Barr, et al., 2010) with people who exhibit more environmentally friendly behavior at home, also reporting higher environmentally friendly behavior while on holidays (Dolnicar & Gruen, 2009). Higher levels of environmental awareness have further been linked to increased environmental behavior on holiday (Andercek, 2009). Given the pronounced attitude/awareness – behavior gap, the frequent use of the Theory of Reasoned Action (TORA) or Theory of Planned Behavior (Budeanu, 2007; Miller et al., 2010) to predict environmental behavior is suboptimal, and actual behavioral measures are preferable.

Although sustainability is conceptualized including at least three pillars relating to environmental, economic, and social/cultural aspects (Mitchel, Wooliscroft, & Higham, 2010), much research in tourism reduces sustainability to one component: environmental sustainability. Eco-tourism papers, frequently first discuss the subject of sustainability but subsequently use environmentally friendly behavior as replacement of the former concept (Budeanu, 2007; Dolnicar, et al., 2008; Dolnicar & Leisch, 2008) with Dolnicar & Leisch (2008) suggesting that sustainable tourism refers to supply side investigations (for example interventions by management) while eco-tourism is used to characterize research into tourists driven by natural experiences.

Only a few academic studies investigate topics surrounding social aspects of sustainability, investigating tourist operators’ expectations of tourists’ behavior, particularly during culturally sensitive activities (Stanford, 2008), exploring cultural differences in intentions to benefit the host community (Kang & Moscardo, 2006), or explore how online travel communities deal with tension arising from their enjoyment of travel and its environmental and social impact on a host community (Rokka & Moisander, 2009). While these studies provide some preliminary insight into social sustainability from tourists’ points of view, the limited attention paid to this pillar of sustainability is regrettable.

This paper investigates the range of behavior discussed as, or recommended for ethical tourists by exploring the content of a range of academic papers and internet websites.

Methodology

In order to gain a broad overview of topics discussed, the investigation was started by using a range of search terms in Google Scholar:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Responsible Tourist</th>
<th>Responsible Tourism</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Environmental Tourist</td>
<td>Environmental Tourism</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ethical Tourist</td>
<td>Ethical Tourism</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sustainable Tourist</td>
<td>Sustainable Tourism;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Eco-tourist (Ecotourist)</td>
<td>Eco-Tourism (Ecotourism)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

While a majority of research deals with management and industry issues relating to these topics (see Table 1), the current research is interested in ethical behavior exhibited by tourists and only papers whose title indicated that they investigated tourist/consumption issues were selected for inclusion. Starting with the most frequently cited articles, papers were explored in order to determine what ethical tourist behavior they discussed. A list of topics was composed and the number of times a particular topic...
was found was noted. Similarly to qualitative interviews, saturation of the topic determined the number of selected articles. In total, 24 academic articles were analyzed.

As a second step, the same search terms were used to start a Google Search for general internet pages dealing with ethical tourist behavior. 34 internet pages ranging from government departments and non-profit organizations to travel agencies specializing in ethical holidays and travel blogs were consulted. While the former frequently discussed ethical tourist behavior in broad terms, travel agencies and blogs often provide very detailed suggestions in the form of a check-list for ethical behavior or suggestions for very specific issues.

For both sources, academic papers and internet pages, items were only selected if they had a broad appeal and would apply for various types of holiday – for example items specifically relating to cruises, or detailed aspects of volunteering holidays were not considered, as this research is the first step in developing a hierarchy of ethical tourist behavior applicable to all/most tourists. A list of academic papers and internet websites considered for this research can be obtained from the author.

After consultation of the 24 academic papers and 34 internet websites, 80 items were found, dealing with ethical consumption behavior. Given the variety of sources used, the specificity of items differed widely, requiring some consolidation of items; for example, items like observe human rights, or travelling in small groups were considered too vague for later inclusion in the quantitative analysis of an ethical tourist behavior hierarchy. Different items that related to very similar actions – for example sealing windows and shutting doors - were also summarized.

Results

During the analysis, items were classified into ethical aspects relating to pre-travel considerations or aspects referring to tourist behavior exhibited during the holiday, additionally, items refer to either environmental or social components of ethical tourist behavior. A detailed table of items and frequencies would imply that the research presents results of a all encompassing literature review. However, the aim is to establish the range of topics discussed in the academic and popular media and gain an appreciation of their relative importance. The results of this study will provide a starting point for selecting a finite number of items for a comprehensive hierarchy of ethical tourism behavior. The final results are therefore presented as word clouds (http://worditout.com/) which provide a visualization of the found items per category including an indication of their relative importance.

Ethical Considerations: Pre-trip

Overall, twelve items relate to pre-trip considerations, with nine focusing on the environment and three focusing on the social aspects of travel.

The environmental aspects of pre-trip considerations include the mode of transportation to the holiday destination, the distance to the destination and frequency/length of travel (see Figure 1). These are broad considerations, relating to an individual’s entire holiday or general holiday behavior with major consequences for ones overall environmental holiday impact.

While, compared to environmental behavior during the holiday, pre-trip considerations were considerably less often found, research has shown that the mode of transport to reach the holiday
destination represents on average two-thirds of the environmental impact of a holiday (Dolnicar, et al., 2010) with air travel being particularly harmful to the environment. In a review, McKercher, et al., 2010 find that while flights account for only slightly more than 10% of all tourist movement, they are responsible to almost half of all tourist generated emissions, with long haul travel being particularly challenging. For long distance travel, for example Europe to New Zealand, over 90% of the total environmental impact of a tourist is accounted for by the flight (Dolnicar, et al, 2010).

Figure 1: Environmental Considerations Prior to Holiday

Only three social concerns an ethical tourist should take into account before the holiday were found, mostly on internet websites providing ethical travel check lists. As Figure 2 shows, items relate primarily to accessing information about the culture of the host community and about the political situation at the holiday destination.

Figure 2: Social Considerations Prior to Holiday

Ethical considerations during the holiday

The majority of ethical behavior found in the academic and popular literature relates to the holiday itself with environmental concerns again being more prevalent (31 different aspects) compared
to social considerations (10 aspects). As with pre-trip considerations there is a clear propensity in the academic literature to discuss environmental concerns (also see Table 1 and the discussion in the literature review about the emphasis on eco-tourism), with over 80% of all ethical behavior mentioned relating to that aspect. Social considerations and the impact of travel on the host community was more often found in the popular media, with almost 40% off all ethical considerations relating to social issues and impacts of tourist behavior.

**Figure 3: Environmental Behavior During the Holiday**

Figure 3 visualizes the occurrence of ethical concerns relating to the environment during a holiday. As can be seen, generic activities like protecting the local environment, reading information about the natural environment and saving water or recycling are prevalent. Environmental decisions relating to transportation at the holiday destination represent another commonly discussed area. Using tourist businesses with environmental accreditation or, more generic, environmentally friendly tourism
businesses relates to choices that take into account whether other institutions also behave environmentally ethically.

The last group of ethical activities relates to social issues. As can be seen in Figure 4, spending money in locally owned businesses is by far the most frequently found item, followed by respecting the local culture. More specific socially ethical tourist behavior like learning the local language, bargain fairly or be a respectful photographer were found on websites dedicated to travel in less developed countries, with no mention of any of these specific social behavior in the academic literature.

Figure 4: Ethical Social Behavior During to Holiday

> Figure 4: Ethical Social Behavior During to Holiday

Discussion and Conclusion

This research has set out to gain an understanding of topics discussed under the umbrella ‘ethical tourist behavior’, using academic literature and popular media sources. Comparable with literature on ethical consumer behavior in general, research into ethical tourist behavior is fragmented and frequently focuses on specific aspects of ethical behavior and on small groups within the tourism population. Research in ethical tourist behavior is dominated by a focus on their environmental impact, with for example sustainable tourist being used as a synonym for eco-tourist. The consulted popular media does however emphasis the social impact and important social considerations, especially when check-lists for being an ethical tourist are provided.

Splitting the items investigated as ethical tourist behavior into pre-trip and during the holiday revealed that pre-trip decisions attract considerably less attention – in terms of the variety of ethical decisions/considerations and in terms of the frequency with which they are found. Particularly relating to environmental aspects, pre-trip decisions like frequency of holidays, distance of holiday destination, and mode of transportation to reach the destination determine a major part of the entire environmental impact of the tourist.
As seen in Figures 2 and 4, generic activities conducted during the holiday, like *saving water*, *respecting the environment* or *respecting the local culture* represent the most frequently found items. Tourists might transfer their ethical behavior between different contexts – for example: saving water in everyday life at home and on holiday. While infrequently found terms still apply to a majority of holidays, they often represent either specialized behavior or behavior that requires considerable effort and potentially a loss of convenience – a characteristic that previous research established as preventing ethical behavior on holidays.

As a next step, items will be selected to investigate a possible hierarchy of ethical holiday behavior. The emphasis is on providing a series of items covering all four categories (pre- and during trip, environmental and social aspects), as well as a range of intensity, from very easy, everyday behavior, to behavior that might be seen as inconvenient or to changing basic characteristics of holidays, and is therefore harder to exhibit. Preliminary results of the hierarchy for ethical tourist behavior will be presented at the conference.

**References**


Wednesday June 5, 2013
11:30a-12:30p
Concurrent Session I

Servants, Servitude and the Philosophy of Service

Abstract/Papers Included

A Re-examination of value co-creation in the age of interactive service robots: a service dominant logic perspective
Willy Barnett, University of Manchester, UK
Adrienne Foos, University of Manchester, UK
Thorsten Gruber, Loughborough University, UK
Debbie Keeling, Loughborough University, UK
Kathleen Keeling, University of Manchester, UK
Linda Nasr, University of Manchester, UK

Servicing the body: Power, service systems and consumer wellbeing
Anna Fyrberg Stockholm University, Sweden
Carl Yngfalk, Stockholm University, Sweden
A Re-Examination of Value Co-Creation in the Age of Interactive Service Robots:
A Service Logic Perspective

Willy Barnett, University of Manchester, UK
Adrienne Foos, University of Manchester, UK
Thorsten Gruber, Loughborough University, UK
Debbie Keeling, Loughborough University, UK
Kathleen Keeling, University of Manchester, UK
Linda Nasr, University of Manchester, UK

With robots increasingly considered as viable service agents, marketers must explore the nature of value co-creation during service interactions and the consequences for the wider nature of relationships between service providers and customers. This study investigates the nature of the direct interaction between humans and robots and the implications for value co-creation. The use of the Zaltman Metaphor Elicitation Technique will draw out the meanings consumers associate with human-to-robot service encounters. The study aims to reveal the underlying structures that influence user opinions of robot roles and value-in-use, and so inform the debate on social implications of robot service. Such insights will create awareness for the changing nature of service encounters and help marketers promote positive interactions.
Servicing the Body: Power, Service Systems and Consumer Wellbeing

Anna Fyrberg Yngfalk, Stockholm University School of Business
Carl Yngfalk, Stockholm University School of Business

Abstract

Service systems infuse contemporary Western society. Service research has looked upon service systems as managerial technologies in which consumers and organizations, with their accumulated skills and knowledge, as well as other internal and external systems, interact to co-create value and wellbeing (Spohrer et al. 2007, Vargo et al. 2008, Maglio and Spohrer 2008). Following the historic trajectory of service marketing and management theory over the last decades (cf. Skålén et al. 2008, Fougère and Skålén 2012), scholars have gone from advocating an strong objectivist and positivist ontology, in which organizations provide value to consumers (e.g. Grönroos 1994, Parasuraman et al. 1994), to acknowledging a phenomenologically oriented perspective inspired by consumer research, in which value seen as wellbeing is understood primarily as experientially determined by the consumer (e.g. Vargo and Lusch 2008, Peñaloza and Venkatesh 2006, McColl-Kennedy et al. 2012). Accordingly, wellbeing is largely theorized in individualistic terms as a human condition and subjective perception of quality of life (Ganglmair-Wooliscroft and Lawson 2011) and which involves, for instance, health, happiness, emotions and agency (Mick et al. 2011, Ostrom et al. 2010).

Recently, a broader discussion has emerged on how service systems constitute wellbeing which is seen as an outcome of service interactions yet determined by the individual through his or her engagement in service (Anderson et al. 2012, Ostrom et al. 2010, Rosenbaum et al. 2007). Consequently, service systems can uplift but may also constrain value creation and, thus, wellbeing through their structuring effects on consumer engagement (ibid.). But despite these developments in service research drawing attention to issues of power, and although it has been acknowledged that wellbeing involves embodiment and materiality, e.g. health and emotional dimensions (e.g. Mick et al. 2011), there is a dearth of theory on the bodily aspects of how power is practiced in service. Investigating such important matters has important implications to our understanding of wellbeing as an outcome of service and it draws attention to issues of power (Zwick et al. 2008): the macro-social, political and material effects of service systems on society (Dholakia 2012).

Therefore, this study investigates how value co-creation processes within a service system seek to construct and manage people as healthy consumers. More specifically, it does so through a discourse analysis of an online weight loss community and peoples’ struggle with loosing weight. Drawing on the late Foucault’s notion of bio-power and his concept of governmentality (Foucault 1979, Dreyfus and Rabinow 1983), we theorize how power operates within contemporary service systems and problematize how consumers but also service employees engage in service by making painful and fierce investments in their bodies in the search for a healthier lifestyle and body for the common good.
References


Grönroos, C. 1994. 'From marketing mix to relationship marketing: towards a paradigm shift in marketing.' Management Decision, 32:2, 4-20.


Peñaloza, L. & Venkatesh, A. 2006. 'Further evolving the new dominant logic of marketing: from services to the social construction of markets.' Marketing Theory, 6:3, 299-316.


### Quality of Life II

**Abstract/Papers Included**

**Shopping ill-being, its measurement and relation to shopping well-being and overall life satisfaction**  
Ahmet Ekici, Bilkent University, Turkey  
M. Joseph Sirgy, Virginia Polytechnic Institute and State University, USA  
Dong-Jin Lee, Yonsei University, South Korea

**The impact of consumption deprivation and materialism on perceived quality of life**  
Dwight Merunka, Cergam, IAE Aix en Provence & Euromed School of Management, France  
Boris Bartikowski, Euromed School of Management, France  
M. Joseph Sirgy, Virginia Polytechnic Institute and State University, USA

**Validating a customer well-being index related to natural wildlife tourism**  
Stefan Kruger, North-West University, South Africa  
Dong-Jin Lee, Yonsei University, South Korea  
Mee-Jin Whang, Yonsei University, South Korea  
Muzaffer Uysal, Virginia Polytechnic Institute and State University, USA  
M. Joseph Sirgy, Virginia Polytechnic Institute and State University, USA
Shopping Ill-Being, its Measurement and Relation to Shopping Well-Being and Overall Life Satisfaction

Ahmet Ekici, Bilkent University
M. Joseph Sirgy, Virginia Tech
Dong-Jin Lee, Yonsei University

Background

Shopping Well-Being (SHWB), defined as the belief that shopping contributes to the overall quality of life of oneself and one’s family producing an overall sense of well-being, is an important construct for macromarketers, as well as for (micro) marketers (e.g. the retailers) and public policy makers. Studies in SHWB can have important implications in demonstrating the impact of individual level economic activities on collective/societal level satisfaction/well-being. For example, a recent study (Authors, 2012) finds that shopping well-being does indeed contribute to life satisfaction for certain people (those who are self-expressive in shopping) and under certain conditions (when shopping leads to money savings).

The literature related to this topic point to both positive and negative contributions of shopping activities on consumers’ overall sense of well-being (i.e., subjective well-being). While some researchers argue that shopping satisfy fundamental human needs such as autonomy, competence, and relating to others (e.g., Tauber 1972), generate hedonic shopping enjoyment (e.g., Beatty and Ferrel 1998; Bellenger and Korgaonkar 1980), induce the experience of fun (e.g., Arnold and Reynolds 2001; Guiry, Magi, and Lutz 2006; Hirschman 1984), allow shoppers to experience excitement and delight (e.g., Oliver, Rust, and Varki 1997; Wakefield and Baker 1998), others point to the “dark-side.” of shopping. For example, shopping can lead to compulsive shopping that wreck havoc and adversely affect consumers’ quality of life (e.g., Hosch and Loewenstein 1991; Hirschman 1992; Kwak, Zinkhan, and Crask 2003; Kwak, Zinkhan, and Dominick 2002; Mowen and Spears 1999; Natatajaan and Goff 1992; O’Guinn and Faber 1989; Rindfleisch, Burroughs, and Denton 1997; Roberts, Manolis, and Tanner 2003; Roberts and Tanner 2005). Shopping can also produce other adverse consequences. For example, researchers have pointed out the negative impact of shopping when consumers perceive shopping as work and a “necessary evil” (e.g., Babin, Darden, and Griffin 1994; Campbell 1997; Fischer and Arnold 1990; Sherry, McGrath, and Levy 1993).

Focusing on the dark side of shopping, it is possible to imagine situations where an individual’s shopping activities result in a decrease in one’s overall life satisfaction, particularly when the individual spends too much time, energy, and money on shopping activities at the expense of other life domains. For example, family well-being is likely to be adversely affected when the consumer exhausts his/her resources on shopping activities. The consumer is likely to experience conflict with family members because he or she has spent much more money than the family can afford. Also, family members may express disappointment and complain about the fact that the consumer is exhausting his/her resources in shopping at the expense of, say, spending time with family and friends. Such role conflict is likely to affect family well-being, social well-being, leisure well-being, as well as financial well-being, which all together may adversely impact the consumer’s overall sense of well-being (i.e., subjective well-being).
Objectives

This study introduces a new construct that focuses on the “dark side” of shopping, namely Shopping Ill-Being (SHIB). We define SHIB as the extent to which the resources (time, energy, and money) an individual invests in shopping at the expense of other life domains result in negative feelings (complaints) among family members, relatives/friends, and/or the people at work. As such, we have two research objectives: (1) To construct and validate a measure of Shopping Ill-Being, and (2) To demonstrate its moderating effect on the relationship between shopping well-being and overall sense of well-being (i.e., overall life satisfaction). Testing this moderation effect should provide evidence of the nomological validity of the SHIB construct.

Measurement of SHIB: Dimensions and Measurement Items

We propose that Shopping Ill-Being (SHIB) may occur when resources (time, energy, and money) an individual use in shopping activities interfere with the resources he/she needs to use in family life, work life, social life, leisure life, and financial life. Thus, the SHIB construct involves 15 unique dimensions (Table 1).

Table 1: Dimensions of the Shopping Ill-Being (SHIB) Construct

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Resource\Life Domain</th>
<th>Family Life</th>
<th>Work Life</th>
<th>Social Life</th>
<th>Leisure Life</th>
<th>Financial Life</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Time</td>
<td>Time-based shopping interference with family life</td>
<td>Time-based shopping interference with work life</td>
<td>Time-based shopping interference with social life</td>
<td>Time-based shopping interference with leisure life</td>
<td>Time-based shopping interference with financial life</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Energy</td>
<td>Energy-based shopping interference with family life</td>
<td>Energy-based shopping interference with work life</td>
<td>Energy-based shopping interference with social life</td>
<td>Energy-based shopping interference with leisure life</td>
<td>Energy-based shopping interference with financial life</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Money</td>
<td>Money-based shopping interference with family life</td>
<td>Money-based shopping interference with work life</td>
<td>Money-based shopping interference with social life</td>
<td>Money-based shopping interference with leisure life</td>
<td>Money-based shopping interference with financial life</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The Research Hypothesis

Research in other contexts suggests the extent to which people can effectively balance their lives is positively associated with the overall sense of well-being (i.e., subjective well-being)—that is, the less the role conflict between the various life domains (e.g. work life, family life, leisure life, and financial life) the greater the overall sense of well-being (e.g., Ayree, Fields, and Luke 1999; Carlson, Kacmar, and Williams 2000; Frone, Russell, and Cooper 1992). When people experience difficulty balancing the role
demand stemming from various life domains, they are likely to experience low quality of life. For example, in the context of “work-family balance,” Greenhaus, Collins, and Shaw (2003) report that when individuals invest substantial time in their combined work and family roles, they are likely to experience a higher quality of life than those who spend more time in work life at the expense of family life.

Similarly, we hypothesize that:

When an individual spends too many resources (time, energy, and money) on shopping activities at the expense of other life domains (family, work, social, leisure, and financial), shopping well-being is likely to contribute negatively to overall sense of well-being (i.e., subjective well-being). Conversely, when an individual spends his/her resources (time, energy, and money) in shopping activities in such a way that do not conflict with the aforementioned life domains, shopping well-being is likely to contribute positively to subjective well-being. (Figure 1). In other words, we hypothesize an interaction effect between shopping well-being and shopping ill-being. Shopping well-being is likely to contribute to subjective well-being under conditions of low than high shopping ill-being.

![Diagram](image.png)

**Figure 1:** Moderating Effect of SHIB on the relationship between SHWB and SWB

**Method**

**Sample and Data Collection**

A dyadic method is used in this study. In other words, each survey questionnaire will be completed by two participants: the subject and an informant. The informant will be provided with a similar version of the questionnaire with the exception that he or she will be required to respond to questions about the assigned subject. Initial data collection will be carried out in the context of a developing country, Turkey, where the exponential growth of shopping malls and proliferation of consumption goods and services would arguably result in both positive and negative consequences for consumer well-being. More specifically, college students in a metropolitan city of Turkey will be asked to participate in the study in return for academic extra credit. The study participants (students) will be asked to recruit a family member who does most of the shopping for the family to participate in the study. The student will play the role of the informant, whereas the family member will play the role of the focal subject. The data collection will take place in the Spring 2013 and the results will be ready to be presented by the time of the conference.
Measures

The informant and focal subject questionnaires include five sections. Section I includes one item for the 15 unique dimensions of SHIB depicted in Table 1. Sections II and III include items representing shopping well-being and overall life satisfaction. Existing consumption happiness scales (Nicolao et al. 2009; Van Boven and Gilovich 2003) were used to develop the shopping well-being items. Similarly, items from the Satisfaction with Life Scale (Pavot and Diener 2008) were modified to measure overall life satisfaction. In addition to the measures pertaining to the central constructs of the study, Sections IV and V include a host of measures that represent covariates (or control variables). Examples of control variables include the sense of well-being in other life domains (e.g., satisfaction with work life, satisfaction with family life, satisfaction with financial life, satisfaction with social life, satisfaction with leisure life, satisfaction with residential life, etc.) and a host of other demographic variables (e.g., household income, marital status, education, gender, employment status, etc.).

Validation and Findings

As noted, the data collection activates will be carried out in the Spring 2013 to establish the construct (content, convergent, and discriminant) validity of the SHIB measures, and to test the nomological validity of the Model depicted in Figure 1. In other words, the hypothesis that will be tested is that subjective well-being (SWB) can be predicted by SHWB as moderated by SHIB, while controlling for a host of control variables (e.g., satisfaction with work life, satisfaction with financial life, satisfaction with social life, etc.).

References


The Impact of Consumption Deprivation and Materialism on Perceived Quality of Life

Dwight Merunka, Cergam, IAE Aix en Provence & Euromed School of Management, France
Boris Bartikowski, Euromed School of Management, France
M. Joseph Sirgy, Virginia Polytechnic Institute & State University, USA

Extended Abstract

Previous research on materialism and perceived quality of life (e.g., life satisfaction) shows a negative correlation (see Larsen, Sirgy, and Wright, 1999, for a review of this literature). This negative effect was explained through the mediation of satisfaction with material life (Sirgy et al., 2012). Specifically, it was demonstrated that materialism heightens material expectations to the point where materialistic individuals perceive their material wealth and possessions to fall short of their expectations causing dissatisfaction with material life. Dissatisfaction with material life, in turn, leads to dissatisfaction with life overall. We believe that materialism plays another major role in perceived quality of life through consumption deprivation—the focus of this study.

To address this issue, we developed a model that reflects the notion that consumption deprivation plays an important role in life satisfaction. Specifically, consumption deprivation influences life satisfaction directly and indirectly. The direct effect is essentially negative in that increased consumption deprivation leads to decreased life satisfaction. With respect to the indirect effect, the model posits that the negative effect of consumption deprivation is mediated by satisfaction in various life domains (satisfaction with material life, social life, leisure life, family life, and health life). Domain satisfaction, in turn, contributes positively to life satisfaction. The model also posits that materialism plays a moderating role in both the direct and indirect effects of consumption deprivation on life satisfaction. Specifically, materialism is likely to magnify the negative effects of consumption deprivation on domain satisfaction and life satisfaction. That is, the negative effects of consumption deprivation are likely to be stronger under high than low materialism conditions. The model is shown in Figure 1.

Survey data has been collected from a representative national sample of the French population (N = 800). All survey measures were adapted from published sources and are shown in the Appendix. Consumption deprivation was defined and measured in terms of unavailability to buy or spend money for basic, leisure and status goods. All measures show a high degree of reliability.

We used product composite scores to estimate the conceptual model (Figure 1) using an OLS regression-based approach (Hayes, 2012). Mean-centered interaction terms were created to account for the postulated interaction between Consumption Deprivation and Materialism. This interaction term is used to test the postulated moderation effect of Materialism. Because the research literature in quality of life suggests an income effect on many of the model’s constructs, we used household income as a control variable in the statistical analyses.
With respect to the direct effect of Consumption Deprivation on Life Satisfaction, the results show a significant negative effect ($b = -.22$, $p < .01$) controlling for the effects of all other constructs in the model (Satisfaction w/Material Life, Satisfaction w/Health Life, Satisfaction w/Leisure Life, Satisfaction w/Social Life, Satisfaction w/Family Life, Materialism) as well as Income. This result supports our hypothesis. However, the interaction between Consumption Deprivation and Materialism was not significant ($b = .016$, $p > .10$) failing to provide support to the hypothesis that Materialism moderates the effect of Consumption Deprivation on Life Satisfaction by magnifying the effect.

With respect to the indirect effects of Consumption Deprivation on Life Satisfaction, the results show a significant negative effect of Consumption Deprivation on Satisfaction with Material Life ($b = -.156$, $p < .01$) controlling for the effects of Materialism, Income, and the interaction between Materialism and Consumption Deprivation. This result supports our hypothesis. Also, as hypothesized the interaction between Consumption Deprivation and Materialism on Satisfaction with Material Life was significant ($b = -.193$, $p < .01$). The interaction plot shows that the negative effect of Consumption Deprivation on Satisfaction with Material Life is stronger under high than low Materialism conditions.

The results also show a significant negative effect of Consumption Deprivation on Satisfaction with Health Life ($b = -.131$, $p < .01$) controlling for the effects of Materialism, Income, and the interaction between Materialism and Consumption Deprivation. This result supports our prediction. However, contrary to prediction, the interaction between Consumption Deprivation and Materialism on Satisfaction with Health Life was not significant ($b = -.06$, $p > .10$).

Furthermore, the results show a significant negative effect of Consumption Deprivation on Satisfaction with Family Life ($b = -.092$, $p < .05$) controlling for the effects of Materialism, Income, and
the interaction between Materialism and Consumption Deprivation. This result supports the model’s hypothesis. However, contrary to our expectations, the interaction between Consumption Deprivation and Materialism on Satisfaction with Family Life was not significant (b = -.107, p > .10).

Additionally, the results show a non-significant effect of Consumption Deprivation on Satisfaction with Social Life (b = -.02, p > .10) controlling for the effects of Materialism, Income, and the interaction between Materialism and Consumption Deprivation. This result does not support the model’s hypothesis. Also and contrary to our expectations, the interaction between Consumption Deprivation and Materialism on Satisfaction with Social Life was not significant (b = -.08, p > .10). Again, this result does not support the model’s hypothesis.

Finally, the results show a significant negative effect of Consumption Deprivation on Satisfaction with Leisure Life (b = -.135, p < .01) controlling for the effects of Materialism, Income, and the interaction between Materialism and Consumption Deprivation. This result does support the model’s hypothesis. Also and contrary to our expectations, the interaction between Consumption Deprivation and Materialism on Satisfaction with Leisure Life was not significant (b = -.127, p > .10). Again, this result does not support the model’s hypothesis.

In sum, the survey data provide some support to the notion that consumption deprivation does indeed affect life satisfaction in negative ways. It does so directly and indirectly through the mediation effects of domain satisfaction—the greater the deprivation the lower the satisfaction with life overall and with various life domains such as material life, health life, leisure life, and family life. The data also provided some evidence that materialism does indeed play a moderating role—magnifies the negative effect on life and domain satisfaction. However, this moderation effect seems to be limited to material life only. In other words, materialism serves to strengthen the negative effect of consumption deprivation on satisfaction with material life under high rather than low materialism conditions. Future research should test the robustness of this relationship.

References


### Appendix

#### Constructs and Measures

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Constructs and Measures</th>
<th>Adapted from</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Consumption Deprivation</strong></td>
<td>Ahuvia (1995)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>It is more difficult for me to buy basic goods</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>than for typical families.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I am frequently concerned about having</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>enough money to buy basic goods.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I am frequently not able to buy the basic</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>goods I want because I cannot afford them.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>It is more difficult for me to buy leisure</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>goods than for typical families.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I am frequently concerned about having</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>enough money to buy leisure goods.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I am frequently not able to buy the leisure</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>goods I want because I cannot afford them.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>It is more difficult for me to buy status</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>goods than for typical families.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I am frequently concerned about having</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>enough money to buy status goods.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I am frequently not able to buy the status</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>goods I want because I cannot afford them.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I admire people who own expensive homes, cars,</td>
<td>Richins &amp; Dawson (1992); Richins</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>and clothes.</td>
<td>(2004)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The things I own say a lot about how well I'm</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>doing in life.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I like to own things that impress people.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I try to keep my life simple, as far as</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>possessions are concerned (R).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Buying things gives me a lot of pleasure.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I don't like a lot of luxury in my life.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>My life would be better if I owned certain</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>things I don’t have.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I’d be happier if I could afford to buy more</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>things.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>It sometimes bothers me quite a bit that I can’t</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>afford to buy all the things I’d like.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I am satisfied with the things I own</td>
<td>Ogden and Venkat (2001); Sirgy et al</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I am happy with the things I own</td>
<td>(2012)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I feel frustrated about the things I own (reversed)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I feel fulfilled with the things I own</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I feel pleased with the things I own</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Life Satisfaction</strong></td>
<td>Diener et al. (1985)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In most ways my life is close to my ideal.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The conditions of my life are excellent.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I am satisfied with life.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>So far I have gotten the important things I</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>want in life.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>If I could live my life over, I would change</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>almost nothing.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Satisfaction in Other Life Domains</strong></td>
<td>Lester (1990)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Satisfaction w/Health Life</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I am striving to maintain and improve my</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>physical self</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I am striving to stay in good physical</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>condition</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I am able to effectively manage my physical</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>health</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Satisfaction w/Family Life</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I get along well with my family</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I accept the types of relationships I have</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>with my family</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
I watch my family grow and evolve

Satisfaction w/Social Life
- I have an impact on my friends and acquaintances
- I have an established network of friends and acquaintances
- I share goals and plans with my friends and acquaintances

Satisfaction w/Leisure Life
- I am able to manage my leisure opportunities
- I feel personally fulfilled by my leisure activities
- I draw satisfaction from my leisure activities
Validating a Customer Well-Being Index Related to Natural Wildlife Tourism

Stefan Kruger, North-West University, South Africa  
Dong-Jin Lee, Yonsei University, South Korea  
Mee-Jin Whang, Yonsei University, South Korea  
Muzaffer Uysal, Virginia Polytechnic Institute and State University, USA  
M. Joseph Sirgy, Virginia Polytechnic Institute and State University, USA

Abstract

This study reports an attempt to validate a customer well-being index related to natural wildlife tourism. The index reflects eight well-being dimensions related to customer need satisfaction in visiting a natural wildlife park. These are: (1) need for novelty seeking, (2) need for relaxation, (3) need for exploration, (4) need to socialize, (5) need to teach and impart knowledge to children, (6) need to gain new knowledge, (7) need to document memorable things and events, and (8) need to experience spirituality. It was hypothesized that the customer well-being index is more predictive of customer loyalty, perceived value, and other behavior-type outcomes (such as length of stay, number of visits, and total money expenditures at the park) than a traditional customer satisfaction index (a formative measure composed of customer satisfaction with a variety of amenities and facilities at the park). These hypotheses were tested using four waves of surveys of customers intercepted at the park in a two-year period. The survey data provided support for the hypotheses, which in turn lend validational support to the customer well-being index. Managerial implications of the customer well-being index are also discussed.

Introduction and Conceptual Development

National parks and natural areas as destinations are important tourism and recreational resources and serve as part of the cluster of attractions that people enjoy visiting and spending their leisure time. These places also have economic significance and appreciative consumption importance. Throughout the world, designated places as parks, parkways, natural wildlife sanctuaries, and wilderness areas are frequented by people to engage in appreciate and aesthetic recreational consumption. Such consumption may enhance the quality of vacation experience, induce happiness, and contribute to consumer well-being. Moreover, national parks and natural areas offer visitors with scenic, historical, cultural, and archaeological and scientific value and satisfy a wide range of development needs grounded in motivation of both intrinsic and extrinsic dimensions. Experiences in natural settings are likely to appeal more to our higher-order need satisfaction, implying that such experiences are likely to contribute to one’s well-being and that measuring customer well-being may be more predictive of consumer behavior outcomes than customer satisfaction. Thus, the present study posits that a measure of customer well-being in a natural wildlife park is likely to be more predictive than satisfaction in a range of consumer behavior outcomes: customer perceived value, customer loyalty, length of stay, number of visits and amount of money spent at the park.

The customer well-being index employed in this study on natural wildlife tourism is based on need hierarchy theory (Maslow 1954, 1970). The central tenet of the theory is that human development
needs encompass a wide range of needs grouped in terms of two major categories, namely high-order and lower-order needs. Higher-order needs include the need for self-actualization, esteem, knowledge, and beauty or aesthetics. Lower-order needs include physiological, economic, and social. The basic postulate of the need satisfaction model of customer well-being is that consumer goods and services that serve to meet the full spectrum of human development needs should be rated highly in terms of consumer well-being than goods and services that satisfy only a small subset of needs (Sirgy et al., 2010).

This theoretical perspective was used by Sirgy, Lee, and Kressman (2005) in developing a customer well-being measure specifically for personal transportation. They conducted a set of three studies that validated the well-being measure. The measure is based on the theoretical notion that the welfare of consumers of personal transportation vehicles is enhanced when the consumption of the vehicle meet the full spectrum of human developmental needs (i.e., safety, economic, family, social, esteem, actualization, knowledge, and aesthetics needs). In this study we report on a measure of customer well-being in relation to natural wildlife tourism. The measure is conceptualized as the extent to which visiting a natural wildlife park satisfy a wide range of human development needs a la Maslow. The customer well-being index refers to need satisfaction related to four lower-order (basic) and four higher-order need satisfaction dimensions.

The lower-order need satisfaction dimensions are: (1) need to document memorable things and events (“To photograph animals and plants”; “To see the Big 5”), (2) need for relaxation (“To relax”), (3) need to socialize (“To spend time with my friends”), and (4) need to teach and impart knowledge to children (“For the benefit of my children”). The four higher-order need dimensions are: (1) need for novelty seeking (“To get away from my routine”), (2) need for exploration (“To explore a new destination”), (3) need to gain new knowledge (“To learn things, increase my knowledge”), and (4) need to experience spirituality (“It is a spiritual experience”).

We hypothesize that our measure of customer well-being (CWB) in relation to a natural wildlife park is likely to be more predictive (than customer satisfaction with the park’s amenities and facilities or SAT) of a range of consumer behavior outcomes: customer perceived value, customer loyalty, length of stay, number of visits, and amount of money spent at the park. See the model in Figure 1. The hypotheses are as follows:

H1: CWB has a stronger positive effect on perceived value than SAT has.
H2: CWB has a stronger positive effect on customer loyalty than SAT has.
H3: CWB has a positive effect on outcome variables through the through the mediation effect of perceived value. SAT does not have a significant effect on outcome variables through the mediation effect of customer value.
H3a: CWB has a positive effect on length of stay through the through the mediation effect of perceived value. SAT does not have a significant effect on length of stay through the mediation effect of perceived value.
H3b: CWB has a positive effect on number of visits through the through the mediation effect of perceived value. SAT does not have a significant effect on number of visits through the mediation effect of perceived value.
H3c: CWB has a positive effect on total spending expenses through the through the mediation effect of perceived value. SAT does not have a significant effect on total spending expenses through the mediation effect of perceived value.
H4: CWB has a positive effect on outcome variables through the mediating effect of customer loyalty. SAT does not have a significant effect on outcome variables through the mediation effect of customer value.
H4a: CWB has a positive effect on length of stay through the mediating effect of customer loyalty. SAT does not have a significant effect on length of stay through the mediation effect of customer loyalty.
H4b: CWB has a positive effect on number of visits through the mediating effect of customer loyalty. SAT does not have a significant effect on number of visits through the mediation effect of customer loyalty.
H4c: CWB has a positive effect on total spending expenses through the mediating effect of customer loyalty. SAT does not have a significant effect on total spending expenses through the mediation effect of customer loyalty.

Method

The conceptual model in Figure 1 was tested using data collected from a series of surveys conducted among overnight visitors at the Kruger National Park (KNP). We conducted surveys at the various camp sites of the KNP in the Northern (Shingwedzi, Olibants, and Letaba) and the Southern (Berg en Dal, Skukuza, Satara, Onder Sabie, and Punda Maria) regions of the park. The data we used in the analysis were gathered through consumer surveys over a period of two years. A total of four surveys were conducted with an interval of six months counted the visitors of national park. Sample sizes ranged from 392 to 463 respondents with the total sample size of 1,727. As the main focus of this study is to test the model across the group of respondents, we pooled the sample for further analyses. The title of the survey was "Kruger National Park (KNP) Overnight Visitor Survey." The questionnaire was used to survey overnight visitors to the KNP remained similar throughout the three years of data collection and consisted of three sections. Section A captured demographic details from each respondent (home language, education, marital status, and age) as well as spending behavior (length of stay and total expense), while sections B and C focused on the measures pertaining to customer well-being in tourism (CWB), customer satisfaction (SAT), customer loyalty, perceived value, and their consumer behavior at the park (length of stay, number of visits, and total expenditures at the park). Customer well being (CWB) was measured with 21 items (e.g., “To get away from my routine,” “To relax,” and “To explore”).
And the respondents were asked to rate how important they considered each item on the scale (1=“not at all important”, and 5=“Extremely important”). The reliability coefficients (Cronbach’s Alpha) for CWB measured across four samples were 0.887, 0.887, 0.650, and 0.762, respectively. These results show that CWB measure is reliable. The composite CWB score was computed by averaging the score of 28 items.

Customer satisfaction (SAT) was measured with 17 to 62 items (e.g., “Restaurants”, “Shops”, and “facilities”) on a five-point Likert scale. The respondents were asked to rate their level of each item’s satisfaction with their travel experience (1=“very poor”, 5=“excellent”). The reliability coefficients (Cronbach’s Alpha) for the SAT measure across four samples were 0.954, 0.954, 0.860, and 0.869, respectively. These are shown that SAT measurements are highly reliable. The composite SAT score was computed by averaging all item scores.

Customer loyalty was measured with the self-stated retention (e.g., “I am loyal to the park”) on a five-point Likert scale. Perceived value was measured by the item “value for money” on a five-point Likert scale. In both questions, the respondents were asked how important were the items on the scale (1=“not at all important”, and 5=“Extremely important”).

Length of stay was measured through a single-item scale, and the question was how many nights did they stay overnighting at the park. The number of visits was also measured with the single-item scale, how many nights did they visit the National Park over the past three years. Both questions were based on open ended questions. Total expenses were measured with 10 items (e.g., "Entrance and conservation fee", "Accommodation", and "Restaurants") as the respondents were asked to indicate in each category how much was their expenses during the visit to the park.

Results

In order to test the model as a whole, we pooled data collected over two year period. The results of regression analyses are organized and reported by hypothesis.

The Differential Effects of CWB versus SAT on Customer Perceived Value (H1)

We hypothesized that CWB is more strongly predictive of customer perceived value than SAT. The results indicate that CWB has a positive effect on perceived value within all four samples (beta=0.480, t=11.181, p < 0.01 for sample 1; beta=0.480, t=11.181, p < 0.01 for sample 2; beta=0.375, t=8.443, p < 0.001 for sample 3; beta=0.464, t=10.100, p < 0.001 for sample 4). Using the pooled sample, we also found that CWB does indeed have a positive influence on perceived value (beta=0.288, t=6.459, p < 0.01). These results initial support for H1. We also expect SAT to have a positive effect on perceived value. The results indicate that SAT has a positive effect on perceived value for overnight travelers in all four samples (beta=0.184, t=3.762, p < 0.01 for sample 1; beta=0.184, t=3.762, p < 0.01 for sample 2; beta=0.218, t=4.640, p < 0.01 for sample 3; beta=0.234, t=4.647, p < 0.01 for sample 4). The results from the pooled sample also indicate that SAT has a positive influence on perceived value (beta=0.193, t=4.219, p < 0.01). When we compare the predictive strength of CWB versus SAT in relation to customer perceived value we see clearly that CWB is a much stronger predictor than SAT. In order to formally test the relative efficacy of CWB vs. SAT on perceived value, slope difference test were conducted. The results indicate that CWB is a significantly strong predictor of perceived value (t=3.303 p< 0.05 for
The Differential Effects of CWB versus SAT on Customer Loyalty (H2)

We hypothesized that CWB is more strongly predictive of customer loyalty than SAT. With respect to the differential effects of CWB versus SAT on customer loyalty (H2), the results also indicate that CWB has a positive influence on customer loyalty to the national park for all four samples (β=0.487, t=11.379, p < 0.01 for sample 1; β=0.487, t=11.379, p < 0.01 for sample 2; β=0.430, t=9.946, p < 0.01 for sample 3; β=0.536, t=12.250, p < 0.01 for sample 4, respectively). For the pooled sample, the result also indicates that CWB does indeed have a positive influence on customer loyalty (β=0.430, t=10.204, p < 0.01). Also, the results indicate that SAT did not have a positive effect on customer loyalty for all samples (β=0.036, t=0.722, p > 0.05 for sample 1; β=0.036, t=0.722, p > 0.05 for sample 2; β=0.087, t=1.803, p > 0.05 for sample 3; β=0.091, t=1.748, p > 0.05 for sample 4). The result from the pooled sample also indicates that SAT did not have a positive effect on customer loyalty (β=0.053, t=1.141, p > 0.05). Comparing the beta coefficients of CWB versus SAT on customer loyalty through beta coefficient test, we note that the CWB coefficients are much higher than those of the SAT coefficients (t=4.511, p < 0.05 for sample 1, t=4.511, p < 0.05 for sample 2, t=3.784, p < 0.05 for sample 3, and t=4.495, p < 0.05 for sample 4). These results collectively provide support for H2.

The Effects of CWB (versus SAT) on Length of Stay, Repeat Visits, and Money Spent through the Mediating Effect of Perceived Value

We hypothesized that CWB to be more predictive than SAT of outcome variables through the mediating effects of customer perceived value (H3). Using regression analyses, we first tested the direct effects of CWB and SAT on the three outcome variables. The results indicate that almost all direct effects are not significant. With the understanding of no direct effect of CWB and SAT on three outcome variables, we then tested the mediation effects.

H3a posits that CWB has a positive effect on length of stay through the mediation effect of customer value. The mediation test results indicate that perceived value does fully mediate the relationship between CWB and length of stay for some samples (t=2.473, p < 0.05 for sample 1; t=2.473, p < 0.05 for sample 2), but not for others (t=1.214, p > 0.05 for sample 3; t=0.519, p > 0.05 for sample 4). In addition, the results from the pooled sample indicate that perceived value does not significantly mediate the relationship between CWB and length of stay (t=1.351, p > 0.05). H3a is only partially supported. H3b posits that CWB has a positive effect on number of visits through the mediation effect of customer value. H3c states that CWB has a positive effect on total spending expenses through the mediation effect of customer value. SAT does not have a significant effect on total spending expenses through the mediation effect of customer value. The results indicate that the mediation effect of perceived value on the relationship between CWB and number of visits was not significant (t=-0.141 for sample 1; t=-0.141 for sample 2; t=0.540 for sample 3; t=1.734 for sample 4, t=-0.192 for the pooled sample). The results also indicate that the mediation effect of perceived value on the relationship between CWB and total expenses was not significant (t=0.307, p > 0.05 for sample 1; t=0.307, p > 0.05 for sample 2; t=0.921, p > 0.05 for sample 3; t=-0.478, p > 0.05 for sample 4; t=-0.082, p > 0.05 for the pooled sample). The results fail to support H3b and H3c.
In contrast, we expected that SAT has a less positive impact (than CWB) on customer’s length of stay, the number of visits, and total expenses through the mediation effect of perceived value. The test results indicate that perceived value does fully mediate the relationship between SAT and length of stay for some samples (t=2.102, p<0.05 for sample 1; t=2.102, p<0.05 for sample 2), but not for others (t=1.186, p>0.05 for sample 3; t=0.517, p>0.05 for sample 4; t=1.313, p>0.05 for the pooled sample). H3a is partially supported in the sense that comparatively speaking, the mediating effect perceived value on length of stay is stronger for CWB than SAT.

The mediation effect of perceived value was not significant on the SAT and number of visit relationship (t=-0.141, p>0.05 for sample 1; t=-0.141, p>0.05 for sample 2; t=0.537, p>0.05 for sample 3; t=1.635, p>0.05 for sample 4; t=-0.192, p>0.05 for the pooled sample). The mediation effect of perceived value was not significant on the SAT and total expenses relationship (t=0.306, p>0.05 for sample 1; t=0.908, p>0.05 for sample 3; t=-0.475, p>0.05 for sample 4; t=-0.082, p>0.05 for the pooled sample). The results further support the notion that CWB does a better job predicting number of visits and money spent than SAT as mediated by perceived value. Thus, collectively, these results provide support for H3b and H3c.

The Effects of CWB (versus SAT) on Length of Stay, Repeat Visits, and Money Spent through the Mediating Effect of Customer Loyalty

We hypothesized that CWB has a positive impact on customer’s length of stay, the number of visits, and total expenses through the mediation effect of customer loyalty. The Sobel test results indicate that customer loyalty fully mediate the relationship between CWB and length of stay for three samples out of the four samples (t=2.846, p<0.05 for sample 1; t=2.846, p<0.05 for sample 2; t=2.767, p<0.05 for sample 3, t=0.966, p>0.05 for sample 4). The results also indicate that customer loyalty does fully mediate the relationship between CWB and the number of visits in three samples (t=2.607, p<0.05 for sample 1; t=4.181, p<0.01 for sample 3, t=1.794, p>0.05). The results from the pooled sample also indicate that customer loyalty does significantly mediate the relationship between CWB and length of stay (t=3.369, p<0.01) and the number of visits (t=3.106, p<0.05). The results provide support for H3a and H4b.

Customer loyalty does not have significant mediation effects between CWB and total expenses (t=0.943, p>0.05 for sample 1; t=0.943, p>0.05 for sample 2; t=1.137, p>0.05 for sample 3; t=1.22, p>0.05 for sample 4; t=0.129, p>0.05 for pooled sample), thus failing to support H4c. In contrast, we also expect that SAT to have a weaker positive impact (than CWB) on customer’s length of stay, the number of visits, and total expenses through the mediation effect of customer loyalty. The test results indicate that customer loyalty does not mediate a relationship between SAT and length of stay (t=0.704, p>0.05 for sample 1; t=0.704, p>0.05 for sample 2; t=1.528, p>0.05 for sample 3; t=1.26, p>0.05 for sample 4). Customer loyalty does not have a significant mediation effect on the relationship between SAT and the number of visits (t=0.70, p>0.05 for sample 1; t=0.70, p>0.05 for sample 2; t=1.679, p>0.05 for sample 3; t=1.26, p>0.05 for sample 4). In addition, customer loyalty does not have a significant mediation effect on the relationship between SAT and total expenses (t=0.576, p>0.05 for sample 1; t=0.576, p>0.05 for sample 2; t=0.966, p>0.05 for sample 3; t=1.005, p>0.05 for sample 4) for all four samples. The results from the pooled sample shows that the mediation effect of customer loyalty on the relationship between SAT and outcome variables are not significant: length of stay (t=1.095, p>0.05), number of visits (t=1.085, p>0.05), and total expenses (t=0.128, p>0.05). Collectively, these results
further reinforce the support for H4a H4b, and H4c.

Discussion

In sum, we conducted a study involving several waves of surveys at a popular national wildlife park in South Africa to validate a customer well-being measure specifically designed to natural wildlife tourism. The well-being measure involves eight dimensions related to customer need satisfaction in visiting a natural wildlife park. These are: (1) need for novelty seeking, (2) need for relaxation, (3) need for exploration, (4) need to socialize, (5) need to teach and impart knowledge to children, (6) need to gain new knowledge, (7) need to document memorable things and events, and (8) need to experience spirituality. We validated this measure by hypothesizing that the customer well-being measure is more predictive of customer loyalty, perceived value, and other behavior-type outcomes (such as length of stay, number of visits, and total money expenditures at the park) than a traditional customer satisfaction index (a formative measure composed of customer satisfaction with a variety of amenities and facilities at the park). The survey data provided support for the hypotheses, which in turn lend validational support to the customer well-being index.

Managerial implications of the customer well-being index are straightforward. Managers of national wildlife parks should use our customer well-being measure to assess the effectiveness of their marketing programs above and beyond the traditional customer satisfaction measure. In other words, we encourage park managers to monitor not only customer satisfaction (by assessing the degree to which park visitors express their satisfaction or dissatisfaction with the parks various amenities and services) but also customer well-being (by assessing the degree to which the park visit was able to meet a variety of visitor’s basic and growth needs). The customer satisfaction data should assist the park manager to improve the park’s amenities and services, whereas the customer well-being data should help develop promotion programs that educate potential park visitors how the park can meet a variety of basic and growth needs, thereby enhancing the visitor’s quality of life.

How about future research? We found that that the consumer well-being index is more predictive of customer perceived value and loyalty than the customer satisfaction index. Our customer well-being index is composed of eight different needs, which in turn can be classified as high-order (growth) and low-order (basic) needs. Future research should examine under what conditions satisfaction of high-order needs may have a stronger influence on customer perceived value and loyalty than satisfaction of low-order needs. Answering such a question should help managers of national wildlife parks adjust their marketing program, serving to further enhance the quality of life of wildlife park visitors.

References

### Arts and Culture I

#### Abstract/Papers Included

**The financialization of art as passion investment**  
Derrick Chong, Royal Holloway, University of London, UK

**Swimming against the current: Examining political influence on artistic practice**  
Victoria L. Rodner, King’s College London, UK  
Chloe Preece, University of Kent, UK
The financialization of art as passion investment

Derrick Chong, Royal Holloway University of London

In the current historical moment – marked by financial speculation and widening income inequality – art is promoted by the private wealth management industry as a ‘passion investment’. We examine the register of this term, as representing art’s shifting relationship between being a conspicuous consumption good and a financial instrument. A key marker in this narrative of the financialization of art occurred on 15 September 2008: New York-based investment bank Lehman Brothers collapsed, a defining moment in the current financial crisis, as a consequence of financial deregulation and increased risk-taking by investment banks; and, just hours later in London, Damien Hirst’s successful exhibition/auction at Sotheby’s would cater to a group promoted by Citigroup as plutocrats. Drawing on developments during the last 10-15 years, the paper addresses finance’s effects on the political economy of culture, with particular reference to how and why art is promoted as the embodiment of finance.
Swimming against the current: Examining political influence on artistic practice

Victoria L. Rodner, King’s College London, London, UK.
Chloe Preece, University of Kent, Canterbury, UK.

This paper compares and contrasts the contemporary art markets of two emerging economies: Venezuela and China. Although we may perceive them as poles apart, these two nations share complex socio-political circumstances that currently hinder the development of their respective local art scenes. Our findings reveal that there is the need for these governments to recognize and acknowledge the complexities and diversities inherent to artistic creation, since a thriving art scene must present multiple interpretations and continuously shape and re-shape itself within the global context. The co-creation of a more desirable collective and individual artistic image, the development of a cohesive national art network with sustainable cultural programing as well as the encouragement of a local buying public made up of wealthy and enthusiastic art collectors, will help place the Venezuelan and Chinese art scenes firmly on the international map, thereby leading these contemporary artists towards global recognition and symbolic validation.
**Teaching Sustainable Enterprise**

Panel
Chair: Mark Peterson, University of Wyoming - Laramie, USA

Panelists
John D. Mittelstaedt, University of Wyoming - Laramie, USA
M. Joseph Sirgy, Virginia Polytechnic Institute and State University, USA
Alex E. Reppel, Royal Holloway, University of London, UK
Stanley J. Shapiro, Simon Fraser University, Canada
This session will bring together experienced teachers and innovators in the realm of macromarketing for sharing valuable lessons learned when teaching undergraduates, grad students and executives concepts related to sustainable enterprise. Those attending this session will gain insights about different approaches that can succeed with a variety of student groups, as well as familiarization with the very latest pedagogical tools for teaching sustainable enterprise.

John Mittelstaedt will present insights from teaching sustainable business practices at Clemson University, as well as the University of Wyoming. In these courses, Mittelstaedt has shared six reasons that make sense for businesses to adopt sustainable business practices. These include 1) the environmental arguments (climate change and terrestrial), 2) the global population argument, 3) the energy independence argument, 4) The competitiveness argument, 5) the good-business-sense argument, and 6) the ethical argument(s), such as intergenerational justice. As a pioneer in teaching sustainability, Mittelstaedt will conclude his presentation with observations about where he envisions sustainability pedagogy going in the future.

Mark Peterson will share his experience of teaching a marketing and society course to the entire MBA class at the University of Wyoming that led him to write the 2013 SAGE book Sustainable Enterprise: A Macromarketing Approach. Today, business persons are increasingly seeking answers for how to approach new complexities of the marketplace that macromarketers have studied over the years. Peterson’s part of the session is intended to help marketing teachers better impart how firms can develop marketing strategies for the marketplace by tapping into the wisdom accrued by macromarketing scholars. In this way, Peterson will focus on managerial macromarketing—macromarketing for sustainable enterprise.

In teaching a course titled Sustainable Business Practices in Fall of 2012, Peterson used his book, but also included a new computer simulation from Innovative Learning Solutions – makers of the Marketplace business simulations - called Conscious Capitalism in the Marketplace. The simulation is designed to illustrate and reinforce the key tenants of the Conscious Capitalism movement. Students have a variety of issues to contend including 1) product sustainability and reliability, 2) environmental concerns, and 3) employee morale. Students must learn to manage a full-enterprise business while addressing the conscious opportunities, situations, and problems embedded throughout the simulation. Peterson will recount student experience with this simulation that complemented the use of his book.

Joe Sirgy used a beta-version of Peterson’s book in the Fall semester of 2012 at Virginia Tech. Sirgy will relate insights from this valuable experience teaching a macromarketing approach to the marketplace. Sirgy has taught courses with macromarketing concepts for years and his thoughts about his recent experience should be valuable to many macromarketers.

Alex Reppel reviewed Peterson’s book in the December issue of the Journal of Macromarketing and suggested that the book offers a third way that aligns with the developmental school of macromarketing for integrating macromarketing concepts in classroom teaching (Reppel 2012). In this
way, teachers have a third choice to managerialism or to critical marketing. As part of the discussion, the developmental and critical perspectives of macromarketing thought will be contrasted with each other and also with the managerial perspective that dominates much of today’s marketing education. Reppel will conclude with a call for critical reflexivity in macromarketing education along with a caution that market-based approaches to sustainability can only work toward a sustainable future, but not solve the problem of an unsustainable lifestyle. Reppel will also report on his recent experience of developing a course on macromarketing-related issues at Royal Holloway, University of London.

Stan Shapiro also reviewed Sustainable Enterprise: A Macromarketing Approach in the December issue of the Journal of Macromarketing and will offer perspective on the book’s position in the ongoing effort to develop pedagogical tools for integrating macromarketing concepts into the classroom (Shapiro 2012). Shapiro observes that Peterson’s is the latest in a number of efforts to provide macromarketing teaching materials. To gain better understanding about how Peterson’s book contributes to macromarketing pedagogy, Shapiro discusses two important monographs published in the early 1970s 1) Fisk’s early attempt to spell out the domain of macromarketing in the first macromarketing bibliography (Fisk 1990), and 2) an important article by Tamilia in which he argued that a macromarketing textbook was urgently required for purposes of both pedagogy and further disciplinary development (Tamilia 1992). Shapiro will then call attention to more recent efforts to provide macromarketing reading lists and to promote a “controversies-based” approach to the study of macromarketing. Shapiro will also explore the similarities and shared macromarketing dimensions of Peterson’s Sustainable Enterprise and Michael Baker’s expanded concept of a Social Business.

Sustainable Enterprise

Businesses can benefit by taking a more holistic approach to the marketplace. This is the focus of the recently published SAGE book Sustainable Enterprise: A Macromarketing Approach. Macromarketing – taking a systems view of the interplay between marketing and society—has had a rich history of scholarship for more than three decades. Over this time, accomplished scholars have contributed meaningfully to understanding the role of marketing in society. Traditional macromarketing topics have included quality of life, ethics, the environment, marketing systems, marketing history, and poor countries.

Businesses from start-ups to Wal-Mart have taken a focus on pursuing purposes beyond profit in recent years. Such purposes might include reducing a social ill, such as malnutrition in the case of Grameen Danone in Bangladesh, or protecting the natural environment, such as in the case of outdoor garment maker Patagonia. In general, these firms are pursuing what can be described as a “triple bottom line” that includes economic benefit for the firm, but also benefit for the environment and communities.

More than fifty-two thousand company web pages highlight the “triple bottom line” (people, planet, profit), signaling that these firms are beginning to account for their net social and environmental impact in addition to the traditional economic metric of economic profit (Hollender & Breen, 2010). Originally proposed by sustainability thought-leader John Elkington, the triple bottom line, or balanced scorecard, is broader than economic results, and includes measures of the firm’s environmental effects (air quality, water quality, energy usage and waste produced), as well as on social outcomes (labor practices, community impacts, human rights, and product responsibility) (Savitz & Weber, 2006). Are such cases merely outliers?

Is sustainability, preserving opportunities for future generations through care for social issues, environmental issues, as well as profits, a fad that will go away? More than 4,700 companies across 130 countries have signed the UN Global Compact pledging to follow its ten principles focused on 1)
human rights, 2) labor, 3) the environment, and 4) anti-corruption (United Nations [UN], 2011). The next generation of business leaders will more than likely receive their business education at one of the 346 schools who have adopted the Principles for Responsible Management Education. These six principles focus on developing capabilities of students in the areas of sustainable value for business and society at large (Principals for Responsible Management Education, 2011).

In sum, it is likely that triple-bottom-line success will be replicated by other firms and by many start-up firms that will grow and prosper as the Industrial Age ends and another comes into being. In this age of the Next Industrial Revolution, the purpose of the corporation might be redefined as creating shared value - not strictly economic profit (Porter & Kramer, 2011). The idea of shared value recognizes that societal needs—not just ordinary economic needs—define markets. Accordingly, expanding the total pool of economic and social value will need to be achieved by actors in twenty-first century markets. John Mackey, co-founder and co-CEO of Whole Foods Market, calls this “Conscious Capitalism”.

References


Wednesday June 5, 2013
2:30p-3:30p
Concurrent Session I

Arts and Culture II

Abstract/Papers Included

Technology and the marketer: Utopian and dystopian perspectives on digital innovation
Darryn Mitussis, University of Nottingham, UK
Alexander Reppel, Royal Holloway, University of London, UK
Thorsten Gruber, Loughborough University, UK
Isabelle Szmigin, University of Birmingham, UK

Exoticising, eroticising and exorcising the feminine: Visual representations of violent women in advertising
Yuko Minowa, Long Island University, USA
Pauline Maclaran, Royal Holloway, University of London, UK
Lorna Stevens, University of the West of Scotland, UK
Technology and the marketer: Utopian and dystopian perspectives on digital innovation

Darryn Mitussis, Nottingham University Business School, The University of Nottingham, UK
Alex Reppel, School of Management, Royal Holloway University of London, UK
Thorsten Gruber, School of Business and Economics, Loughborough University, UK
Isabelle Szmigin, Birmingham Business School, The University of Birmingham, UK

We highlight the dominant position of technological utopianism to advocate for more critical studies of technology and (macro-)marketing by (1) revealing the importance of dystopian visions of technology; (2) celebrating the historically important role of critical theory, art, and literature in providing society with much needed antitheses to the prominent utopian thesis; (3) exploring and formalising critical reflections on technology and (macro-)marketing by applying the practice of exaggerating towards the truth using selected themes from art and literature.
Exoticising, eroticising and exorcising the feminine: Visual representations of violent women in advertising

Yuko Minowa, Long Island University, USA
Pauline Maclaran, Royal Holloway, University of London, UK
Lorna Stevens, University of the West of Scotland, UK

In nature, female mammals fight to protect their young or to ward off other females from their mates. In popular culture women are often depicted as animals whose carnal instincts (usually for food or sex) threaten to take control of them. Women's power and women’s threat is often in their refusal to submit to the conventional, passive role expected of them in culture, and historically such transgressions, both imagined and real, invite swift reprisals. In the sixteenth and seventeenth century in Northern Europe the church and state demonised women who didn’t fit the mold, and the so-called witch craze of that period led to the deaths of hundreds of thousands of women by those intent in rooting out witchcraft from their midst, inspired by such tracts as the Malleus Maleficarum (1486). Indeed there was widespread belief in witches from even the most educated in Europe during that period. It was commonly accepted, for example, that witches mounted their broomsticks and regularly gathered at sabbats in order to engage in deviant sexual acts with the devil himself (Trevor-Roper 1990). Barstow (1995) argues that escalating levels of general and sexual violence in contemporary society can be traced to this earlier purging or “ethnic cleansing” of women in that dark period in European history. She suggests that these events served as a prophetic indication of some facets of what modern Europe would be like. In our own times, residual attitudes towards deviant women are manifest in popular culture texts, which portray the dark side of women: their potential for physical violence, excess, evil, and destruction.

Advertising images of violent or predatory women subvert the traditional hallmarks of femininity in our society where men are usually seen as the aggressors and women as victims. Often they can be used for comic effect, particularly in advertising (Gulas et al. 2010), but there are many that are not. It is therefore tempting to see these latter portrayals as positive signs of women's empowerment and a defiance of gender stereotyping. In popular culture, strong women like Uma Thurman in Quentin Tarantino’s Kill Bill and Rooney Mara in The Girl with the Dragon Tattoo break the mold of female passivity, playing brutal avengers in action-packed dramas of the type normally reserved for male actors. Advertisers too have tapped into this trend to shock with controversial campaigns such as FCUK’s Fashion versus Style, a depiction of lethal combat between two women and Sisley's dominatrix-style series of advertisements. Despite their potential to subvert gender norms, we argue that patriarchal codes are still subtly embedded within such portrayals that work to frequently exoticise, eroticise and if needs be exorcise (if we consider the witch purges of the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries) violent and dangerous women. Accordingly, our analysis of these advertisements reveals that they
Contribute to the depiction of women in contemporary consumer culture as bodies that threaten and subvert stability.

Given that advertisements usually depict women’s primary weapons as being their sexuality, they reinforce a growing trend in Western society, the hypersexualisation of women’s bodies and the normalization of explicit sexual behaviours (Walter 2010), a trend that is associated with the broader pornification of culture (Powell 2009), and the concept of sexual subjectification for women, as distinct from sexual objectification. The difference is that in postfeminist terms women happily collude in sexual excess and subject positions that were previously considered sexist by second wave feminists. In other words, such representations are the glorification of sado-masochism (a la Fifty Shades of Grey), bondage, and the mutual pleasures to be enjoyed through sexual agency and violence. To present our arguments, firstly we explore the cultural and historical significance of images of violent women, particularly drawing on art history and mythology, before analysing more contemporary media representations. Then we briefly discuss the methodology, employing critical visual analysis, before presenting three key emergent themes that illustrate the sexual ambiguity with which these images can be interpreted. In conclusion, we discuss how these images tap into a “raunch culture” that the neo-liberal commodification of sexuality is encouraging (Levy 2005) and which is a reference to earlier times when women were depicted as knowing, dangerous, subversive, sexually voracious and ultimately the enemy to be conquered.

Images of Violent Women: A Historical Odyssey

Throughout history, images of violent women were visually consumed in a variety of contexts. Mythological personae, such as Amazons and Medea, and legendary heroines, such as Judith and Salome, were created by men, and their images were consumed by men for their gaze and moral lessons (Damisch 1992; Lefkowitz 1986; Umezù 1995). The spatiotemporal ubiquity of the phenomenon is evident as it manifests in the contemporary media in the global marketplace. The mythological character Medea, heroine of Euripidean tragedy, was not only historicized but is still alive in various media formats, such as works of art in museums, films, and plays at the theater. The historical omnipresence of violent women is global. A woman warrior Hua Mulan in ancient China is consumed not only in the TV series in contemporary Taiwan, but also in the Disney animation film Mulan in the United States. Moreover, the myth of violent women may be conceptualized and conceived in the modern time and quickly becomes legendary. For example, a fictional manga character Saki in Delinquent Girl Detective was created in the 1970s in Japan and more recently became a protagonist of the film Yo-Yo Girl Cop which was released in the United States in 2007.

Visual representations of violent women are known to have served for moralizing purposes as well. The 16th century oil painting Judith with the Head of Holofernes by Lucas Cranach the Elder is an example. In order to save her country from the enemy general Holofernes, a Jewish heroine Judith – who dressed beautifully “to entice the eyes of all men who might see her” (Judith 10:4, Apocrypha) – went to his camp in disguise, pretending to
be a prostitute. He fell for her scheme and became intoxicated in his attempt to seduce her. She was then able to kill him by cutting off his head, thereby saving her people. In the Cranach’s spatially compressed composition, the heroine rests her arm elegantly on the severed head of Holofernes. Modeled after a lady of the Saxon court, she is adorned in heavily beaded and brocaded velvet – unfit for the repulsive task – a departure from the humble “true Judith” (Reid 1969), a young widow from Bethulia. Yet, this is an expression of puritan fortitude and work of civilization, not barbarism. Oblivious to the gruesome object on the table, Judith rests in perfect composure. Her enigmatic smile captivates the viewer’s attention. Here Judith seems to suggest the spiritual and physical vulnerability of men, and “Weibermacht,” the power of women over men.

The sensual beauty and sexual pleasure that women such as Judith possess speak to an ancient female archetype, a woman who is as captivating as she is poisonous; one who leads even wise and strong men, such as Holofernes, Samson, Aristotle, and Hercules, into danger, subjugation, and death (Damisch 1992). This female archetype is often depicted in contemporary popular culture as the femme fatale, or fatal woman, an irresistibly attractive, amoral, ambitious woman who harbours a secret and threatens to destroy a man by leading him astray, but it is her fate to be doomed to failure and punishment. The femme fatale emerged as a central figure in art and literature in the nineteenth century in the artistic movements of Decadence, Symbolism, Art Nouveau and Orientalism. According to Doane (1991), the archetype “overrepresents” the body and is the antithesis of the maternal body because the femme fatale is invariably barren or sterile. She is not the subject of power but is its carrier, and thus has power in spite of herself (Doane 1991). Furthermore she represents the loss of (male) self. As such she is often depicted in Freudian terms as embodying “castration anxiety” for the male subject; the vagina dentata who both attracts and repels. As a symbolic conflation of sex and death, the femme fatale can therefore be perceived as not so much a feminist subject but rather as a female object that is symptomatic of men’s fears about feminism and women’s quest for power. Indeed Doane writes that far from being a powerful archetype of femininity, the femme fatale "seems to confound power, subjectivity, and agency with [her] lack of these attributes” (Doane 1991, 3).

Critical Visual Analyses of Violent Women

The current study offers a critical visual analysis (Schroeder 2006) of violent or predatory women in advertising. Our analysis builds on visual genealogy as recommended by Schroeder and Zwick (2006), by first examining how violent women were portrayed historically and then exploring how contemporary images are expressed in an art historical framework. Although film and advertising are frequently passed over in fine art canons and considerations, their theories share a mutual concern for visual representation with art history (Schroeder 2002). At the same time, as cultural media, they communicate consumer ideology and serve as socializing agents (Hirschman and Stern 1994). As a result of the critical visual analysis, the following three themes were identified:
Exoticising: Women as (Male) Spectator Sport

Women as spectacle and men as spectators are a commonplace trope in advertisements (Bordo 1997). In representations of women engaging in physical actions such as combat (in this case a “catfight”) or other forms of violent contact, the effect is to stimulate and “give [the viewer] a sense of being alive and of having control over others” (Arnold 2001, 32). Historically visual representations of real or fictitious female fights aroused curiosity and fascination in men, and often such fights were staged for the pleasure of a male audience. Indeed male fascination with seemingly out of control, violent and rebellious women feeds the human desire to observe violence whilst consigning it to the arena of performance and spectacle (Lefkowitz 1986; Zillmann 1998). Thus the two women in the FCUK advertisement Fashion Versus Style are performing a battle of ferocious exotic animals, making the male spectators feel more alive and pleasing them with a hedonistic visual experience. They are objects of desire, “commercialized commodities,” seeking approval from the male subject (Hirschman and Stern 1994, 580).

Eroticising: Glamorization and Sexual Subjectification

The iconic image of female violence and domination is represented as a celebration of female power. Yet this is a power that is also highly glamorized and eroticized, reinforcing a message of postfeminist sexual subjectification. For example, the FCUK catfight ends in a passionate lesbian kiss and Sisley’s sultry siren straddles a naked man who is on all fours with a saddle (reminiscent of Aristotle Ridden by Phyllis by Licas van Leyden around 1515). In these ways women’s violence is reduced to an aesthetic spectacle. As such, their images are trivialized and sanitized, and any associated violence is desensitized and disempowered. Thus, in the seeming celebration of female empowerment as an aspirational referent, violent women are represented as artificially masculinized, superficially idolized female predators; a superficial marker of power transformation in an intricate web of gendered tropes such as the femme fatale and the dominatrix.

Exorcising: The Femme Fatale and Dominatrix

The Femme Fatale, popularized in Hollywood from the 1930s through Film Noir, is alluring, but ultimately she is an isolated, powerless and doomed character (Doane 1991), and rarely invites pity in the audience, given that she is destructive, manipulative and capable of making her male “victim” engage in evil deeds. So, whilst she fascinates with her secretive, dark ways, she is also to be feared and vanquished. Not so her modern day manifestation, that of the Dominatrix. This explicitly sexual, controlling woman enjoys dominating and bestializing men, and men may seek her out for her playful, sadomasochistic dark arts and her violent accoutrements. Both the dominatrix and the femme fatale are incarnations of men’s earlier, ambivalent fascination with witches, who may transmogrify into succubi that possess and destroy them. Sisley’s advertisement features such a woman. She smiles mysteriously at the camera whilst the man faces forward, and holds a lock of the man’s hair in her right hand while holding the saddle with her left hand. Such fetishistic images in cultural media and works of art have historically served to both stir erotic desire in men whilst also acting as warnings that women can overcome them, and indeed historically women’s dark, sexual desires were seen to be a threat to the stability of many societies (Smith 1979; Wolfthal 1999).
**Discussion**

Our analysis suggests that, despite the fact that the FCUK and Sisley advertisements pay lip service to women’s empowerment, these portrayals contribute to the resexualisation of women’s bodies, cleverly couched in neo-liberal discourses of freedom and agency (McRobbie 2009; Power 2009). As Walter argues, “all aspects of the current hypersexual culture are often now seen as proof of women’s growing freedom and power” (Walter 2010, 5). Importantly we need to scrutinise the new forms of gender power that emanate from the use of such tropes and which act as disciplinary technologies under the guise of self-management. Thus, whilst in the face of it these advertisements appear to be edgy and innovative, they actually have a long history of similar visual representations that derive from the discomfiture with which society views female sexuality, and that replay masculine fears and desires in order to constrain rather than liberate contemporary representations of feminised subject positions.

**References**


Abstract/Papers Included

A case study on sustainable business models: The association of Seferihisar tangerine producers
Isik Ozge Yumurtaci, Izmir University of Economics, Turkey
Tugba Orten Tugrul, Izmir University of Economics, Turkey
Bengu Sevil Oflac, Izmir University of Economics, Turkey

Exploring some enablers of behaviors towards sustainability: A netnographic approach
Bipul Kumar, Indian Institute of Management - Ahmedabad, India
Nikhilesh Dholakia, University of Rhode Island, USA

The institutional foundations of materialism in Japan: A replicated empirical test
Miho Miyauchi, Chukyo University, Japan
Pierre McDonagh, Dublin City University, Ireland
William Kilbourne, Clemson University, USA
Masae Takimoto, Osaka University of Economics and Law, Japan
Masaaki Takemura, Meiji University, Japan
A Case Study on Sustainable Business Models: The Association of Seferihisar Tangerine Producers

İşik Özge Yumurtacı, Izmir University of Economics, Turkey
Tuğba Örten Tuğrul, Izmir University of Economics, Turkey
Bengü Sevil Oflaç, Izmir University of Economics, Turkey

Abstract

With the rise of environmental and social concerns, sustainable business models have become more crucial. Implementation of sustainable business models that supports sustainable development emerged as a substantial tool to obtain the desired social, environmental and economic goals. With this regard, herein, we present a sustainable business model of the Association of Seferihisar Tangerine Producers which was developed in Seferihisar, the center town of a coastal district in İzmir-Turkey. A case study approach was followed and semi-structured in-depth interviews were conducted with the Mayor of the Municipality of Seferihisar, the Chairman of the Association of Seferihisar Tangerine Producers and the Representative of the Tangerine Farmers. In light of the research findings, we provide a deeper understanding for the development process of a unique sustainable business model in an emerging economy, the players in the system, the drivers and the barriers. Moreover, in this study, the outcomes of the model achieved and the major performance indicators are also discussed.

Introduction

In a developing country like Turkey, it is useful to understand the mechanism for development and the related variables. Although development is mostly evaluated in terms of economic growth, today’s business rules consider development not only from economic growth but also from social and environmental perspective (Azapagic and Perdan 2000; Mitchell, Wooliscroft and Higham 2010). This is mainly related to the recent trend towards sustainability. Sustainability has become one of the most contemporary and challenging issue not only in academia but also in business world. Global environmental degradation caused by current consumption patterns of consumers and unsustainable market-based strategies of corporations call for developing more sustainable processes for responsible marketing management actions (Mitchell, Wooliscroft and Higham 2010). Therefore, a macromarketing view of sustainable business models proposing such change becomes an urgent need.

The macromarketing perspective draws attention for quality of life, environment and substantive freedom. These lead to development, constrained globalization, free markets, trade liberalization and privatization and as a result enhance quality of life, environmental concern and substantive freedom (Kilbourne 2004). This is interrelated to the aims and objectives of neoliberalism. Neoliberalism concentrates on individual rights and freedoms critically and counters them to the authoritarianism and frequent arbitrariness of political, economic and class power (Harvey 2005). In brief, the aim of neoliberalism can be quoted as follows: “… raising standards of living, full employment and a large and steadily growing volume of real income and effective demand, and expanding the production of and trade in goods and services while allowing for the optimal use of the world’s resources in accordance with the objective of sustainable development, seeking both to protect and preserve the environment and to enhance the means for doing so in a manner consistent with their respective needs and concerns
at different levels of economic development” (WTO agreement cited in Harvey 2005, p. 176).” One of the pivotal challenges of globalization is based upon the unlimited growth of the free markets in neoliberal form. However, nowadays it is questioned if neoliberalism can sustain through global sustainability or not (Kilbourne 2004). Neoliberalism is expected to be successful if proper business models are employed with its intended aims and values in all economic systems.

In this context, this study examines a unique sustainable business model of the Association of Seferihisar Tangerine Producers which was developed in Seferihisar, the center town of a coastal district in İzmir-Turkey. The business model development processes, the drivers of performance, barriers in improving performance, players, outcomes and performance indicators are the issues discussed based on the model from a sustainability perspective.

Sustainable Development
The limited amount of resources in a finite world makes the current level of consumption impossible (Kilbourne, McDonagh and Prothero 1997). Thus, the notions of sustainability, sustainable consumption and sustainable development have emerged as key issues for academicians, policy makers and businesses (Schaefer and Crane 2005). In practice, many governments and companies have started to develop strategies for sustainable development of industries (Azapagic and Perdan 2000). Environmental policy, legislation, taxes, corporate environmental management, cleaner production tools and voluntary agreements between government and industry are some of the practices that can be applied for achieving sustainability (Korhonen 2005).

According to the 1987 report by the World Commission on Environment and Development, sustainable development can be defined as the “development that meets the needs of the present without compromising the ability of future generations to meet their own needs”. Although this is the most commonly used definition of sustainability, it has also been the most criticized one as being difficult to envision the needs of future generations and to predict their abilities to meet those needs (Marshall and Toffel 2005). Therefore, several frameworks describing conditions, characteristics and indicators of sustainability were developed to incorporate the practice of sustainability in daily decisions. As one of them, The Triple Bottom Line paradigm calls for considering not only the economic but also the social and ecological impacts of organizational actions in pursuing sustainability (Elkington 1998). For example, companies should support fair trade by taking into account their social responsibilities along with financial ones, advocate eco-efficiency by balancing and optimizing economic and environmental goals in their strategic decisions or promoting environmental justice by balancing social equity and environmental protection. Similarly, Azapagic and Perdan (2000) proposed a general framework along with the environmental, economic and social indicators of sustainable development for industry. Based on this framework, companies and organizations should indicate their environmental performance by three general categories: environmental impacts (e.g., resource use and solid waste), environmental efficiency (e.g., material recyclability and product durability) and voluntary actions (e.g., environmental management systems and assessment of suppliers). On the other hand, economic indicators measuring the economic performance have been classified into two groups: financial (e.g., expenditure on environmental protection and environmental liabilities) and human (e.g., expenditure on health and safety and investment in staff development). Finally, social indicators concentrate on social responsibility and well-being practices of businesses by two sections: ethics (e.g., preservation of cultural values and international standards of conduct) and welfare (e.g., income distribution and satisfaction of social needs). Thus, regardless of the framework embraced, the pursuit of sustainable development can be achieved by sustainable business models aimed at satisfying social, environmental and economic goals simultaneously.
Sustainable Business Models

Currently, the trend towards economic, social and environmental growth is based on the change and need for sustainable development (Birkin et al. 2009). For sustainable development, the role of business models clearly stands out. A business model is on how an enterprise creates and delivers value to its customers, and then reverts the delivered value into payments and profits (Amit and Zott 2001). Another definition of business model highlights the demonstration of a firm’s main core logic and strategic preferences for creating and capturing value in a network (Shafer et al. 2005). Additionally, Osterwalder et al. (2005, p.17) define business model as follows: “…is a conceptual tool that contains a set of elements and their relationships and allows expressing the business logic of a specific firm. It is a description of the value of a company offers to one or several segments of customers and of the architecture of the firm and its network of partners for creating, marketing, and delivering this value and relationship capital, to generate profitable and sustainable revenue streams.”

The business model comprises how the business organization designs to create value and the way it is delivered to shareholders (Teece 2009). Hence, the business model is crucial for every organization even if it is a new venture or a founded one (Magretta 2002). The main pillars that form a good business model are all interconnected and comprehend building a sustainable competitive advantage and having a desired profit level (Teece 2010). Accordingly, the main components that form a business model play vital role. Table 1 displays the building blocks of a business model.

Table 1. Nine Business Model Building Blocks

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Pillar</th>
<th>Business Model, Building Block</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Product</td>
<td>Value Proposition</td>
<td>Gives an overall view of a company’s bundle of products and services</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Customer Interface</td>
<td>Target customer</td>
<td>Describes the segments of customers a company wants to offer value to.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Distribution channel</td>
<td>Describes the various means of the company to get in touch with its customers.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Relationship</td>
<td>Explains the kind of links of a company establishes between itself and its different customer segments.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Infrastructure Management</td>
<td>Value configuration</td>
<td>Describes the arrangement of activities and resources.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Core competency</td>
<td>Outlines the competencies necessary to execute the company’s business model.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Partner network</td>
<td>Portrays the network of cooperative agreements with other companies necessary to efficiently offer and commercialize value.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Financial Aspects</td>
<td>Cost structure</td>
<td>Sums up the monetary consequences of the means employed in the business model.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Revenue model</td>
<td>Describes the way a company makes money through a variety of revenue flows.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Osterwalder et al. (2005)

On the other hand, it is required that business models should be sustainable to enhance economic, social and environmental growth. Becoming sustainable from the organization point of view necessitates considering the environment’s capacity and caring for the social impacts (Birkin et al. 2009).
Accordingly, a significant mechanism for succeeding a business model is based on establishing co-development partnerships through defining the business objective, assessing the capabilities that are required, determining the degree of business model alignment and considering about the future collaborations (Chesbrough and Schwartz 2007). The business models that are likely to succeed are highly situational and to engage sequencing processes (Teece 2010). Accordingly, examining situational cases may provide deeper understanding of the components and motivating factors for different business models.

**Research Design**

Case study research is recommended when a detailed understanding of organizational process is required (Hartley 2004). Since, it gives the opportunity to examine a real-life situation and to collect a rich and valuable data from an organization and the groups or individuals operating within or around it. Therefore, we believed that case study research can be used to address the issues of the development process, the players, the drivers and barriers, outcomes and challenges of a sustainable business model. The Association of Seferihisar Tangerine Producers was selected as a case study organization because this organization was expected to provide best possible insight into our research questions. With this aim, semi-structured in-depth interviews were conducted with the Mayor of the Municipality of Seferihisar, the Chairman of the Association of Seferihisar Tangerine Producers and the Representative of the Tangerine Farmers in January 2013. The interviews lasted from 30 to 60 minutes in length, were carried by a female interviewer and recorded by notebook. The notes of the interviews including the impressions and insights, and the observed and elicited data about the organization and interviewees were written up as soon as possible (Hartley 2004). The following sub-sections discuss the justification and selection of the case study unit, and the findings of the current study.

**The Case Study Organization: the Association of Seferihisar Tangerine Producers**

Seferihisar is the center town of a coastal district in Izmir Province, Turkey. The economy of Seferihisar is mainly based on agriculture (the production of tangerines and satsumas exclusively), and progressively more on tourism. Additionally, Seferihisar was declared as the first cittaslow city of Turkey in 2009. As it is concerned, the criteria to become a cittaslow city are: environmental awareness, infrastructural investment, technology and facilities for urban quality, preserving local production and products, hospitality and community, and awareness creation (Mayer and Knox 2009). Cittaslow criteria mainly focus and concentrate on sustainability not only in production facilities but also for new investments. Since, the Mayor of Seferihisar is very keen on sustainable business models that are likely to enhance and support the economic growth in the region, the Association of Seferihisar Tangerine Producers was established in October 2012. Research findings examining the unique sustainable business model of this organization in terms of the development process, players, drivers and barriers, outcomes and performance indicators are presented in the following section.

**Research Findings**

This section presents the above mentioned analyses of semi-structured interviews with the Mayor of Seferihisar Municipality (Mayor), the Chairman of the Association of the Seferihisar Tangerine Producers (Chairman), and the Representative of the Tangerine Farmers (Representative).
The Development Process

During the election campaign process, the relevant business model was declared as a campaign promise by the current Mayor. He stated that the main motivating factor to support this model was related to the desire of removing the intermediaries. Since the intermediaries used to market the products did not pay to the producers. Therefore, the producers were incapable of performing their agricultural facilities. Similarly, the damnification of the tangerine farm owners by the intermediaries in terms of financial problems was expressed as the main motivation by the Chairman and the Representative. Therefore, the chairman and the founder former members decided to establish a sustainable business model that would provide benefit mainly to tangerine producers. They investigated the necessary laws for establishing an association. The necessary applications to the Ministry of Customs and Business were performed. However, they were in the need of financial aid in which municipality took role in. In the meanwhile, after Seferihisar municipality built the development of the city on citta slow criteria, sustainable business models have become crucial. The municipality supported this business model by the acquisition of an existing tangerine handling plant. Apart from this, municipality supported this sustainable business model through promotion in the media and society. The Representative declared his grievance caused by the intermediaries. Regarding this repetitive grievance, they came together with other farm owners and established the business model idea. Although the main motivating factor from the farm owners’ side is micro based, it impacted and enabled the entire business model to occur. As a result, the Association of Seferihisar Tangerine Producers is the first case in Turkey that can officially sell agricultural products. The other existing associations in Turkey were not founded with the appropriate reasoning by getting support through proper laws. They arranged all the procedural arrangements and convinced approximately 20% of the region’s tangerine farm owners in three months time period. The association was officially founded in October 2012 which is accepted as the starting period of the tangerine season.

The Players

According to the declarations of the Mayor, Chairman and Representative, main shareholders of this sustainable business model are the residents of Seferihisar, tangerine farmers, municipality and other supply chain members that take place in the business.

The Drivers and Barriers

As explained in the business model development process, one of the main drivers was to eliminate the intermediaries that did not do any payment to the tangerine farmers. Without monetary support, it is not possible for the farmers to sustain their business. As the Mayor articulated, if this situation continued for a long time period, the tangerine farmers would go out of business which would result as a major barrier in the economy of the city. Therefore, municipality and tangerine farmers came together, acquired an existing handling facility in the city and directly removed the intermediaries. The members of the tangerine producers’ association directly sell their agricultural products to the association and the association market products, gather the receivables from the customers and deliver the payments to the farmers without any commission. The association is a non-governmental organization and does not aim to have any profit from the operations. Although, the plant started its activities five months ago currently 20% of the tangerine farmers are members in the association. Another driver of this business model is to gather the other tangerine producers’ association and act as
an entire and more powerful association. The ideas to become a powerful association and to be recognized internationally in regard to tangerine production are the other drivers.

On the other hand, although the drivers enabled the foundation of such a sustainable business model, the barriers were challenging to overcome. Firstly, The Mayor mentioned that the bureaucratic barriers were difficult to prevail over. Second, being unorganized and not acting as a union created problems to market the agricultural products and sustain business. On the other hand, the Chairman claimed that one of the main barriers was to persuade the tangerine farm owners to become a member for such an association. While they were negatively impacted because of working with intermediaries, most of the tangerine farm owners supported the foundation of the association. Currently, the association has 70 members and nearly 20% of the tangerine production in the city is handled and sold by the association.

On the other hand, the barriers are based on building trust and collecting receivables on time. Similarly, according to the Representative the barriers are likely to occur if the payments are not made on time as promised to the members. The Representative was afraid of losing the trust and commitment of the members in case of late payment. Otherwise, it seems there are no major barriers that cannot be overcome. Additionally, as the Chairman stated, enhancing the number of customers not only locally but also internationally is a barrier to overcome in the future.

Outcomes

There are many outcomes that can be discussed in terms of this sustainable business model. The Mayor stated that the support for the city’s economic growth could be listed as one of the main outcome. In addition, employment opportunity nearly for 300 people was also another outcome. This rate of employment decreased the unemployment by 10% in the city.

From producers’ point of view, one of the main outcomes of this sustainable business model was to reduce costs associated with handling the tangerine. As the Chairman expressed, the handling costs of the tangerine was done twofold: inside the farm and later in the handling plant for packing and labeling the product. Before, all the related costs associated to handling of the tangerine belonged to the farmers which decreased the profit level of the farm owners. The association declared that the payments to the farm owners will be made at the end of February 2013. Before the foundation of the association, the intermediaries did not declare any time period for the payments. Also, during the foundation process and in the ongoing activities of the association, all of the Cittaslow criteria were met. The selling prices of the tangerine were regulated and positively adjusted on behalf of the farm owners.

The government currently supports organizations like Seferihisar Tangerine Producers’ Association in case the number of members is more than 50. An agricultural engineer is hired for consultancy to the associations and paid by the government. If some of the improvements in the plant field can be done, the handling capacity of the plant can be increased to 15,000 ton/year. This capacity is enough to handle 50% of the Seferihisar region’s total tangerine production. It is also noted that the foundation and ongoing activities of the association will positively impact the promotion of the city.

The sustainable business model is expected to enable farmers to continue their agricultural production and increase the promotion of the city as the Representative stated. To sum it up, the business model intends to not only achieve outcomes mainly providing benefits to the related shareholders but also serve to economic, social and environmentalist aims of the city.

The Performance Indicators

In terms of performance indicators, the Mayor claimed that the association should collect the receivables from the customers on time and perform related payments to the members of the
association firstly. This would enable building trust and recognition of the association positively not only by its members but also by the potential members. This sustainable business model was also assumed to promote the Cittaslow movement in Seferihisar. The managerial success of the board of trustees played vital role for the sustainability of the business model. Another important performance indicator could be stated as the rate of growth for the business volume of the association. The aim of the association should be providing also by-products of tangerine such as tangerine jam and tangerine liquor. Izmir Development Agency also provides financial aid to support the production of such by-products. Seferihisar tangerine is also geographically labeled by the Turkish Patent Institute. The association uses this geographical label to be recognized as “Seferihisar tangerine” in the agricultural market and to become a brand. It should be noted that the selling price of the tangerine per kilo has increased by 0.2 TL after the foundation of the association and its marketing efforts.

According to the Chairman, while the tangerine farm owners are the members and customers of the association, the satisfaction level of the members in terms of payments and other activities could be assessed as the major performance indicator to sustain for the success of the business model. The increasing rate of by products was stated as another challenge. Additionally, he also mentioned about the need of a cold warehouse to extend the life cycle of the product. Such a warehouse investment would tend to increase the sales. Attraction of big tangerine farms and involving them in the association was perceived as another important performance criterion to sustain the business. The growth in terms of handling capacity, number of members and customers would be required for sustainability as well. Based on the tangerine farm owners’ opinions, similar to the statements of the Major and the Chairman, if the payments by the association are performed on time and unity with the members are provided, the farmers would believe that the business model would sustain and be a leading case for the other cities that produce agricultural products.

**Discussion and Conclusion**

As stated in the previous parts, the economy of Seferihisar is mainly dependent to tangerine farms and tourism. Therefore, agricultural facilities in the region play key role for economic, social and environmental improvement in the city. A business model developed to serve agriculture industry is a significant factor for the potential growth of the city.

Hence, the players of the model have formed a business model which is sustainable by its nature. While the sustainable business model that is discussed in this study is formed mainly with three players, three semi-structured in depth interviews were conducted. The questions in the interview can be found in the appendix. In order to arrange in-depth interview, personal contacts played vital role. The elements of the model which are discussed in the research findings are displayed in Figure 1.

It is necessary to note that the Association of Seferihisar Tangerine Producers is the first economic development that is supported by the Seferihisar municipality. While Seferihisar municipality supports such business models, it is believed that this sustainable business model will be a leading example for the city.

On the other hand, it is hoped that this type of sustainable business model can be guiding for the other agricultural regions. As for future research, the sustainable business model can be expanded with different performance indicators. Also, the success of the model should be assessed not only in midterm but also in the long term. Moreover, empirical analysis through surveys conducted with residents is useful to examine the impacts of the model from economic, social and environmental dimensions.
Sustainable Business Models I
A Case Study on Sustainable Business Models
Yumurtaci et al

Figure 1: Elements of Sustainable Business Model in Seferihisar

References


**Appendix**

**Semi-structured in-depth interview questions**
1. How did you develop this business model?
2. Who are the main players involved?
3. How long did it take to develop this model?
4. What were the challenges?
5. While developing this business model which of the cittaslow criteria were taken into consideration? (what are the impacts on natural life, local development, economy, social life and residents?)
6. Who are the business partners?
7. How are you going to provide continuity in this business model?
8. What are the points that need improvement?
Exploring Some Enablers of Behaviour towards Sustainability: A Netnographic Approach

Bipul Kumar, Indian Institute of Management, Ahmedabad, India
Nikhilesh Dholakia, University of Rhode Island, USA

Introduction

The renowned scientist and ecologist Rachel Carson in her famous book *Silent Spring* foreshadowed that the aspirations for total control of nature were conceived in arrogance. Five decades later, the warnings sounded by Carson (1962) regarding the future effects of greedy and shortsighted actions of humankind are turning into ugly and intractable contemporary ecological realities. A holistic view of the world’s ecological balance points to an adverse tilt, a steady slippage into a red zone characterized by the mammoth effects of global climate change, degradation of air and water quality due to pollution, loss of biodiversity due to uncontrolled exploitation of natural resources, and more.

The intertwined challenges such as energy security and climate change – especially for demographically giant developing countries like China and India – and the resulting adverse effects on climate change require sustained policy and analytical attention, from these countries as well as from advanced nations. As per report on the Energy Technology Perspective of the world by the International Energy Agency in 2010, about 84% of current CO₂ emissions are directly the result of intense energy usage pattern and about 65% of all greenhouse-gas emissions have links with the energy supply and energy use. These facts and figures are quite alarming in nature and the kind of devastating future that apparently lies ahead calls for massive and multiple actions – the time for simple, single, silver-bullet solutions is well past. The overarching concept of sustainability – encompassing all its elemental components (social, cultural, environmental, political and economic) – is much more relevant at this juncture than fractal notions of conservation, efficiency, simplicity, renewability, or biodiversity (Kilbourne, McDonagh and Prothero 1997). The question arises as to how the elements of sustainability can best be articulated and inculcated in every aspect of living: consuming, working, and other human activity. A firm per se may innovate and come up with a sustainable product in its portfolio but the final consumption of that particular product in an unsustainable manner might defeat the whole idea of sustainability itself and thereby might keep the basic conundrum of the human vs environmental balancing act itself on an unstable ground (Connolly and Prothero 2008). The issues pertaining to the environment and ecology are intrinsically related to human behavior (Gardner and Stern 2002). In recent years, the market is flooded with the so called environmentally sustainable products such as recyclable products, energy efficient appliances, and organic food items (Prothero and McDonagh 2010) but the non-compliant behavioral aspects attached implicitly to these products have reduced the degree of benefit which would otherwise have accrued to society and ecology (Midden, Kaiser, and McCalley 2007). A core matter of discussion, therefore, is understanding the requirements of behavioral changes in the adoption of all such sustainable actions by each and every stakeholder involved in the entire value chain. Many environmentally sustainable products also display a great deal of technical and innovative modifications in the existing lines of products (Steg and Vlek 2009) – implying the need for new or at least modified behaviors – which again reiterates the importance of understanding the behavioral dimensions of acceptance and consumption of such products in an appropriate way. If the behavioural change levers at all levels – primary producers, makers and packagers, distributors, buyers, and end
consumers – can be understood in better ways, then public and private policy actions as well as individual behaviors could possibly be reshaped.

**Research Questions**

In view of the above discussion, this study broadly attempts to explore the following research question:

- Which factors act as enablers for facilitating behaviors towards sustainability?

A further elaboration would also look into the finer details of the elements of sustainable behaviors, both at the firm and at the consumer level, to seek answers to the following sub-questions stemming from the main research question:

- What types of attitudes, values and behaviors at the firm or process level are oriented towards sustainability?
- What types of attitudes, values and behaviors at the consumer level are oriented towards sustainability?
- What types of factors seem to exert influence on such attitudes, values and behaviors at the firm and consumer levels, and on cross-level interactions?

**Conceptual Framework**

Following is the initial conceptual framework which we intend to analyze and elaborate upon in a quest to answer the research questions. We realize that, given the emergent nature of findings and the constant comparison of insights derived from the digital field and from the literature, a degree of adaptive flexibility would be needed in this framework.
The discussion is theorized and extended to the particularly complex setting as depicted – where multiple levels, actors and behaviors interact.

**Research Methodology**

We employ a netnographic approach to uncover and understand the key enablers of behaviors towards sustainability, both at organizational (extracting, producing, assembling, making, packing, distributing, servicing) levels and at consumption (contemplating, buying, using, disposing) levels. “Netnography adapts ethnographic research techniques to study the cultures and communities that are emerging through computer-mediated communications” (Kozinets 2002). Given the complex and macro context of sustainability – stretching across countries, industries, companies and consumers – we decided to rely on information available in the public domain in the online formats and to interpret the different aspects such as the needs and the corresponding influencers of the decisions pertinent to the ongoing, global and massive discussion on sustainability. The behavioral dimension of sustainability jointly affects
the organizations and customers making a substantial impact on the both ends of the continuum. The forums which are explored under the netnographic approach provide a healthy input on the entire continuum of the subject matter of interest which are enablers of behavior towards sustainability in our study. Compared to traditional netnography that deals with individuals (typically consumers), our digital field includes individuals qua users/consumers as well as actors that represent their organizations.

**Delineation of the Digital Field**

Since the online discussions on sustainability are wide-ranging and global, involving experts as well as corporate and individual voices, our effort in this study is to outline a digital netnographic field that is wide and varied. We have applied the following rules and principles to delineate the digital field to be studied:

- The time frame of January 2011 to February 2013 has been used for this study.
- Discussion on relevant topics in LinkedIn in the following subgroups –
  - Behavior change for sustainability – 778 members
  - Environmental sustainability – 460 members
  - BRICS sustainability – 954 members
  - Association of Sustainability Practitioners – 1022 members, etc.
- Discussion on Twitter on the subject by following handles –
  - TreeHuggers.com – 204,612 followers
  - Environmental info – 1,139 followers
  - Climate Reality – 102,702 followers
  - Sustainable Business – 30,231 followers, etc.
- Discussion on Facebook on following pages/links -
  - Sustainable Earth with 144 discussions
  - Earthwatch with 108 discussion, etc.
- Discussion on selected websites/blogs -
  - http://www.guardian.co.uk
  - http://www.theenvironmentalblog.org, etc.

**Emerging Themes**

The process of assembling the digital content, sifting of such material, selecting relevant portions of such material, and interpreting from the collected material is going on. Employing a close reading of the text, and by employing grounded and emergent processes of coding along with constant comparison to the literature as well as the concepts that arise from the materials, we have arrived at the following major themes:

- Sustainability: Evolution of a New Era
- Environmental, Social and Economic Nexus
- Sustainable behavior: Whose Baby is it?
- Choice Editing : A Double Edged Sword
- Authenticity of the Green Claim
- Cultural Connections of Sustainable Behaviors
- Does Altruism Help in Changing the Behavior?
• Drivers of Behavior Change for Corporate entities
• Drivers of Behavior Change for Consumers
We have initial netnographic evidence to support all these themes.

Concluding Remarks

Rachel Carson (1962) noted that “the more clearly we can focus our attention on the wonders and realities of the universe about us, the less taste we shall have for the destruction of our race. Wonder and humility are wholesome emotions, and they do not exist side by side with a lust for destruction.” Her views provide a glimpse of ideas which emerge if we are able to read correctly between the lines. These views are also indicative of issues in an explicit manner which are very pertinent for the discussion underway in this study. One can easily relate the concept of humility to that of self-disciplined behavior that the notion of sustainability demands, and expects, from all its stakeholders.

Peter Drucker (1958) defined marketing as a process through which the economy is integrated into society to serve the human needs. Marketers need to revert to this broad and humane notion of the marketing process, and amalgamate the elements of behaviors towards sustainability in their own corporate actions as well as focus their efforts on shaping the behaviors of linked stakeholders, value chain members, and customers towards sustainability. This effort, if done in earnest, not only has the tremendous capability of lifting up the bottom line of the organizations but also has the ability to cause a reverberating and a long lasting impact on the well being of the environment, the society, and the planet.

Reference

The institutional foundations of materialism in Japan: A replicated empirical test

Miho Miyauchi, Chukyo University, Japan
Pierre McDonagh, Dublin City University, Ireland
William Kilbourne, Clemson University, USA
Masae Takimoto, Osaka University of Economics and Law, Japan
Masaaki Takemura, Meiji University, Japan

Abstract
This paper follows previous empirical study on materialism by Kilbourne et al. (2012). Their study showed relation between materialism and a set of institutionalized patterns of social behavior, referred to as the dominant social paradigm. It was developed and tested in a study of seven industrial, market-based countries. As they did, the materialism related studies have been carried out in Western society based. In this paper, by using the same structured survey data, we tested the relation between materialisms and the dominant social paradigm. Though the results suggest slightly different from original survey, materialism in Japan was related with the dominant social paradigm.

Introduction
This paper shows an empirical result on materialism in Japan. Particularly, by replicating a previous empirical test, we will verify whether these findings can be applied to other countries or not. Replication is very important for scientific research as Easley et al. (2012) said. They revealed that journal editors in both the social and natural sciences were convinced of the importance of replication, but replication tests have rarely been performed in social science. Hubbard and Armstrong (1994) emphasized that a successful replication promoted confidence in the reliability of the previous result, and suggested the need to study whether these findings could be generalized to different situations, geographical areas, and countries. Replication helped to determine the scope and limits of the findings.

We have designed our empirical survey in Japan following Kilbourne et al.'s (2010) study. We think this paper has two main contributions to the Macro marketing academy. First, this paper was designed as a replicable survey. According to previous studies that emphasized the importance of replication (Easley et al. 2000; Evanschitzly et al. 2007; Easley et al. 2012), replication work played a valuable role in ensuring the integrity of a discipline's empirical results. Once a survey is successfully performed, it must be contributed to progress our knowledge, and to develop marketing discipline. However, replications are rare in marketing studies (Hubbard and Armstrong 1994). Perhaps, our study may become one of the first replication surveys ever in the macro marketing academy.

Second, this paper generates new knowledge about materialism from another country than those that have previously been surveyed by Kilbourne et al (2010)'s study. Their work was designed as a huge empirical survey covering seven countries. However all of them were in the West, and excluded many Asian countries. This study will show an empirical result about materialism in Japan. Materialism is one of the most important concepts in consumption and marketing studies (Mick 1996; Burroughs and
Materialism was imported from around the mid 1800s to Japan. It came from Germany, based on Marx's materialism. There is no reason they would have the same concept and meaning. Japan is one of the most developed countries on the planet. It has its own and different culture from the West, and this applied to materialism as well. Materialism might have been developed by the Japanese in their way. Materialism in Japan, however, has never been explored.

To achieve our aim, this paper is organized into these four sections as follows. First, we will briefly review the materialism and organize survey design. Second, empirical results will be shown. Third, we will summarize several results aligned with the previous survey. Fourth, we are going to conclude our findings and discuss future research directions.

Theoretical Framework

In this section, we will work on these tasks. First, we will briefly review materialism. Second, we introduce Kilbourne et al.'s empirical survey. To do so, we will outline the issue of this paper, and trace over the knowledge accumulated.

Materialism

Materialism has a long and varied history with multiple, diverse conceptualizations. Indeed, materialism can be seen anywhere and anytime. (Economic) materialism can be found even in the Bible. Since it is an orientation, materialism is generated whenever human beings and objects are together. In general, materialism is defined as the importance a consumer attaches to worldly possessions (Belk 1984). So, materialism has been studied by many different disciplines, philosophies, historians, sociologists, economists, and consumer researchers. A common characteristic through these disciplines is a mode of expressive behavior by individuals in that it is consumption for purposes other than instrumental value, or the immediate utility, provided by the object possessed (Kilbourne et al. 2010). Thus, in general, materialism is defined as a "set of centrally held beliefs about the importance of possessions in one's life." (Richins and Dawson 1992).

Correspondingly, in this study, materialism is conceptualized as a value orientation. The value orientation research has been studied under consumer research. Much previous research has been done and understood some relations between materialism and consumer buying behavior (Belk 1985; Richins and Dawson 1992; Wang and Wallendorf 2006). In consumer research, this conceptualization means that possessions make consumers happy. Happiness, utility in orthodox economics, can be measured as how many possessions a consumer has. For example, as Yankelovich (1982) notes, materialistic attitudes are held by most American adults, and material objects are a necessity for successfully functioning in modern society.

In this sense, materialism seems conspicuous, especially in industrialized modern societies. It is said there are several agendas on materialism. Some of them tended to comprehend it as a product from these societies, sometimes as pathology. For example, Richin and Dawson (1992) suggested that material values were associated with low self-esteem, dissatisfaction with one's life, and an insatiable desire for higher income. Moschis (1987) indicated that materialistic tendencies were often the most acute in situations in which other, more positive enforcers such as parental guidance and adequate material support were lacking. Furthermore, materialism is sometimes contrasted against human relationships. That is, material possessions often served as surrogates for inadequate or unsatisfying
interpersonal relationships. So, individuals who were more materialistic place a greater emphasis on possessions than on interpersonal relationships (Belk 1985: Richins 1994).

These characteristics of materialism are all related with modernity (Giddens 1985). Some scholars, however, discussed materialism within the context of Western industrial societies (Gabriel and Lang 1995; Daun 1983; Featherstone 1991). The relationship between materialism and other social institutions was addressed in a very general way by Ger (1997) who argued that the development of humane consumption rests on the transformation of the institutions that support the status quo in industrial societies. From this perspective, materialism appears to be deeply embedded in the institutional structure or advanced industrial societies. As we know, Japan is one of the most industrialized countries in the world. Many scholars, however, ignored materialism in Japan, and rarely discussed what materialism in Japan is. We will briefly review about materialism in Japan in the next section.

**Materialism in Japan**

In Japan, materialism is often recognized as Marx’s historical materialism. It was imported in the late nineteenth century. Around this time, Japan was completely changed. In 1853, United States Commodore Matthew Perry ported 4 ships, called the Black ships, at Uraga Harbor new Edo (now Tokyo) in 1853. He was met by representatives of the Tokugawa shogunate who told him to proceed to Nagasaki, where there was limited trade with the Netherlands and which was the only Japanese port open to foreigners at that time.

In 1867, Yoshinobu Tokugawa, the 15th Shogun and the last shogun of the Tokugawa shogunate of Japan, resigned, announcing an “imperial restoration”. At that time, the Edo period ended after 300 years. As many may know, Japan kept a “locked state (national seclusion)” until that time. If materialism had been developed in the Edo era, it was not completely the same as the Western one. So, we will deal with the materialism that prevailed nationwide around World War II. Japan had to restore almost everything that was destroyed, especially metropolitan areas. In 1932, the research on materialism association was established in Japan. The association led discussions and agendas on materialism in Japan, but never increased in popularity.

One, and perhaps the dominant, reason why materialism did not become widespread in Japan was regulation. As we stated above, since materialism came with Marxism, it was regarded as a pernicious thought. Like McCarthyism in the U.S., General MacArthur ordered Prime Minister Shigeru Yoshida to purge all top Communist Party officials from public office. The research on materialism association was monitored by the Public Security Bureau. Research on materialism in Japan has never been popular, but it gradually penetrated our everyday life through the great period of growth in the 1960s.

Both Trommsdorff(1983) and Jagodzinsk(1983) works were one of the earliest works about Japanese materialism. Jagodzinski (1983) reviewed materialism in Japan. He showed that a life-cycle explanation could claim as much empirical evidence as a generational explanation, as long as the overall goodness fit and the sign and strength of the age effects and cohort effects are the only criteria the decision is based upon. Trommsdorff (1983) explored the relationship between socioeconomic change and value change. The general assumptions of the one dimensionality of modern and traditional values and their exclusive character were questioned on the basis of available data from surveys carried out in Japan and in the West. Traditional values in Japan obviously changed in some respects, but remained stable in other aspects. The process of changing values seemed to cause internal conflicts for certain subgroups such as women and adolescents. A comparative analysis could demonstrate that some Japanese values seemed “modern” or “post-materialist” for the West, but they were part of the traditional Japanese value system. Such “modern” values fulfilled different functions in different cultures. A theoretical framework
for the study of social change and changing values was proposed, focusing on macro and micro level processes of change. These studies excelled above all other studies on materialism in Japan, but they did not attempt to replicate studies. What we need to know is whether Japanese materialism is the same as the others or not. We will do that in this paper.

**Dominant Empirical Test on Materialism in Western Societies**

In this section, we will briefly summarize Kilbourne et al. (2012)'s empirical test on materialism in Western countries. They designed an empirical test that covered seven countries, Australia, Canada, France, Germany, Ireland, the United Kingdom, and the United States of America. They carefully designed a data collection method, so that the data collection process within each country was very similar. More specifically, cooperation from a major university within each country was acquired and data were collected from a convenient sample of that university’s students, the majority of whom were enrolled in academic programs in business or economics. Table 1 is a result of participants in each country. And we add our survey results in the right column.

**Table 1 Participant numbers in each country**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Australia</th>
<th>Canada</th>
<th>France</th>
<th>Germany</th>
<th>Ireland</th>
<th>UK</th>
<th>USA</th>
<th>Japan</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Numbers</td>
<td>153</td>
<td>109</td>
<td>199</td>
<td>127</td>
<td>189</td>
<td>336</td>
<td>283</td>
<td>515</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Male (%)</td>
<td>44</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>68</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>58</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(Source: Kilbourne et al. (2010), p. 267 and added Japan’s data)

**Main logic of Kilbourne et al. (2012)’s model**

Figure 1 below shows their model. The model mainly consists of two parts. As we have reviewed above, materialism is often embedded in the institutional structure of societies. Materialism in this paper is regarded as the orientation to the value of a possession. In any society, the availability of possessions is controlled by the production system. This understanding corresponds to Marx’s base and superstructure framework. So, first the institutional structure influences materialism. This relation is depicted as an arrow from DSP to Materialism in Figure 1.

As for DSP, this is an institutional structure any society has. DSP shape the market exchange process; what is produced, how to deliver it, and who can have it. DSP becomes an institutional foundation of materialism. According to Kilbourne et al. (2012)’s work, DSP has five dimensions; political, economic, technology, organization (anthropocentric), and functional (competition). Each dimension has its own two or three elements. They became the measurements in their survey and these scales have been already validated in their survey. So, here we omit these detailed explanations.

Secondly it is constructed by the materialism part. Though materialism is determined by DSP, it determines consumers (i.e. our) happiness and success. It is very easy to imagine that once we possess something valuable, we are happy, and someone regards us as successful. Success, however, can be defined by several aspects. These being admire success, define success, and impress success. Happiness
also can be described by several aspects, afford, better, and happiness itself. The validation test with several indicators, GFI, CFI, and so on, showed good scores in every scale.

With this model construction, they formulated three hypotheses as below.

Hypothesis 1: Materialism within consumers of Western industrial societies may be characterized as a second order construct consisting of three dimensions (success, centrality, and happiness).

Hypothesis 2: A Western industrialized society's DSP is a second-order construct consisting of five dimensions (economic, technological, political, anthropocentric, and competition).

Hypothesis 3: Consumers of Western industrialized societies who exhibit stronger (weaker) agreement with their society's DSP will also exhibit stronger, more (less) favorable opinions about their materialistic tendencies.

Research Methodology

In this section, it is logical by academic manner that we refer to Kilboune et al. (2012)’s procedures. However due to this paper limitations, we instead introduce our survey procedure following theirs.

Data Collection

In their survey, a multinational study was designed and data was collected from seven Western industrial countries (Australia, Canada, France, Germany, Ireland, the United Kingdom, and the United States). Their data collection processes were mainly from university students. More specifically, cooperation from a major university within each country was acquired and data was collected from a sample of that university's students, the majority of whom were enrolled in academic programs in business or economics.

In contrast to their process, we employed internet data collection. Macromil Co.,Ltd. collected this data. The participation in this study was voluntary and no incentives were offered in return for their participation. The questionnaire was translated into Japanese. Standard back-translation protocol was used in this case. The survey period was two days from the 23rd to the 24th of August in 2011. We used SPSS 16.0 and Amos 6.0 for analysis, including the imputation of missing values using full information maximum likelihood estimates.

The size and gender composition of the Japanese sample was 515 people and 48 percent male. The average age was 41.6.
Measurement Instrument

As seen in figure 1, we completely follow from Kilbourne et al. (2012)'s survey so that only thing we have to take care with is the survey translation. We employed the back-translation method (Brislin 1985, 1986). First we interpreted the original questionnaire items into Japanese. Then, more than two people who are fluent in both languages interpreted it into English independently. We repeated this process again and again until the differences between the two interpretations was minimized.

Since the model has already been developed and empirically tested, we have to follow it rigorously. Every item in the questionnaire is listed in table 2. Japanese questionnaire items shows in Appendix. All items in Japanese version are the same place corresponding to the original questionnaire.
Table 2. Questionnaire items

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Dominant Social Paradigm</th>
<th>Political dimension</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Freedom</td>
<td>Individual freedom should be the political goal to be achieved in society.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Property</td>
<td>Private property should be protected as a fundamental freedom.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Government</td>
<td>We should limit the government’s role in the choices people make.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Economic dimension</td>
<td>Individual behavior should be determined by economic self-interest.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interest</td>
<td>The best measure of progress is economic.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Progress</td>
<td>If the economy continues to grow everyone benefits.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Growth</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Technology dimension</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hope</td>
<td>Advancing technology provides us with hope for the future.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Good</td>
<td>The good effects of technology outweigh its bad effects.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Control</td>
<td>Advancing technology is under control.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anthropocentric dimension</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Humans</td>
<td>What is best for humans is more important than what is best for nature.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Resource</td>
<td>It is alright for humans to use nature as a resource for economic purpose.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use nature</td>
<td>Nature has value because it is useful for human purposes.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Competition dimension</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Natural</td>
<td>It is natural to be competitive.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Important</td>
<td>Competition is more important for survival in nature than cooperation.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Beneficial</td>
<td>Competition promotes the good of nature in the end.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Materialism</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Success dimension</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Admire</td>
<td>I admire people who own expensive homes, cars, and clothes.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Define</td>
<td>The things I own say a lot about how I am doing in life.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Impress</td>
<td>I like to own things that impress people.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Centrality dimension</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Luxury</td>
<td>I like a lot of luxury in my life.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Simple</td>
<td>I try to keep my life simple, as far as</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
According to Kilbourne et al. (2012), the DSP was developed and used by Kilbourne, et al. (2002) and more, and with their survey they added some slight modifications in wording to accurately reflect the domain of each of the five DSP dimensions (i.e., economic, technology, political, anthropocentrism, and competition). Each DSP dimension was measured with three, seven-point Likert items, with response options ranging from 1 "strongly disagree" to 7 "strongly agree." They added additional wording to some items, but we did not. As we specified regarding the source in Table 2, we completely translated verbatim from the previous survey.

Results

This study replicates Kilbourne et al. (2012)’s procedure, but the purpose is to know the relation between materialism and DSP not in a Western country, but Japan. So we will not employ a two-step approach which they used. The two-step approach is used to test the structural model. In the first step, the measurement model is assessed, and the second step examines the structural model. We will examine the second step procedure, the structural model test.

The first goal was to examine the basic structure of the DSP and materialism constructs, and the second goal was to examine the structural relationship between the DSP and materialism. Their purpose has been to test them within a multinational setting containing Western industrial societies, but ours is to do so in Japan, not necessarily in Westernized society.

Overall, complete replication has not been achieved. However statistical software replied that the solution was not appropriate. There are several expectations for that result. First of all and with academic honesty, Japan is not like Western society. The second reason, in this paper, we used web collected data. The data included respondents from more than just university students. So, we are planning another survey for university students. We will be able to report it at the conference presentation. Third, observable variables did not converge to the small number of factors which the previous study expected. Fourthly, there is some interruption among the latent variables, because when we tried another way, we found another structure model.

So, we added some modification to the procedure as follows. First, we should find how many factors were there in our data sets of DSP and materialism. Then, second we will explore the Exploratory factor analysis sometime used for this procedure (Thompson 2004). The rule of this procedure is organized by these three. Number one; we will omit items which have a communality score below .4. Number two; we will omit items which have a factor loading score for several items over .6. Number three; we will omit items which have a factor loading score .4.

**Exploratory factor analysis**
The first procedure is to know the DSP structure. Exploratory factor analysis found five dimensions. Reliability for each of the scales was also assessed using the coefficient α. The first factor is .92, related to economic. The second factor, coefficient α is .91, related to competition. The third factor is scored as .88, related to political. The fourth factor is .86 as technology. The last, fifth factor is .76, political again.

In many studies employed for exploratory research such as this, α values of .50 or, higher are acceptable. We can say that DSP is a second-ordered construct, but an anthropocentric dimension was not found.

Second, exploratory factor analysis was applied to materialism’s 12 items. Only one factor was derived. The cumulative ratio is .54. This factor consisted of five items (Q2-1,2,3,4,5), α values are .85. Materialism is not a second-ordered construct in Japan.

**Structural equation analysis**

According to factor analysis, our theoretical expectation has not been achieved. Even though, we tried to test by omitting some variables. As we did for DSP, we treated structural equation analysis for DSP and materialism. This is related to hypothesis 1 and 2. They are listed below again.

Hypothesis 1: Materialism within consumers of Western industrial societies may be characterized as a second order construct consisting of three dimensions (success, centrality, and happiness).

Hypothesis 2: A Western industrialized society’s DSP is a second-order construct consisting of five dimensions (economic, technological, political, anthropocentric, and competition).

![Materialism - Structural equation model in Japan](image.png)

**Figure 2. The Structural equation model for materialism in Japan**

Figure 2 shows the result from this analysis. Materialism consists of two factors. From the structural equation model, materialism in Japan is a second-ordered construct, but not completely the same to the previous study expected. Table 3 shows materialism related indicators. It is somewhat difficult to say that hypothesis 1 is validated.

**Table 3. Materialism related indicators**
Figure 3 shows the result of DSP as well. DSP is consisted of five factors. From the structural equation model, DSP in Japan is a second-ordered construct, and completely the same to the previous study expected. Materialism related indicators are listed in Table 4. Hypothesis 2 is validated from this result.

![Figure 3. The Structural equation model for DSP in Japan](image)

### Table 4. DSP related indicators

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>$\chi^2$</th>
<th>$df$</th>
<th>GFI</th>
<th>CFI</th>
<th>IFI</th>
<th>RMSEA</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Japan</td>
<td>241</td>
<td>73</td>
<td>0.932</td>
<td>0.942</td>
<td>0.943</td>
<td>0.067</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Integrated structural equation model**

Once we tried to analyze with the original model, the software replied that the trial reached the
limitation of repeats. One of the reasons for this result is the anthropocentric variable. The variance of error indicated in this variable is too small. Some variables are closely related with anthropocentric variables. Then, we dropped this variable off and tested it with the structural equation model. Figure 4 shows the integrated model in Japan, and Table 5 is filled with integrated related indicators. Now, we know DSP and materialism relationship in Japan, but we cannot honestly say that hypothesis 3 is validated.

![Diagram](image)

Figure 4. DSP and materialism in Japan

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>$\chi^2$</th>
<th>df</th>
<th>GFI</th>
<th>CFI</th>
<th>IFI</th>
<th>RMSEA</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Japan</td>
<td>329</td>
<td>113</td>
<td>0.926</td>
<td>0.941</td>
<td>0.941</td>
<td>0.061</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Discussion and Conclusions**

Materialism has been examined from many different perspectives in Western industrial societies. In this paper, we attempted a replication of Kilbourne et al. (2012)’s empirical survey. Here we listed our
findings that related to three hypotheses. DSP in Japan is a second-ordered construct with five dimensions. So, hypothesis 2 is validated. In contrast, materialism in Japan is constructed with two dimensions. We can hardly say hypothesis 1 is validated and hypothesis 3 has been partially validated.

There can be several reasons. As we discussed before, data collection was not completely the same as the original survey. Japan is not a Westernized country, and we do not have a society which has meanings the same as Western society. It is not the same result as the original survey, however DSP and materialism is related even in Japan. We found the positive structural coefficient between the DSP and materialism.

There were two main purposes for this study. The first was this is first survey replicated from a previous study in Japan. Now we can compare with these studies. The second purpose was to examine empirically the relationship between the DSP and materialism empirically in Japan. We can say that this was achieved. To compare easily, we listed all indicators from Japan’s survey in the original tables below (Table 6 and 7).

Table 6. Individual countries with full sample

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Materialism Values</th>
<th>£²</th>
<th>df</th>
<th>GFI</th>
<th>CFI</th>
<th>IFI</th>
<th>RMSEA</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Australia</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>.930</td>
<td>.944</td>
<td>.943</td>
<td>.087</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Canada</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>.934</td>
<td>.961</td>
<td>.962</td>
<td>.074</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>France</td>
<td>57</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>.944</td>
<td>.951</td>
<td>.952</td>
<td>.083</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Germany</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>.938</td>
<td>.967</td>
<td>.968</td>
<td>.070</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UK</td>
<td>92</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>.944</td>
<td>.942</td>
<td>.942</td>
<td>.092</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ireland</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>.952</td>
<td>.961</td>
<td>.962</td>
<td>.068</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>US</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>.969</td>
<td>.983</td>
<td>.983</td>
<td>.052</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Japan</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>.932</td>
<td>.942</td>
<td>.943</td>
<td>.067</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>DSP</th>
<th>£²</th>
<th>df</th>
<th>GFI</th>
<th>CFI</th>
<th>IFI</th>
<th>RMSEA</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Australia</td>
<td>112</td>
<td>67</td>
<td>.904</td>
<td>.914</td>
<td>.918</td>
<td>.067</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Canada</td>
<td>83</td>
<td>67</td>
<td>.907</td>
<td>.966</td>
<td>.967</td>
<td>.047</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>France</td>
<td>97</td>
<td>67</td>
<td>.934</td>
<td>.933</td>
<td>.937</td>
<td>.048</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Germany</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>67</td>
<td>.900</td>
<td>.912</td>
<td>.918</td>
<td>.063</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UK</td>
<td>162</td>
<td>67</td>
<td>.937</td>
<td>.888</td>
<td>.891</td>
<td>.065</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ireland</td>
<td>118</td>
<td>67</td>
<td>.922</td>
<td>.893</td>
<td>.900</td>
<td>.064</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>US</td>
<td>121</td>
<td>67</td>
<td>.940</td>
<td>.933</td>
<td>.935</td>
<td>.054</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Japan</td>
<td>241</td>
<td>73</td>
<td>.932</td>
<td>.942</td>
<td>.943</td>
<td>.067</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Kilbourne et al. (2012), Table 2, p. 270 added Japanese data.

Table 7. Model comparisons for materialism and DSP
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Aus</th>
<th>Can</th>
<th>Fra</th>
<th>Ger</th>
<th>UK</th>
<th>Ire</th>
<th>US</th>
<th>Japan</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Success</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Admire</td>
<td>.81</td>
<td>.84</td>
<td>.73</td>
<td>.71</td>
<td>.77</td>
<td>.64</td>
<td>.69</td>
<td>.82</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Define</td>
<td>.62</td>
<td>.72</td>
<td>.80</td>
<td>.51</td>
<td>.77</td>
<td>.80</td>
<td>.80</td>
<td>.68</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Impress</td>
<td>.74</td>
<td>.79</td>
<td>.81</td>
<td>.85</td>
<td>.79</td>
<td>.76</td>
<td>.85</td>
<td>.69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Centrality</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Luxury</td>
<td>.89</td>
<td>.79</td>
<td>.83</td>
<td>.91</td>
<td>.81</td>
<td>.81</td>
<td>.86</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Simple</td>
<td>.36</td>
<td>.36</td>
<td>.40</td>
<td>.43</td>
<td>.36</td>
<td>.33</td>
<td>.52</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pleasure</td>
<td>.38</td>
<td>.63</td>
<td>.52</td>
<td>.42</td>
<td>.55</td>
<td>.65</td>
<td>.59</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Happiness</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Afford</td>
<td>.70</td>
<td>.64</td>
<td>.54</td>
<td>.74</td>
<td>.57</td>
<td>.59</td>
<td>.69</td>
<td>.51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Better</td>
<td>.86</td>
<td>.67</td>
<td>.78</td>
<td>.84</td>
<td>.85</td>
<td>.81</td>
<td>.82</td>
<td>.68</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Happy</td>
<td>.83</td>
<td>.92</td>
<td>.90</td>
<td>.92</td>
<td>.89</td>
<td>.82</td>
<td>.87</td>
<td>.83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>DSP</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Political</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Freedom</td>
<td>.71</td>
<td>.61</td>
<td>.49</td>
<td>.57</td>
<td>.57</td>
<td>.45</td>
<td>.58</td>
<td>.77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Property</td>
<td>.51</td>
<td>.76</td>
<td>.83</td>
<td>.52</td>
<td>.59</td>
<td>.86</td>
<td>.66</td>
<td>.55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Government</td>
<td>.50</td>
<td>.47</td>
<td>.28</td>
<td>.42</td>
<td>.39</td>
<td>.31</td>
<td>.67</td>
<td>.77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Economic</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interest</td>
<td>.58</td>
<td>.74</td>
<td>.51</td>
<td>.54</td>
<td>.71</td>
<td>.54</td>
<td>.53</td>
<td>.85</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Progress</td>
<td>.77</td>
<td>.80</td>
<td>.84</td>
<td>.73</td>
<td>.68</td>
<td>.73</td>
<td>.73</td>
<td>.75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Growth</td>
<td>.67</td>
<td>.74</td>
<td>.51</td>
<td>.78</td>
<td>.50</td>
<td>.63</td>
<td>.66</td>
<td>.93</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Technology</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hope</td>
<td>.70</td>
<td>.74</td>
<td>.62</td>
<td>.62</td>
<td>.51</td>
<td>.41</td>
<td>.57</td>
<td>.84</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Good</td>
<td>.74</td>
<td>.82</td>
<td>.86</td>
<td>.77</td>
<td>.77</td>
<td>.87</td>
<td>.84</td>
<td>.65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Control</td>
<td>.65</td>
<td>.62</td>
<td>.60</td>
<td>.60</td>
<td>.60</td>
<td>.49</td>
<td>.59</td>
<td>.83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Anthropocentric</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Humans</td>
<td>.82</td>
<td>.84</td>
<td>.59</td>
<td>.53</td>
<td>.76</td>
<td>.77</td>
<td>.80</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Resource</td>
<td>.57</td>
<td>.66</td>
<td>.33</td>
<td>.69</td>
<td>.64</td>
<td>.63</td>
<td>.65</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Use nature</strong></td>
<td>.42</td>
<td>.51</td>
<td>.68</td>
<td>.45</td>
<td>.41</td>
<td>.39</td>
<td>.43</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Competition</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Important</td>
<td>.73</td>
<td>.70</td>
<td>.58</td>
<td>.64</td>
<td>.67</td>
<td>.69</td>
<td>.68</td>
<td>.89</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Beneficial</td>
<td>.76</td>
<td>.78</td>
<td>.63</td>
<td>.85</td>
<td>.73</td>
<td>.57</td>
<td>.81</td>
<td>.86</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Structural Model</strong></td>
<td>.58</td>
<td>.44</td>
<td>.57</td>
<td>.61</td>
<td>.56</td>
<td>.65</td>
<td>.54</td>
<td>.54</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**References**


Appendix Questionnaire in Japanese

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>支配的な社会パラダイム</th>
<th>政治的面</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>自由</td>
<td>個人の自由は、社会において達成されるべき政治的目標だ</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>所有</td>
<td>個人の資産は、基本的な自由として守られるべきだ</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>政府</td>
<td>人々の選択に対する政府の影響は、限定されるべきだ</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>経済的面</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>興味</td>
<td>経済成長を促進する社会が好きだ</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>進捗</td>
<td>社会の進捗を測定するには、経済成長をみるのが一番だ</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>成長</td>
<td>経済成長し続けることが、みんなのためになる</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>テクノロジー的面</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>希望</td>
<td>テクノロジーの発展が将来の希望を与えてくれる</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>善</td>
<td>テクノロジーが生み出すプラスの効果はマイナスの効果に勝る</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>管理</td>
<td>人間は、テクノロジーが生み出すマイナスの効果を管理できる</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>人間中心的面</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>人間</td>
<td>人間にとっての最善が、自然にとっての最善より重要だ</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>資源</td>
<td>経済的目指のため、人間は自然を資源として利用する権利がある</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>自然利用</td>
<td>自然は人間の目的のために利用されてきた</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>競争的面</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>当然性</td>
<td>競争的であるというのは、人間の性質だ</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>重要性</td>
<td>競争は、協調よりも良い社会的結果を生み出す</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>有益性</td>
<td>競争は、結局みんなに恩恵をもたらす</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>唯物主義</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>成功的面</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>賞賛</td>
<td>高価な住宅／車／服を有する人々に懐される</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>定義</td>
<td>モノによってその所有者の人生が表されると思う</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>感銘</td>
<td>他人への印象に残るモノを持ちたいと思う</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>中心的面</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>変更</td>
<td>人生を変更品で満たしたい</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>シンプル</td>
<td>所有物については、人生をシンプルに保ちたい</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>快楽</td>
<td>ショッピングが多くの快楽を与えてくれる</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>幸福的面</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>余裕</td>
<td>欲しいモノすべてを購入する余裕がないとイラライする</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>より良い</td>
<td>現在は未所有だが、あるモノがあれば人生はもっと良くなる</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>幸せ</td>
<td>もっとモノを買え余裕があれば、幸せになれるのにと思う</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Wednesday June 5, 2013  
2:30p-3:30p  
Concurrent Session III

**Vulnerable Consumer Segments and Developing Markets: Emerging Issues and Future Directions**

**Panel**  
Chair: Thomas Klein, University of Toledo, USA

**Panelists:**

**Operationalizing the constructs of the Integrative Justice Model**  
Tina Facca, John Carroll University, USA

**Santo Domingo: Subsistence marketplace and institutional changes**  
Kyle McDonough, Loyola University - Chicago, USA  
Steven Brinks, Loyola University - Chicago, USA  
Clifford Shultz, II, Loyola University - Chicago, USA  
Raymond Benton, Jr., Loyola University - Chicago, USA
Vulnerable Consumer Segments and Developing Markets: Emerging Issues and Future Directions

Panel

Thomas Klein, University of Toledo, USA (Chair)
Tina Facca, John Carroll University, USA
Kyle McDonough, Loyola University - Chicago, USA
Steven Brinks, Loyola University - Chicago, USA
Clifford Shultz, II, Loyola University - Chicago, USA
Raymond Benton, Jr., Loyola University - Chicago, USA

Thomas A. Klein, Chair, University of Toledo (Emeritus) and Trident University International

This panel addresses a perennial macromarketing question: How well is the marketing system responding to the special problems of consumer segments with the least power in the economic system? This session, though diverse in contents, is inspired by systems implications of the social justice principle. The panel’s comments should motivate junior scholars to engage with this important macromarketing research topic.

Tina Facca, John Carroll University
Operationalizing the constructs of the Integrative Justice Model

To assist marketers with evidence of its measurability and practical applicability, this research develops a structure for operationalizing constructs of the “Integrative Justice Model” (IJM), i.e., determining the measured variables representing a construct and the way in which it will be measured and understanding the extent to which the measured variables actually represent the theoretical latent constructs. Primary data will be gathered from high-ranking marketers and managers in both for- and non-profit organizations to validate the measurement of five theoretical constructs within the IJM. The general hypothesis is that the measured variables will be statistically representative of the theoretical constructs of just marketing as proposed by the IJM. Additional hypotheses might include that there are significant differences between the elements of the IJM, between traditional entrepreneurs and social entrepreneurs or for- vs. non-profits, and that just marketing is predictive of sustainable outcomes (e.g., increased number served, continued funding, increased donations). Future research may develop an IJM index or audit to help marketers measure their level of just marketing, particularly when marketing to, for, or with the poor. Further, we envision the IJM serving as a foundation for teaching marketing skills in subsistence contexts.

Kyle McDonough, Steven Brinks, Clifford Shultz, II, and Raymond Benton, Jr. (presenter), Loyola University, Chicago
Santo Domingo: Subsistence marketplace and institutional changes

Several Caribbean countries can be categorized as subsistence marketplaces. The Dominican Republic is among them. This presentation reports on a project intended to understand micro-entrepreneurs in
Santo Domingo. The methodology employed is reviewed and four reoccurring themes are discussed. Despite existing roadblocks, Dominican people are able to establish themselves as entrepreneurs and to drive their future development through self-motivation and hard work. While some people have the skills required to manage businesses, they often lack operational expertise or business training to develop them into regular sources of income. Much of this is due to the lack of funding and support for education in the Dominican Republic. While funding is necessary, as important is what is being taught. An innovative micro-enterprise consulting project at Loyola University, Chicago is reviewed as a possible educational model to provide the business training needed by micro-enterprise entrepreneurs.

**Summary:** Consumer vulnerability issues deserving both research and policy attention regarding obstacles and paths to improved market power and practice are examined. The framework for Santos and Facca is integrative social justice and the “preferential option” criterion for evaluating marketing decisions and systems – requiring an impact assessment on the most vulnerable market participants. While this preferential option is most often cited as rooted in moral theology, e.g., in Catholic Social Thought and other religious traditions, it is also found in John Rawls’ “difference principle,” calling for narrowing differences between better and worst off members of society. Yet another framework for this preference is recently proposed by Eric Brown (“Vulnerability and the Basis of Business Ethics: From Fiduciary Duties to Professionalism,” *Journal of Business Ethics*, 113:489-504), that business executives, politicians, and regulators have an obligation to look after the interests of their most vulnerable stakeholders comparable to the obligations of such other professionals as physicians, teachers, and public safety officials. Finally, the presentations by Rahtz and Benton provide a necessary applied perspective on, respectively, the potential impact of prohibiting “facilitation payments” on foreign investment in LDCs and the need to support indigenous entrepreneurs with technical and financial assistance.
### Markets and Individualization, Insecuritization and Depoliticization

**Abstract/Papers Included**

**Individualising the Gospel: Neo-liberalism in mega-church practice**  
Jeaney Yip, University of Sydney, Australia  
Susan Ainsworth, University of Melbourne, Australia

**A tale of two food systems: Rescripting neoliberal discourse on the food gap in America**  
Kim McKeage, Hamline University, USA  
Emma Schroeder, Hamline University, USA

**No more happy subjects? Approaches to reshaping the labour market and neoliberal politics of work**  
Mikko Laamanen, Hanken School of Economics, Finland

**Our neoliberal sentiment: Macromarketing and Consumer Culture Theory**  
James Fitchett, University of Leicester, UK  
Georgios Patsiaouras, University of Leicester, UK  
Per Ostergaard, University of Southern Denmark, Denmark
Individualising the Gospel: neo-liberalism in mega-church practice

Jeaney Yip, University of Sydney
Susan Ainsworth, University of Melbourne

Abstract

The primacy of the market as an organising principle for social relations and the elevation of the consumer to be a ‘sovereign’ or primary social identity are by products of neo-liberalism. Moreover, within neo-liberalism, people are encouraged to behave and to think about themselves in particular ways. In this paper, we focus on understanding the dynamics and influence of neo-liberalism in mega-church practice. More specifically, we discuss the form this takes in relation to how ‘enterprise discourse’ – the trend where the non-economic becomes increasingly defined in economic terms – constructs an ideal type of identity for its subjects – the ‘enterprise self’. This is an identity where individuals exhibit autonomy, self-regulation, self-reliance, personal responsibility and self-improvement. We demonstrate how the mega-church facilitates in constructing this enterprise self through market-like individualized Gospels for self-empowerment in pursuit of excellence.

Introduction

Neo-liberalism has had profound consequences and implications on religious organisations, in terms of its expressions and practices worldwide but has neglected scholarly attention (Gauthier, Martikainen and Woodhead 2013). Using mega-churches to understand this neglect, we critique its legitimations, power and permeations in the ways in which it structures, organises, shapes and governs religious organisations. Mega-churches are large Protestant churches with a congregation size of at least 2000 members (Thumma and Travis 2007); although many have exceeded this indicator with congregation sizes of more than 20,000 members as phenomenal growth is achieved within a short time-frame. Many claim non-denominationalist but are often Pentecostal in practice and theology. The mega-church phenomenon is socio-culturally constructed and embraces the market and marketing discourse along with ideologies of freedom of choice, liberal individualistic notions of a person’s choice of faith – all by products of neo-liberalism. These are in fact defining discourses of ‘Americanness’ (Ahdar 2006) as well as Pentecostalism being an American construction (Bonsu and Belk 2010).

Neo-liberalism and Marketing Discourse

Neo-liberalism is a governing technique that centres on the optimization of life; which appears to migrate from site to site as it interacts with various other discourses (Ong 2006). Marketing is a vehicle of managerial ideology which promotes the values of economic neo-liberalism (Hackley 2009). This managerial ideology, what du Gay calls the ‘enterprise discourse’ (1997 p.299) is seen as universally applicable but is seldom questioned. When neo-liberalism in the form of marketing managerialism is introduced in sites previously not related to markets and business (as in education, Bradshaw and Tadajewski 2011; Varman et al 2011; in healthcare Varman and Vikas 2007), a transformation process takes place where market-driven calculations are being introduced in the management of practices and the centralization of the subject position of a customer. Therefore, this research is interested in
questioning how neo-liberalism posits marketing to become the prime factor in shaping religious practices in contemporary churches such as the mega-church. While it is acknowledged that religion affects market activities (Mittelstaedt 2002) and that religion has been imbued with a commercial character (Bonsu and Belk 2010), we are concerned in this research in terms of not merely affirming religion’s succumb to neo-liberalism but attempts to question how it has become legitimized. We demonstrate the extent of legitimized performativity through mega-church practice in constructing market-like individualized Gospels for self-empowerment in pursuit of excellence.

Methodology

Hillsong is a highly successful mega-Church based in Australia and a global market leader in Christian worship music with its own music label, Hillsong Music Australia. It is regularly cited as Australia’s largest independent church with over 25,000 attendees in its total congregation. A range of textual, audio and visual data such as sermons, music lyrics, reports, booklets, brochures, website information, recordings of church services, newsletters, pictorial records of events, services and facilities are included in the data set; as well as three public interview transcripts and seven books written by church pastors. The first author attended several Hillsong services and made extensive field notes of the experiences from the period between 2003-2009. Using discourse analysis (Fairclough 2003; Martin and Rose 2003), we identified the range of discourses that were apparent in the texts. This consists of identifying words and expressions that belonged to a particular lexical register and also provided indications of the connections between the texts and their contexts (Paltrridge 2006).

Individualising the Gospel

Hillsong’s mission statement reads: ‘To reach and influence the world by building a large Bible-based church, changing mindsets, and empowering people to lead and impact in every sphere of life’ (www.myhillsong.com/church). The first and foremost mission of the church is to have global impact by building itself. The latter part of the mission pertains to the individual and every artefact produced by Hillsong Church foregrounds the individual and how their brand of church assists in their self-improvement, empowerment and success.

In pursuing its mission to empower people, Hillsong draws upon this discourse which frames itself as a church that caters to an individual’s spiritual, personal and psychological development that rests on the individual’s authority to activate:

To know the fullness of life He promised, we should be willing to be accountable and take responsibility (Houston 2005, p. 27).

This is a form of what Heelas (1996, p. 21) term ‘unmediated individualism: I am my own authority’. Therefore every other voice of authority, whether they emanate from experts, gurus or any established religion, is mediated by the ‘epistemological individualist’ (Wallis, 1984, p. 100). This form of internalised locus of authority transforms the individual to think and feel that they alone are responsible for their lives. An explicit example of this form of self-sacralisation is demonstrated in a book entitled, For this I was Born: aligning your vision to God’s cause, written by the senior pastor Brian Houston in 2008. While the ‘I’ in this title refers to the author of the book, it is also a subject position targeted at the individual. The title is based on the Bible verse from John 18:37 (NIV) that states:

“You are King then!” said Pilate. Jesus answered “You are right in saying I am a King. In fact for this reason I was born, and for this I came into the world, to testify to the truth. Everyone on the side of truth listens to me”.

This verse is an explicit statement declaring Jesus’ identity several hours before His crucifixion. He
Excellence

“The best is yet to come”
(Houston 2006, no page number)

This expression is taken from a book entitled Selah...pause and think about it! which is a collection of Brian Houston’s ‘statements, sayings and thoughts that have shaped the culture of Hillsong Church’ (2006, front cover). This expression is regularly and frequently communicated in multiple contexts (at the end of a blog post, greeting or sermon, in the front cover of a book dedication) as a form of encouragement to the congregation which is akin to a verbal signature by the senior pastor. While expression of this discourse is vague and abstract, it is also a simplistic offer of hope for the individual to keep believing for the ‘best’ to come in their lives. The ‘best’ is up to the individual to envision and personalise but it is a positive ‘thing’ to ponder that is constantly communicated and reinforced by the church pastor.

Governed by a market mentality, the enterprise discourse subjects individuals within it to ‘enterprising qualities such as self-reliance, personal responsibility, boldness and a willingness to take risks in the pursuit of goals’ (du Gay, 1996, p. 56). The church’s discourse of excellence seeks to cultivate ‘enterprising subjects’ who are productive in every sphere of their lives, which is explicitly communicated in the church’s mission statement of ‘....changing mindsets, and empowering people to lead and impact in every sphere of life’ (www.myhillsong.com/church). Through this, the believer is a religious consumer who is constructed as an active individual in search of meaning and the church is the ‘excellent organisation’ that not only can provide that meaning but also encourages them to be excellent and enterprising in their own lives. The belief that their ‘best is yet to come’ is a blanket of comfort for every individual regardless of background or life’s situation as this discourse of excellence can be configured and fantasised to different identities and aspirations for progress or growth. While this is common ordinary people’s aspirations, ‘the best is yet to come’ becomes a futuristic, never-ending empowering form of promise that cannot be exhausted although it can be measured according to people’s material circumstance in terms of what they perceive ‘best’ to be.

Discussion

du Gay (1996) argues that the most dramatic discursive expression of the ‘enterprising self’ is manifested in the ‘culture of the customer’ which pervades contemporary organisations that are
governed by a market mentality. In this case, through linguistic structures that emancipate the ‘I’ and invoke the agency of the individual, it is apparent that church goers are positioned as customers. According to du Gay (1996), consumers are constituted as independent, self-regulating and self-actualising actors ‘seeking to maximise their quality of life – optimising the worth of their existence to themselves – by assembling a lifestyle, or lifestyles, through personalized acts of choice in the market place’ (p. 77). Hillsong Church offers this choice in the marketplace with individualised offers of hope, empowerment and blessings that is endorsed by its Christian label and packaged in the Hillsong brand. The church facilitates neo-liberal subject positions, which is individually-focussed and operates with egoistic orientations towards society, well being and any kind of gain. In a context of individualism where the erosion of traditional institutionalised religions is evident our findings support the corporate takeover of religion as a subjectivization tactic to shape ‘neo-liberal’ selves (Carrette and King 2005). This does not mean that the Christian discourses have totally disappeared. Rather, they have been blended with market discourses in order to construct an appealing religious product that is resonant to current consumer ideologies.

Conclusion

Neoliberalism governmentality results from the infiltration of market-driven truths and calculations into the domain of religion. It appears that this infiltration has been reproduced and sustained by mega-churches, fueled by similar neoliberal aspirations thereby making the mega-church a product of neoliberalism. The economic rhetoric of the ‘marketplace’ speaks of a free market and a consumer who is free to exert his/her individual authority; a stance that most people in developed societies are comfortable and familiar with. It is no surprise that branded churches such as Hillsong employ this rhetoric in marketing religion, enacted through the familiar consumption ideologies of choice, freedom and individual empowerment. While this observation towards individualized spirituality is not new (Kale 2004), the process of colonisation is substantial and does not merely leave its imprint in language as this research demonstrates. Religion is not immune to the global effects of consumer culture that has the ability to convert anything into a marketable product (Bonsu and Belk 2010). Marketing legitimizes self-serving corporatism (Klein 2001) and upon engaging with this discourse by implication, a religious organization will have to strategically manage both godly and market interests. While this is not surprising, it is also clear that the spread of neo-liberalism is carried forth through subjective reworking of religion as a disseminator of market logic. Therefore as long as mega-churches continue to openly and strategically co-opt consumer-oriented marketing discourse, they contribute towards the advancement and privileging of corporatism that serve its own interests and ‘worships at the altar of neoliberal ideology’ (Carrette & King 2005, p.28). In turn, this has potential to shape religious practice in general if other churches see this as a successful model worthy of emulation.

References


Houston, B. (2006), *Selah...pause and think about it!* Sydney: Leadership Ministries.

Houston, B. (2008), *For this I was born: Aligning your vision to God’s cause*. Nashville: Thomas Nelson.


A Tale of Two Food Systems: Rescripting Neoliberal Discourse on the Food Gap in America

Kim McKeage, Hamline University, St. Paul, MN, USA
Emma Schroeder, Hamline University, St. Paul, MN, USA

Mark Winne’s account of his work with food systems in Hartford, Connecticut demonstrates the inaccuracy of the term “food system” in the U.S. Instead, he recounts a tale of two food systems, with a growing gap between them. One is the impoverished foodscape of urban and rural food deserts, while the other is an abundant market space of fresh, organic, fair-trade, farm-raised foods. This does not “just happen” - members of food distribution channels chase the top dollars that educated, affluent consumers will spend for “real” food while simultaneously abandoning those at the lower levels of the market. Progress on solving the food inadequacy problems of the low end is met with the high end skyrocketing to further unreachable levels. The memes of choice and personal responsibility rule food discourse. The macromarketing lens allows us to focus on this gap, and contemplate what it will take to close it.

Introduction

“It was the best of times, it was the worst of times, it was the age of wisdom, it was the age of foolishness, it was the epoch of belief, it was the epoch of incredulity, it was the season of Light, it was the season of Darkness, it was the spring of hope, it was the winter of despair, we had everything before us, we had nothing before us, we were all going direct to Heaven, we were all going direct the other way ...”

Charles Dickens (1859) A Tale of Two Cities

“We have in America today a tale of two food systems – one for the poor and one for everyone else.” (p. 175)

Mark Winne (2008) Closing the Food Gap

In his account of his work with food systems in Hartford, Connecticut, Mark Winne (2008) points out that it is not really accurate to talk about “the food system” in the U.S. Instead, he recounts a tale of two food systems, with a growing gap between them. Those familiar with food justice research will recognize his characterizations of these two markets, but it is worth repeating the salient attributes of each.

System 1

A complex marketplace of choices includes many options to appeal to the discriminating palate. The educated, relatively affluent (at least middle class) shoppers in this market hale from the suburbs where they typically have their choice of nationally-branded supermarkets, as well as groceries available through big-box discount stores and their local whole-foods type markets and ethnic grocers. Organic foods are widely available both fresh and in packaged form, and consumers often seek local and non-
GMO versions of foods. The daily diet includes fresh fruits and vegetables, and meat choices are increasingly cruelty free and avoid processed forms. Some consumers have adopted vegetarian or vegan diets, made easier by year-round access to grains, vegetables, fruits, and “meat substitutes.” Despite all these standard retail options, the food consumer may prefer to patronize a farmers’ market or CSA, at least in season.

**System 2**

A complex marketplace of choices includes many options to appeal to the budget-conscious consumer. The harried consumer can choose from frozen meals, frozen and packaged ingredients that are readily converted into hearty, satisfying dinners, or sometimes splurge on home meal replacements from the grocery deli. Alternatively, these urban or rural consumers may have restricted access to branded supermarkets, shopping instead at big box discounters or even at convenience stores or liquor stores. In many cases fast food restaurants are more readily available than grocery stores, and the value menu provides inexpensive bulk to fill up a family. The daily diet includes frozen and canned vegetables and fruit, and may rely somewhat heavily on processed potato products such as French fries or potato chips. Some consumers have adopted vegetarian or vegan diets as a way to cope with the expense of meat. Consumers rarely have the up-front cash to invest in a CSA and may not have access to distant farmers’ markets. Indeed, many of these consumers experience food insecurity and rely on food shelves or other assistance (such as the supplemental nutrition program SNAP) at some point in their lives.

As familiar as we may be with this dichotomy, the situation Winne (2008) raises as a concern is not the fact that this gap exists – that problem is old news. Rather, the critical issue focused on here is that the gap is not closing – indeed it seems to be widening. As programs are put in place to try to deal with the food insecurity and nutritional problems of the poor, some improvements result. However simultaneously the foodscape for those at the other end of the spectrum attains new heights that only exacerbate the different life outcomes of the two groups. At the retail strategy level, participants in the grocery industry also see a clear polarization of the markets with increasing pressure on any player trying to serve the middle (Janssen 2011).

The purpose of this paper is twofold. One is to explicate the existence of this ever-widening gap and the ways in which the current food movement recreates the subaltern (Varman and Belk 2008; Gramsci 2001) of marginalized consumers. The second is to examine marketing’s role in this gap and the inability of those subaltern consumers to catch up.

**The Gap**

Many food systems analysts assert that there is enough food to feed people. The problem is not basic supply, but rather one of distribution and access (Allen 1993). How does it happen that some can have just about anything they want from around the world, while others have so little, even in the U.S. economy? Kotler, Robert and Leisner (2006) noted that in the latter half of the twentieth century, we saw a widening of income misdistribution, with a “richest 20 percent share increase from 70 to 85 percent” (p. 234). According to Warren Belasco (2007), the 1970s saw the inception of a decline in the condition of the blue-collar middle class: “American class structure began to skew toward the ends; as the upper 40 percent prospered, the lowest 20 percent worsened, and the other 40 percent stagnated or declined” (p. 193). At that time, marketers were already predicting a widening gap in economic status (Belasco 2007).
Westhoff (2010) notes the correlation between income growth and food, asserting that as incomes rise food consumption patterns shift – at the lower end, toward greater quantity and so satisfying hunger better, and at the higher end toward higher-quality, more highly valued foods. At the lower end of the socioeconomic spectrum, then, we would think that there might be less hunger in the U.S., and could look for evidence thereof. Instead of less hunger, there has been increasing food insecurity and reliance on charitable food assistance such as food banks and government programs such as SNAP (Snap Annual Summary 2013). Meanwhile, at the high end, consumers have come to value “a $4 organic tomato or $15 per pound ... beef” (Winne 2008, 133). Catering to foodies has even been a somewhat recession-proof strategy, as high-end food retailers continued to see growth in a variety of geographic markets as other sectors were slowing down considerably (Janssen, 2011; Tice, 2012).

Our public discourse around poverty and food is lackadaisical at best. In the 1960s, concerns around poverty focused more on jobs and housing than food (Levenstein 1993). This misses the key point.

“Assumptions of unrestricted choice – including access to healthy foods and recreational opportunities – ignore the ways reduction or elimination of urban amenities (including public transportation and large-scale supermarkets) and limited resources (income, transportation, health care) place constraints on the urban poor. In very specific ways, it is limited access to the things that promote health that diminishes the potential for health in the inner city. Food is arguably the most critical ‘thing that promotes health,’ and in urban areas food choice is often severely constrained.” (Eisenhauer 2001, 125).

The foodie movement has also missed this point at times. Proponents of “alternative foods” have embraced certain values with a moral superiority that converges with older patterns of blaming the poor for their plight, assuming that their needs and wants are not only best for them, but best for everyone. In the 1960s and ’70s, this took the form of denigrating the poor for failure to delay gratification and budgeting badly, “helping to foster images of obese welfare mothers, pushing supermarket carts loaded with crispy snack foods, soft drinks, sweets, and sugared breakfast cereals to be paid for with food stamps” (Levenstein 1993, 158). In the early twenty-first century, the criticism is of mothers feeding their children fast food instead of nutritious lunches recommended by foodies such as Jamie Oliver (Fox and Smith, 2011), or choosing to spend money on cable television rather than shop at Whole Foods regularly (Winne 2008). These sorts of criticisms are then used as justifications to constrain food assistance programs or other food systems interventions that would benefit the poor.

Beyond the domestic U.S. market, Klein (2007) notes that market globalization also provides examples of the trade offs between the needs of the poor and the wants of the affluent. “The widespread adoption of free trade agreements around the world has inevitably resulted in the expansion of markets and the attendant differential effects on the allocation of jobs, the availability of and prices for various products, and social and economic development among nations and regions” (Klein 2007, 36). Westhoff (2010) similarly notes the importance of recognizing the global nature of our food system. He notes that developed countries’ food/farm policies have come under criticism on two counts in international trade discussions. One, if our policies raise world food prices because we no longer subsidize cheap food, then costs rise for those who are less able to pay. On the other hand, if our policies subsidize food and lower prices, then they may undercut other farmers/markets who need a...
higher price in order to survive from their farming activities (Westhoff 2010).

Furthermore, in our liberalized international markets the aggregated consumption decisions in one country can have life-changing negative consequences for citizens in far-flung countries. Just recently, for example, a furor has erupted over quinoa. Foodies in the U.S. have latched onto quinoa for its healthful properties (and possibly social cachet), and farmers in Bolivia are satisfying this demand while accruing benefits of improved income and cash flow (Romero and Shahriari 2011). However, their fellow citizens are now priced out of the market, and substituting cheaper processed foods for their traditional quinoa diet – raising fears that they will succumb to the same health problems seen in other developed economies with a high consumption of these foods. Already, public officials are seeing evidence of changing food preferences in children, away from quinoa based products toward white bread and sugared soft drinks (Romero and Shahriari 2011).

As Winne (2008) notes “we show no hesitation about accelerating our pursuit of the dietary good life” (p. 176) – organic, local, cruelty-free, etc. – along with the personal satisfaction we derive from our “virtuous food choices.” However, this pursuit occurs with little thought, it would seem, for consequences beyond our own immediate circumstances and outcomes. Clearly the very highest pinnacles of food are reserved for only some consumers. Michael Pollan (2007) stated “Not everyone can afford to eat well in America, which is shameful, but most of us can.” He exhorts those who can to do so. And yet what are the unintended consequences of that suggestion? He suggests that those consumers who can eat well will benefit those who cannot, such as the growers and neighbors of growers of organic foods. True enough from an environmental and cash payments perspective – but as we see from the story of quinoa, at a macro perspective not everyone in the grower’s market wins.

A key facet of neoliberalism is a tendency to attribute responsibility for outcomes to individuals. Alkon and Mares (2012) describe how this happens within the food movement with the promotion of local food suppliers as a market-creation mechanism. While localism and other factors such as avoidance of GMO foods may serve the interests of many consumers who can afford to pay for food with such attributes, many cannot. At the lowest levels of the socioeconomic spectrum, consumers “simply do not have enough money to begin with, often not enough to cover even the basic monthly expenses” (Rank, 1994, 57). Something more than a local farmers’ market or CSA is needed for these consumers. Yet as Guthman (2011b) notes, the food movement generally circumvents rather than challenges any true reforms of the dominant industrial food market.

Food Systems and Macromarketing

Of all the systems macromarketers could consider, food systems may well be the “most macro” of all. Within macromarketing, the Distributive Justice perspective (Laczniak and Murphy 2008) complicates our understanding of food marketing. Analysis of food systems cannot escape looking at the consistent, persistent negative outcomes experienced by some – typically the urban and rural poor – compared to the vast majority. Laczniak and Murphy (2008) suggest that researchers take note of different parties’ perceptions about “the rights that accrue to various customers and other stakeholders as a result of marketing transactions” (p. 7). If one accepts Klein’s (2007) characterization of Distributive Justice as a “marketing performance criterion” (p. 52) then the consequences of the current distribution of food in the U.S. system must be considered a market failure.
This market failure, in turn, can be considered a consequence of neoliberal discourse around food in both domestic and global markets. As Witkowski (2007) notes, the standard argument is that marketers claim the right to market their products globally in whatever form the market demands (healthy or not, cheap or expensive) in order to leverage the easiest consumer dollar. On the other side, consumers are considered rational decision makers who are responsible for their choices to exercise or not, eat fat and sugar or not, buy organic or not. Winne (2008) agrees that our public discourse has turned relentlessly to a focus on personal responsibility rather than examining the effects of “society, culture, advertising, the calculating hand of capitalism, or a host of environmental factors over which we have little control” (p. 119). However, as Witkowski (2007) so aptly notes, this narrow managerialist argument is not a macromarketing perspective on the ethics of food marketing practices (p. 133). What it is, instead, is a restatement of the dominant social paradigm of food as defined and perpetuated by white, middle- and upper-class suburban consumer culture (Kilbourne and Carlson 2008, 107).

This skewing of food movement sensibilities had not served the poor well. Guthman (2011a) notes “the current menu reflects a fairly delimited conception of the politics of the possible, with a tremendous emphasis on market-driven alternatives, which take root in the most well-resourced localities” (p. 277). Food activists note the prioritization of farmers over consumers, and eschew farm payments to large agricultural concerns, for example. On the other hand, they have not acted against the meme of “choice” that permeates food discourse in a way that implies all consumers have equal power, nor highlighted the many factors that contribute to food insecurity such as unemployment, low wages, cuts in food assistance programs, etc.

Clearly, this is a macromarketing issue as well as a macroeconomic issue. Most people buy some or all of their food (Westhoff 2010). Especially in the U.S., the proportion of the population engaged in agriculture is quite low, and while many people garden very few grow all or most of their food. So they turn to the marketplace – a marketplace that is very unforgiving of poverty.

The failure of the U.S. food system, however, can be characterized as one of quality rather than quantity. North Americans’ food issues do not tend to stem from lack of calories so much as nutritional value of the food, and the health effects of poor diet tend to be those related to obesity rather than starvation (Westhoff 2010). Kotler, Roberto, and Leisner (2006) identify four needs of the poor: “the need to raise income, the need for improved nutrition, the need for better basic education, and the need for disease-curing and disease-preventing health care” (p. 235). Of these, food appears to take precedence, as they note that without daily nutrition it is extremely difficult to make progress on any of the other areas. Furthermore, the link between food and nutrition and the need for health care is strong – food insecurity inevitably leads to poor health outcomes. Witkowski’s (2007) call for an examination of the health consequences of marketing practices (p. 127) can be extended to an examination of all of the consequences of marketing in our food system on outcomes including health, social, and economic well-being. As Mark Winne (2008) noted:

“I have tried to reflect quietly on encounters with irresponsible behavior to better understand the relationship between an individual’s circumstances, his or her personal frailties, and a host of environmental influences. And the more I have done this the more convinced I have become that, yes, diet-related health problems – one portion of the food gap – can be controlled by personal behavior, but that the social, political, and economic forces bearing down on the most vulnerable are so powerful
that it takes an abnormally strong and discerning person to overcome them.” (p. 120)

And while Westhoff (2010) notes that outcomes such as obesity affect all income groups, the consequences do not affect all income groups equally (Viswanathan and Gau 2005).

The gap is widening. While macromarketers have examined many aspects of the food system related to this gap, it is worth taking another look with the gap as the focus. Doing so allows for bringing together some of the disparate but related elements of the marketing system for food that lead to failures in the system. The next section turns to the consideration of these marketing elements.

**Marketing and the Food Gap**

What are some of the marketing actions implicated in the food gap, and what are the consequences? This section examines some of the areas that food systems scholars have identified as areas of concern, including target markets, retail practices, product development, and food waste.

**Target Markets**

At the foundation of marketing is the selection of groups of consumers with whom to do business. Food marketers on all levels have been willing and able to provide certain consumers with their every desire – particularly upscale, health-conscious, foodies. Regarding diet-conscious consumers, Witkowski (2007) notes “According to the concept of market segmentation, if enough consumers are truly diet conscious and this group can be identified, targeted, and profitably served, then marketers will respond with the appropriate marketing mix. Unmistakably this has occurred. Diet foods and a plethora of slimming products and services have become a multibillion-dollar industry in the rich world” (p. 132). If we substitute “organic” or “local” for diet and slimming, we can say exactly the same thing about the Food Movement.

While affluent, educated suburban consumers are targeted for fresh, whole, local and organic foods, the poor, especially in urban areas, are equally targeted. Instead of Whole Foods stores, though, they are served by fast food chains and convenience stores. Winne (2008) notes that these outlets provide calorie-dense food and may fill a person up, but they “prey upon those who are weakened by insufficient money, choices, and knowledge” (p. 111). The results have been life-threatening, particularly for the African-American community. As Byron Hurt (2012) noted in his recent film Soul Food Junkies, in America there is a class-based apartheid in the food system.”

Another insidious consequence of retail target marketing is the effect of property management approaches that leverage upscale food retailers. Shopping centers are often anchored by a food retailer to drive traffic, and as Janssen (2011) notes the presence of an upscale outlet like Whole Foods or Wegmans can shape the character of the entire shopping center. Gone will be the dollar stores and check cashing outlets, and in flow the upscale home furnishings and clothing boutiques. These centers then attract shoppers from well outside the local trading area, while options for lower-priced consumption become more limited in yet another geographic area.

The cycle seems to be complete when the consumers become the consumed. Foodies care about their food, and in the name of “transparency” upscale grocers have used a number of tactics to create a feeling of authenticity about their products and operations. Pavone (2013) outlines some of
those tactics, including the use of employees’ and growers’ names and “stories” on product labels or in store displays, so that customers “know” the person who last (or first) touched their food. Employees are directed to be friendly and casual, and convey a sense of community such as one might find in a traditional city market. There is a nod to consumers’ egalitarian ideals, as well, with the employee mix reflecting diversity even when customers do not (Pavone, 2013).

**Retail Redlining**

As indicated in the previous section, one of the ways in which differential targeting of consumers has been enacted is through retail location decisions. Lack of access to supermarkets and the benefits of retail competition in the form of lower prices can be considered public health concerns. As Winne (2008) notes of the situation in Hartford, Connecticut “we were wasting time teaching people to eat healthfully if they couldn’t find affordable food stores, and they were not getting the full value of the food assistance vouchers that taxpayers were supporting” (p. 89).

This lack has been described as retail redlining (D’Rozario and Williams 2005; Bell and Burlin 1993). In their extensive discussion of this concept, D’Rozario and Williams (2005) define retail redlining as “a spatially discriminatory practice among retailers, especially chain stores, of either not serving certain areas or targeting stores operating in those areas for unfavorable treatment, based on the racial/ethnic-minority composition of either the customers that those stores serve and/or the owners/operators of those stores, rather than on economic criteria,” (p. 176). Types of redlining they describe include retail chains removing successful stores from an area, lack of a discount chain in the area, lack of upscale stores or a sizable mall in an area, and denigration of a promising geographic area by saying that it is not economically attractive, is crime ridden, etc.

One of the complicating factors in the analysis of retailing redlining is, of course, the correlation between poverty and race. Retailers may justify their site decisions by saying that certain areas are less profitable, without necessarily providing detailed justification. However, some chains have realized that they can operate profitably by locating in under-stored food deserts where even poor consumers still have to eat every day (Bell and Burlin 1993). Thus, retailers’ attitudes and assumptions can either allow for continued market failure for urban and rural poor, or they can combat those failures.

Attempts to provide market-based solutions to food deserts have sometimes focused on alternative market structures to bringing supermarkets into impoverished areas. For example, there have been a number of programs to locate farmers’ markets in these areas, such as Greenmarket Farmers Markets in New York, Homegrown Minneapolis, and Homegrown Baltimore. While these are important initiatives in the overall plan to provide fresher, local food to consumers and combat urban blight, ultimately it is the supermarket that is still considered the marker of consumer power and choice when it comes to food shopping (Levenstein, 1993). Instead of food shelves and other aid, consumers in food deserts – like all shoppers – “want a normal food system, not one dependent on charity” (Winne 2008, 169).

**Food Products**

While public policy, especially in the form of legislation such as the so-called “Farm Bill,” has tended to support farmers’ interests over those of consumers, the consumer food dollar disproportionately goes not to the farmer but to members of the marketing channel. In 2010, Westhoff
noted that farmers got only about 19 cents of that dollar, and according to the next year’s USDA update (Canning, 2011) that share is even lower. Historically, as incomes rose and social shifts sent women out of the home and into the workforce, packaged foods were attractive as a substitute for the work of food preparation (Levenstein 1993) – resulting in a continued shift of food dollars from growers to processors. Then marketers capitalized on rising health concerns, which spurred a desire for fresh, organic, and “natural” foods, as well as “light” foods (reduced fat, sodium, and sugar). Marketers provided them – but they have been affordable only for more affluent consumers.

Lower-income consumers may or may not experience food insecurity, but the type of food they consume tends to be calorie-dense instead of nutrient-dense – processed, packaged, and fast food (Levenstein 1993; Witkowski 2007; Westhoff 2010). Advertising has promoted this tendency, and public education campaigns to counter those messages can hardly keep up. Winne (2008) notes that in 2000 McDonald’s spent $500 million telling consumers “We love to see you smile” while the U.S. spent only $3 million on the “5 a Day” campaign to increase consumption of fruits and vegetables (p. 114).

By now we are familiar with the nutritional trends that have occurred in packaged foods – an exercise in adding and subtracting. Concerns about basic nutrition have spurred the fortification of foods from flour to fig newtons. More recent responses to the “worried well” have resulted in subtractions – of fat, sugar, carbohydrates, chemicals, etc. – from packaged foods along with renewed interest in raw and whole foods from milk to mangos. Other current food trends include eschewing GMO foods (those grown from genetically-modified seed) and meat from animals raised in industrial enclosures like CAFOs (concentrated animal feed operations). In most cases the ability to participate in these nutritionally- and/or morally-superior food choices requires at least middle-class socioeconomic status.

Food Waste

Worldwide, a staggering amount of food is wasted. Poppendieck (1995) cites USDA estimates on the total amount of food waste in the US (farm to household garbage) at 96 billion pounds per year. A recent study by the Natural Resources Defense Council claims that the U.S. wastes 40% of our food “from farm to fork to landfill” (Gunders 2012, title page). Waste includes crops left in the field, unsold produce in warehouses and stores, stock pulled from retail shelves when it reaches a sell-by date, uneaten restaurant food, and food left on plates or spoiled in households.

The story of what happens to all this food waste is one of both progress and remaining problems. Much food that would have been wasted in the past is “rescued” by various agencies, especially food banks. One of the early pioneers of food rescue is Second Harvest (Poppendieck 1995), whose Minnesota branch website proclaims:

“Each weekday, the Food Rescue Program’s professional drivers collect produce, dairy, deli, meat, bakery and grocery items from more than 275 retail grocers. This donated product is distributed to food shelves, soup kitchens and shelters throughout Second Harvest Heartland’s 59 county service areas. In our last fiscal year, more than 18 million pounds of nutritious food was distributed to our neighbors in need—an increase of 55% over last year.” (Second Harvest Heartland, 2013).

Again, the amount of food involved is rather mind-boggling. Saving this much food from waste is a significant benefit to many in the food system – food insecure consumers who receive it, the
environment that is saved from excessive landfill accumulation, and the manufacturers, stores, and restaurants that donate.

However, at its roots the need for food rescue is evidence of some fundamental market failures. There is the very pragmatic question of how companies end up with all this waste in the first place, and certainly estimating demand is a key marketing function. Bloom (2010) describes the problem of a surfeit of bread which is experienced virtually everywhere in the food rescue system. Since bread goes stale quickly, Bloom asks why bakers don’t just make less? A reasonable question, and yet even as our predictive models get better and better, there is uncertainty and error. Predicting demand at the micro-level has always been, and may always be, a problem in the food chain.

Another area where marketing comes into play in food rescue is in the rhetoric around both donation and collection. Here we see the institutionalization of the food rescue process and the organizations involved, particularly food banks. Food banks have gotten much more sophisticated in their marketing of food rescue programs, as evidenced by Second Harvest’s website referenced earlier. Organizations are also turning to the internet to promote their causes. For example, an Indiana organization, Food Rescue (http://foodrescue.net), recently received a Google Advertising Adword Grant for $120,000 to promote their activities. WasteCap Wisconsin (http://www.wastecap.org/) offers an extensive brochure that includes exhortations both to reduce food waste and to participate in food rescue, and mentions the Second Harvest Wisconsin Food Bank as a potential partner. These are only some examples of a well-developed campaign for the growth of food rescue programs – while those who run them fervently wish that they could solve hunger problems and shut their doors (Poppendieck 1995).

Closing the Gap?

Is there any possibility of closing this gap, or must we resign ourselves to watching it forever widen? Winne (2008) declared “If a person doesn’t have money, he or she doesn’t participate in the market. If a person doesn’t have power, he or she doesn’t participate in policymaking, which effectively is the only way to make the market work for everyone” (p. 134). In their discussion of economic justice and the Difference Principle, Laczniak and Murphy (2008) propose that public policy should, over time, “make those ‘least well-off, better-off’ … to empower most those who are at the bottom of the social and economic pyramid” (p. 8). That is precisely what must happen if this gap is to be closed (or even narrowed). What is needed is not just a market solution, nor a charitable solution, nor a public policy fix. What is required is a three-sector (market, nonprofit, and governmental) integrated approach to the problem. Key to a viable solution is an integration of stakeholders and influencers.

However, what must be avoided is the tendency for those outside of the problem to impose their value systems and solutions on others. In her chapter “If they only knew” Guthman (2011a) defines the cultural politics of food, and the failings of the “educational” approach to change. Privileged individuals inside the alternative food system looking at those “outside” tend to see different choices as due to cultural differences or lack of education (“if they only knew what was good for them, they would choose that”) rather than confronting structural inequalities and system failures (p. 271).

Those adversely affected by the current food system must be centered rather than marginalized in any discussions of solutions, in the spirit of “for us by us” (McCutcheon 2011). The food sovereignty approach takes this stand, insisting that food consumers have the right to define their own food and
agriculture system, and to control productive resources such as land, water, and seed (Alkon and Mares 2012). That sovereignty needs to be extended to market structures as well as growing systems.

Such sovereignty implies a solution that is in part political. Winne (2008) notes that successful efforts to bring supermarkets to food deserts have resulted from partnerships between for-profit and nonprofit entities, but he observes that some sort of public policy recognizing and curbing the existence of retail redlining would help as well. Government initiatives have worked with markets to increase access to fresh, local foods such as the Farmers’ Market Nutrition Program. In Massachusetts, government officials used state funds to provide farmers’ market coupons to WIC recipients. The result was more nutrition for lower-income families coupled with satisfied farmers (Winne 2008). Farm to School programs that bring farm fresh products to school lunches are another public/private initiative.

Perhaps one of the best examples of success through three-sector involvement is the food rescue initiative. Food rescue ameliorates a significant food waste problem, especially for retailers who deal with the vagaries of daily consumer demand. Food banks such as Second Harvest have a wealth of donated product – often more than they can manage to handle and distribute. And none of this would have been possible – indeed, the programs limped along – until a key piece of government intervention. One of the stated concerns of potential donors is liability for food quality. As Second Harvest and food rescue agencies inform them, and Bloom (2010) explains in his book, the Bill Emerson Good Samaritan Food Donation Act of 1996 protects donors. As Bloom (2010) further relates, his rather extensive research including discussions with the former secretary of agriculture and the former USDA food-recovery coordinator uncovered zero examples of donors being sued for food quality problems from donations (p. 223).

While not perfect, food rescue hints at the potential of a triangulated approach. However, in the search for solutions ethical marketers cannot dominate the discourse or usurp community self-determinism. A cautionary tale emerges from the recent fiasco when Virginia tried to legislate a soda tax. There, the soft-drink lobby used the racialized discourse from the community to promote a position critical of a regressive taxation proposal (proposed in the name of public health) to further their industry’s interests (Jonassen 2013). As Jonassen (2013) notes, “the irony, of course, was that the proceeds from Measure N were to fund programs designed to help low-income youth combat obesity” (p. 2). Giving consumers a “voice” where they advocate against the best interests of their children and community is not a solution based in notions of food sovereignty.

What is required from a macromarketing perspective is a questioning and complicating of our understanding about how the various parties in the food system work. Macromarketing has a well-established tradition of critiquing the tendency of marketers to focus on short-term gains to the exclusion of longer-term concerns and ethical perspectives. Laczniaik and Santos (2009b), for example point out the need to reach out to poor consumers with an approach that builds economies, community and markets for long-term health. Shultz’ (2007) characterization of marketing as “constructive engagement” (p. 293) acknowledges the importance of marketing actions in constructing social realities, including those of class and race. For producers, marketers, and consumers at the forefront of the “food movement” and those engaged in what could be called the “ordinary good food life” of the U.S. marketplace, there is an underside lurking that must be revealed and dealt with.

Shultz (2007) noted that macromarketers understand the difficult nature of these systems-level topics, and that “they require difficult choices. One choice is a decision to engage them – and factors
that predict them – in scholarship and practice” (p. 294). If marketing has any responsibility for the outcomes of the food system, it has, so far, failed. As macromarketers continue to consider our food system and our marketing practices within it, let us try to center those who are least served and most harmed by it, and be mindful of the gap that can only be seen – and resolved - from the macro perspective.

References


Food Rescue (2013), “Food Rescue Received a 120k Google Adword Advertising Grant,” (accessed January 26, 2013), [available at https://twitter.com/Food_Rescue/statuses/288303817399873536].


Guthman, Julie (2011a), “‘If They Only Knew:’ The Unbearable Whiteness of Alternative Food,” in Cultivating Food Justice: Race, Class, and Sustainability, Alison Hope Alkon and Julian Agyeman, eds. Cambridge, MA: Massachusetts Institute of Technology Press, 263-281


Hurt, Byron (Director), (2012), Soul Food Junkies [Film], PBS Video: Independent Lens,


Markets and Individualization, Insecuritization and Depoliticization
A Tale of Two Food Systems
McKeage and Schroeder


No More Happy Subjects? Approaches to Reshaping the Labour Market and Neoliberal Politics of Work

Mikko Laamanen, Hanken School of Economics, Helsinki Finland

Hegemony of neoliberal economic modes of thought has had dramatic impact on societies. Work and the labour market are particular domains of conflict emanating from neoliberalism. In this paper I focus on trade union organisations, their marginalisation in neoliberal theory and practice, and the means of resisting such predicaments. Resistance is not only understood as a reaction to repression, but as multidimensional understandings of power and agency. For illustration I draw from an ongoing ethnographic study of the Finnish labour movement. The study shows an ongoing polarisation to individualisation and collectivism, various acts constructing subjectivity, and the responsive strategic and operative action taken by the trade union organisations. This paper elucidates a state of post-Great Recession labour market, the relationships and activities that constitute, maintain and reshape its structures as well as consequences to well being and justice in society. With this paper I finally wish to pioneer labour market issues as substantial topics on the macromarketing research agenda.

Key words: Work, labour market, neoliberalism, trade union, resistance

Introduction

The failure of neoliberalism and “laissez-faire” economic policies were at the heart of the Great Recession, which took the world economy by storm. Many economies are looking for ways to recover from the devastating effects. Although criticised already before the global crisis of the late 2000s, the legitimacy of neoliberalism is now under particularly scrutiny (Albo 2013). The economic malfunction has resulted in politico-economic actions that go against the common sense of the majority in society and can be considered repressive towards the citizen. Austerity measures, wage cutting, subsidies to and bailouts of the financial market institutions are protested and new social movements like Occupy or Blockupy claim the streets in their demur to unfettered capitalism. The ongoing hegemony of the neoliberal ideology, its theory and practice has changed many conventions and relational dynamics of the various institutional contexts of the capitalist economy. For the purposes of this paper, I examine the labour market as such a context as well as locus of conflict emanating from neoliberal modes of thought. A further localisation is within the labour movement, one of the key stakeholders on the labour market.

Within the labour movement workers across ranks organise in trade union organisations. These organisations are agents in industrial relations and in society at large. Historically trade unions have been connected to socialism and subsequently located left in the political spectrum (e.g. Giddens 1986; Poole 1981) whilst a degree of depolitisation has taken place (Laamanen 2012; Stepan-Norris and Zeitlin 1991). Concurring with the political position and ideology, trade unions exist to oppose harmful and exploitative work life practices and protect the (organised) work force. Over the years this traditional role has been complemented to counterbalance the power of profits and efficiency demands inherent in dominance of the neoliberal corporate and governmental policies. However, with power to shape the labour market embedded in union density trade union organisations are vulnerable. Neoliberalism
effectively marginalises unions as legitimate actors in society and further castigates unionisation as an appropriate activity for working individual (Boxall and Haynes 1997; Dundon, Harney and Cullinane 2010; Upchurch and Mathers 2012; Webb 2006). In order to counteract their diminishing societal agency, trade unions are practicing various forms of resistance. Thus, the research question driving this inquiry is **What are the modes of resistance available for trade unions operating in neoliberal labour markets?**

Interestingly the field of marketing in general and macromarketing in particular has effectively shunned the labour market. A boolean search made on the Journal of Macromarketing home page using the keywords “labour market” OR “labor market”, and “trade union” OR “labor union” OR “labor movement” OR “labour movement” OR “union” resulted in thirty and six hits respectively. An initial analysis of article content and the relation of the keywords to the argument of the paper revealed that in the six papers mentioning unionism none went further than mentioning it in passing. Apart from JMK, a similar search is currently underway for other key marketing publications including e.g. Journal of Marketing, Journal of Marketing Management, Journal of Public Policy and Marketing, and others.

Despite this evident shortage of research and interest in unionism, the labour market actors are still relatively important social actors and change agents. From a marketing perspective unions are similar to other market actors. In their efforts to mobilise resources, they use various strategies and tactics to attract and maintain members, supporters and audiences as well as advocate their causes. They are, as Firat (2013) avers, enmeshed in a “marketing” logic of the society, albeit the vernacular of marketing might be somewhat ideologically foreign.

This paper addresses the lacking research and reintroduces the labour market and its institutions, such as the labour movement, as a valid field of research in marketing. On the following pages I discuss the connection of neoliberal discourse to the labour market. With emerging insights from an ongoing ethnographic study of the Finnish labour movement I attempt to draw a landscape of relationships on a post-Great Recession labour market.

**Neoliberalism, Labour Market, Work, and Resistance**

Neoliberalism emerged as the current politico-economic regime towards the end of the 1970s. In its wake “…all forms of social solidarity were to be dissolved in favour of individualism, private property, personal responsibility and family values” (Harvey 2006, 23). Herewith collectivism and the ‘common good’ was replaced by exaltation of the individual and competition (Amable 2011) eventually giving the condition of market, its competitiveness and profit producing capacity primacy over humans (cf. Firat 2013; Lacznak and Murphy 2012). One of the key areas of implementation for neoliberal theory has been the labour market. The key question is to which extent has neoliberalism then affected it and perception of work?

[In the classical antiquity] there was no such concept of ‘work’ that would have covered labouring for sustaining life as well as self-actualisation. Work, ponos/labor, meant exertion and effort, burden and hardship, ordeal and hard times. It was seen enslaving its doer to the will of others hindering him from pursuing higher aims, such as recognition.

The above quotation by Siltala (2003, 23 [translated from Finnish]) establishes how work was perceived in the classical era. Reflecting its content today, it bears a degree of resemblance to current labour markets. Amable (2011, 4-5) establishes that ideologically neoliberalism is to “…delegitimize collective action when it is liable to lead to redistribution or protection from competition. These pressures take the form of a moral duty to commodify labour power and respect the market competition outcomes as just”. Hence, work and labour can yet again be established as loci of
expansion. Neoliberal exploitation of work is theorised to exist on a structural macro level and on an organisational micro level (Stiglitz 2002). The former is product of the neoliberal economic policies and regulatory experimentation through which labour becomes commoditised. Labour-associated problems often result in bargaining power asymmetries including amongst others labour immobility or precarious conditions. Moreover, as real wage development has been stagnant or negative, individuals have resorted to credit in order to maintain their lifestyles and to secure living standards (Albo 2013).

According to Stiglitz (2002), organisational exploitation on a micro level stigmatises workers who actively seek to improve working conditions and confront management, e.g. in relation to work safety or remuneration. This may also lead to restricted mobility by reducing possibility of employment, especially in industries where close cooperation exists between incumbent companies. Further afield in everyday life, neoliberal discourse emerges through the domination of work in and over other worthy identifications. The productive self has penetrated the previous boundaries between work, non-work and leisure thereby subjectifying the individual to a calculative and continuous self-improvement and self-promotion governing the entire span of relationships and everyday activities (Fırat 2013; Webb 2006). The productive self emerges especially clearly in the discourse of personal branding. This includes not only the work identity of a person but also other spheres of the individual’s everyday life, such as hobbies, travelling or unpaid work. Personal branding instils these non-work related areas particular regimes that govern e.g. taste and preferences. Thus, personal branding can be considered a neoliberal regime of governmentality further commodifying the individual and their abilities in the labour market (cf. Bandinelli and Arvidsson 2013; Lair, Sullivan and Cheney 2005).

In contrast to the glorification of the individual’s capability and self-sufficiency is the stigmatisation of dependency. In the quest for flexibility and efficiency by industry and supported by governmental policy, terms of employment have transformed from lifetime employment to more irregular circumstances. This development is consequently coined as the emergence of the precariat: individuals who are not able to make ends meet due to uncertain prospects (cf. Chomsky 2012; Standing 2011). Its formation has had the hardest impact on vulnerable groups such as youth or those less educated. Governmental policies have supported the neoliberal agenda and often undermined the power of other labour market institutions (Harvey 2005), repeatedly supporting the deterioration of basic securities (for instance minimum livelihood).

A number of social movements oppose such developments in society. The labour movement is an old social movement and one of the quintessential activist movements in civil society. Union activity is ideologically guided by an association with collective action and solidarity aiming at improving the conditions for those in the lower levels of society and work organisations. The neoliberal turn has had the most drastic impact on the labour market and trade unions seek to survive in the consequent politico-economic environment. Unions aim to influence politics and the system of government. Political impact depends on political opportunity, that is, the structural, contextual circumstances that install agency to a social movement. According to Snow and Soule (2010) political opportunity is multidimensional and dependent on the existence and overlap of certain conditions enabling collective action. One enabling issue is the freedom to express views and grievances openly relating to the openness and closeness of the political systems. This level of receptiveness demarcates the degree to which movements and grievances may become institutionalised in open settings or obstructed in closed, and more generally to the extent movements can express their cause, claim and take action in the society without fear of repercussion.

Within the ranges of neoliberalism the state does not secure union survival nor are alternative governments likely to restore former union power (Boxall and Haynes 1997). Accordingly, political opportunity available for the labour movement is effectively narrow (cf. Meyer 2004; Snow and Soule 2010). The state and key economic actors share a common ideology where “...neither envisages a
significant role for trade unions in macro-economic management, on the one hand, and workplace governance, on the other” (Boxall and Haynes 1997, 568). Conflicting views (cf. Buravoy 1979; Bieler 2007) exist to the extent to which the labour movement is co-opted to produce consent to the capitalist politics of production.

Whilst this has become more difficult over time and depending on the ruling government’s makeup, unions aim to maintain an open dialogue on issues related not only to local and national issues, but also workings of transnational institutions, such as the European Union, the World Trade Organisation or the International Monetary Fund; globalisation, especially related to conditions of production and human rights; green transformation, and more recently, the ways out of the financial crisis through “...new initiatives for a basic citizenship income, strengthened unions and workplaces, an attack on precarious work and a vital role for the state in controlling finance and governing markets” (Albo 2013, 7).

On micro level unions have two key relationships: workers and employers. Workers can be understood to encompass both unionised and non-unionised individuals. Defined by Boxall and Haynes (1997) there are two major strategies with internal variation towards each of these relationships. Firstly, worker relationships can be based on a mixture of servicing and organising, where the former represents workers as consumers “...of such union services as advocacy in collective disputes and individual grievances, legal advice and a range of non-industrial benefits (e.g. discounted insurance and travel)” and the latter is unionisation as a ‘living collectivity’ with a lesser consumerist nature and more prone for industrial action (Boxall and Haynes 1997, 572). Neither strategy is likely to exist in a pure form. In fact most current trade unions operate to a quasi-market logic marketing a distinctive offering to secure density for an overall union mandate in industrial relations.

For employer relations the strategic choice is problematic and the issues resemble those on the macro level. According to Boxall and Haynes (1997), unions maintain relationships that vary between adversarial and co-operative. In either case if taken to extreme union power on the workplace may diminish: adversarial approach may result in an inability to become or be accepted in developing the workplace culture and work practices whereas co-operation may entail incorporation. Moreover employers are often overtly or covertly hostile against collective organisation and worker representation (Dundon, Harney and Cullinan 2010).

By marginalising trade union organisations, neoliberal policies are creating insecurity in at least two particular ways: firstly, by removing collective bargaining power and substituting this with an individual responsibility. Secondly, individuals and the labour market are collectively in a perpetual flux of profitability and effectiveness that creates enduring uncertainty. The basis for the success of these measures is in the degree in which institutions based on collective power are stripped of their agency. This happens both to trade unions as well as their members and according to Stiglitz (2002, 13)

...while freedom of association and trade union rights are important in correcting the power balances that exist in labour markets, even workers enjoying such rights are typically in a disadvantageous position. It is far easier for an employer to replace recalcitrant workers than for employees to “replace” a recalcitrant employer.

Considering this enormous change in the power of the labour movement, their marginalisation in society and the erosion of the redistribution common good, various activities of unions can be analysed as resistance. Resistance should be understood not only as a reaction to repression, but also as multidimensional understandings of power and agency (cf. Bieler, 2007; Thomas and Davies 2005). Traditional forms of resistance include strikes, walkouts, picketing, but other and often more subtle methods are available pertaining to identity work and meaning creation. Any such forms of resistance are here collectively called institutional work, which is such that maintains, changes and disrupts
institutions (Lawrence and Suddaby 2006).

On the subsequent pages I discuss the methods and initial findings of a study of the Finnish labour movement and its organisations working to reshape the labour market and contest neoliberal politics of work.

Methodology

The empirical approach to examining forms of resistance on the labour market can be defined as interpretive. This paper is part of an ongoing multi-year ethnographic study examining trade union organisations and their activities in Finland. Using an ethnographic approach it is possible to examine organisational culture and power in relation to work and industrial relations (Whipp 1998), but also viable for examining institutional work. The outlook is on the macro level influences of organisations in institutionalised contexts, whilst it is paramount to perceive the reciprocal nature of relationships between individuals, organisations and institutions over the opportunity-constraint continuum of agency (cf. Battilana 2006; Snow and Soule 2010). A combination of various materials allows for a holistic view to organisational work in the labour movement at the intersection of labour market institutions and competing ideologies (cf. Dholakia 2012). The methods and materials used overall in this research project include:

1. Interview material with trade union officials, shop stewards and rank-and-file members
2. Observations of
   a. Work in union confederation organs
   b. Trade union management practices and strategy work
   c. Shop stewards as representatives and local organisers of the union
   d. Members involved in union activities
3. Research material such as surveys, questionnaires, meeting protocols and photographs
4. Documentary and archival data on the development of working life and unionism in Finland
5. Autoethnographic reflection on personal experience of the author working as a shop steward during a period of one year

The interview material was gathered across the Finnish labour movement including trade union federations and independent trade unions. The sample includes blue- and white-collar unions as well as those for professionals and managers. Similarly documentary materials encompass the entire spectrum of the Finnish labour movement. Observations were conducted in a particular trade union: here of specific interest was to study ongoing work across organisational levels and particularly in relation to members, who are the raison d’être for a trade union and give legitimisation to its actions and claims.

The following chapter presents an initial analysis of the empirical material. In order to contextualise the inquiry, a short introduction to the occurrence of neoliberalism and labour market reforms in Finland is provided. This is followed by particular examples of empirical material that reflect resistance by trade unions in these settings.

Findings

As one of the Nordic countries, Finland is historically, politically, and socially connected to what can be referred to as the Nordic (social democratic) model (Andersen et al. 2007). Endemic to the Nordic model is the societal coordination and investment in public welfare and social capital through social services, childcare, education, and research and development. (ibid, A further tenet of the Nordic model is the institutionalisation of labour relations and the strength of the associated actors (both trade unions and employer associations).
The Finnish organised workers’ labour movement is an amalgamated and bounded system consisting of 3 trade union confederations with a total of 73 affiliate member organisations. The main task of the trade union organisations and confederations is bargaining for their members and negotiating labour agreements. In Finland the collective agreements are universally binding, that is, also non-organised employers must comply. Moreover, the law underwrites working individuals the statutory right of freedom of organising. Union density has traditionally been one of the highest in the world with 71 per cent of all wage earners currently unionised.

In the course of the past three decades many of neoliberal ideas have been introduced in the Finnish society. This development started with the liberalisation of the financial markets in the 1980s. This coupled with the collapse of the Soviet Union and the export relationships plunged the country into a severe depression in the early 1990s. Although recovery was achieved by late 1990s many of the models of austerity eroding the welfare state were continued and the Finnish labour market underwent the most drastic restructuring in the Nordic countries (Kananen 2012; Patomäki 2007).

In the Finnish social democratic model the labour market is an area for larger societal steering. This has taken the form of tripartite national income policy agreements that were drafted by the government in cooperation with representatives of employers and wage earners, employers’ organisations and trade union federations respectively. These overarching agreements covered effectively the entire working population and included salaries, taxation, pensions, unemployment, housing cost as well as other qualitative measures for the working life in their scope.

Currently the will to negotiate nationally seems to have subsided. As of 2008 the main employer organisation discontinued the traditional income policy agreement negotiations calling the central agreements too rigid. This effectively made agreements sectoral and competitive. Moreover, political co-operation is problematic. Recently the Prime Minister’s Office issued a report on labour market and welfare restructuring suggesting pay cuts for young people, cutting benefits from long-term unemployed people, and reducing the protection against unilateral dismissal in particularly SME’s (Valtioneuvoston kanslia 2013). This shows that actors of both the economy and politics are effectively removing unions from having societal importance.

In the following I aggregate different activities of resisting marginalisation that trade unions engage in. These emergent findings from the empirical material are organised under the following analytical constructs: 1) building legitimacy, 2) building identification and competence, and 3) building relationships and networks.

**Building Legitimacy**

With the end of the central agreements the pragmatic agreements-based approach to working life was substituted by confrontational ideological dogmatism. For instance, in the past year the largest employers’ organisation is publically promoting pay cuts for workers and the government has buttressed (see above). This is based on the perceived worsened competitive capacity of Finnish industry, which nevertheless by many indicators is amongst the best in Europe and the world.

This in itself represents a discourse that strengthens societal insecuritisation. Herein, unions see their purpose and role as change agents in society.

*The purpose of the labour movement as a movement is to influence the justness of the society and give voice to the many people, who as individual persons would not get their voices heard ... A channel for giving voice and building justice in this society.*

A further illustration of institutional work is the following formulation of trade union strategy.
This entry is concerned with the organisation’s societal goals and it reads

Justice, moderation and equality are visible in the society. Neoliberalism and self-interest as ideals subside. Economic growth is not the only goal. Beside the GDP other measures are used to evaluate wellbeing. The agreement-based societal model grows stronger. The labour movement organisations are renewed and their ability to operate improves. Attitudes towards unionisation improve further. Legislation secures the rights of employees. Solutions are found to address general unemployment.

Although the formulation is relatively generic, it likens those of other unions. At this time this particular union yet to operationalise these goals. However, the field notes made during the meeting where the above formulations were made reveal that for instance the challenging task of overturning neoliberalism is to be attempted in cohorts with other unions through the union confederation. The diminished effective societal influence of the union confederations with the ending of the centralised agreement is therewith counteracted in part.

Ultimately legitimacy derives from density. Union density is related to relationships with its members (discusses below in relation to identification). A union’s relevance and societal import derives from it visibility. Union management considers the organisational strength to correlate with visibility, most importantly in the members’ everyday lives.

The labour movement has been accused of concentrating only on those in working life and on working life … Considering the impact on social justice [of labour movement activities] it touches upon other things in peoples’ free time … The idea of accompanying people during their lifespan is a smart one, worth to think about.

Constant conflict is not a goal itself, although building and reconstructing legitimacy as a social actor also includes displays of power by demonstrations, picketing and if need be strikes. However, as one union president describes:

The greatest problem of trade unionism is that members are suffering from a well-being syndrome. People, those who are employed, have it good. … There is no reason for people to go on general strike.

Such well-being syndrome can however be brought on to unions themselves as a consequence of increased servitisation and negligence of mobilisation. Thus, inactivity of members, who consider themselves as consumers, in part hinders efforts in building legitimacy. A counteractive strategy builds identification with the particular trade unions and the labour movement in general as well as engenders competencies for members to support themselves and just developments in society.

Building Identification and Competence

As established elsewhere in this paper, neoliberal thought postulates a moral justification in decollectivising society and deinstitutionalisation of collectivism. With the consequent institutionalising of the individual, building identification to unionisation is challenged. The glorification of the individual, her personal qualities and competitive ability creates an illusion of omnipotence to influence own future in the working life. In their purest form individualised employer relations would consist of individuals negotiating their agreements directly with their employers. Unions justify their existence also through
attempt to educate the all-powerful individual. The following discussion that took place on a discussion board between an non-unionised worker and a union executive illustrates this further.

Thankfully I am not a member of a horrifically expensive trade union, where money is spent on ludicrous amounts of bureaucracy, paying hoards of employees and keeping up with the Joneses in decorating office palaces. What of collective bargaining? It’s better to take care of these issues yourself.

Fortunately union membership is voluntary! We wish you good luck in the storms of your working career! These will most definitely come. To a degree you will of course be free riding for instance if an when you enjoy the fruits of unions’ collective bargaining efforts such as education leave, paternal leave or alternation leave. These are just petty examples. Not to mention vacation or regular working hours. Some even receive overtime pay...

The union was of no use in the storms back in the day. You sure know how to collect money. Now I am saving hundreds of euro without the union and can invest this money for a rainy day. I have to remain a free rider in the sense that the workers have to abide to the collective agreement on the orders of the employer, even if they wouldn’t want to and would agree to worse terms...

Apart from the external pressure, internal problems relate to distance between members and management. Poole (1981) contends that trade union management often works based on approximations of the grievances and issues on the field. Similarly Buravoy (1979, 112) asserts that in the everyday and on the shop floor “...[t]here is a pervasive cynicism as to the willingness and ability of the union officials to protect the interest of the membership.” Deriving from my data is a shared understanding in the labour movement that the instrumentalisation of union relationships is a recent development attributable to generational differences. Older traditionalist perception of the incontestability of membership is replaced with a consumption-savy ‘bang for the buck’ outlook.

Younger folks may not have a similar perception to this union thing as with somewhat older, who often talk about, that you have to belong to a union, this has been the way it’s done. I don’t believe that the younger folks see it that way. They seek different things. It’s not self-evident to be involved, which then brings challenges to the activities in a different way than when there are traditions that lead to certain kind of unionising.

What if our main product is no longer attractive? What is to become of us? ... Each organisation is challenged by communalty, communalty is what is sought, but [it] is sought in new ways and are we still included in these, or do we fade away and people find their ways of acting and influencing?

Nevertheless, such discourse might also be a convenient explanation to hide the problems of democracy and power, such as referred to by Poole (1981) and Buravoy (1979). An alternative analysis could assert the inactivity of youth being related to inability of involvement and subsequent relative exclusion from decision-making. The rise of direct activism and new social movements are responses to older movements, their sluggish structures and elitist governance. Essentially unions are challenged to reinvent organisational models with the ability to generate ties that transcend generations, sexes and professions in order to avoid the twilight of organised labour.

In the arena of civil society unions attempt to address societal issues, develop citizen competences and influence their behaviour. One of such activities is social marketing. The picture below...
represents a campaign by the Central Organisation of Finnish Trade Unions is an example of the efforts to increase voting turnout during the 2007 Finnish parliamentary election. The slogan is “Who cares about working people, they don’t even vote. Vote anyway. SAK” and the portrayal of an industry magnate downplaying the power of workers to influence the socio-political climate is a strong ideological message. It portrays the importance of voting as resistance to neoliberal powers in society.

Figure 1: An example of social marketing efforts by Finnish trade unions
The campaign started off with a number of television adverts that agitated especially the conservative parties and employer interests groups. Subsequently the adverts hailed slanderous mudslinging by their opponents were banned from the airwaves and substituted with the banners, such as the one above.

**Building Relationships and Networks**

Beyond slogans, opposing neoliberal practice requires standing up to economic and political powers in the working life and in society. Such resistance requires leverage of intra- and extra-organisational relationships and networks. Unions build internal networks to disseminate information and experiences. Internal networks particularly serve shop stewards, who represent and organise collective bargaining locally. Especially important is the chief shop steward as a conduit between local organisation and central administration as well as between different local areas. During the fieldwork I observed that the most effective mechanism for establishing common practice over various locations is mobilising the chief shop steward. Shared practices mostly relate to resisting local exploitation.

Still unions do not only oppose employers, but also see employers as a key partner in workplace governance. Ever since collective agreements and wage steering was made sectoral, working relations with the employees in the sector have become particularly important. Consider the following union strategy formulation regarding employer relationships, which is intentionally formulated to show intent of conflict avoidance and cooperation

*The union has working relationships with the employer. The employer respects the union’s activities. The union negotiates strong agreements and co-operates well with other labour organisations in the group. The union builds the company into the best work place in Finland and a work place where the employers are respected. We contribute to a long-term perspective in management.*

Cooperation with political parties may offer a societal opportunity to trade unions. These can be analysed as political opportunities as described above. A depolitisisation in trade union organisations and their management is partially due to the aim of securing and maintaining working terms with any government, current or future. This sort of depolitisisation can naturally be considered a political opportunism, but it holds to securing backup against free market agents, who in the purest form of neoliberalism would assign less agency to the state in workings of the market.

Alliances are further sought with civil society organisations in other institutional contexts. For instance, one union executive sees a partnership with consumer rights organisations as possibly fruitful. Such an alliance could in some cases strengthen argumentation for promoting the rights and addressing problems related to the situation of both workers and consumers.

**Discussion**
This paper establishes the existence of various modes of resistance to neoliberalism through collective organisation. Changed environments, where not only the external pressures are intensifying, challenge trade unions from within to consider organisational legitimacy and models. It remains to be seen whether it is possible for individuals and organisations in neoliberal settings to reclaim their subjectivity, thus be happy subjects no longer and have agency over their own destinies. The empirical material suggests that the regime of neoliberal dogma may work as blinders or as Harvey (2006, 3) puts it “...[neoliberalism] has become incorporated into the common-sense way many of us interpret, live in, and understand the world”.

Naturalisation of institutional settings, as Battilana (2006, 645) suggests, depends on the belief that institutions and their conventions have always been there “…because most often those who are constrained by institutions, and those who initially created these institutions, are not the same”. Thus, it is not understood that these institutions are humanly produced, not ordained by a higher power. Counteracting such “naturalisation” process requires action, but also critical analysis of such action, to highlight human agency on a variety phenomena occurring in the social world.

Research needs to be sensitive to contextual (e.g. industry, region, country) differences between labour markets, subsequent nature of the collective organisation of workers and how the labour movement mobilises grievances and resources. For instance, there is a huge difference between the levels of organisation, and the cultures of power and politics. Consider only the differences between United States and the Nordic countries, where employers in the former can control unionisation whereas in the latter it is a universal right of the employee. Moreover, at the moment this research project examines the modes of resistance over local and national effects of neoliberalism. A further endeavour would be to extend the view to work related to transnational institutions and the global work market. This is especially relevant considering movements of labour e.g. in the EU. Finally, although mentioned, precarious work and employment are not particularly developed here. It may be worthwhile to examine these in contrast to the neoliberal glorification of the individual and e.g. personal branding as a manifestation thereof.

With this paper I am hoping to (re)introduce issues of the labour market to marketing discourse. By ignoring labour market issues the scholarly community of macromarketing is disregarding a significant arena of human life that has implications to markets, consumption, societal justice, unfair redistribution, the creation of the new poor and precariat, rise of radical movements and others. In the humble opinion of this author, discussions on social inclusion, justice and sustainability cannot exclude issues of the labour market. These should be embraced as essential and worthy topics and instead of producing critique towards such elusive and opaque phenomena as neoliberalism or corporate social responsibility, we could be asking toward remedial research assigning agency to individuals and organisations embedded in repressive environments by provide answers to questions such as the one below as expressed by a union leader.

_Could we change the societal atmosphere so that it would be more favourable to unionisation?_ … _How could we change the discursive climate so that the labour movement would appear in a more positive light?_ _Ultimately, we are concerned with the employment conditions of regular people._

References


Kananen, Johannes (2012), “Nordic paths from welfare to workfare: Danish, Swedish and Finnish labour market reforms in comparison,” Local Economy, 27 (5-6), 558-76.


Patomäki, Heikki (2007), Joulujoukkueen historia ja tulevaisuuden vaihtoehtot. [Neoliberalism in Finland. A short history and future options]. Helsinki, Finland: WSOY.


Snow David A. and Sarah A. Soule (2010), Primer on Social Movements. New York, NY: W. W. Norton &
Co.


Our Neoliberal Sentiment: Macromarketing and Consumer Culture Theory

James Fitchett, University of Leicester School of Management
Georgios Patsiaouras, University of Leicester School of Management
Per Ostergaard, University of Southern Denmark

Abstract
This paper aims to reflexively evaluate, critique and assess the implications and consequences of epistemological developments in the marketing and consumer research field, and to re-state and re-enforce the role of the macromarketing movement as a primary means for critically assessing the development of marketing ideas and marketing discourse. It identifies as problematic the assumption that there are synergies between Consumer Culture Theory (CCT) approaches and macromarketing. The macromarketing approach can be most usefully employed to constructively identify and then highlight the ideological assumptions in CCT research which, it is argued draws heavily on a neo-liberal sentiment.
Sustainable Business Models II
Sustainable Fashion: An Oxymoron or a Possibility?

Panel
Chair: Terri Rittenburg, University of Wyoming - Laramie, USA

The need for sustainable fashion and investigation as to its feasibility
James W. Gentry, University of Nebraska - Lincoln, NE, USA
Shipra Gupta, University of Nebraska - Lincoln, NE, USA

Exit from High Street: An exploratory study of sustainable fashion pioneers
Sarah Bly, Copenhagen Business School, Denmark
Wencke Gwozdz, Copenhagen Business School, Denmark
Lucia Reisch, Copenhagen Business School, Denmark

Collaborative consumption: Business model opportunities and barriers for the fashion industry
Esben Rahbek Gjerdrum Pedersen, Copenhagen Business School, Denmark
Sustainable Fashion: An Oxymoron or a Possibility?

Panel
Terri Rittenburg, University of Wyoming - Laramie, USA (chair)

James W. Gentry, University of Nebraska - Lincoln, NE, USA
Shipra Gupta, University of Nebraska - Lincoln, NE, USA
Sarah Bly, Copenhagen Business School, Denmark
Wencke Gwozdz, Copenhagen Business School, Denmark
Lucia Reisch, Copenhagen Business School, Denmark
Esben Rahbek Gjerdrum Pedersen, Copenhagen Business School, Denmark

This special session deals with the specific topic of Sustainable Fashion.

The first paper by James W. Gentry and Shipra Gupta of the University of Nebraska, “The Need for Sustainable Fashion and Investigation as to Its Feasibility” starts by taking the more traditional economic perspective of the fashion industry in terms of sustainability, noting the tremendous amount of wastage associated with discarded textiles, environmental issues involved in the growing of natural fibers and the environmental damage caused when synthetic fibers are created and when all fibers are processed, and the energy costs associated with maintaining the garments through washing and drying. Sustainable consumption in the fashion industry seems unlikely, as the planned obsolescence underlying most fashion models results in destructive consumption with high percentages of no-longer-wanted garments being disposed of in landfills or incinerated. The second half of the paper attempts to take a more humanistic approach by looking for possible benefits derived from fashion, an alternative perspective demanded by macromarketers Dolan (2002) and Schaefer and Crane (2005). The authors searched the Quality of Life literature in vain looking for empirical work linking fashion positively to quality of life, and contacted QOL guru Joe Sirgy, who said that he was unaware of the existence of such work. The authors then looked at a variety of literatures to find work linking positive self-identity, self-esteem, and self-confidence to fashion. The authors suggest that the life course finds many consumers valuing ‘fashion’ less and ‘style’ more as they move beyond the young adult stage, and argue that emphasis on style rather than fashion would be more sustainable.

The second paper by Sarah Bly, Wencke Gwozdz, and Lucia Reisch of the Copenhagen Business School, “Exit from High Street: An Exploratory Study of Sustainable Fashion Pioneers,” also discusses issues with the fashion industry, but proceeds to study through depth interviews and netographic methods a select group of consumers whom the authors were able to identify as sustainable fashion consumers. From their empirical work, they suggest several alternative variations of fashion consumption that are relatively sustainable. These solutions, however, are not simple ones. For instance, paying more for more durable items consistent with one’s personal style will reduce the magnitude of textiles used, but at the same time may result in higher energy usage if the consumer does not maintain the garment efficiently in an environmental sense. Other possible solutions will be discussed, including the use of used clothing stores to provision one’s wardrobe, fashion/style issues, and the use of clothing discounts at retail outlets to encourage the recycling of unwanted garments.

The third paper by Esben Rahbek Gjerdrum Pedersen also of the Copenhagen Business School, “Collaborative Consumption: Business Model Opportunities and Barriers for the Fashion Industry,”
investigates new alternative business models applicable to the fashion industry. Collaborative consumption, the topic of the recent (Dec. 2012) JCR article by Bardhi and Eckhardt on Zip Cars, may have potential in the fashion industry. After all, men have been renting tuxedos for wedding ceremonies (relatively sacred events, by the way) for decades. While contamination issues are often associated with the wearing of used apparel, it is not clear that certain types of textiles (for example, young children’s clothes) might not face such problems. So the collaborative models would include swapping as well as sharing, and will be evaluated systematically.

ABSTRACTS

The Need for Sustainable Fashion and Investigation as to its Feasibility
James W. Gentry and Shipra Gupta, University of Nebraska-Lincoln

The authors, one a male whose apparel style is best described as that of a slob and the other a female who has worked in the fashion industry, generate a somewhat contentious view of the fashion industry. The first author takes a relatively standard economic approach to reach the conclusion that the fashion industry sucks in terms of its sustainability, given the waste in terms of discarded garments in the developed world, the environmental damage involved in the growing of the natural fibers and the creation of the synthetic fibers, and the energy cost associated with the use phase. The second author provides a more humanistic approach, providing insight into the benefits (self-confidence, self-esteem, etc.) to justify some of the relatively insensitive (in a sustainability sense) behaviors practiced by the industry. The authors note the importance of unique identities to humans, and that younger consumers are more likely to seek the uniqueness provided by fashion designers, whereas many consumers develop their own unique styles as they move past the young adult stage. The authors then investigate the fashion/style distinctions in terms of their relative influences on sustainable fashion.

Exit from High Street: An Exploratory Study of Sustainable Fashion Pioneers
Sarah Bly, Copenhagen Business School; Wencke Gwozdz, Copenhagen Business School; Lucia Reisch, Copenhagen Business School

Sustainable fashion has remained low on the vernacular of policymakers, industry and consumers alike. This is not due to lack of impact as environmental degradation, human rights abuses and a host of other social ills accompanying the influential 450 billion dollar fashion industry. Beyond the tangible impacts that can be seen and measured, fashion serves a symbolic function - shaping societal values and lifestyles in a more indirect way. While there is a clear case for its importance, “sustainable fashion” terminology presents a problematic pairing. A transient system with baked in obsolescence competes with the longevity sustainability demands, making it difficult for consumers to achieve both goals simultaneously. There appears to be, however, a group of consumers who have not only found a way to manage this tension but also report increased well-being as a result of their sustainable fashion consumption behavior.

This research explores early adopting consumers of sustainable fashion practices or “sustainable fashion pioneers” using in-depth interviews supported by online monitoring to illuminate the motivations, abilities, and external facilitators and barriers that play a role in their reported behavior. Using the MOAB (motivation, opportunities, abilities, behavior) framework, key results suggested that respondents did not report having exclusively purchased garments labeled as sustainable fashion, but instead adopted alternative behavioral practices such as purchasing higher quality items that would be worn longer or exiting the market altogether and purchasing only second-hand or handmade clothing in
order to consume sustainably. These practices were found not only to elevate perceived sustainable behavior, but moreover were seen as a way to elevate their sense of style and perceived well-being. Respondents reported to increased time and financial resources as well as enjoying the challenge, novelty and creativity that these sustainable fashion consumption practices provided them with. This research suggests that the altruistic, puritan sacrifice often associated with ethical consumption behavior might be an ineffective way of motivating sustainable consumption to the wider population. Instead, by acknowledging the case for self-interest and re-framing the discussion to highlight the potential pleasure that can be found in these alternative consumption behaviors, a wider adoption of sustainable fashion might be achieved.

**Collaborative Consumption: Business Model Opportunities and Barriers for the Fashion Industry**

Esben Rahbek Gjerdrum Pedersen, Copenhagen Business School

The idea of collaborative consumption has gained widespread popularity since Rachel Botman and Roo Rogers popularized the term in the book *What’s Mine is Yours* (2010). Collaborative consumption is ultimately about people sharing and collaborating to meet certain needs, whether it concerns transportation, accommodation, land, etc. However, the idea of collaborative consumption has yet to gain mainstream attention in the fashion industry. This may be about to change as we are currently seeing the contours of new market niche based on the ideas for sharing and community.

There are good reasons to pay attention to these initiatives and explore ways to scale up these new business models. From an economic perspective, collaborative consumption has promising business potential. According to ThredUp, the US market value for used children’s clothes alone is said to be between USD 1-3 billion. From a societal perspective, an intended or unintended consequence of collaborative consumption is that these initiatives promote sustainability by reducing overconsumption. Today, around 30% of the clothes UK households have in their wardrobe have not been worn for a year or longer, representing an estimated value of £ 30 billion. Promoting clothes redistribution will therefore benefit the buyers and sellers as well as the environment.

The purpose of this paper is to explore barriers and opportunities for business models based on the ideas of collaborative consumption within the fashion industry. The paper is one of the first attempts to examine new business models for collaborative consumption within the fashion industry and contributes to the discussions of whether and how fashion sharing and collaboration holds promise as a means to promote sustainability.

**References**


Wednesday June 5, 2013
4:00p-5:30p
Concurrent Session III

Marketing Systems and Corporate Dealings II

Abstract/Papers Included

Shopping in the digital environment: The sorting function in an Internet-based marketing system
Robert A. Mittelstaedt, University of Nebraska - Lincoln, USA
John D. Mittelstaedt, University of Wyoming - Laramie, USA

Say What You Want About It But Corporations Can Say What They Want
Steven W. Kopp, University of Arkansas - Fayetteville, USA

Corporate philanthropy and channel impact in food security
Sylvain Charlebois, University of Guelph, Canada
Julia Christensen Hughes, University of Guelph, Canada
Shopping in the Digital Environment: The Sorting Function in an Internet-based Marketing System

Robert A. Mittelstaedt, University of Nebraska, Lincoln, NE, USA
John D. Mittelstaedt, University of Wyoming, Laramie, WY, USA

The Internet has changed and is changing the shopping environment for all consumers by simultaneously expanding the offerings available to them, while enhancing the opportunities for and means by which producers and consumers communicate with one another. By divorcing the flow of information from the flow of goods, the structure of the market system is being altered; new institutions have emerged and traditional institutions are being forced to adjust to survive. While the consumer enjoys a greatly expanded capacity to communicate with other consumers, and with sellers, the enormous expansion of choice options has put greater emphasis on the sorting process we call "shopping." The result is that market power is passing from those who can supply the goods to those who can guide the consumer through the sorting task. This paper reviews these trends and suggests implications for the directions in which marketing systems are evolving.

Fisk (2006) has observed, “Internet market searching by buyers and sellers is transforming transaction routines in high-consumption level countries . . .” (215). This paper’s purpose is to investigate the ways transaction routines are being transformed by examining how the Internet’s capacity to detach information flow from product flow impacts shopping behavior. It goes on to examine how the transformation of shopping behavior, in turn, is affecting the nature of the marketing system itself. It is intended as an illustration of the point made by Layton (2008) when he wrote “Macro outcomes flow from emergent patterns and not simply from aggregation” (219).

Implicit in Fisk’s statement is Alderson’s concept of the double search, i.e. sellers search for buyers while buyers also search for sellers. For the past half-century, the managerial approach to the study of marketing has largely ignored this perspective and treated the consumer as “…the recipient of goods. Marketers do things to customers; they segment them, penetrate them, distribute to them, and promote to them. The customer is an operand resource” (Vargo and Lusch, 2004, 7). By contrast, these authors’ “dominant logic” proposes that the consumer is “a coproducer of service. Marketing is a process of doing things in interaction with the customer. The customer is primarily an operand resource, only functioning occasionally as an operand resource” (7). With no intention to negate in any way the power of this view, which has informed recent macromarketing scholarship (e.g. Zwick and Dhalokia 2008), it should be noted that the concept of dual search has always viewed the consumer as an active participant in the market system. Before acquiring the goods, consumers search through the alternatives available to them to find those goods and services that best fit their needs and wants. In other words, they shop and it is this shopping activity that is being changed by and, in turn, changing the marketing system. Those changes are the subject of this paper. After looking at the role of communication in the sorting process, changes in the market environment brought about by the Internet will be examined and, finally, the implications of these for the marketing system will be
discussed.

**Sorting and Communication in a Marketing System**

To Alderson (1965), marketing systems exist to perform the sorting needed to resolve the discrepancy of assortments that exists, in broadest terms, between the conglomerations provided by nature and the assortments desired by households. The various sorting activities performed in the supply chain (sorting out, accumulating, allocating and assorting) resolve these discrepancies. Unless a supply chain is completely “direct” (e.g. farm to consumer sales), various institutions and firms exist to perform these sorting tasks; communication among them (B2B) is essential to make the system work.

On the other side of the transaction, buyers sort through the available products and suppliers seeking those that satisfy their needs and wants. Although there are instances in which consumers cannot or will not exercise choice for both product and supplier, most consumer acquisition activities involve a degree of choice and employ the sorting process called “shopping” in its broadest sense. The consumer’s sorting process employs information gained from seller-controlled sources (B2C), other consumers (C2C), neutral third-party sources, and, eventually in many cases, from contact with the goods or services themselves. Usually, communications with these latter two sources are initiated by the consumer and can be described as consumer-to-business (C2B) communications.

To bring the activities of buyers and sellers to fruition in a transaction, sellers sort through possible consumers. attempting to identify and reach those with greatest potential need or want for the product, using information about the targeted consumers to choose the appropriate tools using the processes we associate with term targeting. Sellers have, or can find, information about many characteristics of the buying public and the essence of their sorting task is to choose those variables that most clearly delineate potential buyers. No one set of variables is best for all sellers or all products or all situations, so this search is never-ending.

Similarly buyers have, at least potentially, information about many product characteristics and their task is much the same, beginning with efforts to define the most relevant variables, or what might be called sorting criteria. Different consumers employ different criteria and/or weight the relative importance of each criterion differently. Criteria and information about products relative to those criteria are often gathered simultaneously and, at the moment when the transaction is completed, are usually incomplete.

**Internet Effects on the Environment of Shopping**

Clearly the technology of the Internet has changed the way we communicate and, therefore, is changing the environment in which shopping takes place. The changes are quantitative in the sense that any one firm or consumer can be connected with many more “others.” Further there are qualitative differences; the content of B2C, B2B, C2C and C2B communications adds features unknown in previously used communications. This section discusses three of the major changes.

First, the new communications technologies are changing those communications initiated by businesses, B2B and B2C. The changes, especially those in B2B, are enabling what some describe as the “New Industrial Revolution” (Anderson, 2012; Marsh, 2012.) Any one business can reach a greater number of potential suppliers and industrial customers literally anywhere in the world. But more
importantly, they can exchange a greater variety of information and do it interactively. For the first time not just voice or printed words, but photos, technical drawings, videos, data sets and other materials can be moved instantaneously from any place in the world to any other. Among its profound effects are these: (a) The ability to separate the design function from the production function allows much of the production process, especially mass production, to locate in countries with lower labor costs. And (b) customers (both industrial customers and household consumers) may participate in the design process. Open sourcing, which began with software development, has moved into other areas of production and, along with crowd funding, has brought consumer involvement into the design process in a way that was almost inconceivable several decades ago. As Anderson (2012) puts it, “The act of ‘making in public’ turns product development into marketing” (173). As a result, these changes are, and will continue to, create “. . . more opportunities for customization – with many companies offering a mix of ‘mass customization’ and ‘mass personalization’ to widen choice. (In turn) The possibilities for making and selling products in narrow ‘niches,’ aimed at specific groups of customers, often widely spread globally, will be greater” (Marsh 2012, 214).

Although there are significant legal issues especially surrounding open sourcing and patent law (Boyle, 2012) that may hamper open sourcing, the New Industrial Revolution appears to be proceeding and changing the choice environment in which the consumer makes decisions. In one sense the number of choices available is expanded; in another sense it is narrowed to the extent any one consumer is able to find a product that precisely fits his or her individual needs and wants. However, no matter which view one takes, the consumer’s choice environment is becoming increasingly complex and the sorting process more daunting.

Second, because the new technology expands the opportunities for C2C communications, the ability to contact people anywhere in the world gives the consumer the chance to expand his or her network beyond the confines of traditional word-of-mouth. Blogs and forums can expose one to like-minded people and, especially, to those who, at least potentially, have expertise that one’s usual circle of friends may lack.

Considerable attention has been given to e-word-of-mouth (reviewed by Chan and Ngai 2011), but what appears to have received much less attention are the changes in the Internet itself and its effect on the information being exchanged in C2C. Looking back about a decade, on-line C2C communications first brought what had been face-to-face interactions into so-called chat rooms, operating in end-to-end networks with (often) non-anonymous participants in direct communication with each other through a non-intervening hub. Although some on-line forums and nearly all the social media (e.g., Facebook, Twitter) retain the end-to-end structure of (mostly) identifiable participants, the chat rooms and forums devoted to exchanging product information have been largely superseded by two types of sites containing moderated postings contributed by anonymous participants. One type is the independent site (e.g. Angie’s List); the other type consists of the product reviews that appear on many sellers’ sites. The central point is that both types involve the moderating of postings, and it this fact that makes them different from earlier forms of C2C exchanges. Some independent sites charge to participate, but all present issues of privacy. The sites on which information exchange is moderated by the seller raise obvious questions of credibility. On the other hand, questions of information credibility are not completely absent in the independent sites; they are not immune to manipulation by both shills and saboteurs.
Another relevant issue for consumer search is the tendency on independent and seller-moderated sites toward the systematization of the information collected and its presentation. Free chatter and the ability to ask questions are replaced by rating and ranking formats with their prescribed choice dimensions that presume a uniformity, among consumers, of choice criteria and the relative weights of those criteria. But even if the site includes product reviews in an open-ended format, the inability to interact with the reviewer limits the potential usefulness of the information to the inquiring consumer.

The various social media (e.g. Facebook) can act as sources of consumer information. Although their structure seems to avoid both the potential biases and uniformity involved in independent and seller moderated sites, their usefulness as sources of information is bounded by their reliance on social ties for sourcing. It seems a reasonable conclusion that, for most people, their Internet friends are their actual friends and the ties with them are “strong” in the sociological sense (Granovetter 1973) with the limitations that this implies. Thus, while any one consumer’s close friends (i.e. connected by strong ties) are likely to have similar likes and dislikes making their recommendations useful, the limits of their knowledge are likely to be about the same as that of the consumer and, relative to chat rooms and forums, their information value limited in both scope and depth thereby diminishing their value as a source of new ideas.

Third, profound changes are taking place in C2B communications. Of course consumers have always been able to complain and the opportunities to make those complaints more public is now offered by the Internet. And purchases have always been a form of C2B communications, and sellers can and do learn much from careful analysis of sales results. However, until the advent of on-line shopping, sellers had limited ability to track the purchasing of individual consumers and almost no ability to track any individual’s shopping activity that did not result in a purchase.

A new characteristic of the Internet environment is that consumer activity, both C2C communications and “looking without buying,” leave trails that are observable to sellers. One can spend 30 seconds looking at the description of a given product on a particular website and thereafter, on other unrelated sites, be bombarded with pop-up ads for this product. Or turn to the site of a well-known Internet retailer using a device with the appropriate cookie and you will be recognized. And once recognized you will find displays of products “recommended based on your browsing history,” or “related to items you have viewed,” or described by the phrase “customers who bought items in your recent history also bought.”

In addition, the trails left by C2C communications on the social media not only reveal a great deal of information about each participant but also provide data on each participant’s identifiable “friends.” Thus a user of Facebook, while browsing on the Internet for some product, is not only exposed to particular products that her prior behavior suggests he or she might favor, but is also informed about products his or her friends have somehow indicated they like – and all of this with no direct communication between the consumer and his or her friends.

Again, all this is made possible by the ability to track and record the behavior of Internet shoppers. Combined with the changes summarized as the New Industrial Revolution, the shopping environment of the Internet customer is qualitatively different than that encountered by those shopping in a brick-and-mortar environment. While there are many more choices and many and different sources
of product information available on the Internet, the on-line shopper has become the focus of many sales efforts tailored to that individual’s likes and dislikes.

Shopping in the Internet Environment

Just as the Internet environment has changed the context for seller-provided information and consumer-to-consumer interactions, it is changing the very nature of shopping itself. And this change in consumer behavior is, in turn, changing the marketing system. This section discusses those changes.

The consumer’s shopping process is based on three general types of information. Type I includes the pre-encounter sales efforts generated by the seller (e.g., advertising, personal selling, and public relations.) Type II is the pre-encounter information that consumers glean from interactions, both verbal and observational, with other consumers. Type III includes the information that comes from visiting retail establishments, the activity we usually call shopping. In the world of brick-and-mortar shopping, this information has been inseparable from its context, the physical environment in which the goods are encountered (e.g., displays, retail salespersons, labels, visual inspection of the goods.)

What is of concern here is the information provided to and used by the consumer at the time a purchase decision is made. If the role of information is to reduce risk, it seems likely that, in addition to the variation in risk inherent in different purchase situations, consumers vary in the amount of information they require to reach a decision in any given situation. However, taking that into consideration, when a consumer begins the process of “looking for” a product to buy (Alderson [1965] would call this “entering the market”) their need for information will depend on the amount of information they already possess. He described purchasing situations by classifying them according to the degree to which consumers are able to specify their need/want in advance of entering the market. As he put it “The consumer enters the market prepared to state her requirements with more or less precision” (1965, 58). At one end of the implied continuum is the need or want that is fully and unambiguously specified in advance, allowing the transaction to be completed with almost no effort and no exchange of information other than availability and price. Some familiar examples would be the purchases of a favorite brand of candy bar from a vending machine, a cartridge for one’s printer, a required textbook for a class, or a medication prescribed by a physician. At the other end of the implied continuum is the need or want that is completely unspecified (e.g. “I need to get my Mother a birthday gift, but I have no idea what to buy her.”) In other words, there appear to be situations in which the consumer, in advance of the purchase encounter, knows neither what goods will satisfy his/her need/want, nor even what choice criteria to employ. One might argue that there is no such thing as a completely unspecified purchase situation; eventually consumers will find that they do have choice criteria that allow them to sort out unsuitable products (e.g., “I know my Mother would never want that” or “That isn’t suitable; my Sister is giving my Mother one of those.”) And, in addition, the consumer in this totally undefined situation may elect to shift the purchase decision to a third party or agent, e.g. an interior decorator or a professional gift buyer.

But somewhere between the two extremes are the vast bulk of purchase situations in which the consumer knows pretty well what she/he is looking for (i.e., has choice criteria) and is searching for products that match them. Given that the consumer’s need for information will depend on the information they bring to the purchase situation, the question now becomes “How does the available information on the Internet differ from that available from other retailers?”
First, in the traditional retail setting, the role of a salesperson was to provide product information and, in many situations, to assist the consumer in defining his or her choice criteria. The process was interactive and the consumer’s questions, or even body language, told the astute salesperson what information might bring the encounter to closure. This aspect was seen as the “true art of selling.” The Internet reduces the interactive part of the sales encounter to a set of canned responses to anticipated questions (i.e., the ubiquitous FAQ section) and, if that is unsatisfactory, to a phone call to a toll-free number, an on-line “chat,” or an e-mail response to a question. This means that those products that consumers often buy with little advanced planning or knowledge, especially about the choice criteria they will employ, are difficult to present in an Internet environment. For example, gift shopping with no specific product or even fixed choice criteria in mind is made more difficult on the Internet than in a brick-and-mortar environment. On the other hand, for the fully specified purchase, when the only issues are source and price, the Internet search engines, or the so-called shopping bots, are quick and easy solutions for the consumer.

Second, by its very nature Internet shopping eliminates the “touch and feel” contact with goods themselves (although liberal return policies may mitigate this apparent problem, a point to be discussed below.) Therefore, it might be argued that the process of Internet shopping is not fundamentally different from catalog shopping; it is simply a more efficient medium. There is a sense in which this is true. However, as the Internet evolves as an information environment, three things are happening.

(A) The number of alternatives available to any one shopper has grown substantially and continues to grow. By becoming what are, in effect, drop shippers, some Internet sellers can and do offer more choices than even the largest brick-and-mortar or mail-order retailer could match. For example, during the first week of January, Zappos.com offered 28,273 different women’s shoes. If one narrowed the alternatives to “black, flat heel, leather dress shoes,” there were still 54 different shoes, 30 priced below $100. If one specified that a narrow size was needed, 4 from 3 different manufacturers remained to be compared. At the same time, Hayneedle.com was offering 85 different “slow cookers,” 9 of which were programmable. And Amazon.com was offering well over a hundred cook books specifically for slow cookers, 36 of which had been published during the last three months of 2012.

(B) For many product categories, more information about any single product is available on-line than one could from a catalog. By contrast the product descriptions on-line tend to be nearly overwhelming in the detail they present and, if anything, may serve to confuse the consumer. But more importantly, while it appears that website product presentations are like catalogs in that they do not allow hands-on contact with the product, Internet presentations can present additional visual and audio information, including multiple views of the product, video footage showing the product being used, and sound.

(C) Unlike the printed catalog where the presentation is fixed in print, consumers are able to apply their own choice criteria to sort through the information presented in the on-line environment and, in many instances, line up products for comparison. For example, the previously mentioned Zappo site has 13 criteria for sorting (e.g. occasion, heel height, color) which may be used singly or in any combination. One category, style, has 45 sub-categories including “other” which, in early January, contained 1163 options.

It has been said by many that the Internet is changing the way we think, often expressed in the aphorism “Filtering, not remembering, is the most important mental skill in the digital age.” Filtering,
i.e. sorting through alternatives, has always been the essence of shopping, but the Internet is now available to store information (i.e. be the memory) and increasingly, and more importantly, to provide the tools necessary to accomplish the filtering tasks. Because different people apply different criteria, successful sites present a variety of ways to sort through their offerings. The general search engines (e.g. Google and Yahoo) are incredibly powerful devices for sorting information or alternatives or both. But the website of every major on-line retailer or service provider also must have a search tool. Some are fairly rigid with respect to search criteria while others allow one to apply various product characteristics and other criteria such as newness, popularity, and acceptance by critics.

Implications of Changes in Shopping Behavior

These new realities affect Internet marketing and, in particular, shopping behavior. In turn, the behavior of consumers is changing the nature of marketing and the marketing system. This final section discusses six such implications.

First, as suggested above, the ability of sellers to effect change in buyer’s criteria is limited, reducing the role of traditional forms of “selling.” The enhanced ability of each consumer to find exactly what he or she is looking for is combined with the ability of the system to provide a product that matches specific needs or wants. Thus, the overall market for any given product category will continue to become, more and more, a collection of “tails.” Further, as consumers respond positively, the market will continue to fractionalize in a self-reinforcing process. And, further confounding the role of traditional selling tools, it will be difficult to persuade those consumers who succeed in finding the right “tail” to switch.

Second, to the extent the previous point is valid, the nature of branding will change. While the concept of “corporate branding” has never been fully consistent with the concept of market segmentation, it seems to have been a successful strategy in that it has been shown to enhance the equity value of the corporation (Rao, Algarwal and Dalhoff, 2004). To the extent a market becomes an aggregate of tails, the “brand portfolio” strategy would seem to increase in relevance. If cannibalization occurs among a family of brands under a single ownership, as seems to be the case (Morgan and Rego, 2009), the tighter loyalty to particular brands that seems to be implied will reduce this phenomenon. In the end, the creation of tail products may produce a situation of brand proliferation. And while critics may decry this, these specialized brands will aid consumers in their basic sorting tasks.

Third, the consumption of many products lack social visibility; when consumed in private the opportunity for social influence on their purchase and consumption is greatly reduced. Some examples would be tankless water-heaters and treatments for various medical conditions. The Internet gives consumers of these products the opportunity to find many other like-minded people and, from them, learn about products and sources. Some are products whose consumption carries some social stigma or disfavor (e.g. pornography) and the anonymity of the Internet makes contacting other like-minded consumers non-threatening and, in fact, encourages some to begin or increase consumption (Aviv, 2013). So far experience suggests, although it is hard to measure or document, that sales of these products have grown significantly in the on-line environment.

Fourth, the role of consumers in product design may lead to useful and successful innovations, but the concept of products as “mashups” raises new issues for the nature and role of intellectual property law. Therefore many, if not most, producers have discouraged, if not downright rejected, consumer suggestions for products or product forms. For example, as of January 2013, Apple’s stated policy is:
“Apple or any of its employees do not accept or consider unsolicited ideas, including ideas for new advertising campaigns, new promotions, new or improved products or technologies, product enhancements, processes, materials, marketing plans or new product names. Please do not submit any unsolicited ideas, original creative artwork, suggestions or other works (“submissions”) in any form to Apple or any of its employees.” The policy goes on to state the reason: “The sole purpose of this policy is to avoid potential misunderstandings or disputes when Apple’s products or marketing strategies might seem similar to ideas submitted to Apple” (Apple, 2013.)

Rather than reject consumer suggestions, the new era of open source production will encourage them. Presumably those making suggestions will understand and sign agreements that clarify ownership of ideas with respect to the product involved. However, this does not take into account the possible legal actions against either the consumer making the suggestion or the entity engaged in open sourcing by “patent trolls” (or copyright trolls) claiming that the suggestion violated an existing patent or copyright (Porter 2012.) These trolls, like those making suggestions, may be anywhere in the world. As more and more people become involved in any one project, an action against any one individual contributor may stifle the entire project. The entire edifice of intellectual property law was developed before the advent of the Internet and, because it varies from country to country, consumer participation presents a considerable challenge (Boyle 2012). Some have gone so far as to suggest that patents, by their very nature, stifle innovation and therefore the entire patent system should be scrapped (Boldrin and Levine, 2012).

Fifth, as more shopping, with or without purchasing, occurs on-line, the role of the brick-and-mortar retailer in the marketing system is bound to change. It is clear that the once highly successful “category killers” in books, music and electronics are in trouble. It has been observed that these stores have become mere showrooms for many shoppers. For example, a recent article described the plight of Best Buy in this way, “Rather than ruminate with a sales person before making a selection, tech-savvy consumer are more likely to walk into stores, eyeball products, scan barcodes with their smart-phones, note cheaper prices online, and head for the exit” (Stone and Walsh 2012, p.6). Conversely, it has also been observed that younger shoppers appear increasingly willing to shop online for categories such as fashion clothing and shoes, heretofore goods for which touch-and-feel has been thought to be vital (Lal and Alvarez, 2011).

One substitute for pre-purchase touch-and-feel, a generous return policy, can be offered by on-line retailers. Historically return rates for mail-order retailers have averaged about 12% (Totkay 2012) and there is little reason to believe that they are much different for Internet sellers. There are at least two factors which would appear to drive return rates even higher. First, there is evidence that on-line sites such as e-Bay can be used to dispose of return merchandise at higher prices than have usually obtained, thus lowering retailers’ costs of accepting returns (Choi, Li and Yan, 2004.) Second, the ability to examine the purchase records of individual customers has led to the idea that there is an optimum return rate, meaning that profits could be increased by managing returns and, in some instances, implementing policies to encourage some shoppers to take greater risks with their purchasing when backed up by the knowledge that the products are returnable (Peterson and Kumar, 1999 and 2012.) Having a physical place to return products is a benefit to the consumer and helps encourage this behavior.

Both of these roles, showroom and return point, suggest that the role of the physical store may be evolving toward that of the “depot,” a term suggested by Aspinwall (1962) to describe a retail facility
much like a military supply depot and devoid of traditional selling activities. Many firms that operate both brick-and-mortar stores and sell online now offer both ways of ordering equivalent to online and a act as a place to make returns. And even some brick-and-mortar retailers offer these services for others; e.g. Sears takes returns for Consumer Cellular phones and, although it owns LandsEnd, it accepts their returns for items it does not stock.)

**Finally,** it is clear that there are economies of scale in Internet retailing. Shopping, no matter where it occurs, favors sellers with the largest selection, the most information about each product and, most importantly, the most effective and efficient means of sorting according to consumer-determined criteria. In a real sense the very large Internet retailers (e.g. amazon.com and iTunes) with their enormous assortments enjoy these benefits. However, it is important to observe that the competitive advantage given these large online retailers by their efficient and effective search tools would exist even if they didn’t own any inventory. So, unlike the power of chain stores rooted in the control of the flow of goods, and the power to negotiate for lower cost merchandise, power in an Internet marketing system accrues to those who control the ability to access, and sort, the vast storehouse of information in the system. And, it should be noted, if the critical consumer task is sorting, and the provision of sorting tools is separable from the information itself – as would be shown by existence of a search engine such as Google – then power in the system comes to rest with those who control the ability to access and sort information and not necessarily the sources of the information themselves.

Thus we seem to confront a situation in which, because of the Internet, there is an expanding array of new products designed for the market’s small niches. At the same time the Internet empowers consumers to seek and find goods and services that best fit their individual needs. On the other hand, sellers can and will use data about individuals and their shopping behavior to more carefully target those individuals with products the seller chooses. For example, a British hotel group is reported to us as many as 4,000 attributes to define customer groups and has developed over 1,500 customized marketing messages to be directed at the various defined groups (Rosenbush and Totty 2013). This kind of micro targeting can, in effect, reduce consumer choice by exposing people to only those alternatives that marketers choose through these elaborate and highly refined targeting strategies.

Therefore, a key to the future, and an important emerging public policy issue, revolves around the question of control of the sorting mechanisms. Wu’s (2011) history of information industries (e.g. telegraph, telephone, radio, TV) is not encouraging; he concludes that, eventually, control becomes centralized in one, or a very few, dominant firms. With the flow of information separated from the flow of goods, market power will not be with the brick-and-mortar chains, whatever their size. Ultimately it may not be the Internet retailers, whatever their size, who hold that power. The outcome, and the implied public policy issue, will rest on the openness of the Internet.
References

Say What You Want about It, But Corporations Can Say What They Want: A Brief Legal History of the Corporation’s Point of View and the First Amendment

Steven W. Kopp, University of Arkansas, Fayetteville, AR, USA

Recent federal court decisions have extended the Constitutional protection of “freedom of speech” to include both political and commercial “speech” of corporations. Indeed, the fundamental premise of prohibiting, restricting, or compelling what information a corporate entity might express requires free-speech justification.

At the time of the ratification and adoption of the Constitution, many current methods of communication did not exist. These have developed in such a way that the Constitutional protection of “speech” has presented constant challenge to First Amendment doctrine. The definition of the “speaker” has expanded, situations again requiring sometimes considerable elasticity in interpretation of “who” may speak. This paper is provides a brief history of the legal development, determined by the U.S. Supreme Court as the rule of law, of the Constitutional status of the “free speech” protections provided to corporations.

First, the paper discusses the history of the corporation’s status as a “person,” ultimately achieving many of the same basic rights as those assigned to “We the people of the United States.” Second, the paper discusses the evolution of the First Amendment as it has been applied to commercial speech – initially, the U.S. Supreme Court declared that advertising and other types of “commercial speech” were not eligible for protection under the First Amendment. Over the past century, however, commercial speech has found its way into the marketplace of ideas. This paper discusses the parallel that exists between those rights that are political and those that are commercial.

Ultimately, two off-hand statements that the Court made many decades ago have developed into two concurrent doctrines that, taken in combination, will eventually require a redefinition and new rationale for government regulation of corporate speech. The distinction between what a corporation may say as “political speech” and what it may say as “commercial speech” is becoming blurred. From a marketing perspective, this has significant implications for consumer protection regulation in the United States.

REFERENCES AVAILABLE UPON REQUEST
Corporate Philanthropy and Channel Impact in Food Security: The Case “Nourish” by Campbell’s Canada

Sylvain Charlebois, University of Guelph, Canada
Julia Christensen Hughes, University of Guelph, Canada

This paper discusses how corporate philanthropy influences channel behaviour in the context of food security. Nourish was launched by Campbell’s Canada in 2011 with the intent to alleviate hunger. The ready-to-ship, ready-to-eat product was designed to support disaster-stricken regions around the world where food security was a challenge. Nourish also served a domestic purpose in that it allowed Campbell’s to support food banks in the country. In this case study, we review the case of Nourish post-launch and assess how Campbell’s used its marketing channels to support the project. A conceptual framework on corporate philanthropy and channel impact is presented. It is suggested that philanthropic acts by one company can influence other channel members and reflect paternalistic attitudes when intent is driven by altruistic and politically strategic motives. Even though Nourish is considered by the company as a success story, it faced many challenges. A discussion on findings and future research opportunities are also presented.

Keywords: Food security, hunger, corporate philanthropy, marketing channels.

Introduction

Food companies and the food sector have faced public criticism and significant systemic risks related to corporate social responsibility over the last decade or so (Michael 2006). The behaviour of food companies, most particularly multi-nationals, has never been more under the spotlight. It has been criticized for providing unhealthy and sometimes unsafe products to consumers. Transfats, excess sodium content and major food safety-related incidents, for example, have had a negative impact on how the public perceives major food companies. A new approach has been adopted by the food industry which focuses on food and nutrition. Many food companies are extending their focus on food products to matters of social responsibility, now concentrating their efforts on diminishing the inequalities in health between different socio-economic groups.

Social responsibility requires the food sector to consider ethics, accountability and its own value systems which have been in rapid transition (Jamali and Mirshak 2007). The strategic focus seems to go beyond profitability and value provided to shareholders. Some food sector pundits have contradictory positions on social issues at times, which often fuels public skepticism (Welford 2002). One striking example is the obesity epidemic and seeing corporations continue to sell affordable, but yet health-damaging products to children. The lack of a systematic, focused, and institutionalized approach to corporate social responsibility means that the practice of corporate social responsibility is often still grounded in the context of philanthropic action. Many initiatives have been perceived as communications plows. What has become more prominent in the food sector has been corporate social responsibility more in the context of rights as it has been recognized that access to food is a fundamental human right (van Heukelom 2011).
Global corporate social responsibility in the food industry has evolved from follower strategy to the use of a more refined approach in food security; the latter underlines a brand’s corporate identity while doing well in the community, creating products and programs that lead change (Mattos 2011). Philanthropic acts can make a difference, but a corporation cannot always operate in isolation in order to meet its philanthropic objectives, particularly in the food sector. In some cases, it needs to appreciate the complexities of managing marketing channels, and how it can leverage a corporation’s own philanthropic ambitions. The transmission of philanthropic values is often assisted above all by the entrepreneurial values and by the company’s embeddedness in the local socio-economic environment (Del Baldo 2012).

This study seeks to investigate the concept of corporate philanthropy in marketing channels. The marketing channel can be defined as the outer organizational system operated by executives for the purpose of achieving a corporation’s distribution objectives (Rosenbloom 1999). This study conceptually explores the impact of a philanthropic project channel cooperation, which, in turn, will influence the outcome. More specifically, it seeks to understand how a hunger-alleviating food product developed by a food processor can capture the interest of other channel members and its macro-environment. The study is on a product called Nourish developed by the Canadian division of Campbell’s Soup. The manuscript first reviews the literature on food security and corporate philanthropy, before linking these to marketing channel performance concepts. Next, the research methodology is described, which is followed by the findings of the study. The limitations of the study are identified, and directions for future research are suggested.

**Relevant literature**

Rches (1999) has argued that obstacles standing in the way of achieving food security around the world include the increasing commodification of welfare and the corporatization of food. The depoliticization of hunger alleviation by governments and by NGOs has been noticed by corporations in the food sector. Some corporations have felt compelled to reverse that trend globally. As such, food systems globally are in rapid transition. Unequal market power is ubiquitous and inevitable in agriculture and food, as land is not mobile (Murphy 2008). As a result, many regions around the world experience food insecurity, for one reason or another. Food insecurity exists whenever the availability of nutritionally adequate and safe foods or the ability to acquire suitable foods in socially acceptable ways is limited or uncertain (Klein 1996). Notably, unlike hunger or malnutrition, food insecurity is a state, a more quantifiable and measurable concept. Hunger would be considered a feeling as a result of food insecurity, whereas malnutrition would be a cause of food insecurity (Sperdea, Mangra, Cojocaru and Ljubisav 2011). Furthermore, it has been argued that food supply chains comprise an important subset of broader food security due to their vulnerability and importance to global and local populations and economic prosperity (Voss et al., 2009). The present study focuses mainly on the issue of food security.

The food industry has not always retained substantial public visibility in the past. But things have changed in recent years. Many have come to realize the large role the food industry plays in the national economy as a multi-trillion dollar industry and leading export. Food marketing channels are compelled to play a more active role in resolving complex systemic ailments that our society needs to address. One of these ailments is global food insecurity. As the scale and scope of human-generated activity have generated substantial pressures on food systems, the public has become concerned about the well-being of society and the environment. It has been argued that global food security is not about food per se, but about the social, environmental, and economic relations within which food is produced, and through which capitalism is produced and reproduced (McMichael 2009).
And thus, the food industry feels compelled to take action and connect with causes related to food security. As a result, one of the most charitable industries in recent years has become food. Each year thousands of kilos of canned goods, produce, meats and more are donated to food banks and homeless centres.

**Figure 1**
Corporate Philanthropy and Channel Impact in Food Security

**Corporate philanthropy**

Corporate social responsibility is now a crucial part of a company’s overall strategy. In this vein, strategic philanthropy is generally recognized as corporate efforts aimed at supporting a cause while generating value for owners (Seift, Morris and Bartkus 2003). Executives who value benevolence and integrity are more likely to broadcast their intrinsic concern for others in the wider society in the form of corporate philanthropy (Choi and Wang 2007). Corporate altruism or philanthropy is described by Risks et. al (2005) as “the action when a corporation voluntarily donates a portion of its resources to a societal cause”. While philanthropy does invoke, to a certain extent, feelings of altruism, there are many motives for corporations to give. They can be strategic in nature, but not exclusively (Humphries and Brown 2008). Meeting strategic corporate objectives can be an important if not primary goal of philanthropy. These objectives can be financial. Saleh, Zulkifli and Muhamad (2011) suggest that there are positive and strong relationships between corporate social responsibility and the financial performance of an organization.

In some cases, marketing channel members in food distribution would need to rely on other channel members to reach their philanthropic objectives, particularly in cases where those not in the habit of communicating with customers directly must rely on those which are. This point is critical in cases in which the efficient flow of goods and information between channel members is paramount to the success of philanthropic endeavors.

Industry norms in food processing appear to pressure firms to create an image of generosity, even though firms’ stockholders may limit executive discretion in philanthropic gestures (Seift, Morris and Bartkus 2004). When economic cycles are not favorable to philanthropic gestures, the pressure would likely increase. To act and go against prevailing market conditions represents a certain amount of risk. Scherer and Palazzo (2007) have argued that globalization has changed the power relations between political and economic actors. Altruistic acts are a form of redistribution of wealth amongst marketing channels, and between marketing channels and society. The main mechanism for redistribution is sharing which, in turn, is an important form of exchange in channel philanthropy (Pandya and Dholakia 1992). Sharing of resources and knowledge can lead to trust amongst channel members (Carson, Devinney, Dowling and George 1999).
The concept of institutional and channel legitimacy should also be considered (Sharman 1994). This factor of institutional legitimacy is critical; we are not concerned with the legitimacy of a single organization or even a group of institutions. Rather, we are concerned with the legitimacy of a class of business firm behaviors. A corporation reputation related to the cause can have a significant impact on its ability to sway channel members to support the same cause.

Reciprocity is a form of exchange where channel members belonging to a common network are obliged to give and receive gifts of goods and services. This is a requisite antecedent to channel altruism. Obligatory reciprocity is usually implicit in corporate altruistic activities, so therefore these endeavours should not be considered in isolation (Mauss 1974). Organizations are an integral part of society and their corporate responsibility activities should therefore be understood in relation to the social structure in which the company operates (Halme and Laurila 2009). In the context of marketing channels, reciprocity also has an impact on altruistic acts. The definition of reciprocal altruism has since been refined as one actor helping another with the understanding that it will benefit in turn from a reciprocal gesture (Palmatier 2002). For channel altruism to occur, co-operation between channel members implies that one party gives up some immediate benefit in the hope of receiving a later payoff (Price, Feick and Guskey, 1995).

Global food security and hunger relate to causes beyond an organization’s socio-economic influence. Corporate social responsibility motivates firms to go beyond merely preventing or rectifying harms they have done to recognizing their liability in public welfare deficiencies for which they are not solely responsible (Lantos 2001). Nonetheless, Aupperle, Carroll and Hatfield, (1985) and O’Neill, Saunders, and McCarthy (1989) indicate that corporate managers agree that corporate philanthropy is a discretionary responsibility and that, because firms are fundamentally economic institutions, to seek a just return for owners remains the most important social responsibility (Seifert, Morris and Bartkus 2004).

**Marketing channels**

Creative, well-executed marketing channel strategies provide some of the more potent means by which companies can enhance their ability to compete (Irani, Shahanaghi and Jandaghi 2011). Marketing organizations are fundamentally social systems. Between channel members, power, conflict and co-operation are exercised to variable degrees (Hogarth-Scott and Parkinson 1993). Many dyadic relationships within marketing channels involve interdependence and this interdependence is not necessarily evenly balanced amongst channel members. It is likely to fluctuate as time goes on, and with other changes in the environment and the network (Mehta, Larsen, Rosenbloom, Mazur and Polsa 2001).

One of the dominating rules in distribution is found in the self-adjusting meter of supply and demand. It can be argued that food insecurity is an externality which can be used as evidence that natural distribution mechanisms have failed to adjust to changing market conditions. Some consumers have challenged the influence, perceived or real, of the food industry on their diets. As a result, the food industry has attempted to gain trust from the public in many ways, including getting involved in philanthropic projects. Some channel members have attempted to do so by exercising some form of channel leadership. Yet, the fact that a channel member wants to be in a position to exercise leadership does not mean that it will be successful. The channel might carry on operating without recognizing a member’s attempt to exercise its leadership power over others (Mehta, Larsen, Rosenbloom, Mazur and Polsa 2001). In channel philanthropy, channel collaboration enabled by leadership and power from one of the channel members may become a crucial success factor. In this instance, power would be...
expressed in a form of tacit enticement since a successful outcome would not only benefit the leading channel member, but it would also provide dividends to the channel's macro-environment.

The physicality of food products has to be considered. A framework for food products is necessary to provide an integrative approach for food security, which requires continuous evaluation of perceived utilities by consumers (Charlebois 2008). Often despised as self-indulgent, consumers are frequently motivated by altruism and their needs to express their identity, to build relationships, to obtain fulfillment when purchasing food products (Moynagh and Worsley 2002). Product utilities from a marketing standpoint ought to be compatible with the cause and the channel's architecture. As stated by Valor (2007), a channel member ought to evaluate the ability of a potential partner when coordinating the flow of goods in philanthropy, legal status, internal organization, territorial scope and logistical capacity. The selection process based on this antecedent can either complicate the logistical aspect of the project, or could accentuate the channel member's philanthropic efforts. Furthermore, while internal corporate pressure may often be the major force behind the development of corporate social responsibility strategies, more companies emphasize different aspects of social, environmental and economic responsibility through supply chains. These aspects may vary based on scale, scope and geographics (Tate, Ellram and Kirchoff 2010).

In matters of trust, it is known that consumers' perceptions of altruistic activities have a positive influence, both directly and indirectly, on their impressions of the quality of the products offered and their satisfaction (Swaen and Chumplitaz 2008; Secchi 2009). Such enhanced trust between consumers and retailers can arguably become a determining factor in the context of marketing channels and corporate altruism, should the member have tasks beyond retailing.

From a channels perspective, trust is also about positive expectations regarding the other party in a risky situation. “Benevolence trust” is the belief that a supplier will be ready and willing to offer assistance and support even when circumstances are changing (Kumar et al. 1995). In food distribution, the distributor’s benevolence trust in its supplier is its belief that the supplier is sincere, reliable, stands by his or her word, and fulfills promised role obligations (Marja-Riitta and Rönni 2008; Liu, Tao, Li and El-Ansary 2008). Altruistic acts involving product development require parties to accept a certain level of risk. Thus, philanthropic opportunities involving new food products would arguably depend on inter-organizational trust.

A change in the supply chain’s governance, from an arms-length market model to a collaborative partnership, often will be necessary to leverage sound corporate social responsibility practices (Lim and Phillips 2008). To encourage collaborative work within marketing channels, incentives must be put in place (Heide 1994). The types of incentives used and the basis on which they are distributed constitute a key aspect of marketing channels. Incentives, in most cases, are inherently short term in nature and are tied directly to the completion of a transaction. Incentives in the food industry tend to be based on short-term objectives. Market forces compel supply chain participants to focus on price points and delivery as they compete for the channel captain’s business, rendering corporate social responsibility observance a secondary issue.

Shared interests amongst channel members related to the cause itself should also be a common denominator. In order to understand how a product is perceived in each role within a marketing channel, and in what way product meanings are shared among channel members, the sharing of information is key. The sharing of product meanings can have an effect on communication in marketing channels, and on what kinds of product meanings have been found to be essential in the roles of design, processing, and retailing (Hakkio and Laaksonen 1998). Such meanings should be transmitted throughout marketing channels with little or no distortion. Included in meaning sharing would be technical information, product and service attributes, and the cause itself if an altruistic and/or philanthropic act is involved.
The macro-environment is believed to have a significant effect on channel impact as well. Private or corporate philanthropy in food is reshaping the way we view foreign aid and international development assistance (Adelman 2009). Companies in the food industry players have emerged, who are finding ground-breaking ways to help regions affected by food insecurity and, in the process, are transforming the concept of foreign aid. Most innovative projects entice local communities to be empowered, either by engaging in projects that increase agricultural production capacity for their region or by receiving materials which can provide long-term benefits to many involved. Philanthropic gestures can garner implicit support from the broader community, or they can also attract unfavorable faultfinders, such as institutions and groups in the channel's macro-environment (Meadowcroft and Pennington 2008). Indirect factors of the macro-environment can be added to the analysis, such as the effect of social and cultural factors on channel members when committing an act philanthropic in nature (Lin 2008). In terms of challenges, intense social scrutiny leveraged by social media, the complexity of managing multiple markets and coordinating marketing strategy, a host of risk elements, and the sheer difficulty of managing geographic, cultural, and political messages around philanthropic tasks are among the factors which impede the firm's success in corporate altruism. These factors can fuel skepticism from a variety of different groups in the macro-environment. Desirable and/or undesirable influences coming from the macro-environment may ultimately influence other channel members' commitment to the project and cause (see Figure 1). The implementation of a frontline communications strategy with proactive features can potentially overcome some of the criticism that corporations face (Wright 2001).

**Nourish**

The initial spark for Nourish actually originated in 2005 when the vision of Campbell’s was renewed. As in other economic sectors, the vision in the food sector is updated, revised, and improved, in order to define a corporate identity. It may be used together with an overdetermined belief in cause and effect in strategic planning (Darlington 1998). This effort was spearheaded by the leadership group from the start. The company wanted to develop and market authentic products which can be applicable to all Canadians, including those with fewer means. This vision became a strategic stimulus behind many of their campaigns, one of which involved reducing sodium to provide healthy food products to Canadians. Out of concern for possibly confusing employees with an overly complicated articulation of their vision, objectives, and campaigns, Campbell’s felt compelled to develop ten (10) belief statements for Campbell’s for internal purposes, which are highly visible in the company headquarters and divisions. Many of these beliefs are intrinsically linked to working with the community and making a difference.

To develop the product, Campbell’s Canada organized its focus around three main principles: ensuring positive nutrition, aiding better food choices and helping alleviate hunger (Condon 2011). Campbell’s believed more attention should be paid to the food security situation and steps should also be taken to promote good nutrition. These causes would be used to channel the work being done at Campbell’s. Employee groups were organized based on these three principles. The company recognizes that it cannot alleviate hunger. By making this a worthy cause for the group, it acknowledges it can play a leading role. From a marketing standpoint, Campbell’s considers shoppers to be customers, even citizens, many of whom might consider buying in to a cause more than just a food product. Nourish became the flagship project under hunger alleviation, but it did take some time before the product was actually created. The “Help hunger disappear” campaign was the initial thrust coming from the hunger alleviation group. Several initiatives around the country involved having retail stores spell the word “Hunger” and inviting customers to buy Campbell’s products to raise awareness.
After an overseas trip to the Dominican Republic and participation at a food security summit, Campbell’s wanted to do more than just raise awareness. The original name for a product was “Meal for the world”. Campbell’s found there was a way to use naked oats to design the perfect meal which wouldn’t require any heating before consumption. With the exception of naked oats, we were already using all the ingredients in Nourish. Naked oats are known to be high in fibre and protein and it is an important source of iron. It also requires less processing which would reduce the amount of energy to produce a food product with naked oats (Batalova, Changzhong, Rusakova and Krotova 2010). For the first few waves of production, many suppliers donated ingredients for the manufacturing of the product. The Nourish product was designed to be a complete meal packed into one pop-top can, edible cold or hot, with sufficient nutrients. Nourish is a one 425-gram can of the six-vegetable grain formulation, with 18 grams of protein and 19 grams of fiber. There are two versions: one with protein from naked oats; the other with chicken. In addition, the product is culturally sensitive as it is halal certified (Food in Canada 2011).

Ingredients are water, pea beans, tomato paste, hull-less oats, carrots, mushrooms, diced tomatoes, roasted red peppers, spinach, potato starch, sugar, salt, carrot juice concentrate, dehydrated onions, spices, dehydrated garlic, citric acid and soy lecithin. Most are accessible products to regular consumers. The intent of Nourish was to offer the product to food banks across the country (Leeder 2011). It also has a disaster-relief purpose well. Its ready-to-ship solution is appealing for disaster-stricken regions around the world. Nourish speaks to Campbell’s commitment to be authentic.

The company partnered with the United Nation’s World Food Programme to extend its reach around the world (Campbell’s Canada 2011). The partnership though has never been pursued officially since the launch. For every Nourish product purchased, the company donates one canned food item to Food Banks Canada and 25 cents to the United Nations World Food Programme (MacLean’s 2011). It seems little was done on strategic planning for Nourish. The product benefited from little or no advertisement. A video was made and several visits on University campuses were organized to support the launch of the product.

Given the cause, the overall setting was favorable to the launch of a product like Nourish. Food security has attracted a great deal of attention in recent years. Campbell’s seemed to have had a paternalistic approach to hunger and food security for Canadians with fewer means and impoverished regions of the world. Being a subdivision of a multi-national based in the United States, Campbell’s Canada was challenged by the head-quarters’ tentativeness about the project. It was eventually approved despite the project’s lack of parallelism with the head office’s main cause at the time—childhood obesity.

**Methodology**

We chose an exploratory case-study design to guide our investigation, based on Yin’s (1994) argument that case studies are the preferred strategy when ‘how’ or ‘why’ questions are being posed, and when the focus is on a modern phenomenon within a real-life context. Such a design is particularly appropriate for understanding the details and complexity of a phenomenon and design (Stake 1995). In our study, research data was collected through multiple approaches. A semi-structured questionnaire was designed and adopted to collect primary data. The objective of the empirical segment is not to test the applicability of the existing approaches but rather to study conceptual nuances related to the presented model.

A survey study was focused on formal interviews onsite where product development and marketing occurred. Interviews were conducted in June 2012, more than 15 months after the launch of Nourish. Comments were recorded comprehensively for supporting analysis. Respondents were interviewed separately, and represented key informants in a variety of functional areas; these individuals possessed...
sufficient experience and understanding of the organization’s culture and strategic intents to be able to comment with authority. The interview questions were largely designed to be open-ended in order to provide flexibility in interview discussions. The interviews provided information on perceptions, application and experience of strategy in food security and philanthropy. The collected data was arranged, analyzed and inputted into the subsequent application phase. A draft version of the paper was submitted for review to the organization for internal validity (Yin 1994).

Findings

In the first year after the launch, the company sold 200,000 cans in two waves. Net profits went to food banks. The campaign was designed to offer an opportunity for consumers to donate while satisfying their own need to eat. In addition, for each can sold, Campbell’s donated one can as well. For the company, the launch was deemed a success. The product launch did not come without criticism. Some groups accused Campbell’s of taking advantage of a popular cause to brand its own name. Campbell’s Nourish campaign was already perceived as an attempt to institutionalize food banks when many believe that, with proper social policies, food banks would cease to exist.

Table 1
Marketing Channel Philanthropy in Food Security

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Antecedents</th>
<th>References</th>
<th>Observations</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Corporate Philanthropy</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Political and Strategic</td>
<td>Choi and Wang (2007), Humphries and Brown (2008)</td>
<td>Paternalistic and genuine approach to cause (+)¹</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>motives related to cause</td>
<td></td>
<td>Managerial values at Campbell’s Canada favorable to corporate philanthropic</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>gestures (+)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Nourish speaks to Campbell’s commitment to be authentic (+)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Campbell’s wanted to go beyond industry norms to make a difference (+)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Food security is a cause with great visibility (+)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Wanted to support hunger and food banks as causes initially (-)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Channel Legitimacy on Cause</td>
<td>Seifert, Morris and Bartkus (2004), Sharman (1994)</td>
<td>Company has been involved with hunger alleviation cause since 2005 and</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>engaged with distributors before Nourish (+)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Food processing industry was contracting at the time of launch, which didn’t</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>create favorable macro-conditions for philanthropic acts (-)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Extendable altruism</td>
<td>Palmer (2000), Lantos (2001)</td>
<td>Customers donate when buying a can (+)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>All excess inventory is donated to local food banks (+)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Managerial Discretion</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Corporate priorities</td>
<td>Aupperle, Carroll and Hatfield, (1985) and</td>
<td>Intent and actions around campaign were not just strategic but altruism</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>O’Neill, Saunders, and McCarthy (1989), Ricks</td>
<td>sentiments were clearly detected (+)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Campbell’s US tentative about Canadian project (-)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

¹ (+) Probable philanthropic enabler, (-) Probable Philanthropic disabler
Campbell’s sought a just return for owners by way of making a difference, using different methods (+)
Wanted to play a channel leadership role and innovate as well (+)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>No clear evidence Campbell’s wanted to generate more revenues and/or provide more value to shareholders (-)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Leadership team planned an important role but empowered employees to lead process (+)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Brand value recognized by third-party agency (+)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Channel Management</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>Product utility compatibility with cause and logistics</strong></th>
<th>Valor (2007), Stanton and Burkink (2008), Tate, Ellram and Kirchoff (2010)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Ready-to-ship, ready-to-eat product which makes transportation less cumbersome (+)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Nourish is a heavy product, but does not require water or refrigeration (+)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Product does not have implied or distinguishable market space or segment (-)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Listings were a concern and shelf-space availability as well (-)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Several suppliers gave ingredients to Campbell’s during initial stage of campaign, but no evidence that it will continue (-)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>No evidence of gained trust between retailer and consumer to create pull effect for Nourish (-)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>No clear redistribution of resources amongst channel members (-)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Relationship with distributors built on benevolence trust and authenticity, given the risks involved (+)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Clear attempt from Campbell’s to take leadership role and try something which, allegedly, has ever been done before in the country (+)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Mutuality of interest related to Cause</th>
<th>Hakkio and Laaksonen (1998)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Seemed to have gotten better support from distributors which have shared sentiment on hunger and food security (+)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>No meaning in sharing of cause (-)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Campbell’s may refocus and commit to domestic issues related to food security (+)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Nonetheless, the support from Universities, distributors and other stakeholders seemed to have countered the influence of messages advocating against the product. Campbell’s mentioned it never intended to manage Nourish as a typical brand. The intent was not to distort its original philanthropic and altruistic objectives. The support provided by distributors and retailers across the country varied. Many distributors took Nourish in and displayed it in stores. It seems Nourish was particularly successful with distributors whose corporate values would align naturally with the underlying strategic intent of Nourish. Overwaitea Food Group, Western Canada’s biggest grocery chain, seemed to have given a great deal of attention to the product and the cause related to it. The group is known to have already been involved with the cause over the last few years (Kunkel 2008). It credits its successful relationships with distributors based on its persistence to maintain trustworthy rapports with partners. Trust, according to Campbell’s, can be built on regular, authentic and transparent exchanges. Events around hunger are often organized in conjunction with distributors. The Nourish products were less successful with some other distributors but the lack of retail momentum was not perceived as a significant concern for Campbell’s since excess inventories were given to charity. In addition, donations were localised. All donations were given to local food banks in the communities from where the sales came. Campbell’s credits Nourish as the reason why the company was ranked seventh on the list of most respected brands in the country (Cooper 2012).

No performance measures were considered as the project was “organically” managed, capitalizing on internal natural energies. The company is not aware of how many customers have bought the product as a result of liking the attributes of the product (taste, nutritional benefits). The primary goal for Campbell’s was just to launch the product without any market expectations in mind. It was reported that no strategic plans were written for the project. The company claims that total costs related to the project were not accounted for, but it estimates total costs to exceed well over 1 million $CAN. Campbell’s was hoping that one distributor would invest in the product and lead the initiative, but it did not happen within the first eighteen months after the launch. The company remained open to new opportunities. The competition did not respond with similar products on the market. There was not clear evidence that Campbell’s had a strategy beyond the first year after the launch. In the future, it intends to focus more on domestic food banking rather than global food insecurity. It is hoping it can use Nourish as a vehicle to build some awareness around food banks, which would represent a change in how Campbell’s intends to manage its marketing channel in the future to support Nourish.
Discussion

Food security and corporate philanthropy

The uniqueness of food security in this study is noteworthy. The proper access to food is perceived as a fundamental right by many industrialized nations. The corporatization of food over the years has attracted some criticism from many different factions in the Western world, including in Canada. Any philanthropic endeavour led by the food industry often garners both support and criticism, as was the case with Nourish. A market condition has been created by some interest groups which produces a shared belief that corporations engage in philanthropy for selfish interests. In the food sector, market conditions often reduce the need for altruism or exogenous norms of cooperation. Corporate philanthropy describes the action when a corporation voluntarily donates a portion of its resources to a societal cause. Nourish’s case is different in that it is not just a linear transactional gift between a corporation and an organization actively involved in the cause. The project relies on the active participation of other channel members, including consumers, to support the campaign led by Campbell’s. It was a form of an extendable altruistic venture which allowed all channel members to contribute to the cause. Consumers gave while buying the product for themselves and excess inventories went to food banks. The product design, which hailed it as the “perfect food,” enabled the project to be successful from a logistical standpoint. It was observed though that the reciprocity of exchange amongst channel members was not well articulated throughout the campaign.

The company acknowledged that domestic food banking is different than dealing with the issue of global food security. Global food security is often a chronic, multi-faceted issue; it is difficult to control and measure impact when shipping food products and materials for the needy. Campbell’s understood that food is no longer a concern restricted to impoverished people in developing countries. The resource-constrained nature of our economies, in combination with population growth, urbanisation, shifting diets and climate change, is rapidly elevating food insecurity as a fundamental threat to the quality of life.

The scope of food security was never really defined by the company. It was acknowledged during interviews that domestic food insecurity was far different than dealing with food banks domestically. To measure impact on both fronts can be challenging. For food security abroad, a significant problem is that global databases and performance metrics on food insecurity have not caught up with the paradigm shift that has occurred in defining food security and the improved means of measurement that have come with it (Pinstrup-Andersen and Herforth 2008). Domestically, data could be difficult to find as well. Commitments from other channel members can be compromised if Campbell’s fails to show the project is reaching its goals. Focusing on both could be a demanding task, so limiting the scope to domestic food needs could prove more practical and realistic.

Arguably, in terms of impact, philanthropic acts by one company can influence other channel members when intent is driven by clear altruistic and politically strategic motives, and reflects individualistic and paternalistic attitudes (Sanchez 2000). Campbell’s was paternalistic but attempted to serve many causes at once. Committing to only one cause in the future may help consolidate resources and corporate energy around one single cause.

Channel philanthropic leadership seemed to have been one of Campbell’s corporate priorities. Behind the showpiece of altruism stands a strategic objective to maximize the influence a member would have on other channel members. By using philanthropy to increase its legitimacy within the business community, a company can arguably enhance its political currency amongst channel members. Campbell’s seemed to have achieved that with Nourish.
Since Campbell’s never designed a strategic plan to promote the product, demand for the product was never fully stimulated. The idea was to flush the market with Nourish, and assess results later. For distributors, it was likely difficult to commit to compromising shelf space without knowing anticipated sales of a poorly advertised product. The only incentive was that the cause itself resonated with the distributor which wanted to collaborate with Campbell’s.

Philanthropy and marketing channels

It is known that the concepts of power and dependency are central to channel relationships (Stern and El-Ansary 1992). In food distribution, it has been argued that food distributors hold more power than food processors due to end-user proximity (Ruyter, Wetzels and Lemmink 1996). For corporate altruism acts to have an impact when generated by functions other than distribution and retailing, one can only argue that channel members would require a significant number of antecedents to be successful. In Campbell’s case, as shown in Table 1, many became enabling to a successful outcome while others arguably made the project more challenging.

Retail market dependency represents a challenge for food processors wanting to distribute a product using philanthropy as an overarching motive. Dependence can lead to better cooperation. An alliance with distributors, or with just one, may have enhanced Campbell’s chances to increase its impact on its marketing channel.

One other dimension to marketing channels is increased vertical and horizontal coordination. Changes in supply chain management in the food industry over the last few years indicate that most channel members participate in increasingly coordinated supply chains (Stanton and Burkink 2008). Spurred by globalization, free trade agreements and private labelling strategies by distributors, marketing channels are quite different from those of just a decade ago. Therefore, it becomes increasingly difficult to offer a product which has no implied or distinguishable market space or segment, which was the case for Nourish.

Finally, the macro-environment can arguably crystallize or destroy channel impact (Paz-Vega 2008). In the head office, the environmental emphasis became clearly strong during the campaign. After several tension points with interest groups, media, public opinion became more and more important to the company. The company has realized that the profit is dependent on the public opinion, which creates pressures to maintain a good image; one way is to practice corporate social responsibility.

Limitations

To correctly interpret this case study, one has to keep in mind its major limitations. A dyadic relationship cannot be analysed in isolation. Making a strategic decision of compelling magnitude related to a multi-faceted issue like food security can be arbitrary if analysed in relation to only one business. Given that the study was conducted to capture the state of the project at a critical juncture, such a punctuated context creates temporal sampling problems. With food security, we would need to consider other relationships within the marketing channel. The macro-environment of the marketing channel could also be incorporated in a future study.

Another limitation is the scope of the study itself. This study does not compare other campaigns related to a similar product. In fact, it is believed that Nourish is unique in that it is the first ready-to-eat, ready-to-ship food product which was developed with the intent to serve the greater good. By using Campbell’s as a context for channel altruism in food security, exploring whether their results may be generalized beyond this one study would unsubstantiated. Campbell’s Canada, the Canadian Division of an American-based multi-national food processor, arguably deals with factors inherently different than
other food companies. Future research on channel philanthropy, altruism, and impact conducted in other contexts may result in different findings.

**Conclusion**

Nourish can be considered as a successful project by Campbell’s since it has been driven by altruistic and politically strategic motives. These corporate motives reflect the food processor’s paternalistic and genuine attitude towards food security.

Food processors that want to address the issue of food security or any other societal causes, domestically or abroad, will not cease. The challenge for food processors lies in the functional nature of their role within marketing channels. Since they do not transact with consumers directly, they depend on distributors and retailers to relay their philanthropic convictions to consumers. Based on the Nourish case, this study set out a series of antecedents which would support similar initiatives.

From the viewpoint of food processors, a key aspect of marketing strategy is to determine how best to go to market (Bowersox & Cooper 1992). Marketing channel decisions related to food products, regardless of the intent, are among the most critical decisions facing management. The channels chosen intimately affect all the marketing decisions. In Nourish’s case, there was no evidence of proper planning surrounding distribution strategies; it was assumed distribution would function on the basis of past institutional relationships. Yet, the project seemed to have garnered a significant amount of support due to Campbell’s sincere underlying motives.

Thus, the success of philanthropy strategies to a great extent depends on how effectively they are administered by the channel member and the extent to which the modus operandi of the scheme is understood and accepted by the other channel members and the macro-environment. As the project matures, Campbell’s may contemplate a different approach and consider supporting the Nourish project with a comprehensive channel strategy.

Hopefully, this research will spawn future studies that increase our knowledge of channel philanthropy as well as identify other determinants that can be used to heighten cooperation among channel members on food security. Additional comparative research needs to be undertaken at a variety of levels in order to analyse and reify different dyadic relationships within marketing channels. First, samples should be drawn from other types of distributive institutions such as primary producers, wholesalers, retailers, and food specialty stores. Second, future research should assess if the influence-channel impact linkage is mediated by cooperation or is direct. Third, studies should investigate if philanthropy beyond marketing a new product and channel impact are correlated. Fourth, future investigations should examine whether the relationships between corporate leadership style and cooperation and, in turn, channel member performance remain stable or fluctuate as a philanthropic project matures and grows. Because research on channel philanthropy can still be characterized as largely embryonic, this area offers substantial opportunity for scholarly contributions.

**Acknowledgement**

We are grateful to Phil Donne and other members of Campbell’s Canada for their contributions to this research project. We also want to thank them for their constructive comments and inputs on the initial version of this article.

**References**


The CASE for DISTRIBUTION. (1940, Nations Business (Pre-1986), 28(4), 35-35.


## Macromarketing and Asia

**Abstract/Papers Included**

**From Japanese ingenuity to Chinese ambition: Could China change as the World gets flatter?**  
A. Coskun Samli, University of North Florida, USA  
Michael Czinkota, University of Birmingham, UK, and Georgetown University, USA  
Svetla Marinova, University of Birmingham, UK

**Shared ethnicity effects on advertising effectiveness in Malaysia**  
Chong Hang Loo, Limkokwing University, Malaysia  
Wen-Ling Liu, University of Hull, UK

**The reshaping of Chinese consumer values in the social media era: Exploring the impact of Weibo**  
Jingyi Duan, University of Rhode Island, USA  
Nikhilesh Dholakia, University of Rhode Island, USA
China is perhaps the most dynamic economy in the world. It has made tremendous progress with exporting relatively lower cost and somewhat lesser quality of products. But as the world gets flatter it is questionable if China can continue the way it has been operating. Chinese costs going up and competition is getting keener.

Highlights of two masters’ theses are presented here. The first one emphasizes the changing conditions for Chinese exports and the second study is discussing the change Chinese are pursuing. The authors discuss the movement from comparative advantage to competitive advantage by drawing from the Japanese experience and articulate as indicated in the two cited studies that China in its own way is following the same pattern.

Introduction

As the world is flattening and all markets and knowledge centers are connecting (Friedman 2005), companies and countries will have to keep up with the speed of the change. This change has been very good for China. By using cost efficiency based pricing, that country has had a tremendous growth in its exports and in its economic wealth. However, the flattening world also allows many newcomers into global supply chains, most of which are offering lower prices for many basic products. This is when companies like Google, Yahoo, Amazon.com and Tivo have tried to keep ahead by building collaborative systems that cater to specific customer needs and not compete just by price (Friedman 2005). China is facing the challenge of the flattening world. Conditions, demand, competition are all changing. The question is could China change.

When David Ricardo constructed his theory of free trade, he did not even imagine globalization. When Gottfried Haberler (1950) made a plea for more international trade he was not aware of the forthcoming of today’s globalization. When Eli Heckscher (1950) and Bertil Ohlin (1950) refined their theories of comparative advantage, in their ever wildest dreams, they could not have imagined the modern globalization the world is experiencing in recent times. The current era of globalization, which is the closer integration of the countries and peoples of the world is based on major reduction of costs, improved transportation and communication and the reduction or elimination of artificial barriers to world trade (Stiglitz 2002). This is significantly the result of the flattening of the world (Friedman 2005). With the help of flattening world and globalization activities, many newcomers entered into the flow of global trading. As perhaps until about 1990, much of this global trading activity as has been throughout the recent history has been based on comparative advantage. As seen in basic economics books comparative advantage is based on price, cost and efficiency in the products that are introduced to the global flow (Stiglitz 2006). We are specifying about 1990 as a date to identify some degree of decline in comparative advantage and the need for something else, here this something else is coined competitive advantage. Many newcomers to the global trade flow, particularly China, are finding that it is becoming
more and more difficult to rely on comparative advantage. This paper has three objectives. First, to establish that comparative advantage based global trading has become more and more difficult. Second, discussing the Japanese success in pursuing competitive advantage and finally discussing the current possible components of competitive advantage. The discussions in the paper are based on two individual Chinese studies.

Problems With Comparative Advantage

The classical comparative advantage is based on cost and production. The classical doctrine emphasizes the three factors of production that land, labor and capital. At the era when Ricardo's free trade model gained acceptance the Great Britain was enjoying perhaps the most qualified labor force and most advanced capital formation. Thus, comparative advantage connected to free trade doctrine made Great Britain the most powerful country in the world during the 19th century. Comparative advantage based international trade went on with reasonable success until at least the third quarter of the 20th century. Many newly industrialized countries including the Asian Four Tigers took advantage of comparable cost superiority in the early stages of a flattening world.

However, in a dynamic, competitive and globalizing world, the superiority of comparative advantage is not likely to remain the same or even continue. In fact, as early as late 1960s Japan under the influential thinking of Deming (1993) introduced a fourth and perhaps the most meaningful factor in production management. Japan although had some labor and capital qualifications was not necessarily superior to other industrialized countries. It was then; Japan introduced the fourth factor of production that is management. Although Japanese management has been studied many times from many different angles, it is the present authors’ belief that the fourth factor of production has not been isolated the way it should have been. Based partially on early indicators of Japanese success, as early as 1965 Wroe Alderson advocated the movement from comparative advantage. He foresaw that management is the key for successful marketing both in domestic and international arenas (Alderson 1965).

It is extremely important to realize that with the introduction of management as the fourth factor of production and, by definition, economic growth, comparative advantage principles were modified. The modification moved in the direction of management’s superiority. This is known to be the competitive advantage. It is almost inevitable that comparative advantage in time will give way to competitive advantage. In fact, Michael Porter used this concept to emphasize competitive advantage of Nations (1990) where he emphasized that the dynamic diamond which is composed of the firm’s strategy, conditions of factors, supporting industries, and stimulating demand would put a country in a leadership position. Samli and Jacobs (1995) added government support as a key additional factor to dynamic diamond. Subsequently Porter (1990) identifies the difference between comparative versus competitive advantage moving from cost advantage to differentiation and focus based advantage. The basic orientation here is that good management is always more effective than the advantage of only lower prices. It may start with lower price emphasis that is basically comparative advantage to good management emphasis which is competitive advantage. Although Japan was very successful in its general orientation, comparative advantage still has had some basic support through trade until recently.

The Japanese Experience

Starting about 1965 and continuing over two decades or so Japanese companies entered a period of optimism and deliberate mode of managerial leadership creating competitive advantage
This was way beyond cost leadership emphasizing a powerful and proactive marketing strategy.

With Deming’s influence (1993) Japan emerged as a major if not the major international player. As such it graduated from a cheap imitator to a respected innovator who can market its products rather successfully. It displayed core differences in its marketing and management approaches which created the “Japanese miracle” (Czinkota and Samli 2007). In fact, the Japanese approach was so successful that the per capita income in that country moved up from being half of that of the U.S. after WWII to being higher than that of the US in early 1980s.

Exhibit 1 illustrates the highlights of the Japanese strategy which practically dominated international markets. As can be seen, during these period cultivated markets by using proactive and aggressive, specifically localized international marketing strategies. The general orientation was a specific marketing strategy for each market rather than once size fits all. Thus, Japanese acted in an extremely polycentric manner. As presented in Exhibit 1, in their polycentric orientation, the Japanese adapted to unique conditions of small markets, by adjusting the marketing mix components for each and every market.

Even though the Japanese experience positively displayed superiority of competitive advantage a number of new countries during the past two decades or so entered the global marketing flows still with the comparative advantage orientation. Among these, particularly China and India are performing rather well based simply on cost benefits which are the essence of comparative advantage.

The Chinese Experience

China’s story has been absolutely remarkable. At no time in the history of mankind a country with about 1.5 billion population managed to grow double digit. This growth has been based on very strong cost based comparative advantage. Practiced successfully by small and medium size companies, (SMEs) comparative advantage based exporting as well as domestic efforts estimated to contribute 60 percent of gross domestic product and account for 68 percent of total exports (China Daily 2008).

Gradually, however, Chinese entrepreneurs have been finding it to become difficult to continue the way they have been performing (Lin and Wang 2008). A few years earlier Qu and Li (2004) posited that China’s current export policies have been facing certain particular obstacles. These analyses have led two particular studies:

Study One

The study was based on Mahajar and Mohd Yunus (2006) findings of exporting barriers. Using convenience sample of 20 medium size exporting companies generated a set of data which are supporting the conclusions of the Qu and Li (2004) and Lin and Wang 2008). The respondents were all top managers (Quan 2008). A series of structured interviews have resulted Exhibit 2. Particularly three responses indicated major problems in International marketing. First cost increases in production that resulted in price increases for the companies. This made it difficult for continuing on low price advantage in international markets. Having managerial issues regarding making decisions in international markets and having difficulty in developing new international markets, among others, have been and are creating barriers to continuing in their practices of comparative advantage. Participants in the study felt that these problems are not unique to them but are common in general (Guan 2008).

Study Two

The second study is based on the effectiveness of fighting off the barriers to Trade Expansion through Export Fairs (Exhibit 3). This study is based on the conclusions of a few previous studies that the
market advantage in China is shifting from the ability to reach large numbers of customers to the ability to create and deliver superior customer value with high levels of insight into customer’s behaviors and preferences. According to this study establishing long term relationships to keep and retain certain customers is the key and this is basically competitive advantage (McKenna 1992, Payne 1995, Mai 2008).

The second study, dealing with these issues proposed Export Fairs. Exhibit 3 is the general listing of problem areas that are counter acted by the current attempts to generate some degree of competitive advantage. One type of competitive advantage, trade fairs are used as a possibility. As seen in Exhibit 3, there are more general barriers in comparison with those presented in Exhibit 2. The study by relying on the response of those that visited the trade fair indicates that this approach may establish long term relationships and partially may offset the emerging problems of comparative advantage. Although there is no prioritization ordering Exhibit 3 illustrates in what ways the comparative advantage that Chinese have been enjoying thus far cannot continue. Although not quantified, the points in Exhibit 3 clearly indicate that the key strengths of comparative advantage are challenged.

Even though not quite similar to the Japanese competitive advantage model, Chinese are showing certain understanding of, at least, the needed change and are partially removing themselves from pure comparative advantage by relying on relationship marketing which can be easily classified as a major managerial tool. They are partially accomplishing the goal of emphasizing competitive advantage by using multiple trade shows and keeping in touch with the attendees and establishing strong relationships (Mai 2008). The study indicated that multiple trade shows conducted in China have had very high level of success. These trade fairs have led to strong relationship marketing.

Thus, second study presented a brief analysis of factors that Porter has proposed (Porter 1998). These factors, by definition, go against the comparative advantage and presents, in general, forces that need to be faced and coped with by having a competitive advantage orientation. It must be noted that only a very small part from each of the two studies are taken here. Hence, the authors did not concentrate on the methodologies and total findings of these studies. These two theses are cited only to point out that Chinese are beginning to feel the difficulties of relying on comparative advantage in a flattening global system and hence switching to competitive advantage by emphasizing relationship marketing. The authors simply attempted here to cite firsthand experiences as evidence. Both theses deal with convenience samples but important and credible respondents.

Competitive Advantage Orientation

The authors believe that no matter how reasonably priced all products in the flattening world will have increasing challenge generated by more competition. This is because there are always some groups in the world hungrier than others and they are likely to produce and market better products. China and a few other countries who are still benefitting from the low price feature of comparative advantage are already feeling the pressure of doing something different and hopefully better. While the first study cited here particularly articulates the emerging challenges to comparative advantage the second study indicates that China may be starting its version of competitive advantage. Unlike the Japanese model, Chinese are emphasizing relationship marketing as the beginning of their competitive advantage model. This may not be the only activity in that direction, but it is quite likely to be an effective first step. Perhaps the key issue here is: how successful are Chinese to be implementing and maintaining a relationship marketing mode?

Conclusion and Future Research
Perhaps the most important point of this study is indicating that comparative advantage is likely to be temporary. Unless it is modified to become some degree of competitive advantage in this continually globalizing and flattening world comparative advantage would not last long. Japanese appeared to have understood this point early enough and developed their version of competitive advantage model. It is still too early to tell if Chinese are going in that direction. This paper, certainly, makes a major issue of comparative advantage being temporary. No country or economy can rely on comparative advantage for a long time without having a plan of developing some version of competitive advantage. Different variations of competitive advantage are going to be displayed in future global marketing models. This research direction displays tremendous potential in the future shaping of globalization.

Although the Japanese model has been very successful, it is necessary to explore other alternatives and particularly to determine what happens if different countries or companies were to be exercising their model of competitive advantage. Would this create a global chaos or would it force emergence a global order? Certainly, these are extremely important issues for the future and the progress of our very fragile globe.
### Exhibit 1
THE JAPANESE COMPETITIVE ADVANTAGE

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Functions</th>
<th>Japanese Practice</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>General Orientation</td>
<td>Polycentric</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Overall Strategy</td>
<td>Adapting to unique conditions of small markets</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Product Strategy</td>
<td>Developing products adjusted and well performing in various local markets</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Promotional Practices</td>
<td>Making a particular effort to communicate with local markets locally</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Distribution Systems</td>
<td>Global distribution networks and being able to work what is available</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Price and Entry Strategy</td>
<td>Low price and low end penetration of the market strategies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Targets</td>
<td>Small peripheral and or marginal markets</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Market Objectives</td>
<td>Long term profitability</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

SOURCE: Adapted and revised from Czinkota and Samli (2007).
### Exhibit 2
BARRIERS TO TRADE EXPANSION

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Barriers to Trade Expansion</th>
<th>% Response</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Price Increases</td>
<td>65%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Foreign Currency Problems</td>
<td>50%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Product Adjustment</td>
<td>10%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Managerial Issues</td>
<td>60%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Research and Development</td>
<td>25%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Moving Production Location</td>
<td>15%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Developing New International Markets</td>
<td>60%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Increased Domestic Demand</td>
<td>55%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Foreign Direct Investments</td>
<td>10%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Others</td>
<td>5%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Exhibit 3
BARRIERS TO TRADE EXPANSION
2nd Study

Problem Areas

- Competition in communication
- Competition from multiple players
- Saturating markets
- Globalization pressures
- Porter’s Factors: Competitors, supplies, entrants, buyers, substitutes

*Topics were brought up by respondent’s without being in the survey instrument

References


China Daily (2008), “Real Boon for SMEs” (on line), 13 August.


Shared Ethnicity Effects on Advertising Effectiveness in Malaysia

Chong Hang Loo, Limkokwing University, Malaysia
Wen-Ling Liu, The University of Hull, UK

Abstract

The Malaysian advertising industry is looking deep into its collective ethnicities over the issue of ethnic people, i.e. Malays, Chinese and Indians, when designing an effective advertising today. The main challenge is the need for advertising agencies to create advertising that is relevant to Malaysia’s multicultural society. This research explores the three ethnic groups’ responses to the visual and linguistic stimuli of television advertising, and how cultural diversity shapes their reactions to the communications.

The influence of culture on interactions between brands and customers is becoming an ever-important consideration as marketplaces worldwide continue to diversify. Drawing on insights from cultural-oriented literature and McGuire’s (1984) distinctiveness theory, the authors propose that encounters involving three ethnic groups in Malaysia will be especially persuasive to the effect of shared ethnicity. Research suggests that ethnic subculture differences can influence peoples’ perceptions of advertising message (e.g. O’Guinn and Faber 1986; Forehand and Deshpandé 2001). Following distinctiveness theory postulated, Deshpandé and Stayman (1994) discovered that members of minority found an ad spokesperson from their own ethnic group to be more trustworthy and that led to more positive attitudes toward the brand being advertised. Ethnicity is broadly defined as the sense of identification that a cultural group collectively has largely based on the group’s common heritage (Eriksen 2002). Thus, ethnic origin is the key to people’s identity, much more than education, income, religion, sex and sexual orientation. If ethnicity remains relevant, the question is whether or not address consumers as a segmented approach rather than taking as a whole in creating advertising effectiveness. For example, it is a growing trend for advertising agencies adopting different campaigns in targeting different ethnic groups in the US, such as African-American or Hispanic audiences.

This study focuses on the examination of the ethnic group’s perspectives to understand the meanings behind their responses and behaviors. The research objectives are:

- To investigate whether targeted (ethnic-skewed) or non-targeted (non-ethnic skewed) advertising work better with the three main ethnic groups.
- To examine how each ethnic group reacts to the stimuli provided by the elements (visual and text) and what are the cues (e.g. culture, language, beliefs, political) employed.

This study contributes to the general understanding of how subcultural ethnic affects reactions to advertising and to the conceptual work underlying the basis for designing ethnic advertising in Malaysia.

Qualitative data on responses of advertising stimuli from three different ethnic subcultures extended the experimental findings. 20 interviewees from Kuala Lumpur were first shown simulation samples of seven TV commercials and then took part in the in-depth interviews. The interviews were digitally recorded and transcribed via the back-translation technique (Brislin 1970), and the primary data were coded for interpreting the findings.
The content analysis resulted that three ethnic groups used their own cultural schema to interpret advertising contents targeted at them and those targeted others. Different views of the same image or message were the result of varying level of cultural knowledge and experience of the three groups.

Language as a cue to assess advertising message was more important to the Malays compared to the Chinese and Indians. This was largely attributed to the fact that both the Chinese and Indians were mostly tri-lingual while the Malays were bi-lingual. Subsequently, Chinese and Indians were more accommodative toward advertising written in Malay, while the Malay responded unfavorably to advertisement in Chinese and Tamil.

Furthermore, results indicated that the Malays were less familiar with the cultures of the other ethnic groups, i.e. the Chinese and Indians, and reacted less favorably to advertisements targeting others. Due to the fact that, Malaysian culture is essentially Malay culture, the adoption of the Malay culture by the Chinese and Indians meant these ethnic groups were more able to accepted advertisements targeted at the Malays.

In conclusion, it is arguable that ethnic groups are best reached with communications in their mother tongue. However, ethnic advertising makes sense for advertisers that are either very big so can afford multiple advertising campaigns, or very specialized. Based on the advertising policy in Malaysia, getting the right ethnic perspective is tricky in designing of advertising message. The impact of ethnicity presented in this study should be of value to marketers for its segmentation/advertising implications. In spite of the increasing importance of ethnicity consumers and digital media, it is worth to further examine how brands communicate with targeted customers in the various ethnic media.

Keywords
Advertising, ethnicity, market segmentation, culture

References

The reshaping of Chinese consumer values in the social media era: Exploring the impact of Weibo

Jingyi Duan, University of Rhode Island, USA
Nikhilesh Dholakia, University of Rhode Island, USA

Traditional Chinese consumer values have historically focused on thriftiness, suppressing of desires, and delaying of gratification (Pan, Chaffee, Chu & Ju 1994). Also related are the social norms to keep personal acts of extravagance inconspicuous and out of the public eye (Fan 2000). The confluence of rising affluence and widely followed social media are transforming the values evident in the consumptionscape of contemporary China. This study investigates how Weibo, the Chinese version of Twitter, is reshaping the Chinese consumer values and replacing them with their opposites – visible desire, hedonism, and materialism. This study also reveals that, because of Weibo, the impact of elite lifestyles and electronic word-of-mouth have both become more powerful, leading to some convergence in the values of the elite and grassroots groups.

Introduction

The Chinese have long valued thriftiness, suppressing of desire, and the delaying of gratification through consumption, especially conspicuous consumption (Fan 2000, Pan et al., 1994). Traditional Chinese values are rooted in the Confucian cultural ethos (Yao 2000), many aspects of which have been embraced and trumpeted by the ideology of the Communist government (Lin and Wang 2010; Robertson 2000; Spears, Lin and Mowen, 2000; Tse, Belk and Zhou 1989). Since Confucianism requires people to respect social order and stay with their respective social status positions in the hierarchies, the gap between the values of the elite and of grassroots groups have persisted since ancient times (Tasaki, Kim and Miller, 1999; Pan et al. 1994). In contemporary China, rising affluence coupled with widely available social media, especially via mobile devices, are transforming and reshaping consumer values. This study explores the role of one of the most prominent social media platforms in China – represented by Weibo, the Chinese version of Twitter – in changing the traditional Chinese consumer values and in aiding the convergence of the elite and grassroots values.

The reasons for choosing Sina Weibo as the platform for this research are threefold. First, Sina Weibo (Weibo is the Chinese word for microblog) has gained substantial success and popularity in Greater China and Southeastern Asia. According to Sina, by June 2012, Weibo had a registered total user base of 368 million and accounted for 57% of microblogging market in China. Second, as a microblogging tool, Weibo has several features – such as embedded multimedia content and a chat function – that make Weibo a better microblogging platform than Twitter. Third, given the tremendous number of Weibo users and messages and the text-plus-picture oriented nature of Weibo postings, the consumption-related Weibo messages available for interpretation and analysis are numerically large and visually rich and varied. Compared to simple physical observation or observing less-featured platforms, interpreting
and analyzing Weibo messages provide a more comprehensive view of consumers’ desire in the social media era.

Conceptual Framework

As mentioned above, suppressing of overt and expressive desire to consume has been historically appreciated as a traditional Chinese value. According to Belk, Ger and Askegaard (2003), desire represents the passion about good life in modern societies, and it often takes the form of consumption. On Weibo, when people are posting advertisements of desirable products or services, and when people are retweeting others’ Weibo messages about desirable items – what others have consumed, as a way to project admired possessions or sought-after experiences – they are actually revealing their own desires. Indeed, desire is reflected intensively and with compelling immediacy on Weibo. Therefore, under the impact of Weibo, desire is no longer a sin, or a state to be suppressed or masked. Instead, desire turns into an attractive and engaging chase for ideal states of being. By visualizing desire, Weibo may gradually but profoundly change the traditional Chinese values – instead of inhibiting their desires, Chinese people would start demonstrating their desires publically and conspicuously. Since Weibo encourages immediacy in the sharing of past, current and future consumption, more and more people post what they are consuming and what they have consumed, for mainly two reasons. First, because of Weibo, consumption becomes traceable and more enjoyable and sharable with an audience that is wider and more numerous than physically proximate groups. Even when the nature of consumption is originally utilitarian, posting it on Weibo renders the consumption experience more hedonic. Weibo thus encourages the rise of hedonism in China. Second, since consumption signals one’s social status and cultural capital (Holt 1998), competition is unavoidable in many forms of consumption (Veblen 1902). Competing is an interactive process which serves to distinguish the consumer from those around – corporeally or virtually (Groves, Charter and Reynolds, 2000), and a form of playing and having fun in consumption (Grayson 1999). Hence, when people are posting what they are consuming and what they have consumed on Weibo, they are actually competing with each other. Such competition promotes materialism. Hedonism reflects an “enjoy now” consumption ethos (Lin and Wang, 2010), which is opposite to the traditional value of delaying gratification; and overt materialism goes directly against the traditional value of thriftiness. Under the influence of hedonism and materialism that are boosted by Weibo, the traditional Chinese values are being reshaped.

Besides changing traditional values – suppressing desire, delaying gratification and thriftiness – Weibo may significantly merge the values of the elite and grassroots groups. The contents posted by the vast majority of Weibo users represent the grassroots values (Huang, Yuan and Hu, 2012). On the other hand, according to an IBM developer blog (Siu 2012), Weibo has also become a communication tool for the Chinese elite celebrities to interact with their followers, and opinions from the elite and their lifestyles are becoming more visible, pursuable, and imitable by the majority of Weibo users. Furthermore, because of the highly interactive nature of Weibo communications, exchange of ideas and messages between the elite and grassroots groups become two-way processes – and the values of these two historically separated groups are thus influencing each other. Given that the impact of elite as well as mediated word-of-mouth are immediate and powerful, the interpenetrating and converging of values via Weibo need careful and deeper exploration.

Methodology

This paper applies content analysis method, with an interpretive orientation. Over 250 Weibo messages regarding consumption were analyzed (8 Weibo users were selected for observation, with 30 to 35
Weibos per user). Half of the 8 Weibo users are with the ‘V’ icon (V designates VIP status) which is conferred by Sina Weibo as way of verifying and endorsing the elite identity of users with this icon. The other half of the users represented grassroots folks – common consumers without the V icon. The education levels of these users varied. The average age of the users was 28. Both pictures and texts of the Weibos were interpreted. The Weibo messages in Chinese were translated into English for interpretation and discussion.

**Initial Findings**

Initial exploration shows substantial evidence of demonstrating desire (e.g., retweeting others’ consumption items and fantasizing them); enjoying now – immediacy of hedonism (e.g., posting a fancy dinner at the moment of consuming it), and materialism (e.g. showing/retweeting conspicuous acts or sought-after forms of consumption). In contrast, suppressing desire, delaying gratification and thriftiness are not much evident on Weibo. Moreover, not only grassroots groups – the fans of the elite – are retweeting the elite’s Weibo messages, sometimes the elite groups are also retweeting and commenting on the Weibo messages of grassroots groups. The evidence shows that the values of the elite and grassroots groups are no longer separated by substantial gaps – they are actually converging in many ways.

The initial findings suggest that Weibo is reshaping Chinese consumers’ values. By the immediate sharing and interactive communication functions offered by Weibo, personal consumption experiences are available for public gaze. Under the impact of such unprecedented change, desire for material and powerfully signified objects and materially-rich experiences is more visible and tangible, “enjoy now” (or “enjoy sooner”) is becoming an appreciated life attitude, and materialism and hedonism are growing with irresistible force. As a result, the traditional Chinese consumer values – suppressing desire, delaying gratification and thriftiness – are replaced gradually by their opposites. Moreover, since Weibo makes the influence of the elite as well as electronic word-of-mouth very powerful, the values of the elite and grassroots groups are actually converging instead of being separated by substantial chasms that have existed historically.

**References**


### Thursday June 6, 2013
8:30a-10:00a  
Concurrent Session II

**The Violence of Marketing Systems I**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abstract/Papers Included</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Violence and exchange: Premodern lessons for the postmodern world  
John Desmond, University of St Andrews, UK |
| Neoliberalism and structural violence in developing countries: the case of the Cambodian education market  
Paul Henry, University of Sydney, Australia  
Marylouise Caldwell, University of Sydney, Australia |
Violence and exchange: Premodern lessons for the postmodern world

John Desmond, University of St Andrews, UK

Introduction

This paper discusses the results of a preliminary analysis of social exchange in the Táin Bo Cúalnge, thought to be the oldest vernacular epic in western literature, to enhance our understanding of the problems presented by exchange in ancient societies. It is argued that one can better understand the question of violence in relation to the capitalist market system, by comparing this to the difficulties confronted by societies based on sharing and gift exchange. Mainstream evolutionary theorists argue that issues relating to social exchange presented a major adaptive problem for pre-human hominids, positing that kin selection and reciprocal altruism developed as domain-specific modules to contain these problems. Where sharing amongst kin is a feature of many species, theorists argue that the reciprocal altruism, characteristic of gift-exchange, developed during the Pleistocene, alongside mechanisms to detect cheats (Cosmides & Tooby, 1989).

There is nothing explicitly on the topic of violence in the relatively extensive literature on gift exchange in consumer research, much of which focuses on how gifts produce pacific relations within groups (Belk & Coon, 1993; Joy, 2001; Belk, 2007; Belk, 2010). One or two authors discuss the violence implicit in the ‘dark’ side of the gift relation (Sherry et al., 1993; Marcoux, 2009), but no-one addresses the question overt violence. Authors draw selectively on the anthropological record in discussing this question. Sahlins (1972) argues that sharing based on the principle of general reciprocity is prevalent amongst kin, moving to balanced reciprocity as social distance increases. This difference in exchange relation raises the question of what happens when males from external groups are drawn as affines into kinship groups? A study of the Piaroa, who are notable for their pacific communal relations found that exchange relations are carefully managed in such instances so as to minimize the potential for violence, with family members taking pains to avoid conflict by refraining from demand sharing and from exchanging of large gifts with these dangerous relatives (Overing, 1992).

Studies of hunter-gatherer groups who dwell in remote parts of the world such as that mentioned above, provide clues about the kinds of problems related to social exchange and violence that were potentially faced by our Pleistocene ancestors and how these were dealt with. Another form of insight can be gained from the study of ancient myth, which is an important topic for structuralists (Lévi-Strauss, 1969; Barthes, 2008) who have sought to understand the unconscious rules by which social exchange is organized. As Dooley argues, “the cosmogenic and mythic constructs of preliterate peoples are not independent of their social context, but provide a basis for the meaningful ordering of human actions at the level of cultural praxis” (2006: 14). The prevailing understanding of myth is that by means of the classic linguistic operations of metaphor and metonymy it acts to systematically reveal and conceal meaning (Barthes, 2008; Girard, 1987; Dooley, 2006).

This paper discusses the results of a preliminary analysis of one myth. The prose epic Táin Bo Cúalnge forms the centre-piece of the tales of the Ulster Cycle and is regarded by many as the oldest vernacular epic in Western literature. Thought to have first been fixed into the Irish literary tradition in the first
millenium AD, the Táin continues to constitute a font for the oral tradition of storytelling in Ireland. For the purposes of analysis the main story and its *remsceal* (foretales) can be broken down into forty-one related narratives that are accessible to most readers, linking heroes, villains and magical agents together in a sequence (Propp, [1928], 1968; Greimas, 1987).

The Táin has been read in various ways; as an example of the struggle between priestly and warrior castes; a conflict between Celtic-Aryan father dominance and pre-Celtic mother dominance (Kinsella, 1986: xii); a mastercode of mythic initiation (Dooley, 2006); or as a tale of heroic acts (Kavanagh & O’Leary, 2004). This paper advances the hypothesis, based on a preliminary analysis of the material, that the Táin can be interpreted in the context of exchange, as a potent warning against the acute dangers presented to premodern communities by acquisitive mimesis (Girard, 1986; Girard et al., 1987; Girard, 1995). Specifically the stories warn against the potentially calamitous consequences that could arise from boasting, which was a noteworthy feature of Celtic life.

Due to the scope and complexity of the work, this paper focuses on two of the most significant *remsceal*, the stories of Deirdre and of the two pig-keepers in addition to The Pillow Talk, which is the story that initiates the cycle of stories which constitute the Táin proper. The remainder of the tales that constitute the Táin are then summarized before analysis and discussion.

The Táin

**Remsceal: The Two Pig-Keepers**

The relation between the Celts and their animals, especially their cattle, should not be viewed as being similar to that between the modern farmer and his herd but rather more in keeping with the relation between the Masai and theirs. Frequently cattle are used as a means of reference to humans. For example in a *remsceal*, entitled ‘How the Bulls Were Begotten’ it is clear that these represent a particular form of dynamic principle that is central to the later text of the Táin.

One *remsceal* recounts the tale of two pigkeepers. One is the pig-keeper for the head of the *sídh* (*spirit-beings*) of Connacht; the other of the king of the *sídh* of Munster. There is bad-blood between the two kings, whose pig-keepers are the equal of each other in every aspect of talent and ability. When one has a surplus, the other will travel to his land to share in this and vice versa. The kings try to set them against one another, each boasting that theirs has the greater power. Goaded, the pig-keepers put their talents to the test, and as each in turn seeks to demonstrate his prowess, so it becomes clear that they are doubles in all respects. Each is then dismissed by his respective king.

The pig-keepers now transmute into two quarrelling birds of prey, each spending a year in Connacht squabbling and then a year in Munster squabbling. The men of Munster become tired of the squabbling of the birds and gather at that place. The birds then turn back into the two pig-keepers and are made welcome. They are asked what they have been doing and reply ‘We bring only war-wailing and a fullness of men’s corpses’. They then take the shape of two water creatures and live for two years in two of the great rivers where they are seen devouring each other; then they become two stags which gather up each others’ herds and ruin each others’ dwelling place; then they become two phantoms terrifying each other; then two dragons; then two maggots which fall into two wells, which are drunk up by two heifers – and thus the light bull, the *Finnbhenach* and the *Bo Cuailinge* or dark bull, which is the disputed property of the Táin are born.
The Pillow Talk

The Táin proper begins thus; Ailill and Medbh, King and Queen of Connacht are in bed. Ailill turns to Medbh saying:

‘It is true what they say love’, says Ailill, ‘It is well for the wife of a wealthy man.’

Medbh retorts:

‘True enough, - what put that in your mind?’

Ailill replies:

‘It struck me how much better off you are today than the day I married you.’

Medbh says that she was well enough off before she married him. Ailill fires back that he hadn’t heard much of her wealth, ‘except for your woman’s things and the neighbouring armies making off with loot and plunder’. Inflamed, Medbh speaks of her impeccable lineage and her father, the High-King of all Ireland. She then tells Ailill that before she married:

‘I asked for a harder wedding gift than any woman in Ireland – the absence of meanness and jealousy and fear.’

She then says that she couldn’t marry a mean man because it would be an insult if she were more generous than her husband; nor a timid man, because she thrived on trouble; nor a man who was more spirited, nor jealous, nor sluggish. She got the man she wanted, a kept man. Ailill interjects:

‘You amaze me. No one has more property or jewels or precious things than I have and I know it.’

They challenge each other to determine who indeed has the most property and the lowliest of their possessions are brought out and numbered, including jugs and iron pots. Then their jewelry is brought out; next their clothing; then their herds are gathered and counted. And after all, everything is exactly equal between them, except for one thing. There was one great bull (the Finnbennach, or white one) in Ailill’s herd that had been a calf of one of Medbh’s cows but he, refusing to be led by a woman, had gone over to the king’s herd.

Incensed, Medbh sends her messenger out to scour the whole of Ireland to see if the like of the Finnbennach can be found. The messenger reports that the Ulsterman Daire mac Fiachna, has the Bo Cuailnge (the Brown Bull of Cooley), a match for the Finnbenach if ever there was one. Medbh sends envoys to Daire to seek the loan of the Bo Cualinge for a year and Daire agrees. That night, while staying with Daire two of the envoys are engaged in conversation. One says that Daire is a good man. The second agrees, adding; ‘Is there a better man in Ulster’. The first replies ‘There is indeed, Conchobor the king of Ulster – In any case it was good of them to lend us the Bo Cuailinge; - to have taken him by force would have required the four provinces of Ireland.’ A third man enters the conversation asking the men what they are talking about. One replies ‘We were saying what a good man Daire was’. He then repeats what the two had said about Conchobor and how it would require the four provinces of Ireland to have taken the bull by force. The third man expostulates:

‘I’d as soon see the mouth that said that spout blood! We would have taken it anyway, with or without his leave.’

At precisely this moment the man in charge of Daire’s household enters the hut carrying drink and food for his guests. Seething with fury at what he has just heard he goes straight to Daire and recounts the story to him. Incensed, Daire recants his offer. The envoy returns to Medbh who says:
‘We needn’t polish the knobs and knots in this. It was well known that it would be taken by force if it wasn’t taken freely. And taken it will be.’

Medbh and Ailill draw on their bonds of kinship and allegiance and assemble a great army to seize the Finnbenach from Ulster by force. Due to a curse laid down by Deirdre some time before (Deirdre was forced to race the king’s horse while heavily pregnant due to the boastfulness of her husband but cursed them before she died), the men of Ulster are struck down by a malady and so cannot take up arms to respond to the incursion. Amongst the men of Ulster, only the youthful Cuchulainn is immune to this malady and able to defend his province. Because this youth alone confronts her mighty army, Medbh sends various champions to engage Cuchulainn in single combat. He defeats all of these and it quickly becomes clear to Medbh that only Ferdia, Cuchulainn’s own foster-brother, has the skill to kill the Ulster champion. However Ferdia lacks one key skill that is possessed by Cuchulainn. The two great champions meet – their battle takes up the best part of a chapter – and ultimately Cuchulainn prevails through his one key skill, though he is seriously wounded. Towards the end of the tale the men of Ulster begin to recover from their malady and form an army to confront that of Medbh and Ailill. The two armies engage and death and destruction are widespread. At the close of the tale, the two bulls confront and attack each other. The Bo Cuailinge triumphs but later dies. Peace ensues.

Analysis

The events narrated in The Pillow Talk are ancient, but have a contemporary feel; one can imagine similar quarrels of the ‘Where would you be without me’, variety occurring daily between couples along the length of the land. That the ancient Celts, who were known for their “we” identity were keenly aware of the concept of private property is interesting, although it is noteworthy that as royalty, Medbh and Ailill were regarded as distinctive individuals. The stories are especially interesting in relation to their discussion of sharing.

A theme, almost a principle, akin to entropy, re-occurs at key points throughout the sequence of tales. Mimetic doubles, rivalry and violence permeate the entire sequence to its end, where, although peace breaks out at last, the land is despoiled and virtually all are slain. This principle irrupts into the lives of the two pig-keepers, who are the equal of each other in every way and share amicably, untill goaded by their overlords, to engage in a rivalry that transmutes itself throughout the whole of nature, comprising the maggot that comes to dwell in the rivalry of the bulls. Deirdre is goaded to participate in the race by the boasting of her husband. Ailill’s boast about his superior wealth, incites a new wave of rivalry that draws the hero Cuchulainn into battle with his loved foster-brother, Ferdia, whom he kills; the two great armies then join in battle; finally, the bulls battle to the death.

The stories can thus be read as warning against pride, boastfulness and envy, particularly the threat these pose to sunder the integrity of the kin-group, by destroying relations between husband and wife. Ailill’s barb strikes home to Medbh, a proud and powerful woman, whose father is the High King of Ireland and for a time, it seems that their rivalry might escalate to violence between them. However, once Daire refuses them the bull, husband and wife pull together to draw on their alliances established by kinship and reciprocity to take on the men of Ulster.

Given the context of mimetic rivalry, material is important in the stories, but is only vital in relation to lack and difference. There are wonderfully vivid descriptions in some of the stories of the clothing and weaponry possessed by the heroes and rivals. However in relation to the dynamic theme of rivalry material does not matter in its own right, but only insofar as, in the case of the Finnbenach, it comes to signify the lack of the subject (Medbh) in relation to the model (Ailill). Material thus changes its
meaning and significance depending on the relations of desire pertaining between the subject and the one they take as their model. When Medbh discovers that it is the only thing that separates her from Ailil, the bull, which hitherto meant nothing to her (she at first didn’t even know that she owned the bull, never mind that it had gone astray) becomes supercharged, comprising the only thing that matters in the battle for prestige (Girard, 1987).

The story of Daire illustrates important issues about demand sharing in relation to the *aporia* of the gift (Derrida, 1992). Since Mauss (1990) rubbish the claims made by Malinowski about the pure, or free gift, it has become popular to sideline this aspect of the gift relation as mere romanticism and to focus instead on the demand for reciprocity as central to the gift relation. However as Derrida (op. cit.) makes clear, a gift is not a gift unless it is given freely. When asked to share the bull with Medbh, Daire not only freely agrees to let her messengers bring it with them, but also shows them great hospitality in doing so. His disposition is entirely changed when he overhears the threat that force would otherwise have been used. From that point onward, war is inevitable.

**Discussion and Conclusion**

Although theorists discuss the evolution of domain-specific modules for human cooperation during the Pleistocene, including sharing through kin-selection and gift exchange, or reciprocal altruism (Cosmides & Tooby, 1989; 1992), they do not discuss threats to these pacific relations. The above preliminary analysis of the Táin described suggests that if one assumes the events it describes to be of pressing importance two thousand years ago, then threats to sharing and reciprocity constituted major problems for human social groups. It focuses in particular on potentially dangerous affinal relations by situating the key dialogue in *The Pillow Talk* between Medbh and her husband Ailil who married into her family. Given its ancient provenance and the fact that fragments of the story prevail in oral culture in Ireland to this day, the Táin can be read as a warning against the dangers to social cohesion presented by boasting, jealousy, envy and threats, which can transform the rivalry that is endemic in a family group to epidemic proportions, spreading through the entire social group. Containment of envy and rivalry perhaps explains why principles of demand sharing prevail in many traditional societies, where goods move quickly from one person to the next (Dumouchel, 2011). Traditional communities are thus characterized by relatively pacific relations within the group and hostile relations between groups.

This raises the question of the emergence of large-scale cooperation between strangers demanded by market societies? It is suggested that the development of religion played a vital role in forging the large-scale cooperation necessary to the formation of market societies (Atran & Henrich, 2010). Where traditional societies manage violence by ensuring that goods move quickly from one person to the next through demand sharing and the circle of gift exchange, market societies seek to manage the problem differently by enabling everyone to have the same goods. In this respect, perhaps the difficulty signaled by the Táin, which remains relevant today, is that when it comes to prestige, what matters is not positive, related to the quantity of one’s possessions, but rather by what is lacking or missing, the thing that makes the vital difference between your lack and someone else’s gain. This raises the question that if acquisitive mimesis is alive and well in market society, how is this contained?
References


Dooley, Ann (2006), *Playing the Hero: Reading the Táin Bó Cúailnge,* University of Toronto Press, Toronto


Gabriel, Yiannis (ed.). *Myths, Stories and Organizations: Premodern Narratives for Our Times.*


Neoliberalism and structural violence in developing countries: the case of the Cambodian education market

Paul Henry, University of Sydney, Australia
Marylouise Caldwell, University of Sydney, Australia

This paper highlights the way in which the implementation of neoliberal economic policies, a condition of many loans provided by the World Bank, gives rise to structural violence (Galtung 1969) in developing countries (Varman and Belk 2009; Varman, Skålén, and Belk 2012). Informed by neoclassical economics, neoliberalism proposes that the control of economic factors is best situated in the private rather than the public sector, that markets be deregulated and government taxes and investment in the public sector be kept to a bare minimum (Varman and Belk 2009; Varman, Skålén, and Belk 2012). Structural violence “occurs when economic and political structures systematically deprive need satisfaction for certain segments of society” (Christie 1997, 315). In exploring these issues, we examine the Cambodian education market, in which inequity linked to neoliberalism results in substantial deficits in human development and self-determination. The situation is exacerbated by a political and cultural context characterised by authoritarianism and networks of patronage in which norms of power sharing are markedly absent. Conversations with former Cambodian students add an important experiential flavour to our analysis. We construct our argument as follows: first an overview of Cambodia’s political, social and economic characteristics followed by an analysis of the education market embedded in this setting, next how students experience structural violence and finally we identify the distortions created by a one-size-fits-all neoliberal intervention.

The Political, Economic and Social setting

Following thirty years of civil war, genocide and ten years of occupation by the Vietnamese, The United Nations Transitional Authority in Cambodia (UNTAC) was set up to assist the locals in rebuilding the shattered nation (Chandler 2007). The intervention was to become the largest UN intervention in terms of dollar value at the time. A (neo) liberal democratic constitution was drawn up under the watchful eye of UNTAC and elections were held in 1993. Hun Sen’s ruling Cambodian People’s Party, installed by Vietnam after their invasion, won 38% of the vote against the opposition Funcinpec’s 45% (Coates 2005). Yet bottom line is that Prime Minister Hun Sen remains firmly entrenched in power today. An ex Khmer Rouge officer who defected to Vietnam, he has now run the country for thirty years.

A central coordinating body in funding this reconstruction has been the World Bank who has pushed the neoliberal agenda of free market economy, deregulation, limited government intervention, and privatization. This has indeed benefited some sectors such as the garment industry through low regulation and tariff free status with Europe and USA. However, it has also resulted in very low wages and unregulated working conditions that can be characterized as being poor, to outright dangerous. Many cases have recently been reported about workers collapsing and becoming sick as a result of these unregulated conditions (Channyda and Slattery...
Indeed, at time of writing a garment factory building collapse has just been reported in news bulletins.

Indicators of success such as a steady growth in GDP of approximately 6% per annum and stable government mask persistently high poverty rates. The Asian Development Bank (2013, vii) states that “about three-quarters of the population remain poor, or near poor, below or marginally above the poverty line.” The World Bank estimates annual per capita income in 2011 at $820. This figure places Cambodia at 140 out of 169 listed countries. The country lacks most all forms of basic services that range across education, energy, health, transport and social services; and very poorly funded bureaucracy and weak public service structures. At time of writing the country has no rail system, just two commercial airports and the main highway running north from Phnom Penh to the second biggest city—Battambang—is in dangerous disrepair.

Most telling is the continuing and heavy reliance on foreign aid to prop up a barely functioning civil system. Foreign aid accounts for nearly half of public spending and virtually all of the social security spending. This makes Cambodia one of the most aid-dependent countries in the world and means that the World Bank is a very influential player in Cambodia. However, the World Bank also diplomatically reports that despite this overtly free market orientation they have sought to foster that other kinds of market “distortions” persist. “Cambodia has made major progress in developing the foundations for an effective state after decades of conflict. At the same time, a host of issues constrain the government’s ability to deliver core services and all available studies point to persistent high levels of corruption. Establishing more effective, transparent and rule-based governance remains at the heart of Cambodia’s development challenge” (World Bank 2011, ii). Transparency International (2012) ranks Cambodia 164th amongst 176 nations on its Corruption Perception index.

Persistent high levels of corruption are deeply embedded across all sectors and levels of Cambodian society (Brinkley 2011; Coates 2005; Ear 2007). One reason is very poor levels of pay for most all categories of public servant. To sustain family and life public sector workers are forced to supplement their incomes. So free services become fee for services. For example, doctors earning around $100 per month often charge for medical attention in public hospitals, bureaucrats at the transport department will take an extra fee to reduce delays in motor bike registrations or police will take a fee for turning a blind eye to traffic infringements. These relatively small everyday occurrences pale into insignificance when the patronage of senior government officials is considered. Prominent issues at the moment include payment for allowing “friends” to engage in illegal logging or effecting large scale “land grabs” by party members on powerless small land holders (Cambodian Human Rights Action Committee 2012). Furthermore, locals frequently explain that an average of 25% of donor funds is siphoned off by ruling party officials before distribution to provincial government departments.

This culture of corruption is closely related to poor governance structures and the complete dominance of Prime Minister Hun Sen and the Cambodian People’s Party across the last thirty years. Kheang Un (2012, 202) puts it succinctly “the country has moved toward rule by law rather than rule of law, meaning ‘for my friends everything; for my enemies, the law’.” Bhattacharya (2012) points out that while Cambodia presents as one of the few free market economies in Asia that “on a closer look, Cambodia isn’t free. It’s a free-for-all, where without proper rules, only the most well connected thrive.” Part of the issue relates to poor pay. However Cambodia exhibits a very long history of patronage where loyalty networks are built and favours given in return. This happens from the top-down where the government maintains control.
through buying off powerful players with economic concessions. This may include access to a tract of land for logging or mining; free reign to engage in land acquisition for growing rice in a particular region; or exclusive right to sale of construction materials in a particular area. All of these examples act against free market conditions. At the more local level we have heard firsthand accounts of purchasing public service jobs for up to five thousand US dollars followed by paying a proportion of a weekly wage to a supervisor; who then in turn pays a portion to their superior. We have also heard firsthand accounts from small business owners about their exposure to arbitrary levy of various taxes and costly fee compliance to ill-defined regulations. Brinkley (2011) cites many examples of the patronage system that operates across the police force, judiciary, military, and health and education sectors. In short patronage is a ubiquitous feature of Cambodian society that probably has deep roots extending back into the rule of Monarchy (Tan 2008). Consequently, rule of law and democracy are quite foreign to Cambodian culture. Kent (2012) points out that the primary means that Cambodians employ to win a dispute is to use their connections. This makes powerful patrons far more important than the legal system in Cambodia. These cultural issues are complex and warrant explication in a separate paper.

The Education Market

Sitting squarely within the social and economic context described above is the public education sector. The Cambodian constitution explicitly states that free primary and secondary education will be provided for all citizens and that quality education will be accessible and available to all (Tan 2007). The collection of fees by teachers from students is officially banned by the Cambodian Education Ministry. Yet, a range of schemes where teachers collect money from students is found to be widely employed across the public school system. They come in a variety of different guises. These schemes are well documented (Benveniste, Marshall, and Araujo 2008; Bray 2007; Brinkley 2011; Dawson 2011; Tan 2008; World Bank 2005) and we have heard of them described repeatedly across many discussions with former students. They range from daily collection of fees from school students by teachers. This is often encouraged through implicit threat that students will be negatively biased at exam time if they fail to pay. They are also sometimes disguised as “bicycle parking” fees. The most common fee for study comes in the form of paying for extra classes. Now in Western societies paying for extra tutoring is also common. However, these extra classes are conducted in lunch hours or after school in the same classrooms where students who pay are positively advantaged in a range of ways not found in the West. For example, in many cases examinable material is withheld from normal classes and only taught to fee paying classes. Fee paying students are often given the exam questions in advance or simply given higher marks at exam time. In these ways the payment is not seen to be about learning quality, but more about avoiding threat of poorer grades.

The other well-documented area of education corruption lies in widespread purchases of final exams or bribing of exam monitors to turn a blind eye to cheating. While we focus on the school system, we note that this also applies across the tertiary education system. It is difficult to pin down the scale of these practices. However, it comes up repeatedly in discussions with former students and has become a public issue in the Cambodian press. For example, a recent Phnom Penh Post (2012) headline reads “Exam Cheating Rampant” and cites a survey of student cheating practices where 92% of the student respondents admitted to some form of bribery or cheating in the National High School Exam (Ley 2012). The gravity of the situation is also
backed up by calls from The Cambodian Independent Teachers Association for the government to take action (Noun 2011).

Part of the reason for this corruption lies in poor pay. However, these fee collection schemes operate in the same way as that of the broader cross-sector patronage system described above. There is systematic pressure on teachers and exam monitors to pay targeted amounts up to their supervisors and then supervisors being pressured to pay further up their hierarchy (Dawson 2010; Soun and Sophon 2012). In this way the education setting exhibits the same patronage system seen across other sectors of Cambodian society. Brinkley (2011, 208) describes how it typically operates; “Teachers, in turn, have to give some of the bribe money to their principals ... principals, in turn, have to pass some of that money up to the local education ministry office. An NGO study called that a facilitation fee, required before the ministry would release salaries and other state funds for the school.” In these ways the individual participants lack agency and are pawns in the system.

One implication for such a corrupted system where teachers are poorly paid is that the quality of both the teachers and the actual educational experience is low. In 2010 only 11% of teachers had completed a tertiary degree (World Bank 2011). The World Bank (2011, 59) noted that “it is difficult to expect high quality outcomes given teachers’ low level of qualifications and relatively low pay. Higher wages in other fields reduce the pool of people willing to become teachers.” Another outcome of coercive extraction of fees is the resentment felt by parents and students against teachers. This acts to reduce the perceived integrity of the education system as a whole (Tan 2008). Bottom line is that there is little real learning going in Cambodian public schools and it is costing people in an already poor society additional money they can ill afford. The result is that “only 38% of the children who enrol in grade 1 continue through grade 9” (World Bank 2011, 54).

**Structural Violence Affects All**

The education market described above features an inbuilt structural violence that negatively affects all Cambodian students in a range of ways. First, the system diverts much of the cost of public education onto households that already contend with a harsh economic environment. One estimate puts household spending at half of the total spending on public education (World Bank 2011). Second, the overall quality of the education system means poorer learning outcomes for all students. It retards the possibility of Cambodian youth to realise their full potential. Third, the outcome for reputation of the Cambodian school system is that it is held in poor regard. It discourages intrinsic learning. This leaves the only role for education as a pathway to job enhancing credentials. This works against the neo-liberal goal of an education system that builds human capital to enable Cambodia to compete successfully in a global marketplace. The current system acts to discourage merit through individual effort—prized by neoliberals. Fourth, the system acts to reinforce the broader culture of corruption. Rather than study, students who use money to succeed are likely to model such behaviours in other spheres of life. These same patterns translate into the tertiary education section and then into the job market where payment for position is also common practice. This reinforcement of culture of corruption is arguably one of the most deleterious implications for Cambodian society. As Brinkley (2011, 208) succinctly puts it “you go to school and learn how to bribe people.” Fifth, the system fosters greater income and wealth disparity across Cambodian society. Those able to pay use their relative advantage to accumulate further material advantages. Over time, these
conditions could potentially promote the kind of popular frustration and dissatisfaction with inequality and corruption that drove the rise of Khmer Rouge in the 1970’s.

Violence of Inequality

“The large inequality of spending by the different income quintiles implies substantial inequality in access and ultimately outcomes ... therefore within the same public school system some students have a qualitatively different experience because their parents supplement the public provision with their own resources—for instance by buying textbooks not provided by the government or by getting private tutoring ... public education, as a result, amplifies rather than mitigates social inequality” (World Bank 2011, 60). The implication is that the corrupt system creates two tiers within individual public schools—a division between wealthier students who pay the fees and bribes and those that do not, or cannot. This is different to the Western education system where money is also employed to gain advantage, yet the students are screened from each other through enrolment into different schools that are graded by socioeconomic area and fee structure. In Cambodian schools the poorer students are well aware of their disadvantage compared to other students in the same school. They either stretch their family finances in paying the fees or go without. Resentment and disaffection is common. For example, one student quoted in Noun (2011) stated that he had to borrow money from relatives and that “If I didn’t I wouldn’t pass. Actually, it is not a good thing to do but we have no choice. We have to do it because the lazy rich students can easy to do it and get good grades.” Poorer students reported being well aware that richer students were skipping classes because they knew they did not have to study. In our conversations with former students those that were unable to pay extra fees typically stayed apart from the more affluent students. One informant felt that some other students looked down on him and when asked the reason why he said “They are rich. They had enough money, but for us we did not have money for school. I was afraid to be their friend and I just had friends who were poor as me.” So this created a segregated environment where inequality is understood and overtly distinguishes rich and poor. This lack of fairness is also noticed by poorer students in that students from wealthy families had money to buy snacks and wore newer clothing. They also experience inequity when as non-fee paying students they are publicly labelled as being academically “weaker.” One informant stated that “I was not as clever as rich students.” Not surprisingly they report feeling ashamed and stigmatised by their inability to pay fees and by their inevitable poor performance. This reinforces a negative experience of school life. Overall they found their school days to be a de-motivating experience. Consequently many don’t complete high school. Of course poorer exam results and early drop out from school dramatically increase the likelihood of a lifetime in low-paying jobs. In Cambodia non-completion of high school results in a much higher probability of a life below the poverty line of $1.25 per day (Renzenbrink 2012).

What of This Neoliberal Intervention?

The interaction between Western neoliberal oriented agencies and a culture of patronage controlled by an authoritarian regime has resulted in adoption of formal rules and regulations professing support for free market and limited government intervention—as agencies such as the World Bank have sought to foster. However this amounts to window dressing. The Cambodian government goes along with this facade in order to ensure the continued flow of donor funds and
favourable trade agreements. It is true that the international donor community speaks out against inefficiencies and widespread corruption. Responding to such pressure an anti-corruption watchdog was recently set up. However, it is poorly funded and staffed. More importantly it lacks independence and reports to the government. Noting that the judiciary is also dominated by the government the potential for the ruling party to use this anticorruption body to selectively target political opposition figures becomes apparent. In a myriad of similar ways the government responds to Western pressure with additional free market window dressing in ways that actually increase their grip on power. The neoliberal ideal of minimal government interference is diverted by corruption and arbitrary application of rules and favours that clouds the environment with uncertainty. Gupta (2012) argues in the Indian setting that even with apparent genuine commitment that the failure of public services delivery is often caused by the arbitrariness in application of rules. He further argues that arbitrariness and poor work performance is an expression of public servant oppression. If this also applies to the Cambodian setting then it indicates a deep sense of dissatisfaction and resignation amongst Cambodian civil servants to the current situation.

Bourdieu (1998) critiques the possibility of a neoliberal “utopia.” A central issue lies in the rationalist economic argument that gives little consideration to social realities. Individual rationality is prized by the neoliberal thinker. This cult of individual responsibility has emerged as the dominant ideology in Western societies (Henry 2010). Yet the reality is that human life is sustained by social relations and facilitating communal structures. This reality buttresses more moderate liberal notions of social support and equitable social outcomes. In Cambodia such liberal notions are also present. However, the most significant social phenomena that stands against the possibility of a neoliberal utopia lies in the deeply entrenched culture of patronage and associated networks of power. Bourdieu is found to be right in saying that social realities overtake rational ideals. However, the social realities in Cambodian society are quite different to that of the West. It is interesting that the social realities in Cambodia mean that the power elites are happy to formally enact neoliberal policies and regulations. Yet in fact they actually engage in significant levels of arbitrary market intervention that stand outside the rule of law. It appears that international donor organisations have been able to apply little leverage on the Cambodian government to effect real change. Despite periodic threats to withhold funding the Cambodian government has been quite effective in maintaining the status quo.

An interesting question is to compare the outcomes of a neoliberal agenda with that of Cambodian authoritarianism. At the theoretical level neoliberals place the onus of responsibility on the individual to achieve and they believe that this is best facilitated by minimal government intervention. This is quite different to the Cambodian patronage system where success means that the winnings are shared amongst the successful patronage network—to the exclusion of everyone else. For Cambodians, success is primarily dependent on participation in powerful patronage networks—not on their individual efforts. This reveals a stark contrast between an authoritarian patronage system and Western neoliberal logic—success through cooperation versus success through individual effort. At the more pragmatic level casual observation indicates that the two approaches share a common characteristic and that is the appearance of conditions that can be better likened to a “free for all.” The justifying facades may vary. However, more broadly those with greater power exercise that power to dominate the rest. This conforms to work that explores how authoritarianism figures prominently in neoliberal practice (Giroux 2004; Springer 2009).
Note on Data Collection
The authors have been made five extended field trips to Cambodia over a two year period starting in January 2011. In this time we have developed and implemented an AusAID funded project in Cambodia designed to equip young women with entrepreneurial business skills. In this period we have worked with Cambodians to develop case studies of women in small businesses and have supervised a research project examining the outcomes for female graduates. One author has also participated in a second AusAID funded project that involves training Cambodian public health workers in social marketing techniques to effect health behaviour change. We have also supported the activities of an Australian NGO that runs an orphanage and community outreach centre in Cambodia. This has lead to our interest in studying the transition from the school experience through to independent living. For this current paper we draw upon discussions with young people that have recently finished their schooling. More broadly we use the understandings accrued across our extensive interactions with a large range of people across Cambodian society.

References


## Market Making and Marketing in Emerging Economies I

**Abstract/Papers Included**

The self, space, and marketing: Examining the promises of ideal existence in the gated communities of Indian metros  
Himadri Roy Chaudhuri, IMI-Kolkata, India  
James W. Gentry, University of Nebraska - Lincoln, USA
Gated communities symbolize new urban forms in India, which have emerged out of the traditional city spaces. This paper attempts to unpack the resident cultural meanings expressed in advertisements, reports, and blogs of gated communities, which situate these urban structures as heterotopias of good life. The discussion is built upon the substantial scholarship on space and subjectivity and unfolds the tropes of a fantasy world that contrasts sharply with the surroundings. Although neo-liberalism has been successful in partially subverting the age-old practices like the caste system (Prasad2008), evolving social structures are still pronouncing the idioms of exclusion, discrimination, suppression, and power and reflect the ‘politics of forgetting’ (Fernandes 2004).

Key words: marketing, promotional materials, branding, textual analysis, culture, the self.

Selected References


Tuan, Yi-Fu. (1978), *Space and Place: The Perspective of Experience*. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press.


The Violence of Marketing Systems II

Abstract/Papers Included

Small and medium-sized retailers compete against global giants by local adaptation: Market structure of grocery distribution in Japan
Narimasa Yokoyama, Nihon University, Japan
Masae Takimoto, Osaka University of Economics and Law, Japan
Masaaki Takemura, Meiji University, Japan
Small and Medium-Sized Retailers Compete against Global Giants by Local Adaptation: Market Structure of Grocery Distribution in Japan

Narimasa Yokoyama, Nihon University, Japan
Masae Takimoto, Osaka University of Economics and Law, Japan
Masaaki Takemura, Meiji University, Japan

Abstract

This paper aims to identify the distinctive features of the Japanese grocery retail market, which is regarded as the most difficult market to enter, from macro perspectives. By conducting a macro data interpretation of the structure of the Japanese retail market, we demonstrate the possibility that small- and medium-sized grocery stores in Japan could have a kind of countervailing power against large-scale “big box” retailers; we also attempt to determine the reasons behind this by analyzing the cultural diversity and tolerance in Japan. In our study, we explain the mechanism of the functioning of the grocery retail market in Japan. Historically, the local culture in Japan was extremely diverse; thus, retail stores competed by market segmentation based on the subtle differences in consumer preferences. Competition among retail stores contributes to the improvement of the organizational capabilities of the stores. This competition leads to an increase in the number of large-scale retail stores, and on the other, it allows the small-and medium sized retail stores to focus on the micro demand. This makes it more difficult for large-scale standardized “big box” retailers—which are unable to focus on the varied consumer needs because of their management style—to enter this market. Though standardization has been progressing in various sides by social and economic globalization, we think this point is very important in respect of securing variety and sustainability of locality in Japan.

Keywords: small and medium-sized retailers, global giants, standardization, local adaptation, McDonaldization

Introduction

In recent years, the retail market has undergone significant globalization. Large-scale “big box” companies such as Walmart (U.S.), Carrefour (France), and Tesco (U.K.) have penetrated the retail markets of several countries. These companies employ the strategy of stocking a huge volume of goods and selling them at cheap prices, by utilizing a high buying power and huge capital. They dominate the overseas markets as they have a cost advantage over other companies. This trend has now spread to various countries and regions worldwide. For example, although the physical and cultural distance between U.S. or European countries and Asian countries is very large, global giants are now entering into the Asian markets (Table 1).

In spite this global trend, global giants have not successfully been able to enter certain markets like the Japanese grocery market. The Japanese grocery market has several distinctive features, and it is regarded as the most difficult market to enter (Kotler et al., 1985; Christopher, 1986). Despite this general perception of the Japanese grocery market, Walmart has achieved outstanding results in Japan,
where it has over 300 stores. Thus, in order to understand whether this perception is correct or not, we briefly review the entry of global giants in the Japanese market.

Table 1. Number of Big Box Stores (July 2011)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Walmart</th>
<th>Carrefour</th>
<th>Tesco</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>China</td>
<td>352</td>
<td>195</td>
<td>105</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Taiwan</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>63</td>
<td>—</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Korea</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>354</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>India</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Malaysia</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Thailand</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>782</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indonesia</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>83</td>
<td>—</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Japan</td>
<td>371</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>132</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Official websites of these companies

Seiyu, which became a subsidiary of Walmart in 2006, introduced the Walmart’s strategy diligently, yet it could not increase its sales volume considerably; rather, it is believed to be struggling to sustain a position in the Japanese market (sales volumes: JPY997.324 billion in 2007 (recent data is not variable); ranked 5th in terms of sales volume in the category of supermarkets). Carrefour established Carrefour Japan Inc. in 2000 and attempted to enter the Japanese market. Eventually, Carrefour was forced to withdraw and sold its Japanese subsidiary to AEON Company (a Japanese retail conglomerate). Tesco, which acquired Sea True Network Inc. (a Japanese regional supermarket) in 2003, opened supermarkets in Tokyo and entered the Japanese market; however, it announced its withdrawal in 2011, and AEON Company acquired its majority shares at merely 1 yen.

These cases indicate that global giants’ cost leadership strategy and huge capital resource power cannot win the support of Japanese customers. In other words, it is difficult for large-scale retailers to realize their competitive advantage based on huge management resources. In this paper, we propose a framework that demonstrates how small- and medium-sized retailers can successfully compete with global companies that have a huge capital.

The remainder of this paper is organized as follows. First, we briefly review the literature on the Japanese distribution structure and confirmed their dominant paradigm. Second, we analyze macro census data and validate the structural features of the Japanese retail market. We also determine how large-scale retailers could control the food retail market, by analyzing the data on transitions in the market concentration ratio from 2008 to 2011. Finally, we discuss our research question and analytical framework to clarify the structure of the Japanese grocery retail market, by examining the interaction between retail strategy and local culture and taste. We also suggest the theoretical and practical implications of our study.

**Brief Review of Previous Studies on Japanese Distribution Structure**

There is a valid explanation for why very few studies have examined the Japanese distribution structure. Since Japanese researchers have written their research in English, most researchers in foreign countries can read them. However, Japanese researchers’ works written in Japanese are not widely read by foreign researchers worldwide.

A relatively early study on the Japanese distribution structure was conducted by Yoshino (1971). Although his study primarily focused on Japanese businesses, one portion of his study discussed the
distribution sector in Japan. His analysis was based on qualitative data, and he discussed the growth of large-scale retailers, retail chains, and department stores, especially self-service stores. Later on, some other researchers also wrote research papers on this topic; however, their works were barely noticed by dominant English-speaking researchers.

In the 1980s, the Japanese management system became widely popular. Vogel (1979) published the bestseller, Japan as Number One. Lazer et al. (1985) focused on four aspects in Japanese businesses: the growth in Japanese marketing management, nature of government and business relationships, process of formulating strategies, and practical process of formulating marketing strategies. They described the Japanese distribution system as confusing, unintelligible, an impossible maze, and long and complicated, as it involved several middlemen, an oversupply of retailing and wholesaling personnel, a strong emphasis on service, and high costs and inefficiencies in Japanese marketing management. In Japan, the larger, more efficient wholesalers saw an improvement in economic efficiency, while retailers did not achieve a sufficient degree of integration despite a significant growth in the number of mass merchandise retailers, including chain stores and self-service stores.

These studies made forecasts regarding the Japanese distribution system. Researchers discussed several prospects and reached a consensus on the importance of large-scale retailers. Nevertheless, the majority of retailers in Japan are small, independent, and economically inefficient.

Czinkota and Woronoff (1986) indicated two main problems in the Japanese distribution structure. The first issue was the large number of wholesalers in Japan. They showed comparative results on population per wholesalers between U.S. and Japan. In U.S. there were 643, contrast with 351 in Japan. That is, wholesalers in Japan were counted twice more than U.S.’s were. The second issue was that the W/R ratio of Japan (3.77 in 1979) was also more than twice of that of the U.S (1.74). W/R ratio is an indicator that describes the number of transactions between wholesalers and retailers (the bigger number, the worse). This ratio roughly indicates the length of the distribution structure, and it is sometimes employed as evidence of the inefficiency of a distribution structure.

The Japan-U.S. Structural Impediments Initiative (SII) report, which discusses the problems in the Japanese distribution system, has been widely read (Morita, 1991; Bush and Kaifu, 1991). The report was prepared after a meeting between the Japanese and U.S. governments regarding Japanese business customs, and it criticizes many of the customs. It suggested changes in Japanese saving and investment patterns, land policy, distribution system, exclusionary business practices, “keiretsu” relationships, and pricing mechanisms. It recommended that the regulations of the Large-Scale Retail Store Law of 1973 be revised; this law restricted the establishment of a retail store with over 3000 square meters of space. SII recognized that the Japanese distribution system could be improved by eliminating inefficient small retailers.

Several Japanese studies examined this topic in detail. Many discuss the reason why these inefficient small retailers still remained in Japanese distribution system. However, since they were all written in Japanese, no one apart from the Japanese could understand them. In this paper, we interpret these Japanese studies.

Previous studies suggest that the number of both wholesalers and retailers in Japan is the reason for its ineffective distribution system; Japan’s store density or retail stores per capita was very high in 2002 (Table 2).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th># of Stores (/1000 people)</th>
<th>Japan</th>
<th>UK</th>
<th>U.S.A.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td># of Stores (/1000 people)</td>
<td>9.1</td>
<td>5.2</td>
<td>5.5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Japanese Ministry of Economy, Trade and Industry
Table 2 implies that store density could affect the purchasing behavior of Japanese consumers; however, this effect might be different from that on American or British consumers. These differences can be explained from three perspectives.

First, “market slack” and distribution policies facilitated the survival of small-scale retailers over the past 60 years. Market slack is the margin that modern large-scale retailers are not able to cover in a certain trading area. Tamura (1986) pointed out that market slack occurs when the total demand is greater than the total supply. High levels of overall economic growth allowed small retailers to maintain their business, and distribution policies protected them from large retailers. Market slack can be explained partially by the distribution policy. The Large-Scale Retail Store Law governed the operations of large retailing stores. Its purpose was to protect consumer benefit and provide small and medium-sized retailers with the opportunity to grow. It was in force from 1974 to 2000. Second, the Japanese food culture requires food retail stores to accommodate customer demands (Maruyama, 1992). For example, Japanese citizens often eat fresh raw fish (Sashimi). To ensure safe consumption, Sashimi must be bought frequently because of the difficulty in keeping it fresh. Third, the population density in Japan is relatively high while the houses are relatively small. As a result, Japanese citizens are unable to store a large amount of groceries in their house (Naryu, 1994).

Because of these factors, Japanese consumers have to buy grocery more frequently than American and British consumers do. The average frequency of fresh food shopping for Japanese consumers is 4.92 times per week (Japan Meat Information Service Center, 2007). Given these factors, a variety of grocery stores are required in Japanese neighborhoods. However, large-scale “big box” retailers find it difficult to open stores in Japanese neighborhoods because of their high costs. Therefore, small- and medium-sized grocery store retailers are considered more amenable to the Japanese distribution structure.

Analysis and Main Findings

Previous studies have made predictions about transitions in the Japanese distribution system. Many of them forecasted that the system will become more efficient and will be dominated by larger retailers. We now have unique data about the system from Japanese Commercial Census and Nikkei Marketing Journal (Nikkei MJ). Thus, in this section, we provide evidence about the feature of Japanese distribution system by using macro data, and summarize our main findings.

Macro Data Analysis

By using macro-level data obtained from the Japanese Commercial Census and the Nikkei MJ, we conducted analyses to confirm the Japanese distribution structure and characteristics of the current Japanese retail market.

The shares of different retail formats’ sales in the entire retail market’s sales from 1991 to 2007 are summarized in Table 3. These data indicate a decreasing trend in the sales of department stores and general merchandising store and an increasing trend in the sales of cloth retail supermarkets and food retail supermarkets.

The extent to which the retail market in Japan resembles an oligopoly is low (Maruyama, 1992; Minamikata, 2009; Naryu, 1994). The relative market share is calculated by using the following steps: (1) Choose a particular format from within the top 100 retailers. (2) Sum up the sales amount to calculate the total sales of the format. (3) Divide a particular retailer’s sales by the total format’s sales. These predominant Japanese retail formats are summarized below. The sales figures for the supermarket format are provided in Table 4 and Figure 1.
Table 3. Trends in different retail formats’ sales (1991–2007)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Department store</td>
<td>8.1</td>
<td>7.4</td>
<td>7.2</td>
<td>7.0</td>
<td>5.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>General merchandising store</td>
<td>5.9</td>
<td>6.5</td>
<td>6.7</td>
<td>7.1</td>
<td>5.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cloth retail supermarket</td>
<td>0.3</td>
<td>0.6</td>
<td>0.8</td>
<td>1.3</td>
<td>1.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Food retail supermarket</td>
<td>4.4</td>
<td>9.2</td>
<td>10.0</td>
<td>13.2</td>
<td>12.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Home associated supermarket</td>
<td>1.0</td>
<td>2.1</td>
<td>3.1</td>
<td>7.7</td>
<td>6.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Convenience store</td>
<td>5.0</td>
<td>5.8</td>
<td>3.5*</td>
<td>5.0</td>
<td>5.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Drug store</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>2.0</td>
<td>2.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The other supermarket</td>
<td>6.9</td>
<td>5.8</td>
<td>6.8</td>
<td>4.6</td>
<td>4.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Single line store, Specialty store</td>
<td>68.4</td>
<td>65.5</td>
<td>61.9</td>
<td>56.2</td>
<td>59.2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


* The definition of convenience store is changed from what it was in 1997

Table 4. Companies’ relative market shares in the supermarket store format (2011)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Rank</th>
<th>Company</th>
<th>Sales (million yen)</th>
<th>Sales share in the top 100 retailers’ sales (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>AEON RETAIL**</td>
<td>2,199,900</td>
<td>14.97</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Ito-Yokado***</td>
<td>1,361,060</td>
<td>9.26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>UNY</td>
<td>1,079,150</td>
<td>7.34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Daiei**</td>
<td>869,494</td>
<td>5.91</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>IZUMI</td>
<td>515,874</td>
<td>3.51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>LIFE CORPORATION</td>
<td>503,106</td>
<td>3.42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Valor</td>
<td>410,577</td>
<td>2.79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Heiwado</td>
<td>389,570</td>
<td>2.65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Izumiya</td>
<td>351,546</td>
<td>2.39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>YORK BENIMARU***</td>
<td>348,600</td>
<td>2.37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Maruetsu**</td>
<td>323,179</td>
<td>2.20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>Beisia</td>
<td>322,910</td>
<td>2.20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>Fuji</td>
<td>311,083</td>
<td>2.12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>OKUWA</td>
<td>300,513</td>
<td>2.04</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>MANDAI</td>
<td>262,096</td>
<td>1.78</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>CO-OP SAPPORO</td>
<td>261,860</td>
<td>1.78</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>MaxValu Nishinihon**</td>
<td>255,130</td>
<td>1.74</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>CO-OP Kobe</td>
<td>252,594</td>
<td>1.73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td>AEON Kyushu**</td>
<td>249,144</td>
<td>1.70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20</td>
<td>SUMMIT</td>
<td>242,902</td>
<td>1.65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21</td>
<td>Yaoko</td>
<td>237,371</td>
<td>1.62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22</td>
<td>OK</td>
<td>236,108</td>
<td>1.61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23</td>
<td>Kasumi**</td>
<td>221,697</td>
<td>1.51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24</td>
<td>Inageya**</td>
<td>219,164</td>
<td>1.49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25</td>
<td>TOKU STORE CHAIN</td>
<td>210,992</td>
<td>1.44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26</td>
<td>Marunaka**</td>
<td>188,009</td>
<td>1.28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Name</td>
<td>2011 Sales (million Yen)</td>
<td>Market Share</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td>---------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------</td>
<td>--------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27</td>
<td>AEON Hokkaido**</td>
<td>167,273</td>
<td>1.14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>28</td>
<td>MaxValu Tokai**</td>
<td>163,215</td>
<td>1.11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29</td>
<td>CO-OP Tokyo</td>
<td>158,467</td>
<td>1.08</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30</td>
<td>sanwa</td>
<td>154,009</td>
<td>1.05</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31</td>
<td>KOBE BUSSAN</td>
<td>150,682</td>
<td>1.03</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>32</td>
<td>San-A</td>
<td>146,000</td>
<td>0.99</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>33</td>
<td>CO-OP Kanagawa</td>
<td>132,843</td>
<td>0.90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>34</td>
<td>Taiyo</td>
<td>130,863</td>
<td>0.89</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35</td>
<td>MaxValu Kyushu**</td>
<td>126,132</td>
<td>0.86</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>36</td>
<td>Belc</td>
<td>123,924</td>
<td>0.84</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>37</td>
<td>MaxValu Chubu**</td>
<td>122,338</td>
<td>0.83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>38</td>
<td>KANSAI SUPER MARKET</td>
<td>118,927</td>
<td>0.81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>39</td>
<td>YorkMart***</td>
<td>118,422</td>
<td>0.81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>40</td>
<td>RALSE</td>
<td>118,174</td>
<td>0.80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>41</td>
<td>Peacock Store</td>
<td>112,627</td>
<td>0.77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>42</td>
<td>Eco’s</td>
<td>108,591</td>
<td>0.74</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>43</td>
<td>Saitama CO-OP</td>
<td>108,013</td>
<td>0.74</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>44</td>
<td>Harashin</td>
<td>106,123</td>
<td>0.72</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>45</td>
<td>Miyagi CO-OP</td>
<td>102,975</td>
<td>0.70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>46</td>
<td>Yamanaka</td>
<td>102,368</td>
<td>0.70</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Total**: 13,581,472 (100)

Source: Nikkei MJ, June 27, 2012

*Including general merchandising stores and food retail supermarkets

**AEON group

***Seven & I Holdings group

Figure 1. Relative market share in supermarket store format (2011)
Table 4 and Figure 1 demonstrate that top retailers, AEON RETAIL and Ito-Yokado, have a relatively large share in the supermarket retail industry. In addition, AEON Company has a number of subsidiaries and affiliated retailers in the top 100 retailers. Given these holdings, AEON Company maintains a 34.3% market share. The company that holds the second-highest market share, Seven & I Holdings, has two subsidiaries apart from Ito-Yokado in the top 100 retailers. Because of these holdings, Seven & I Holdings captures 12.4% of the market in the supermarket format.

In summary, some top-ranked companies have organized a conglomerate, specifically AEON RETAIL and Seven & I Holdings, and have a dominant share in the supermarket industry. This market structure has been in place since 2006. Under this structure, Walmart acquired SEIYU (ranked 5th in 2006, with sales of 996 billion yen) in 2006 and AEON became affiliated with DAIEI (ranked 4th in 2006, with sales of 1,196 billion yen) in 2007. The relative market share and market concentration of top-ranked companies are listed in Table 5. Here, market concentration is indicated by the Herfindahl-Hirshman Index (HHI), which is calculated by squaring the market share of each firm competing in the market and then summing the resulting numbers (The United States Department of Justice: http://www.justice.gov/atr/public/guidelines/hhi.html).

In spite of numerous holdings, the relative market share and HHI of the top three retailers is not very high (1383.54). In addition, although AEON Company has twelve subsidiaries and affiliated retailers in the top 100 retailers, five of them that are Daiei, Maruetsu, Kasumi, Inageya, and Marunaka; these do not fundamentally adopt the standardized management and operation of AEON Company. In other words, AEON Company merely contributes to their private brand and distribution system. Therefore, these five retailers are still unique for their customers. After excluding these five retailers, the relative share of AEON Company in 2011 was 21.9%. The relative share and HHI of the top three retailers was 41.6% and 687.65; these low scores indicate that these firms have not formed an oligopoly and that the competitive environment in the supermarket format is sound.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Retail group</th>
<th>Sales including group company</th>
<th>Relative share in Top 100</th>
<th>Relative share of Top 3 in Top 100</th>
<th>HHI of Top 3 in Top 100</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2011</td>
<td>AEON RETAIL, etc.</td>
<td>5,040,590</td>
<td>34.3</td>
<td>54.1</td>
<td>1383.54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Ito-Yokado, etc.</td>
<td>1,828,082</td>
<td>12.4</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>UNY</td>
<td>1,190,247</td>
<td>7.3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2010</td>
<td>AEON RETAIL, etc.</td>
<td>4771488</td>
<td>33.49</td>
<td>54.1</td>
<td>1346.26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Ito-Yokado, etc.</td>
<td>1827560</td>
<td>12.8</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>UNY</td>
<td>1112781</td>
<td>7.8</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2009</td>
<td>AEON RETAIL, etc.</td>
<td>4840326</td>
<td>33.8</td>
<td>54.7</td>
<td>1371.26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Ito-Yokado, etc.</td>
<td>1845256</td>
<td>12.9</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>UNY</td>
<td>1134427</td>
<td>7.9</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2008</td>
<td>AEON RETAIL, etc.</td>
<td>5189177</td>
<td>35.6</td>
<td>56.9</td>
<td>1506.21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Ito-Yokado, etc.</td>
<td>1918974</td>
<td>13.1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>UNY</td>
<td>1190247</td>
<td>8.2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Although this retail format experiences high levels of competition among firms, it also experiences high inter-type competition across independent vegetable stores, meat stores, or fish stores. However, the traditional single-line stores are not generally competitive. The supermarket format has also recently begun competing partially with convenience stores, which deal in ready-cooked food.

**Main Findings**

In this section, we summarize the findings obtained by analyzing macro data on Japanese retailers. First, the HHI score for grocery stores was found to be low. Both the global giant and convenience store segments show high market concentration. To explain this finding, we now discuss the background of the capitalist world (Dholakia and Firat, 1996). Grocery store retailers are good at handling packaged products owing to their management strategy. Their buying power works as pressures for manufactures to reduce the price. Their strategy of opening multiple store branches contributes to the production of standardized packaged products. Standardized products are suited to our everyday lives. People prefer eating pre-cooked meals that can be microwaved to cooking at home. However, fresh vegetables, fish, and meat are not suited for standardized procurement, logistics, and store operation.

Second, contrary to previous forecasts, many small and medium-sized local grocery stores are still operational. We believe that this is the primary reason that even global giants have failed to enter the Japanese market. Adaptation to local needs is a major obstacle for global giants because their strategies are based on standardization, while local grocery stores are able to meet the local needs.

Thus, our research question focuses on the strengths of small and medium-sized local grocery stores. In the next section, we discuss our research question based on the above-mentioned findings.

**Research Question**

Our research question explores why small and medium-sized local grocery stores are still operational in Japan. As discussed earlier in the paper, Japanese researchers believe that external conditions have contributed to the survival of local grocery stores; for instance, in the face of market slack, the market demanded the goods supplied by such stores.

The researchers’ reasoning undoubtedly explains the mechanism of the Japanese distribution system. However, our question remains unresolved. In Japan, market slack occurred more than 20 years after the country witnessed a high economic growth period. It is well-known that Japan’s economy has been facing the great recession since the past two decades. We have previously explained why global giants could not cater to consumers’ tastes in Japan as they did in other countries. However, we now need to explain why Japanese consumers’ preferences are stable and not changing in such a globalizing economy.

We hypothesize that the reason for this is the macro interaction between local grocery stores and consumers’ preferences under diverse food cultures. Local grocery stores adapt to local characteristics and tastes. Once these stores understand the local needs, consumers themselves decide what they wish to buy. This is the mechanism of enhancing each retailer’s strategic behavior - interaction.

The Japanese market has many local markets, which are said to have originated in the Edo era in 1603. There were 276 han (feudal domain) in the Edo era. The han was a governmental mechanism started by the Tokugawa shogunate (Japan’s feudal government functional from 1603 to 1867). The shogunate permitted a han to occupy a certain area (land) and govern it. Each han was responsible for security in its area and collected rice as tax. Each han established its own culture, because interrelationship among hans was not permitted by the shogunate.
If we accept the hypothesis of the existence of multiple local markets, we must examine how these cultures were retained and which mechanism dominates the global retail scenario. In the next section, we develop an analytical framework temporally for further analysis.

**Analytical Framework**

Global giants have struggled to enter into the Japanese retail market. We believe that this is because culturally differentiated markets exist in Japan. Our research question addresses the difficulty faced by global giants, which employ a standardization strategy, in entering Japanese markets. In this paper, “standardization strategy” involves cheap prices, standardized packaged goods assortment, and multiple store settings. This strategy makes social welfare higher because it may realize a customer satisfaction. More theoretically, Ritzer (1993) called this trend “McDonaldization.” Consumers who mostly stick to their own cultures sometimes buy these cheaper goods to change their tastes.

Nonetheless, despite McDonaldization, consumers have resistance to standardized products. All consumers have their respective cultures, tastes, and characteristics. Therefore, different consumers might have different tastes. Thus, it is necessary to understand how these different tastes can be catered to for a long time. We experience a reproduction mechanism in our everyday lives. Consumers sometimes rationalize whatever they do (Thompson et al., 1990). In fact, consumers always justify their shopping decisions through an existential-phenomenology method (Thompson et al., 1989).

Based on our discussion above, we can understand how a consumer chooses which strategy is superior. To simplify our discussion, we assume that global giants are good at implementing the standardization strategy while local grocery stores are good at the local adaptation strategy. Consumers always prefer products that are apt to their tastes when encountered with standardized products and localized products. Further, McDonaldization influences only local tastes; thus, the effect of the local adaptation strategy is contingent upon the level of McDonaldization.

Under these assumptions, we propose the hypothetical framework for global giants and local grocery stores in Figure 2.

![Figure 2](image-url)
Figure 2 shows our analytical hypothesis. In Japan, local groceries stores have knowledge of the local needs and are familiar with consumers’ preferences, so the local adaptation strategy often works well for them. In addition, severe competition among these local stores enhances their organizational capabilities.

McDonaldization, however, diminishes the effect of the local adaptation strategy. When the society is at solid line circumstance, local cultures, tastes, and characteristics can be repeatedly reproduced by competition between local retailers. Depending on the angle of inclination, the degree of this reproduction capability is changed. If McDonaldization is widespread, retailers’ local adaptation strategy has less effect on reproducing local culture, taste, and characteristics. In the future, we plan to determine the degree of angle at which the invasion of McDonaldization cannot be resisted.

Conclusion and Directions For Future Research

As mentioned above, Japanese consumers prefer to eat fresh food, and Japanese houses are too small to store much food. Therefore, small- and medium-sized retailers, which sell fresh food, have a competitive advantage over large-scale retailers. In fact, although small retailers are rapidly decreasing in number, medium-sized retailers who employ 5–49 persons are increasing (Table 6).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>1–2 persons (%)</th>
<th>3–4 persons (%)</th>
<th>5–49 persons (%)</th>
<th>50+ persons (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1982</td>
<td>60.2</td>
<td>24.0</td>
<td>15.4</td>
<td>0.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1985</td>
<td>57.8</td>
<td>25.1</td>
<td>16.6</td>
<td>0.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1988</td>
<td>54.0</td>
<td>26.2</td>
<td>19.4</td>
<td>0.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1991</td>
<td>53.1</td>
<td>26.2</td>
<td>20.2</td>
<td>0.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1994</td>
<td>51.0</td>
<td>24.7</td>
<td>23.6</td>
<td>0.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1997</td>
<td>49.9</td>
<td>24.7</td>
<td>24.6</td>
<td>0.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1999</td>
<td>47.0</td>
<td>22.8</td>
<td>29.2</td>
<td>1.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2002</td>
<td>46.4</td>
<td>22.9</td>
<td>29.6</td>
<td>1.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2004</td>
<td>45.9</td>
<td>22.9</td>
<td>29.9</td>
<td>1.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2007</td>
<td>44.3</td>
<td>22.2</td>
<td>32.1</td>
<td>1.4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


Based on these findings, we can infer that even medium-sized grocery chain stores have a competitive advantage over large-scale retailers like AEON Company, Ito-Yokado, and even global giants. Thus, retailers should set criteria according to the refined differentiation strategy not obey the standard segmentation strategy such as difference of prices and races.

On the other hand, grocery stores must focus on the production method (e.g., organic farming or origin of districts where raw material is cultivated), quality (e.g., degree of sugar in fruits and rich tint), and degree of freshness (e.g. check if there is no drop of green leaves or the fish have glazed eyes). Retailers mainly compete on price; however, the fact that fresh food is not manufactured allows retailers to set slightly different prices such that the consumers do not notice the apparent difference in prices. Further, besides prices, retailers also compete on assortment of goods.

In Japan, it is often said that “supermarket A is good at assorting fresh fish,” “supermarket B is good at assorting green leaves of good condition,” “meat sold at C meat shop is so good,” and “fruits sold at supermarket D often go a bit off.” Therefore, differentiation strategy based on these subtle
differences brings more severe retail competition than that of based on standard segmentation like income or race.

To survive such competition, retailers need to improve their organizational capabilities. Further, retailers that successfully manage to meet consumer needs should continue operating. Consumers have the option of shopping at a variety of stores in Japan. This also aggravates further competition. Thus, despite a huge capital, global giants might find it difficult to become market leaders merely through cost leadership.

In future studies, we plan to emphasize on the influence of McDonaldization on local characteristics. Since Ritzer’s (1993) work, many studies have been conducted on McDonaldization. While some of them agreed with Ritzer, others criticized his viewpoints (Alfino et al 1998; Drane 2008). We believe that we cannot judge which viewpoint is correct, but we can always learn more from different perspectives. Next time, we shall take an interaction approach to this theme.

References


Minamikata, Tatsuaki (2009), A Comparative Study of Retail Structures Between Japan and the UK, Osaka Shougyou Daigaku Ronshu, 5 (2), 21-37. (in Japanese)


The United States Department of Justice (http://www.justice.gov/atr/public/guidelines/hhi.html)
Thursday June 6, 2013, 10:30a-11:30a
The Violence of Marketing Systems II
Small and medium-sized retailers compete against global giants by local adaptation
Yokoyama et al


## Thursday June 6, 2013
11:30a-12:30p
Concurrent Session I

### Market Making and Marketing in Emerging Economies II

**Abstract/Papers Included**

Emerging nature of assortments and market making: A marketing system approach  
Hossain Mohammed, University of Western Sydney, Australia

New market systems, aspirations, and consumption patterns: Daily food choices of Chinese teenagers  
Ann Veeck, Western Michigan University, USA  
Hongyan Yu, Sun Yat-Sen University, P.R. China  
Fang Yu, Brock University, Canada  
Hong Zhu, Northeast Normal University, P.R. China  
Gregory Veeck, Western Michigan University, USA  
Kay M. Palan, Western Michigan University, USA

Market Making at the Bottom-of-the-Pyramid  
Ronika Chakrabarti, Lancaster University, UK  
Katy Mason, Lancaster University, UK
Emerging nature of assortments and market making: A marketing system approach

Hossain Mohammed, University of Western Sydney, Australia

This paper conceptualizes three levels of assortments: micro-meso-macro, which foster community engagement, and in consequence enable market making. It exemplifies how market making is more successful when culturally embedded.

Introduction

Agri (culture) is one of the longest cultural practices in any society. It influences almost every productive system of society and most aspects of our life. This paper briefly examines its influence on marketing system and market making. Key objectives of this paper is to identify; 1) Traditional agro (culture) practice in communities which create culturally embedded assortments, 2) Impact of tradition on making market.

Theoretical Background

Mittelstaedt et al., (2006) mentioned that studying market under marketing system should examine most aspects of culture and its norms, and all action of market participants reflecting environmental conditions from which they emerge thereby benefitting entire community. Similar views echoed in studies (Layton, 2011; 2009, 2007; Shultz, 2007; Jamison, 1999) which emphasize socially embedded market development. Culture as a key determinant of society can be singled out to examine actions of participants, and how such actions benefit their community, not only a single customer. While the focus is on macro-benefit, it is pivotal to examine influence of culture or socially embedded marketing system. Keeping this in perspective, this paper argues that actions between participants in a community must produce something which can be traded not typically by single transaction but reciprocity (Layton, 2009) and co-operation (Shultz, 2007) between community members.

The uniqueness of marketing system is that it has successfully replaced narrowly defined output of marketing practice, namely product (Kotler et. al., 2012) with socially embedded concept assortment (Layton, 2012; 2009; Alderson & Martin, 1965; Alderson 1957). The making of assortments requires participation of families, kinship groups, or neighbourhoods (Polanyi et al., 1957) and trade takes place between community members (Swedberg 2005), and exchange of assortments between groups (Alderson, 1957). Social institutions creating assortments depend on intensity of co-operation/reciprocity between family, kin and community members. The cultural tradition of community and its members create assortments that they need. This paper urges readers to replace notion of a network of organization (which produces a product) with cooperation between community members who make their own assortments. Environmental pressure (i.e. changing livelihood, avoid poverty, modernization etc.) instigates participants to co-operate and develop relationships that make assortments, which are highly beneficial to individuals, groups, and community. In such process of reaping benefits through creation of assortments, cultural practices of participants in communities create a market of their own, and engage in trade related activities based on co-operation and trust. Co-
operation is a noble notion assumed to mitigate rivalry and destruction (Shultz, 2006) to create market that benefits participants. The domain of this study- as far as ‘influence of culture’ is concerned on marketing system- is in examining interplay between individuals, families, kin, and neighbours. A critical assessment of such interplay conceptualizes organic formation of market.

Methods

An ethnographic study was adopted to extract agricultural practices and traditions in studied communities. From field study, two persons of interest were considered to identify the way they cultivate and socialize with neighbours. Person 1 is a male farmer who has adopted maize recently. He learned techniques from his friend, and always encourages others to adopt maize. Person 2 is a housewife who has adopted maize for cultivation for the first time in her community being a female. Data were collected from author’s dissertation dated from November, 2008 to December 2009. Observation, walk-alongs, interviews, and focus group were used to collect data. Methodological focus of this study is to assess adoption of maize as a new crop and its influence on agro-cultural tradition.

Case 1: Mr. Asad

Mr. Asad is a young farmer who has been engaged in cultivation since he was 10 years old. Due to the requirement of getting microloans (only females from a household can borrow money not the men), his wife and mother have borrowed money from four NGOs. In addition, he has taken loan from two personal traders under the condition that crops would be sold to them immediately after harvest. He taught few of his neighbours how to plant maize seed and take care of soil and plants, and also taking care of crops during storage and distribution. He acquainted himself to few petty wholesalers who buy crops and managed to develop close relationship, and also introduced other prospective maize growers to them. He became a role model in the village. He was always a central figure in local gatherings in tea shops, and ready to answer inquisitive questions regarding maize. After harvesting, Asad sold his crops to moneylenders as per condition. The profit made was so marginal that he was unable to pay back NGOs loan. He then borrowed in advance from another lender under the condition of selling crops from next year’s harvest. Some elder farmers of the community warned him not to introduce such relentless borrowing culture since Asad’s actions is likely to encourage young farmers to borrow insubstantially. They pointed out the fact that growing rice instead of maize ensured round-the-year household requirement of the staple. The elders also added that if next generation are too keen to make profit then whole village will face food shortage. In addition, if everybody grows maize then local traditional crops (i.e. peanuts, pulses, beans etc.) will disappear and may cause malnutrition in their community. It must be mentioned that the young farmers are interested in growing maize not because of cash incentive but for the fact that it is easy to grow, requires no weeding and minimum fertilizer, and allows leisure to maintain part-time work.

Case 2: Mrs. Rashida

Mrs. Rashida is a housewife with a 10 years old daughter and a three years old son. Her husband works is Middle East, and has been there for last three years. She receives money from her husband which is spent on maize cultivation. She made a fair profit from maize. Now, she sends her daughter to a good school, and has funds for a house tutor. She used her guest room for maize storage. She employed three female neighbours to help her harvest and store maize. She provides three kilos of maize as a daily payment. She used green leaves of maize plants to feed household pets (i.e. cows), and also grind maize grains to feed chickens. She collects surrogate baby cobs from maize plants to make a deep fried snack
delight. She often gives maize snacks as lunch to her daughter, which has created enough enthusiasm in her school to pass the message to other parents. She had shared the recipe with her neighbours and also with the school principle. She had learned from her uncle from a distant village that maize cobs (after unshelling) can be used as fuel for cooking. She demonstrated this in front of her neighbours, which became very popular since it saves cutting branches from trees. She frequently shares her experiences with her female neighbours, and curious neighbours press their husbands to cultivate maize due to its diversified utility. She is called ‘maize lady’ in community. Often, people from distant villages come and visit her to learn more about maize. Unlike other male farmers, she didn’t sell crops immediately after harvesting, instead stored maize at home assuming that price will be higher when all maize in her village has been sold. She often travels to local markets in search of petty wholesalers willing to pay higher profit. She is well determined to grow more maize next year on rented land and engage not only female neighbours but men who can till soil with a tractor. She had communicated to her husband about buying a mini-tractor next year.

Findings: Implication of culture on marketing system

Traditional practice of agriculture is on the verge of change in the studied communities. Young and female headed households have shown immense interest in adopting new crops. Such adoption of new crops has intensified social links and connections (Layton, 2011). Kin and families are getting involved and sharing new information with neighbours. Community members engage more than ever desperate to change livelihood and getting out of poverty. In order to pursue development, they create their own assortments. The aforementioned cases suggest that cooperation is the key to create assortments, and this process is conceptually manifested at three different levels (elaborated in table 1). Such creation of levels- as a key concept of marketing system- is output of collaborative practices intensified through cultural tradition, which in consequence result in making market.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Micro level assortment</th>
<th>Meso level assortment</th>
<th>Macro level assortment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Cultivation techniques</td>
<td>Loans and credits</td>
<td>Changes in cultivation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Profit</td>
<td>Maize trade</td>
<td>tradition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Loss</td>
<td>Relationship</td>
<td>Changes in cropping pattern</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maize snack</td>
<td>Exchange of ideas, skills, and knowledge</td>
<td>New generation of farmers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cooking fuel</td>
<td></td>
<td>Diffusion of maize crop.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Animal feed.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In micro level assortment, individuals have created their own assortment altering traditional cultivation practice. They are shifting from growing household consumption crops to profit making cash crops. Maize related assortments such as: maize snack, fuels and animal feed are direct outputs involving shifts from tradition which can be directly observed or measured. In meso level assortment, individuals involve in co-operating with neighbours creating links with people holding varying specializations (i.e. housewife, school principal, petty traders etc.). They are now well linked and in reciprocity create trade linkages and strong family or neighbourhood bonding. They are open to share secrets and help each other. In macro level assortment, the overall community produces a new wave of cultivation and cropping, and a new generation of farming community emerges. Macro-level assortments are outcome of meso-level assortments providing directions to how new farmers assess impacts of their cultural practices.

Influence of changing culture on making market
Transforming pattern of agro (culture) influences participants to participate in different levels, and as a consequence new assortments emerge. The emergence of new system or new levels of assortments in the community have created markets. As exemplified here, person 1 had produced two networks of trade- a) network of credit and, b) network of traders. Even though micro level assortments seemed promising, it proved less sustainable since meso level assortment impacted in huge debt not only onto him as an individual but with negative links to his family as a whole. In addition, macro level assortment is likely to cause food shortages. In case of person 2, a collaboration of social market was created by exchanging crops as payment for daily labour. Her prudence of introducing a storage system of harvested crops is a display of micro assortment that also motivated neighbours to adopt maize. In addition, her collaborative engagement with people of different specializations coupled with her constructive engagement (Shultz, 2007) with neighbours and relatives have created a community market. The rules (i.e. payment of daily labourer by barter system) and norms (i.e. help, trust etc.) of such market are guided by community tradition and culture. Market activities are propagated through emerging nature of assortments. Assortments diversify and emerge as participants engage in higher levels of market activities.

Implications and challenges

The implication of cultural practices has significant influence of marketing system. Marketing system- as an emergent social matrix concept- can contribute more to our society if culture is well understood and measured. The changing tradition of cultivation enables creation of socially embedded assortments which satisfy greater needs of individual, groups, and community. As exemplified here, emergence of assortments may also be challenged by sustainability issues. The high rate of adoption of new cultivation tradition may cause food shortage, mono-cropping, and nutrition shortages etc. Therefore, discrepancy (Layton, 2009) between emergent assortments and its long term consequence must be assessed and monitored carefully. A future direction of marketing system can be aimed to reduce such discrepancy and create a sustainable community.

This paper has proposed a framework of socially embedded assortment which is the outcome of changing cultural practices. Emergent phenomenons were captured under a framework, and also provide a fresh approach to identify and assess how to make market under the emergent theory of marketing system.

References
Alderson W. and Martin, M. W. 1965. Toward a Formal Theory of Transactions and Transvections,

240
New Market Systems, Aspirations, and Consumption Patterns: Daily Food Choices of Chinese Teenagers

Ann Veeck, Western Michigan University, USA
Hongyan Yu, Sun Yat-Sen University, P.R. China
Fang Yu, Brock University, Canada
Hong Zhu, Northeast Normal University, P.R. China
Gregory Veeck, Western Michigan University, USA
Kay M. Palan, Western Michigan University, USA

The pace of change in China’s privatizing and globalizing economy raises questions of how traditional guidelines related to consumption choice are altered by new forms of markets and marketing. The overall objective of this research project is to examine how eating choices of teenagers in Chinese cities are affected by families, peers, conventions, and markets. Teenagers, along with the person in their family who serves as the primary food shopper (usually a parent), were interviewed to explore what guidelines they believe should be used to make appropriate food choices. Analysis of the interviews reveals a disconnect between what teenagers and their parents identify as important guidelines related to food choice and the actual food-related behavior of the teenagers as they negotiate an intense, education-centric daily schedule. The results demonstrate that knowledge of how food choice is embedded in the social patterns of everyday life and accommodated and altered by the marketplace is necessary for informed policies that allow healthy food habits to be promoted to families and communities to ensure greater possibility for real change.
Market Making at the Bottom-of-the-Pyramid

Ronika Chakrabarti, University of Lancaster, UK
Katy Mason, University of Lancaster, UK

By drawing on the concept of ‘Orders of Worth’ we seek to generate understanding into how sustainable markets that are deemed ‘worth the effort’ might be enabled at the bottom of the pyramid (BoP). In keeping with the market studies literature, we describe how exploring multiple, contested and reframed needs, generate insights into the efforts (and practices) that shape orders of worth in economic life. Orders of worth are the everyday practice of social values that constitute economic value and are framed through the moral values of social worlds as these values are put to work to calculate economic value. Through an ethnographic study insights are generated into how intervention efforts by NGOs are making-markets in sites of extreme poverty. We understand how spaces are carefully created to allow for value and values to be unearthed, articulated, contested and translated into market-making practices.
Thursday June 6, 2013  
11:30a-12:30p  
Concurrent Session II

Exploring the Performativity of Marketing I

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abstract/Papers Included</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Putting consumers’ bodies to work: The role of consumer biometrics and measurement devices in the performance of markets for advertising communications  
Stefan Schwarzkopf, Copenhagen Business School, Denmark |
| Is non-profit marketing really non-profit? The possibility of performativity  
Kosuke Mizukoshi, Tokyo Metropolitan University, Japan  
Yuichiro Hidaka, Yamanashi Gakuin University, Japan  
Masaaki Takemura, Meiji University, Japan |
Putting Consumers’ Bodies to Work: the Role of Consumer Biometrics and Measurement Devices in the Performance of Markets for Advertising Communications

Stefan Schwarzkopf, Copenhagen Business School, Denmark

Abstract

Using an actor-network-theoretical approach, this paper studies the emergence and social-economic effects of various biometrical methods in the area of marketing research from the 1890s to the 1990s. The spill-over of biometrical research from advertising psychological laboratories set in motion a cycle of performativity that ended up rendering the relationship between advertisements and consumers similar to that which had been constructed in the laboratory purely for research purposes. Advertisements in ‘real’ markets were increasingly designed in ways that fulfilled the predictions that advertising psychologists had made. In these markets, representations of consumers and their behaviour began to take on a life of their own and allowed markets for consumer attention to be enacted. In that process, consumers’ bodies became increasingly reconfigured as walking measurement instruments. This reconfiguration enabled researchers and advertising practitioners to bypass consumers’ cognition and instead draw upon the ‘truth’ of their physiological reactions in order to create norms of accountability. These norms, in turn, allowed quantifiable market relations to be created around inherently qualitative, aesthetic experiences.

Keywords

Biometrics, Media Planning, Consumer Neurosciences, Starch Recognition Procedure, Adnorms, Performativity, agencement, Actor Network Theory, Valuation, Valorisation
... a decree went out from Caesar Augustus that all the world should be enrolled. This was the first enrolment, when Quirin’-us was governor of Syria. And all went to be enrolled, each to his own city.


Most people who speak of advertising as a game think of the game as something simple, like spin-the-bottle; actually, the game of advertising is a classic game, as complicated as chess. What the advertising man loves in his work is the constant testing of his efforts, the mysteriously changing numbers that measure, or seem to measure, his success or failure. The client’s marketing problem is developed and analysed, the advertisements prepared and presented. A few weeks later the Starch figures come in, reporting how many people saw the ad and read it and noted the product it advertised, and how the ad stacked up in these respects against other advertisements for similar products. Later, a client emissary delivers the thick reports from Gallup & Robinson, verbatim transcripts of what people who noticed the ad or commercial had to say about it, what they thought the sales arguments were, and how important and believable the arguments seemed to them. Then the advertising man examines the new Nielsen index for his product, and sees how sales figures moved while the ads were running, the degree to which the product he advertised increased its share of market or lost ground to its competitors. Finally, the value of the effort as a whole is measured by the client with the one simple number that emerges from all the complexities: the size of next year’s advertising appropriation.

_Martin Mayer, Madison Avenue U.S.A. (1958: 43-44)_

Introduction

This paper aims to establish two arguments. Firstly, it shows that techniques and apparatuses to measure consumers’ reactions and attitudes towards advertisements, packaging, brand logos, etc. exist in order to enable and shape markets around normative assumptions regarding these consumer reactions. In order for such markets to function, market actors need to render essentially ‘soft’ and qualitative entities like consumers’ attention and attitudes ‘hard’ and calculable (Callon and Law, 2005; Cochoy, 2005). Secondly, over the course of the twentieth century a tradition has emerged which Coon and others have described as attempts to ‘standardize the subject’ in industrial modernity (Coon, 1993; Van de Water, 1997). I argue that the recent growth of biometrical methods in the consumer neurosciences, especially those based on so-called ‘brain scanners’ (fMRI), is merely the latest step in that long tradition (Schneider and Woolgar, 2011; Shiv and Yoon, 2012).

From the 1890s onwards, a dynamic industrial-scientific network emerged consisting of advertising agencies, market research consultancies, manufacturers, and print-media (later also radio and television), all hoping to use laboratory-based research methods in order to establish ‘hard’ and objective norms against which the effectiveness of an advertising campaign could be measured. The steady growth of biometrical techniques in marketing research can be used as an example to show not only how psychologists modelled their epistemic objects, that is consumers, but also how these models gradually led other market actors like advertising agencies and print-media to act in ways that
conformed to these models. In the cycle of performativity which led from laboratory to market transactions, material devices like tachistoscopes, cameras, galvanometers and polygraphs came to occupy a position of paramount importance as they allowed for specific market transactions around this consumer to be performed.

It has been widely acknowledged that from the 1890s onwards, marketing and advertising practices began to assimilate psychological research, which in turn often directly followed new directions given by academic psychology and its laboratory practices (Buckley, 1982; Kreshel, 1993; Kuna, 1976). The extent to which scientific research practices actually shaped market practices in the advertising industry, however, has so far not been studied in detail. Although many authors assumed that academic psychological research had some influence on advertising agencies and their practices, historians have so far tended to ignore questions about the precise structure of the flow of theoretical assumptions and material practices from the psychological arena into the world of advertising and marketing (but see Cochoy, 2011).

In this paper, I will look at these flows from a long-term, historical perspective which spans the one hundred years or so from the first advertising testing laboratories in the 1890s to the rise of ‘neuromarketing’ during the 1990s. The first part of the paper will analyse how specific circuits for the transfer of norms and standards between laboratories and advertising service markets first emerged, and what role measurement devices played in the enrolment of consumers’ bodies in these markets. The second part of this paper will be devoted to an in-depth study of case of the advertising researcher and business consultant Daniel Starch and his company’s role in the establishment of a market for consumer attention. The concluding part will discuss the evidence presented in this paper in the light of ANT- and Valorisation-theoretical approaches in the economic sociology of markets.

**Advertising Efficiency and the Attention of Modern Consumer Masses**

Late nineteenth-century advertising psychologists subscribed to the ideals of the industrial efficiency movement which began to emerge at the same time. Two pioneers in the field, Harlow Gale of the University of Minnesota and Walter Dill Scott of Northwestern University, translated the ideology of efficient industrial production into the sphere of advertising and consumer research by breaking down advertisements into distinct verbal and visual elements, like words, sentences, forms, shapes and colours. In a laboratory setting which both had inherited from the founder of the school of psychophysiology, Wilhelm Wundt, Gale and Scott presented consumers with different combinations of such visual elements in order to find out which advertising designs attracted most attention, were most easily comprehensible, and were best stored in people’s memory. Gale conducted series of experiments from 1895, the same year Frederick Winslow Taylor published his first monograph on what later became known as scientific shop-floor management. Scott began experimenting with advertising from 1901 (Eighmey and Sar, 2007; Jacobson, 1951; Kuna, 1976a; Kuna 1976b; Lynch, 1968; Scott, Scott, 1911; von Mayrhauser, 1989).

Psychological experiments in advertising research as devised at the turn of the last century focussed on measurable ‘value’ elements in advertising communication, especially the attention and the memory value of advertisements (Gale, 1900; Nicolas and Ferrand, 1999; Scott 1903). Gale and Scott constructed efficiency-related tables which showed, broken down by gender as the main category, the attention and memory value of different colours used in advertisements, of various advertising positions on magazine pages, of different type-faces and the like.
Gale’s and Scott’s work set standards for American advertising psychology, which as a field developed rapidly during the Progressive Era, the decades between 1890 and the late 1920s (McMahon, 1972; Hollingworth, 1913; Tipper et al., 1915: 8-14; Poffenberger, 1925; Strong, 1925). This era was characterised by an emerging consensus among advertising psychologists and practitioners which posited that advertising was a powerful means of modern mass communication, and that it was able to mould consumer behaviour. Often referred to as the ‘strong theory of advertising’, this consensus was based on the idea that magazine advertisements, posters at a railway station, and radio commercials took consumers through distinct cognitive stages from gaining their attention, creating interest in the advertised product and service, making this product message memorable through repetition, instilling a desire to own the product, and finally leading to the required action, that is the purchase of the product (Barry and Howard, 1990; Strong, 1925: 9; Vakratsas and Ambler, 1999). In this construction, consumers were seen as passive and reactive (Gale, 1900; Lipstein, 1985). The consensus had emerged because economic and political concerns with the efficiency of industrial production (Taylorism) and the management of the masses (crowd psychology) had made their way into psychological laboratories. In these laboratories, societal concerns became embedded into a measurement apparatus which reconfirmed and experimentally reproduced a professional consensus that advertising campaigns were the marketing and sales counterpart to a Fordist production line (Scully, 1996).

Laboratories and Measurement Devices of Consumer Biometrics

By the 1930s, numerous advertising psychological laboratories had sprung up in the United States and in Europe. In their attempts to make the interaction between advertising campaigns and consumers accountable and calculable for those who commissioned, paid for, created and printed advertisements, advertising researchers developed a whole range of biometrical techniques and devices which rendered the attentive, gazing, cognitive and emotive consumer a perambulating measurement instrument, who for the sake of data-extraction could be called into these laboratories whenever needed (Derksen, 2010; Muniesa, 2010). The objects used in advertising psychological laboratories to extract that information from consumers had specific assumptions about markets, consumers, and the economy built into them. The laboratory apparatus created around the biometrical investigation into advertising thus acted, in the words of Norton Wise, as ‘mediating machines’ in that they allowed for political, economic and social ideas about the consumption process to be translated into the fixed and controllable space of the psychological laboratory (Wise, 1988).

Ascertaining what type of advertisements consumers noticed, understood, liked, remembered and acted upon required knowledge. Crucially, this knowledge was not to be found in the adverts themselves, but it was buried, hidden and embodied in consumers. Asking consumers which advertisement, which slogan, picture or other element made them buy a product was futile, as Harlow Gale and Walter Dill Scott had already established around 1900. Thus, the information that consumers were unable to provide consciously had to be extracted from the corporeal equivalents of their subconscious: the fallibility of their memory, the involuntary movements of their eyeballs, the almost unnoticeable tremor of their muscles, and the telltale velocity of their pulse. All that was needed for this modern inquisition to hold court was a dark room, a projector, a timer, and a recording device. By the 1940s, cameras, mirrors and galvanometers were added. During the 1970s, enhanced voltimeters in form of the electroencephalogram and the electromyogram entered this cabinet of wonders, as did brain imaging techniques from the late 1990s.
**The Tachistoscope**

The first advertising psychological experiments only required subjects to look through a booklet containing cut and pasted advertisements. Afterwards, the subjects would be asked what adverts they remembered and which they thought attractive and appealing. This method of course allowed research subjects to look at the advertisements presented to them with different speeds and intensity. Advertising researchers like Gale and Scott therefore used projectors in darkened rooms in order to control the speed (Greek: *tachos*) with which a set of pictures was presented to the research subjects. In a further development, projection techniques changed from wall-projection to the use of slides presented on the inner side of a box into which subjects had to look. The crucial point about the tachistoscope, thus, was that it allowed researchers to present visual stimuli at great speed and for a controlled duration (Benschop, 1998; Godning, 2003; Sokal, Davis and Merzbacher, 1976; Taylor and Maslin, 1970). This, in turn, enabled early advertising psychologists to compare the visual impact (attention) and memorability of advertisements, and to test which elements of these advertisements were most able to attract attention and most memorable (Strong, 1911).

![Tachistoscope in a Research Laboratory, ca. 1930](image)

After the session on the tachistoscope, research subjects would either be asked to fill in a questionnaire and identify which elements, slogans, brands, products etc. they were able to remember. Alternatively, subjects would be given a break and then return for another session on the tachistoscope, which now had been equipped with a different selection of images. This time, subjects would be fitted with a small switch attached to their hands which they had to tap each time they remembered one of the images. Connected to the switch was a recording device, normally a stylus on a revolving cylinder, which left a mark each time a subject recognized an image. This apparatus, consisting of the research subject, slides, projectors, timers, switches and recording devices allowed researchers to manipulate...
every conceivable element that made up an advertisement, ranging from font-sizes, the position of captions and text, the amount of text, to the use of colour, pictures and photographs in advertisements.

The aim of the apparatus, within which the gazes and the cognitive capabilities of the human body were firmly incorporated, was geared towards providing calculability of market value. Entire series of product advertisements could now for the first time be assessed as to the ‘attention value’ and ‘memory value’ that they provided to those who paid for them, the manufacturer (Scott, 1903). In serving these manufacturers, Henry Hollingworth devised appeal-response-tables that gave a measure of how to efficiently construct an advertisement for a certain kind of product (Hollingworth, 1913: 18).

With its ability to direct the psychologist’s research focus towards distinct elements of the advertisements’ designs, the tachistoscope recreated within the laboratory the mantra of optimization preached by contemporary scientific management and the ‘salesmanship’ philosophy of advertising preached by contemporary marketing practitioners (Hopkins, 1923; Mahin, 1914: 24-32). This school of thought relied on the idiom of mathematical exactness, which the test apparatus constructed around the human gaze and the tachistoscope seemingly provided. The ‘scientific efficiency’ of the production and sales machinery needed advertising psychologists like Henry Foster Adams of the University of Michigan, who proposed that his experiments were able ‘to show with mathematical exactness the effect of the various elements [of advertisements]’ (Adams, 1916: v). Mathematical exactness, in turn, required laboratory-based experimental ‘rigour’ and it stimulated the design of instruments that helped observe new kinds of psychological and physiological phenomena.

The Eye Camera

While the earliest projection techniques, like the dark room and the tachistoscope, provided a first insight into the way consumers retained visual information in advertisements, it was clear to many practitioners and researchers that ‘real’ consumers did not flick through their magazine in the same way as images were presented to them through a slide projector. Consumers sometimes linger on some advertisements while completely ignoring others. The tachistoscope, by fixing the head of a research subject, allowed no observation of how a consumer’s eye wandered across a magazine page or a poster, which parts it focussed most on, and whether there were patterns in the way consumers read an advertisement.

Eye cameras allowed researchers to observe precisely these things. By placing a folded mirror at a specific angle in front of a subject, the mirrors reflected both the pages that were read and the movements a research subject’s eyes took across the pages of the medium. Behind the subject was fixed a camera which recorded these eye movements. The earliest experiments with eye cameras in advertising research took place in 1924, but film and camera quality proved a handicap. In 1940, a research device consisting of cameras and mirrors was developed at Purdue University which enabled researchers to film how a research subject actually read a full newspaper or a magazine as they went through its pages. While earlier projection methods relied on artificial mock-ups or slides, the Purdue eye camera provided a real-time record of the attention value of advertisements in their ‘natural’ setting in a print medium (Karslake, 1940; Copland, 1958: 19-23). In 1960, Norman Mackworth of the

---

2 In 1923, the advertising man Claude C. Hopkins summarized that advertising was ‘salesmanship in print’.
Stanford Medical Institute further perfected this procedure by developing an eye movement recorder (‘Optiscan’) which allowed a film to be produced which showed the viewed object, such as a magazine, and a superimposed white marker that indicated the actual path of the eye movements across that object (Mackworth, 1960).

![Figure 2: The Purdue Eye Camera, ca. 1940](image)

**The Psychogalvanometer**

Eye tracking devices are, of course, still part of the biometric arsenal of marketing researchers today, and so are the tachistoscope and the slide-show (Bradley, 2007: 124-25). Before the late 1930s, however, biometric advertising research focussed very much on the consumer’s eyes as the *via regis* to understand how their subconsciousness was stirred by specific images and designs, and how it retained information. These presentation methods allowed virtually no insight into a consumer’s *emotive* reactions to particular advertising messages, packaging designs and brand logos. Once again, it seemed clear that asking people direct questions about the place of products and adverts in their emotional household made little sense (Anon., 1936; Aynsley and Furgerson, 1987; Matte, 1996: 20-32). Help came from an unusual quarter as the new industry of lie detection provided a blueprint for advertising researchers.

During the 1930s, lie detectors began to incorporate the measurement of skin conductance and resistance, or galvanic skin response (GSR) (Montagu and Coles, 1966). Advertising psychologists

---

3 Source: Karslake, 1940.
borrowed this technique in the form of the Psychogalvanometer which for the first time allowed to measure the intensity of sub-conscious, emotional states of the mind by measuring changes in a person’s skin resistance to a constant electrical current which was run through the skin – usually at one of the finger-tips – of a subject (Conrad, 1929; Copland, 1958: 24-26). The application of GSR measurement techniques marks a crucial step in the unfolding of the actor-network of consumer biometrics in that not just peripheral behavioural responses and reactions of consumers (reported attention and memory, visible eye movements) were being measured, but invisible physiological reactions. With research subjects being attached to galvanometers while exposed to film and print advertisements, researchers could entirely circumvent consumers’ biases, rationalizations and poor memory.

The Polygraph

From the 1930s onwards, the tachistoscope, the galvanometer and the eye camera were combined with techniques that allowed the recording of virtually every physiological reaction researchers could think of which promised to reveal a subconscious emotional reaction on the side of a research subject. Once again, it was the lie-detection industry which paved the way by combining the recording of changes in respiratory rate (pneumograph), muscle movement (tremorgraph), heart-beat and pulse (cardiosphygmographs), blood circulation (plethysmograph), blood pressure, and voice (voice stress recorder) into a kind of super-apparatus for the total record of a subject’s physiological states, the polygraph. This apparatus, although expensive, cumbersome to handle and slow in producing actionable results, and necessarily limiting the number of research participants, became widely used in advertising research (Brickman, 1976; Hensel, 1971; Kroeber-Riel, 1979).

Figure 3: A Polygraph from the Cambridge Psychological Laboratory, 1920

The Voltmeter and Oscillograph

Electroencephalographs (EEG) and electromyograms (EMG) rely on the use of enhanced voltmeters which allow the recording of the spontaneous electrical activity of the brain's neurons, and of muscle cells, respectively. The constantly varying signal voltages in the scalp region and various muscle-regions are then recorded in form of a graph on a sheet of paper, or through the cathode-ray tube of what used to be known as oscillograph. Although the first EEG was recorded in 1924, it was only by the late 1960s that a better understanding of the ‘meaning’ of these waves had been developed, so that their form could be used to detect neuropathological defects. In 1969, the advertising and public opinion researcher Herbert E. Krugman for the first time used electroencephalography to record a young woman’s brainwaves in response to three television commercials for General Electrics products (Krugman, 1971; Weinstein, Drozdenko and Weinstein, 1984).

By the late 1980s, the interest of advertising researchers in the EEG began to wane. More recently, enhanced algorithms and computer technology that allow the topographical location of certain waves and better visualization of data have led to a comeback of the technology in the advertising psychological laboratory (Elliott, 2008). The application of electroencephalography and electromyography, especially facial EMG’s, today responds to the same promises that once drove the uses of eye cameras and polygraphs, namely to circumvent the potentially duplicitous mind of the consumer by measuring and observing their physical reactions directly (Littlefield, 2009). When Gerald Zaltman of Harvard Business School began during the 1990s to use ‘brain-scanners’ (fMRI) in his research on the dreams, narratives and emotions that drive the connection between brands and consumers, this promise was as alive as it had been a hundred years earlier (Lewis and Bridger, 2005).

The measurement instruments listed here are but a small selection of the wide range of consumer biometrical devices in use today. A minor industry has emerged around developing and supplying these instruments (hardware) and offering software solutions to compute the data that the network of consumer bodies and instruments produces. Other instruments in the arsenal of advertising researchers include the Anglemeter and the Perimeter to study consumer perception of advertising and packaging at angles and when placed in the margins of their field of vision; the Nyktoscope to test at which lighting levels a consumer is still able to recognize a specific shape; Tacho-Akustoscopes; Pupillometers; Thermographs to measure a person’s blood circulation in the skin; devices to measure eye blink frequency; and the Daktyloscope, which allows to detect whether a consumer touched and inspected a promotional element, such as an advertisement or a product packaging dummy in a laboratory test (Pepels, 1996: 199-209). The Dutch company TEMEC has developed a portable multigraph or polygraph, the Vitaport System, which allows researchers to fit consumers with several small digital units that simultaneously measure a person’s brain waves (EEG), heart frequency, pulse, breathing speed and intensity, skin response, body and room temperature, and muscular activity (see Illustration).

The epistemic politics behind the new consumer neurosciences and the older consumer biometrics share certain similarities. Advertising researchers from Gale to Zaltman treated the body as the consumer’s in-built lie-detector whose secrets needed to be extracted in order to allow the prediction of consumer reactions to advertising appeals. The key difference is that brain scanning makes visible the neuronal correlate to the gazing, breathing, sweating and muscle-toning consumer body that the older methods recorded so diligently. Today, therefore, biometrics and brain-scanning are increasingly used side-by-side (de Balanzo, Ohme and Eising, 2011).
The Making of a Market for Consumer Attention

Despite the remarkable continuity in the epistemic politics behind advertising research methods and technologies over the last one hundred years or so, very different assumptions about consumer behaviour went into the making of the various apparatuses described above. The first use of the EEG by Krugman, for instance, was driven by his doubts whether the ‘strong theory’ of advertising was able to explain those situations in which consumers did not go through stages of attention, conscious interest, and proactive purchase behaviour (Krugman, 1965). Equally, current interpretations of what advertising is and how it works differ radically from the consensus formula as it emerged at the beginning of the last century (Heath and Feldwick, 2008). Neuromarketing research today does not attempt to find standardized, ideal lengths for advertising headlines or precisely measure the ‘pulling power’ of

---

particular advertisements (Lucas, 1934; Tiffin and Winick, 1954). The roll call of laboratory devices presented above should therefore not be read as a story of increasing scientific perfection or continuous enhancement.

Rather, my argument here is that these measurement, observation and recording devices allow for particular types of markets to emerge and to be performed by a network of actors. Different laboratory-based research techniques commoditize very specific aspects of consumer behaviour, ranging from simple ‘attention’ to more complex forms of emotional attachment to brands. In order to exemplify how an emerging network of researchers, advertisements, consumers, companies, and statistical tables and graphs can perform a market, I will look in more detail here at the case of the psychologist, advertising researcher and entrepreneur Daniel Starch.

Starch, who had a background in mathematics and psychology and who occupied one of the first chairs in marketing research at Harvard Business School, embodies the type of consultant-entrepreneur that became characteristic for the American advertising industry (Buckley, 1982; Converse, 1987: 87-88, 107-111; Johanningmeier, 1978; Ohmer, 2006; Schultz and Schultz, 2000: 239-42). Few American consultant-entrepreneurs however developed a combination of laboratory-based material artefacts and statistical formulas that became performative for markets in quite the same way as Starch’s did.

At the time Starch set up his company, Daniel Starch and Staff Inc., in 1923, attention, recognition and memory (recall) tests with dummy magazines and images presented through the tachistoscope were considered the mainstay of advertising research. Naturally, Starch was not the first who realised that if these tests could show which types of advertisements (as regards their size, frequency of appearance, use of colour, and page positions) scored highest in activating specific attitudinal and behavioural responses in consumers, then newspaper and magazine pages and positions could be sold at different prices depending on their attention, recognition and memory ‘value’. Intuitively, magazines had always charged more for a full-colour advertisement than for an equivalent in black and white, and more for a full-page than for a half-page advertisement. Similarly, using the front-page of a daily newspaper for an advertisement meant that advertisers had to have deeper pockets than those relying on smaller advertisements in the pages further down (Starch, 1914: 7-9).

What was not clear to print-media companies, advertisers, and the space buyers in advertising agencies during the 1920s, however, was precisely how much a particular size and position of space and the use of colour were worth. Larger advertisements and those printed in colour of course attracted more attention and were more memorable. But should a full page be sold at twice the price of its half-page equivalent? Was the use of colour worth four times as much as a black-and-white half-tone print, or ten times, or twenty times? And how was the artistic work of advertising agencies to be rated? Was the illustration commissioned from a well-known and highly skilled studio artist worth ten times or a hundred times more than the drawing of an office clerk?

---

6 This was only partially due to higher printing costs. While colour printing was indeed much more costly than black-and-white processes, different sizes of b/w advertisements and different positions in the paper had no effect on printing costs for the newspapers. Printing on the front-page was as expensive as printing on page four or five. The size of an advertisement had equally no impact on printing costs, since the printing block was supplied by the advertising agency which in turn had to order these from a block-maker.
While at Harvard, Starch developed the ‘Starch Recognition Procedure’, an advertisement readership measurement method that was first published in his 1923 landmark publication Principles of Advertising. Starch’s key move was to take the advertising research approach developed by Gale, Scott and Strong, and reconstruct it in a commercial context that transcended the confined space of the laboratory. He devised a system for studying ‘readership of advertisements that could be used to measure continuously’ the observation and reading of advertisements as they appeared currently in publications’ (Starch, 1923; Starch 1966: 8, emphasis added). Starch’s procedure analysed a representative cross-section of the readers of a regular issue of a magazine within a typical reading context, by that going beyond the use of students as readers of dummy sets and slides under laboratory conditions. Starch’s commercial research thus moved practices and apparatuses from the psychological laboratory into the social world, thus extending ‘the rails’ (Latour, 1983: 155) on which scientific facts travel from the laboratory to the construction sites of markets for attention.

The outcome of this extension were measurable performance ratings which allowed advertisers to gauge the recall (‘memory value’) and penetration (‘visibility value’) of an advertising campaign achieved in a particular medium. In order to provide such ratings for individual advertisements as they appeared in the media, Starch’s company developed a recognition procedure, which from February 1932 was offered to subscribing clients in form of the Starch Continuing Readership Research Program. Initially based on the advertisements that appeared in 13 weekly and monthly magazines, Starch later added newspapers and outdoor posters to the roster of advertising media covered by his reports. By the mid-1960s, Starch’s team studied more than 1,000 current issues of consumer magazines, newspapers and business publications and conducted nearly a quarter of a million personal interviews with consumers each year (Starch, 1966: 10-11). During the interviews, readers would be not only be asked whether they could remember having noted a particular advertisement in a magazine or newspaper, but also whether they were able to associate an advertisement they had glanced at with a particular brand name and whether they had actually read parts or all of the advert. This sequence of ‘Noted – Seen/Associated – Read Most’ was at the heart of the Starch Recognition Procedure and allowed the company to study and compare thousands of advertisements across a wide range of visual and broadcast media (Starch, 1966: 14).

Having conducted thousands of advertising readership experiments under the ‘natural’ condition of interviews in consumers’ homes, Starch’s company was able to compile lists which showed the percentage of readers that noted, read and remembered specific types of advertisements (size, b/w or colour, position in the publication, type of publication). These lists were then broken down by gender, product category and media, which in turn allowed Starch to provide his subscribers with a cornucopia of statistical detail: 27 per cent of men noted advertisements on the upper half of the pages of national newspaper, and 30 per cent those on the lower half; in issues of the Saturday Evening Post, 79 per cent of women noted a full-page Campbell Tomato Soup advertisement, 78 per cent associated it with the brand, and 34 per cent read most or all of the advertising copy (Starch, 1966: 32-34, 56). Collated, these figures did not only show long-term trends in advertising readership, they also allowed to provide statistical averages against which advertising campaigns could be measured. These averages, known as ‘Adnorms’, were then used by advertising agencies and their clients as targets. Knowing that

---

7 The company is now owned by the GfK Group and has a database containing tens of thousands of advertisements. In 2008, it published its latest advertising readership survey for which the company studied 37,000 advertisements across 840 issues of 125 consumer magazines and trade publications.
Advertisements for soap were noted on average by 63 per cent of female readers of the Ladies’ Home Journal meant that all other soap advertisements could be judged against that norm.

‘Adnorms’ allowed to compare the ‘advertising performance’ of a given product advertisement with the averages of all advertisements in the same product category in the same medium (Copland, 1958: 169; Starch, 1966: 121). What came to be known as ‘Starch Ratings’, these performance measures allowed clients to continuously observe, measure and track their advertising agencies’ work and create norms of accountability as regards advertising ‘results’. Starch’s ‘Norms’ and ‘Ratings’ provided other actors in the market for advertising services with a number: the average Adnorm Index of 100. This index number defined which advertisements were efficient and which were not. If an advertisement for a refrigerator reached 100 on the Starch Ratings, it was as at least as efficient as all other refrigerator advertisements in being noted, understood and read. If it reached a rating higher than 100 it was ‘worth’ more of the advertiser’s money than those that scored lower. As more and more advertising agencies, print media and manufacturers began to subscribe to the Starch service, more and more advertisements in the United States were designed so as to score high on the ‘Ratings’ that they would inevitably be exposed to. Advertising agencies whose work failed to reach the required score on Starch’s ratings began to face criticism from their clients (Mayer, 1958: 270).

The measure of value established by the ‘Adnorms’ and the Starch Ratings was of great importance for the agencies, the print media and the clients who paid for the advertising space in these media. Comparing thousands of advertisements of the type that were noted, read and remembered most with those that were ignored and forgotten, the Starch Ratings seemed to show that ‘successful’ advertisements needed to be more than just of large size, in preferred position or printed in colour. Conducting research on car advertisements in Life and Saturday Evening Post during 1951 and 1952, Starch found that specific aesthetic elements enhanced a car advertisement’s chances of being noted, read, understood, and remembered. Advertisements with high ‘Ratings’ had a dominant focal centre that showed people and car in action, and a ‘curiosity-arousing picture or headline’ (Starch, 1966: 79-84).

These and many other research results that Starch & Staff published in practitioner journals and their house magazine, Tested Copy, clearly influenced advertising designers of the mid-1950s so heavily that in the race to meet clients’ demands for demonstrable accountability, car advertisements began to look increasingly similar. A typical set of American car advertisements from 1955 would therefore have shown car and people in action in the centre, would have used red as eye-catching colour, and attracted attention through a curiosity-arousing headline. In the same vein, a typical American advertisement for a detergent powder in 1955 would have shown an attention-grabbing headline extolling the cleansing power of the detergent, a housewife and product in action in the centre, followed by some product explanation and a pack-shot in the right bottom corner (see Illustrations).
Starch’s research brought into being a new form of market relationship between advertising agencies, media and clients, one that circulated around a single number. This new type of relationship, which had not existed before the 1930s, only worked because all three parties in the exchange of advertising space, money, and consumers’ eyeballs agreed that advertisements consisted of distinct

---

8 Source: Advertising Archives, London.
9 Source: Advertising Archives, London.
elements which taken together had a measureable effect on consumers. This tacit agreement, in turn, had been established because psychologists like Starch used experimental methods and laboratory instruments in order to prove that the ‘efficacy’ of advertisements as a communications and sales tool was measurable in the first place. Although Starch’s surveys took place in people’s own homes, his team used biometrical measurement techniques like eye-camera tests to calibrate their interview methods and to corroborate their survey findings (Starch, 1966: 26-29). The same psychologists then developed commercial applications to serve marketing aims, like the tracking of advertising readership and response. Yet, as we have seen above, specific marketing-related assumptions had already gone into the make-up of the material artefacts (measurement instruments) and accountability standards (‘Adnorm’ and ‘Rating’) that were now used to create relationships between market actors which heavily relied on the idea of measurable performance indicators.

Assembly of a market agencement in the case of Daniel Starch’s Advertising Readership Ratings

Error! Objects cannot be created from editing field codes.

This cycle of market creation and stabilization as it emerged from the 1930s onwards hinged on the existence of material devices like measurement instruments that translated marketing assumptions into a laboratory context and vice versa. This nexus created both winners and losers. The latter category was filled by newspapers and magazines whose readership structure did not meet the expectations of advertising agencies.

These agencies now had available the power of a number, the ‘Adnorm’, and if an advertisement in a publication did not reach that number, either the campaign or the media had to be dropped from the schedule (Mayer, 1958: 43-44). The agencies and their clients, the interests of which this measurement- and performance-oriented paradigm was supposed to promote, found themselves in an equally tight spot when it became clear that advertisements began to look all too similar so as to secure high scores on the Starch Ratings. The psychological theories that had been developed to make advertising more efficient had become counter-performative in the moment the standardized test methods threatened to kill off agencies’ creativity (Hedges, 1974). Speaking for many in the industry, the well-known advertising man David Ogilvy complained in 1955 that American advertisements looked too similar and thus failed to stimulate excitement in consumers (Ogilvy, 1955). Two years later, Les Pearl of the agency BBDO complained that ‘research men are statistic-ing the creative man to death’.10

Discussion

Laboratory devices like the tachistoscope possess market-making and performative capabilities. When advertising psychologists first began to use the tachistoscope to uncover the relationship between advertising stimuli and consumer reactions, the social-political imperatives of industrial efficiency and standardization became embedded in research devices and the technology of stimuli-response measurement systems. These systems in turn gave rise to social control fantasies about ‘consumer

---

10 Advertising Age, January 21 1957.
engineering’ (Sheldon and Arens, 1936; Starch, 1936), and they became translated into market processes which these psychological theories helped enact.

The material exchange processes between advertisers and their agencies were then organized around ratings systems like those developed by Daniel Starch’s marketing consultancy firm. Thus, market mechanisms emerged which followed what a specific set of early-twentieth century psychological theories predicted. These mechanisms remained stable until at least the 1960s, when they were challenged by psychological theories and by immaterial devices, like the in-depth interview used in motivation research which rejected the salesmanship-understanding of advertising (Schwarzkopf and Gries, 2010). The short history of advertising psychological research presented in this article shows that specific societal and political imaginations of the consuming masses were embedded in the research designs that became constructed in laboratories. These designs then reconfirmed the socio-political imagination of the consumption process and allowed calculability and accountability to be built into the market exchange processes that surrounded the buying and selling of advertising space in media. Furthermore, with the development of consumer biometrics since the 1890s, life itself in form of the physical, breathing body came to be used as a measurement tool to enable modes of valuation and accountability in the sphere of the market. In these markets, the cognitive and emotive functions of these bodies (attention, memory, etc.) were then tradable as a commodity. Market relationships between agencies, product promotion, media and consumers became reshaped so as to resemble the advertising psychological laboratories within which they were meant to be studied ‘objectively’. Entrepreneurial psychologists rendered markets to resemble their own laboratories, and they provided markets with anchors of accountability, such as norms and indices.

This paper concentrated on how biometrical measurement methods and devices helped validate and legitimize specific advertising research methods. The evidence presented here shows how these research methods enabled the enrolment of consumers’ bodies into a market agencement consisting of laboratories, material devices (e.g. instruments), psychologists, research consultants, advertising agencies, advertising clients, and media. This network of actors became stabilized around the production and circulation of monthly tables which recorded the efficiency of advertising campaigns in particular media, and which expressed this efficiency in form of a single number. Thus, this paper mainly focussed on the way advertising ratings of the kind produced by Starch and other consultants helped perform a market for advertising services as it revolved around consumers’ attention and memory as commodities. To say that intermediary markets for advertising services are performed is not the same as to say that consumers in these markets are performed by psychological theories (Azimont and Araujo, 2010). And yet, these theories played a crucial role in stabilizing the potentially most unstable node in this actor-network, the consumer.

This raises the question as to why advertising agencies, manufacturers and research consultants strove so hard in the first place to put the body of consumers to work, and to enrol the fickle, fluctuating, fallible consumer. Would not objective sales data have provided a much easier route to discerning whether an advertising campaign provided a manufacturer with value for money? A campaign that sells products could be termed successful, and one that lacks sales power should be discontinued. Arguably, the connection between consumers’ attention, understanding, and memory on the one hand, and their actual purchase behaviour on the other, was the weak point of Starch’s readership research and advertising measurement method. What the Starch procedure measured was the efficiency of advertisements in being noted, read, understood and remembered, but not necessarily their

Despite these shortcomings, Starch’s methods enjoyed increasing confidence among media organisations, advertising agencies and their clients. The reasons for this confidence are manifold. Firstly, sales data (post-test data) alone do not allow pre-tests of advertisements, and thus make prognostic interventions in markets impossible. Starch’s method, by contrast, allowed draft advertising campaigns to be pre-tested. Secondly, relying on the studies of sales figures would have made budgeting of communication expenditure a hit-and-miss procedure since the sales effects of an advertising campaign can set in with considerable time-lag. Thirdly, and crucially, there is no direct link between advertising and sales. The rise in sales of a product is not necessarily due to an effective advertising campaign but can also be caused by a well-targeted sales promotion campaign running in parallel. Lastly, not all advertising campaigns have the immediate sale of products as their key aim. These circumstances, which complicated the relationship between advertising and consumer behaviour, allowed researcher consultants to ‘sell’ the consumer body. Stabilized by measurement devices and made intelligible by the questionnaire method, the consumer’s body became something rare and valuable, an enigma. Naturally, members of this market network for advertising services needed the research consultant as a reader and interpreter of this enigma, the consumer.

The enigma of the consumer was needed by the market actors because the value of an advertising campaign is not an intrinsic feature of the advertisements that make up the campaign. Rather, an advertisement’s value, both seen as its ‘worth’ and in purely pecuniary terms, is ascribed to it by its different creators and publics. An advertising campaign, in other words, needs ‘valuation’ by various market actors. For the clients of the advertising agency, the campaign they buy is a credence or post-experience good the utility of which is difficult to establish even after its consumption by the client and the consumer public (Dulleck and Kerschbamer, 2006). No metrics exist that could safely prove that the advertisements have increased sales or met an otherwise agreed target. The only element in the market architecture around advertisements which can help establish the value of advertisements are therefore the consumers themselves. Since at least the 1930s, however, it was clear that one could not simply go out and ask consumers whether they would purchase a product because of an advertisement or whether they had done so because of a particular advert they had seen. Since such questions were known to be futile, it was the consumers’ bodies and subconscious that had to be put to work. Without this labour being continuously performed by consumers, the (e)valuation of advertising campaigns would have been based on hunches, guess work, people’s personal opinions, and hearsay.

Consultants like Starch and Gallup set themselves up as key intermediaries in the market for advertising communications services in order to extract precisely that labour from consumers’ bodies and their subconscious. Starch’s research procedure valorised the consumer body and its cognitive capabilities of attention and memory. Markets rely on price signals, and consumers’ attention with regards to advertisements therefore needed to be translated into monetary value. Hence, a consumer’s eyeball and the activation of the cells of their neocortex were ‘worth’ a specific monetary amount, and this amount was made tangible in Starch’s ratings. The valorisation of consumers’ bodies allowed a normative evaluation of advertising creative work (Aspers and Beckert, 2011: 4-7). The readership tests, scales and ratings of the type that Starch and other consultants developed, translated the aesthetic and creative ‘worth’ of an advertisement into a calculable entity (King, 1967).
Despite, or because of, serving the interests of market actors, cycles of performativity as established by Starch’s ‘Adnorms’ are remarkably fragile. It is indeed observable that advertisements during the 1940s, ’50s and ’60s began to look increasingly similar and predictable.\footnote{Starch published annual collections of the ‘best read’ and ‘most effective’ advertisements. The winners in this competition were determined by the IBM computer in the basement of Starch’s company offices in Mamaroneck, New York. See Starch (1931) and Reeves (1969).} Yet, some agencies like Doyle Dane Bernbach and their 1959 black/white advertisements for the Volkswagen ‘Beetle’ managed to break out of this cycle and deliver highly memorable advertising campaigns (Tungate, 2007: 49-59). Moreover, the shortcomings of Starch’s research methods engendered a lot of potentially destabilizing competition. Other market and consumer research consultancies, most notably Nielsen and Gallup-Robinson, began to develop their own advertising performance indicators and ratings measure (Maloney, 1994).

The reasons for the stabilization of the cycle of performativity of markets, from laboratory to advertising service providers and back, is therefore not necessarily to be found in the material devices of measurement instruments or in the research methods themselves, but in the socio-economic institutions that emerged around them. Media publishing houses showed a great interest in Starch’s advertising readership measurements because the sheer availability of these measurements made print-media more attractive to advertisers. Another institution which effected the long-term stabilization of markets for advertising services was the idea of planning and the establishment of media planning and advertising research departments (often called copy research) at advertising agencies from the 1950s.

\footnote{Source: DDB Agency, New York.}
onwards. In the marketing communications process, advertising agencies and media companies appropriate consumers’ cognitive surplus. In order to do this most economically, media planning departments were formed in order to advise campaign managers through which media vehicles their clients’ advertising money was being spent most efficiently (Calantine and Brentani-Todorovic, 1981; Danaher, 2007; Fox, 1997: 182).

Media planners became the focal point at which knowledge about consumers’ media use was gathered and analyzed. As gatekeepers of knowledge about markets and consumers, media planners create knowledge which helps reinforce the role of the advertising agency in the power relationships that exists between agency, client, media and consumer (Brierley, 2002: 121). The material production of media planning departments, including media briefs, target analyses for clients, channel analyses, and media plan recommendations on flowcharts for the agency campaign managers, therefore required more and more consumer and media analysis tools. Around this demand, which increased exponentially with the arrival of radio and television as advertising medium, more and more suppliers emerged which sought to valorise consumers’ attention and appropriate their cognitive surplus. Advertising (copy) research departments began to fulfil a similar function by attempting to pre-measure the effectiveness of advertising copy (headlines and text) and designs before they were placed by an agency’s media planning department. This research, in turn, stabilized the normative and performative effect of Starch’s ‘Adnorms’ and ‘Ratings’. In 1944, for example, the McCann-Erickson agency’s advertising researcher Marion Harper developed a test which predicted the Starch effectiveness rating of an advertisement before it ran in the print media. At this moment, the test methods developed by research consultants, here Daniel Starch, and those used by advertising service providers, here the McCann agency, began to stabilize each other and thus engrain the cycle of performativity both were part of even deeper.

References


13 See the files of the Media Resources and Research Department of the J. Walter Thompson agency’s Chicago office, and the files of the Administration Officers of the Outdoor Advertising Association of America (OAAA), both at J. Hartman Center for Sales, Advertising and Marketing History, Duke University, North Carolina.
14 Today, media planners have a plethora of choice among research and planning tools, including Adnorms, Simmons Connect, Mediamark Research Inc. (MRI), Advviews, Comscore, Netratings, Nielsen Ratings, Arbitron data, and many others.
15 Advertising Age, November 26 1946.


Hopkins, C. C. (1923), Scientific advertising. Chicago: Unknown Publisher.


Scott, W. D. (1908), The psychology of advertising: a simple exposition of the principles of psychology in their relation to successful advertising. Boston: Small, Maynard.


Is non-profit marketing really non-profit? The possibility of performativity

Kosuke Mizukoshi, Tokyo Metropolitan University, Japan
Yuichiro Hidaka, Yamanashi Gakuin University, Japan
Masaaki Takemura, Meiji University, Japan

The purpose of this paper is to highlight the importance of relationships, created by the interaction among actors, in non-profit marketing research. This paper proposes that focusing on relationships enables us to capture the maintenance and transformation of stakeholders and their interests as well as the process that a not-for-profit aspect of the project is created performatively through the interaction.

Keywords: non-profit marketing, performativity, wine tourism, case study

Introduction

As part of the expansion of concepts that began with Kotler & Levy (1969a, b), non-profit marketing research has developed in conjunction with the increasing adoption of the exchange concept. Studies on the relationship concept are considered to be insufficient as the research on non-profit marketing began in this manner. In addition, the relationship concept has particular implications in non-profit marketing.

In part 1 of this paper, we discuss the need to: (a) ascertain the diversity of stakeholders in non-profit organizations (NPOs), and (b) focus on relationships considering the maintenance and transformation of stakeholders and their interests. In part 2, we describe how the focus on relationships makes it possible to ascertain the non-profit level of the operations. This not-for-profit aspect is often partly built into for-profit activities. At the very least, the not-for-profit aspect is not clearly defined and categorized in advance; rather, it should be viewed as constantly being reconstructed through the interactions carried out in practices. The focus on the relationship concept makes it possible to address how, in terms of marketing theory, this not-for-profit aspect can be created. These discussions are in line with the concept of performativity, similar to those mentioned in Araujo et al. (2010). Neyland and Simakova (2010) discusses the fairtrade whith is difficult to difine 'goods' or 'bads'.

In the following section, we offer theoretical considerations and emphasize the importance that the relationship concept could create in non-profit marketing. Subsequently, we conduct a case study of wine tourism as an example of non-profit marketing that focuses on relationships. Further, we discuss the presence of diverse stakeholders and their fluid characteristics as well as the dynamism in the not-for-profit aspect of an organization's operations.

Brief Review of Previous Studies

1. Exchanges and relationships in marketing theory and non-profit marketing theory

The expansion of marketing concepts to NPOs began with Kotler & Levy (1969a, b). Their expansion of concepts generated a dispute among theorists, who believed that the scope of marketing should be limited to conventional for-profit enterprises. Kotler & Levy (1969a, b) and Bagozzi (1975) stressed that broad social exchanges were within the scope of marketing theory, but in response to this,
Luck (1969), Bartels (1974), and Ferrell & Zey-Ferrel (1977) each stressed that it should be limited to economic exchanges.

The exchange concept gradually became more sophisticated during this dispute. Kotler claimed that it was possible to replace the core concept of a “market transaction” with “exchange” (or trading, as a more general meaning). Unlike market transactions, in which buying and selling are the focus, exchange was considered a model from which such actions were abstracted; therefore, it became easier to expand concepts. In other words, according to Kotler, market transactions as a business are one form of exchange. Therefore, as exchange itself is included within the scope of marketing, it is naturally also possible to apply marketing to NPOs.

With the increasing sophistication of the exchange concept, researchers began to aim to construct social marketing and generic marketing. The strong need for social marketing for NPOs, such as the government, had been previously highlighted; it is thought that a marketing-mix framework is useful when carrying out activities to realize social goals. Further, in generic marketing, the exchange concept becomes completely abstracted and positioned as a model through which all topics of research can be understood.

Hunt (1976) established a general theory of marketing that focused on the exchange concept. However, to this day, no marketing theory has been constructed upon the foundation of the exchange concept, including Hunt’s expansive general theory. For this reason, we can point out: (1) the limits of the positivistic viewpoint on which Hunt relied, and (2) that the exchange concept is perceived to be unsophisticated. We indicate that initially exchange was not always a prerequisite for NPO activities; this includes the many NPO activities for which there is no price (Mizukoshi 2011).

The concept of relationship marketing has attracted attention within marketing research as a type of logic that can be positioned relative to the exchange concept. From the 1990s, the concept of relationship marketing was bringing about a paradigm shift (Grönroos, 1994; Webster, 1992). However, the relationship concept itself was not given a clear definition, as was the exchange concept; nor did it become the focus of consistent research. The American Marketing Association’s (AMA) definition of marketing provides one example of relationship marketing’s increasing importance. Their definition in 1985 emphasized the importance of exchange, but the 2004 revision comprehensively focused on exchange transactions but also made explicit their continuous nature. In other words, it can be thought that the AMA critically perceived an awareness of the singularity of exchange with an emphasis on the exchange concept and the mutual maximization of profits and, as a result, aimed to incorporate the relationship as a core concept for marketing activities.

Within the general introduction of the relationship concept into marketing, some researchers have from time to time pointed out the need to pay attention to the relationship concept for non-profit marketing (Kotler & Roberto, 1989; Kotler & Andreasen, 2003). However, while only a few such studies exist within the body of research as a whole, it is still not apparent what has been clarified by the observations made by these researchers.

An extremely interesting point is that originally when Kotler & Levy (1969b) expanded the marketing concepts, they had already highlighted the importance of relationships together with the exchange concept. According to them, the for-profit activities of today are not intended to achieve short-term sales, but to acquire long-term relationships, and the activities undertaken to build these long-term relationships are extremely similar to those carried out by schools to maintain relationships with their graduates or by churches to increase the size of their congregations.

This idea is similar to Kotler & Levy’s relationship concept, but it is only marginally applicable to the subsequent debate on this topic. Based on their previous assertions, Kotler & Levy themselves assumed that it is ultimately possible to think of the education service provided by schools to students as a “sale,” and the religious service provided by a church to its congregation, as a type of “ticket sale.”
As far as the authors can understand, the expansion of marketing concepts does not mean it is possible to apply marketing’s exchange concept to NPOs; rather, it signifies that the relationships that NPOs develop could possibly be incorporated into marketing.

2. De-marketing makes new demands?

Moreover, from the context of general relationship marketing, researchers have suggested different meanings for the relationship concept and the possibility of introducing it into non-profit marketing. Relationship marketing includes many different domains, and in recent years, research has been actively pursued in this field. The existence of a marketing viewpoint, which is different from the one assumed by an American-style marketing theory, had been pointed out by Arndt (1979) in his theory on the internalization of the marketplace. Arndt (1978) was also involved in the concept-extended dispute and indicated that the problem of responding to long-term needs that could not be clearly ascertained had significance for the expansion of concepts to NPO organizations.

In non-profit marketing, organizations must cooperate with a diverse range of stakeholders and acquire the approval of third parties to carry out their operations, such as with government organizations that have the jurisdiction for official approval, the providers of working capital, and other enterprises and industry groups. Kotler (1972) pointed out the existence of nine stakeholders for generic marketing presentations. However, Kotler emphasized marketing management that could be used for all stakeholder groups, and his focus on relationships was limited; therefore, the diversity of stakeholders needs to be ascertained while focusing on relationships.

Based on the research of Morgan & Hunt (1994), Hastings (2003) pointed out that the typical problem of diversified stakeholders is one that occurs especially for NPOs and that, as a result, the relationship concept is important for them. Further, Knox & Gruar (2006) drew on the previous argument of Coviello et al. (2002) to investigate how marketing approaches tailored to each stakeholder would differ and stated that the diversity of stakeholders had become an important issue in non-profit marketing.

However, we need a concept of relationship in NPO marketing for another reason. It is difficult to define "NOT-FOR-PROFIT" precisely. Organizations can earn from not-for-profit activities, or as in social marketing, for-profit companies can work “not for profit” in the form of corporate social responsibility (CSR). NPOs need funds to sustain their own activities. When they succeed in their aim of raising funds some stakeholders begin to doubt their not-for-profit aspect. The opposing stakeholder in particular will strengthen this doubt. The non-profit marketing is carried out over the not-for-profit aspect.

Marketing is performative. The most obvious example is de-marketing, which has been studied in NPO marketing. De-marketing, as indicated by Kotler, is an activity to restrain customer demand. Kotler (1971) classified de-marketing into general, selective, ostensible, and unintentional de-marketing. The most-interesting de-marketing is ostensible de-marketing. Ostensible de-marketing is paradoxical, because it involves the appearance of trying to discourage demand as a device for actually increasing demand. This paradox causes a debate with Brown (2001, 2002). Eventually, it cannot be decided precisely whether demands are really restrained, on the contrary it could fan a hunger and lead to new demand creation. This problem appears to be a basic problem of the not-for-profit aspect. In other words, it is difficult to define a not-for-profit activity from the intention of the actor, and we need to understand that it is reconstituted in practice consistently.

One of the few important factors is a relationship. The meaning of relationship appears to have been settled easily. For example, in Kelly et al. (1996), the effect of the anti-drug campaign is analyzed. Some students were caught up in the campaign itself, and the effect was less than satisfactory. However, their parents and friends saw and heard the campaign, and used the contents as an
A Case Study of Wine Tourism

1. Theoretical points and the purpose of the case study

   Let us outline the discussion up to this point. Part 1 described how, beginning with the expansion of concepts, not-for-profit marketing research has developed in parallel with the increasing adoption of the exchange concept and, therefore, the treatment of the relationship concept continues to be insufficient. However, not-for-profit marketing requires the relationship concept. Part 2 explained that by focusing on relationships, it is possible to understand the communication to the extent to which operations are not for profit, but this cannot be defined in advance, because whether operations are considered to be “not for profit” or “for profit” is determined by relationships.

   1. In the expansion of marketing concepts to NPOs, it is not the exchange concept that is important, but the relationship concept.
   2. The diversity of NPOs’ stakeholders can be described based on the relationship concept.
      2.1. Stakeholders themselves are performatively maintained and are then transformed.
      2.2. The marketing activities of NPOs are developed with discussing whether their operations are not for profit.

   Next, this paper focuses on a case study of wine tourism in Japan. In the wine market, many marketing strategies have been carried out globally (Porter & Bond, 1999; Porter & Solvell, 2003). In Japan as well, wine production has become popular as the “New World,” and has also increased the activity of local revitalization through wine by non-profit organizations. Wine Tourism discussed in this paper is a project to attract customers to visit and walk around the Katsunuma region in Koshu city, Yamanashi prefecture, Japan. The project’s aim is to enhance the attractiveness of Katsunuma, one of the foremost wine producing regions in Japan where many wineries have been opened. This paper reveals that Wine Tourism performatively followed the interactions between various stakeholders (e.g., Latour, 1987). Based on a case study, we discuss the problems and solutions of non-profit marketing.

   In Wine Tourism, customers were free to explore the wineries and historic sites in the region on buses. In addition to the wineries, the nearby eateries and grape farmers also participated in Wine Tourism (through cafés or rest stations). Customers could take a break at rest stations, and enrich their understanding of the wine and the region through their dialogues with shopkeepers and farmers.

   Wine Tourism has been held in November every year since 2008, and was managed by Wine Tourism Limited Liability Partnership (hereinafter Winetourism Yamanashi). Until now, Wine Tourism has not been actively promoted, except online. However, the number of customers, in recent years, has increased to about 3,500 from about 2,000 in 2008 (the first year of operation).

   Working capital was financed in two ways until 2009: (1) income from customer participation, and (2) total subsidy income of 2 million yen from the prefecture, city, and the Farm Ministry. These incomes were used for website management of Wine Tourism, the production of the guidebook, administrative expenses, and so on. The project was mainly managed by Mr. Takayuki Sasamoto, who was the CEO of a company in Yamanashi and was responsible for organizing Wine Tourism, and by Mr. Takayuki Oki, who was the owner of a café in downtown Yamanashi. They participated in Wine Tourism as volunteers. Therefore, labor costs were not recorded in the balance sheet.

2. The initial intention and trigger of Wine Tourism
Wine Tourism was initiated by Mr. Sasamoto, who supported the independence of the black community in the US. He then tried to develop a similar activity in his hometown Yamanashi as well. Therefore, the initial intention of Wine Tourism was to proactively create local revitalization by local residents without the help of subsidies or administrative organizations. At that time, however, he did not know what was suitable for local revitalization in the region. He opened informal workshops to discuss concrete directions for local revitalization from 2004. He was aware of wine tourism in Europe and the United States. From February 2005, with Mr. Oki, he deployed low-profile activities such as a wine festival, for which customers were invited to Mr. Oki’s café. The customers included individuals, who were interested in wine, as well as winery managers of wine breweries. During the wine festival, customers could enjoy wine and listen to explanations on wine production from winery managers. The wine festival was conducted once every three months, and drew in about 80 customers, who in great part, were personal acquaintances of Mr. Sasamoto.

For Winetourism Yamanashi, few relationships were maintained with the wine industry; however, Winetourism Yamanashi received subsidies of 2 billion yen from Yamanashi Prefecture and Koshu city (in the Katsunuma region). These subsidies were used for outsourcing to the private sector to promote tourism in Yamanashi Prefecture.

3. The transformation of the not-for-profit aspect of Wine Tourism, which led to the transformation of relationships

The trigger of subsidies was the wine festival. One official of the prefectural government was participating in the wine festival. In the wake of his awareness of Wine Tourism at the wine festival, Wine Tourism became well known, which led to outsourcing. In particular, consistent with Wine Tourism, the prefecture tried to put a similar plan as Wine Tourism into effect. Therefore, the Wine Tourism project happened to be aligned with the interests of the Department of Tourism in the prefecture. The prefecture discussed whether the project should be managed by them or whether it should be outsourced. At that time, the Wine Tourism project was known in the prefecture government, and the prefecture was urged to outsource the activities. They believed that it was quite irrational for the public sector to separately manage the project, as there was an actor available who had an excellent and concrete plan of the same project in the private sector.

Winetourism Yamanashi could continue the project to some extent by receiving the subsidies. First, subsidy plays an important role as operating capital for business operation. Second, subsidy plays an important role to enhance the legitimacy of a project to contribute to the public and involve other stakeholders. Actually, Winetourism Yamanashi had asked the Katsunuma Winery Association for cooperation to put this public project into practice.

In reality, however, the subsidy worsened the relationship between Winetourism Yamanashi and the wineries. When Mr. Sasamoto visited the Katsunuma Winery Association to explain project, he was unable to get a favorable response. The Katsunuma Winery Association is a group of wineries in Katsunuma. The presidents or owners of each winery participated in regular meetings. During a particular meeting, Winetourism Yamanashi received strong criticism against the receipt and use of the subsidies. Their project’s purpose was questioned and the project was believed to have begun to only receive subsidies and, in truth, it was believed that the project was started only for the organizer’s profit. Wineries were important stakeholders, and Winetourism Yamanashi could not have executed their project without the wineries, and thus the wineries had been asked to cooperate. However, the initial intention of the project was not communicated, and the not-for-profit aspect of Wine Tourism was left out because of the subsidy and the relationship with the wineries deteriorated. The subsidy had created a new opportunity but it had also created a new problem.
However, several wineries responded positively to the explanation offered by Winetourism Yamanashi. After all, the project had received the approval of several young executive candidates of the wineries to participate in the meeting of Wine Tourism. Many wineries estimated that Wine Tourism could attract several hundred customers at most and it was only necessary for them, they thought, to cooperate to such an extent that Wine Tourism did not get in the way.

In such difficult circumstances, Mr. Sasamoto strongly requested the cooperation of Mr. Takayasu, the representative of two non-profit organizations that had engaged in proactive regional constructions by local residents. Mr. Takayasu did not wish to cooperate initially, but finally he decided to cooperate because he thought that Wine Tourism was a substantial project to have received subsidies from administrative organizations in addition to the attractiveness of the project itself.

Thus, the not-for-profit aspect of Wine Tourism was maintained by temporary consent from a few young wine brewers and local residents. The first year attracted about 2,000 customers and barely broke even. This result was significantly higher than the previous forecasts.

4. Further interactions of actors, which transformed the not-for-profit aspect of Wine Tourism

The higher-than-expected result strengthened the suspicions of the executives of wineries. Wineries and local residents, who had participated as volunteers, criticized the project. But the higher-than-expected success eventually strengthened and diffused the suspicions of the not-for-profit aspect of Wine Tourism. Mr. Sasamoto explained the balance sheet while disclosing the financial statement to help the stakeholders better understand the not-for-profit aspect of Wine Tourism, but it was quite difficult to obtain their consent. The deteriorating relationship with wineries, which stemmed largely from the higher-than-expected result, aroused stronger suspicion of the not-for-profit aspect of Wine Tourism.

If this situation persisted, then it would be difficult to continue with the project. However, a decision on subsidies gradually turned the situation around. Originally, Wine Tourism was aimed at creating proactive efforts from local residents without subsidies or administrative organizations. To achieve this aim, Winetourism Yamanashi decided not to receive subsidies from the second year of operations.

Of course, without subsidies, Winetourism Yamanashi would have lost a major source of operating capital. However, this decision had gradually enhanced the understanding among wineries. The suspicions that people outside of the wine industry received subsidies disappeared after this action. Further, this decision came to the notice of Yamanashi’s prefectural governor and the mayor of Koshu City. As a result, they recommended Wine Tourism not only formally but informally as well, which led to increased awareness and further legitimacy for Wine Tourism. Their political policy had measured the improvement of tourism in this region.

It is quite important not only for profit organizations but also for non-profit organizations to drum up capital funds continually. First, in the case of Wine Tourism, subsidies supported the project initially. Second, however, subsidies created and also worsened the relationship with the wineries. Third, subsidies gave Wine Tourism the legitimacy of a project that would meaningfully contribute to society, and also created a relationship with the administrative organization. Fourth, the relationship with the administrative organization led to subsidies, which helped forge a new relationship with wineries, and this new relationship promoted a better understanding of Wine Tourism among wineries. That is, the relationship with other stakeholders had determined the not-for-profit aspect of Wine Tourism.

Through the above process, wineries and local residents began to understand Wine Tourism and rediscover the charm of the region. For example, many wineries were kept open on holidays, after being closed on holidays previously. Through Wine Tourism, they realized that they had not taken care of their
customers who had visited them until then. In addition, a local resident stated that many local residents found customers, who visited the region to see the charm of Katsunuma and now saw the region in a fresh light. Some new stakeholders began to come to this region from outside as well. For example, a sommelier, who had worked in a famous French restaurant in Tokyo, opened a new restaurant in Katsunuma, his home town.

In the wake of Wine Tourism, new customers appeared in the region, and the relationships between stakeholders changed. The stakeholders’ understanding of the region also appeared to have changed since Wine Tourism. Many stakeholders did not recognize the attractiveness of the region from the very beginning. In the wake of increased customers, the relationships between stakeholders began to change, and this change set off substantial transformations of the position of stakeholders and their understanding of the not-for-profit aspect of Wine Tourism.

Major Findings and Implications

Finally, from the case study above, we discuss the significance of the relationship concept in non-profit marketing. Hastings et al. (2003) took notice of the relationship concept and regarded each stakeholder as independent and their roles as static. In addition to the significance of the relationship concept in non-profit marketing, we discuss the possibility that non-profit marketing should undertake continual communication over the not-for-profit aspect of its own project. We refer to the existing studies about de-marketing.

1. Relationship shaped performatively through actor’s interactions plays an important role

First, however, stakeholders should not be independent, but should play multiple roles at a time, such as a customer and an official of the prefectural government. The official of the prefectural government, who participated in the wine festival and became the gatekeeper to the prefecture, played two roles, that of the customer of the wine festival and an official of the prefectural government. When the festival was first organized, he played a single role. In the wake of the Wine Tourism project, his role as an official, which had been implicit, finally became explicit. We propose the utility of focusing on the relationship which is shaped performatively through the actor’s interactions, as indicated by Araujo et al. (2010), in non-profit marketing.

2. Focusing on a relationship enables us to capture the generation and transformation of actors and their interests

Second, by focusing on the relationship through the actor’s interactions, such as Latour (1987), we could understand how stakeholders are generated and transformed. The subsidy served as not only operating capital but also as a factor that determined the relationships with the wineries or administrative organizations. As seen above, the subsidies worsened the relationships with the wineries, but, on the other hand, it also improved the relationships with wineries by creating another relationship with the administrative organization.

Focus on the relationship makes it possible to capture the process of generation and transformation of relationships and their interests. This process would have been hidden if we analyzed the case after we assume the stakeholders and laid out the whole picture of the case in advance. As indicated by the case study, without the prior assumption about who the stakeholders are and their interests, it would be difficult to practice in the field by focusing on the relationship, which is shaped through the actor’s interaction.
3. Focusing on relationships enables us to capture how the not-for-profit aspect is constructed performatively

This paper pointed out that the not-for-profit aspect of a project could not be defined in advance, in reference to the extant research on de-marketing. The not-for-profit aspect could be constructed in the interaction between the actors performatively. Therefore, non-profit marketing should be seen as the continual communication process over the not-for-profit aspect of the project itself. Hence, it is quite important for non-profit marketing research to capture how the not-for-profit aspect of a project is established in the interaction of actors. In this paper, we conducted a case study to illustrate the establishment process of the not-for-profit aspect.

In the case study, the not-for-profit aspect was exposed to strong suspicion due to the deteriorating relationship with the wineries (based on the use of the subsidies). Further, the project was exposed to stronger suspicion due to the relationship with the wineries and the expected customers. Naturally, higher number of customers should be the fruit of non-profit marketing from the perspective of continual operation. It is important even for non-profit organizations to gain operational capital. Revenue from customers or subsidies should cover operational capital. In the case of Wine Tourism, however, the appearance of customers by itself did not work positively to establish the not-for-profit aspect. Conversely, it aroused strong suspicions of for-profit activities. Probably, the more non-profit organizations gain operational funds, the stronger their activities appear suspect. The appearance of more customers worked positively only after the references made by the prefectural governor and the city mayor. That is, their not-for-profit aspect, which they had intended, was transformed performatively according to their actual activity. The not-for-profit aspect had no relation to the initial intention. That is, the relationship, which was created by the interactions of the actors, had determined the not-for-profit aspect of Wine Tourism.

The case in this paper indicates that non-profit marketing should have a continual communication process over the not-for-profit aspect of a project. Focus on relationships shows how the not-for-profit aspect of a project or some new markets would generate and diffuse according to the actor involved in the ongoing practice.

4. Non-profit organizations should focus on the creation of relationships for legitimacy

This paper indicates the direction to be taken by non-profit activities for managerial implications. For instance, gaining legitimacy is very important for non-profit activities. However, this legitimacy does not come from an entity (i.e., government, subsidies, or industry group). Instead, it comes from the relationships created by the actors’ interactions. Thus, if non-profit activities require legitimacy, they should focus on the relationships in which they are embedded instead of focusing on entities.

References
Arndt, Johan (1979), “Toward a Concept of Domesticated Markets,” Journal of Marketing, 43(Fall), 69-75.


Hunt, Shelby D. (1976), Marketing Theory, Grid, Inc.


Kotler, Philip & Alan R. Andreasen (2003), Strategic marketing for nonprofit organizations 6ed., Prentice Hall.


Mizukoshi, Kosuke (2011), The Firm, the market, and the observer: new horizon of methodology in marketing studies, Yuhikaku (Japanese).


Neyland, Danie & Elena Simakova (2010), "Trading bads and goods: Market practices in Fair Trade Retailing," in Araujo et al., 204-223.


<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Thursday June 6, 2013</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2:00p-3:30p</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Concurrent Session I</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**The Nature of Relationships in Market Processes**

### Abstract/Papers Included

The relevance of male breadwinner ideology for the analysis and design of Marketing systems  
Michaela Haase, Freie Universität Berlin & Friedrich-Alexander Universität Erlangen-Nürnberg, Germany  
Ingrid Becker, Friedrich-Alexander Universität Erlangen-Nürnberg, Germany  
Alexander Nill, University of Nevada - Las Vegas, USA  
Clifford J. Shultz, II, Loyola University - Chicago, USA  
James W. Gentry, University of Nebraska - Lincoln, USA

Towards a sustainable fashion system: Slow fashion movement  
Zeynep Ozdamar Ertekin, Izmir University of Economics, Turkey  
Deniz Atik, Izmir University of Economics, Turkey

Indigenous business development from a network identity perspective  
Daniel Schepis, University of Western Australia, Australia  
Sharon Purchase, University of Western Australia, Australia  
Nick Ellis, Durham University, UK
The Relevance of Male Breadwinner Ideology for the Analysis and Design of Marketing Systems

Michaela Haase, Freie Universität Berlin & Friedrich-Alexander Universität Erlangen-Nürnberg, Germany
Ingrid Becker, Friedrich-Alexander Universität Erlangen-Nürnberg, Germany
Alexander Nill, University of Nevada, Las Vegas, USA
Clifford J. Shultz, II, Loyola University Chicago, USA
James W. Gentry, University of Nebraska-Lincoln, USA

Abstract

This paper continues and extends available work in macromarketing on the male breadwinner ideology (Nill and Shultz 2010). “Male breadwinning” designates the effects of shared and overlapping ideologies and thus also patterns of marketing systems. Like institutions, ideologies are both restrictions and enabler for market processes. Ideologies influence the economic organization and thus type and number of relationships in marketing systems. Our paper wants to contribute to the development of measures which can inform the private as well as public decision-making units about the ideologies available in actual as well as potential marketing systems and the influence they might have on the demand for particular offerings. Based on a qualitative pre-study, the paper develops a Male Breadwinning Model and conducts a vignette analysis in Southern Germany. First results of the vignette study are included.

Macromarketing, Ideology and Institutions

What has macromarketing to say about the way a society (a macromarketing system) organizes the division and re-integration of labor and other resources, the access to resources and the way it grants liberty on the one hand, and protects those who are less able to realize their interests, on the other? How can the division of labor and integration of resources be organized within a marketing system so that it contributes not only to the achievement of individual ends but also to the common good? Shall a society (government) try to take action on the initiation and steering of particular markets or on the condition under which particular agents can make offers to these markets such as the labor market or the market for health-related services? To which individuals or groups is agency granted at all?

Marketing systems are by definition “embedded in a social matrix:” Layton (2009, 354) characterized marketing systems by ideas as well as products, services, and experiences. The social and institutional order influences the production possibilities of marketing systems, their structure and function, and the development of technology and innovation. Our study is interested in the interplay of economic organization and formal and informal institutions on the one hand, and the ideas and ideologies underlying institutions on the other.

---

1 We would like to thank Adrian Wille, Master student at the Friedrich-Alexander Erlangen-Nürnberg, for his research assistance.
2 The liberalization of family law while protecting children may count for an example (see Lewis 2003).
From an institutional-economic perspective, institutions are the “rules of the game” governing interactions in markets and organizations (North 1990). As objective mental entities, institutions exert influence on the belief systems or mental models of agents. Institutions are social phenomena because they are shared within given collectivities (see Schmid 1981, 59). As exemplifications of the social, institutions relate mental and non-mental phenomena like beliefs or knowledge on the one hand, and activities or practices, on the other. Against this backdrop, institutions can be conceived of as entities which have given rise to particular practices.

Ideologies have been considered as “patterns of ideas” (Cheal 1979, 111), and ideologies are exemplifications of the social which result from different though interrelated sources. Like institutions, ideologies are objective mental entities. Elementary sources of ideas reside in the personal experience of individuals and in the social intercourse consisting of the communications between individuals (Cheal 1979, 110). Cheal refers to the first group of ideas as practical ideas, and to the second as received ideas. As Cheal (1979, 113) has pointed out, ideologies can get into conflict with each other and they can overlap.

Note that we use the concept of ideology in the descriptive sense (Geuss 1981), and from the perspective of critical theory (Finlayson, 2005; Habermas, 1989 [1962]; Habermas, 1987 [1981]) which distinguishes between descriptive, pejorative and the positive senses of “ideology” (Geuss, 1981). The descriptive sense of the term is expressed in the recognition of ideology as constitutive part of the social world. We do not intend to assess particular ideologies with respect to their possible wrongness (ideology in the pejorative sense), or their potential to initiate or guide social or political movements (ideology in the positive sense). Groups, organizations, communities, or (parts of) nation states can be characterized by in part common, in part different ideologies. Descriptive ideology has been made the subject of diverse scientific disciplines such as ethnology, sociology, and philosophy.

With reference to Denzau and North’s (1994) word use with respect to institutions, we use the expression “shared ideology” for cognitively shared frameworks of ideas or belief systems (see also Van Dijk 2006). “Shared ideologies” presume that ideologies as objective mental phenomena can interact with individual belief systems; as social phenomena ideologies are thus always somehow “shared.” That an ideology is shared within a group means that the group members refer to the same ideology though not necessarily to the same degree or with respect to all ideas in a framework of ideas (ideology). Ideas and values might be constitutive or in effect in more than one ideology. For this reason, it is said that these ideologies “overlap.” That main strands of economic and political ideology both draw on the idea of the reasonable and autonomous person, might count for an example. It can be assumed that individuals take an active part in the process of making particular ideas effective for their belief system. The impact of ideologies or the open-mindedness of individuals toward particular ideologies can be traced back to practices or experiences, on the one hand, and to theories or scientific disciplines, which are not untouched by ideas and values, on the other. In any case, individuals will get into touch with diverse ideologies. As ideologies do not have to fulfill a consistency condition, the ideas and values underlying them can conflict with each other.

1 Note that North makes a distinction between institutions, i.e. the rules of the game, and organizations, i.e. social systems.

4 As Schmid (1981, 60 f.) note, Althusser (1971) has put institutions on a par with sets of practices.

5 Cheal’s (1979, 113) re-analysis of data from a 1964 survey in Britain has identified “major political ideologies” (conservatism, laborism, and liberalism) and shown that “there are differences in opinion consistency between the conservatism and labourism collectivities.”
Ideologies play a part in the interpretation of personal experience and thus exert influence on the understanding or classification of practices as well as the way individuals value and perform certain practices (e.g., the way they assume responsibility with regard to caretaking within or beyond families). That an individual performs a practice does not imply that the individual completely agrees with a particular (set of) ideology (ideologies) which “back(s) up” the practice. It can happen that a particular activity is enforced by an ideology although it does not harmonize with the preferences of agents (women might prefer to “buy” care-related service but shy away from realizing this preference because of the “bad conscience” related to that, or cannot realize their preference because of the social costs related to becoming a social outsider). In addition, within couples, individual choices based on individual preferences are negotiated among the partners (Närvi 2012).

In this paper, we refer to political ideology, economic ideology, the ideology of domesticity, gender ideology and family ideology (next section). In our model (Figure 3), gender ideology influences both family ideology and the ideology of domesticity while the ideology of domesticity links the sphere of the political with gender issues. After that, we address the influence of the male breadwinner ideology on marketing systems from a general perspective and present our research design as well as the results from a first factorial survey conducted in the south-west of Germany. It is our aim to contribute to the development of a measurement – or (for a “weaker” expression) – determination method for ideologies in marketing systems. The results of such studies are assumed to be of use for the analysis and the design of marketing systems thus informing for example potential private as well as public providers of care-related services. The paper ends with discussion, conclusion and outlook.

The Theoretical Framework for the Analysis of Male Breadwinner Ideology

“Breadwinning” is a dominant concept in family sociology (Warren 2007) and other areas of family research within a wide variety of disciplines (e.g., Commuri and Gentry 2005; Lewis 2003; Reilly 1982). The use of the concept is not theory-guided in sociological studies (Warren 2007). Our use of the term “male breadwinning model” refers to the theoretical representation of the phenomena related to male breadwinning and the ideology on which these phenomena draw.

The Male Breadwinner Ideology (MBI) can be conceived of as a framework of ideas which is related to ideologies from different origins and has serious consequences for the design and the developmental potential of marketing systems. The MBI exemplifies one way a society organizes the division and provision of labor. There are diverse aspects to this, economic as well as ethical ones. Among others, the economic aspects can be or have been discussed in terms of access to resources, development of human capital, and division of labor, while the ethical aspects have been discussed in terms of freedom, autonomy, responsibility, equality, and justice. These concepts are also constitutive for the interface of economics, ethics, and political philosophy. With reference to these “hub concepts” and the values underlying them we construct our Male Breadwinner Model (MBM) on the basis of five ideologies.

On the one hand, this selection of ideologies is the consequence of a theoretical pre-decision: We choose them because of their alleged relevance for macromarketing in general (economic and political ideology) and for the phenomenon of male breadwinning in particular (ideology of domesticity,

---

6 The impact of the MBI on public policy or institutional design, respectively, has been documented in political science, sociology, and macromarketing (Nill and Shultz 2010).
gender ideology and family ideology). Political science and economics are of common origin; it can thus be expected that there are ideas and values belonging to either ideology. On the other hand, the integration of the above-mentioned ideologies results from the interpretation of a qualitative pre-study which was conducted prior to our vignette study.

**Five Ideologies of Relevance for the MBM**

Every societal group can be characterized by group-specific as well as overarching ideologies (such a description results in what Geuss 1981 has named “descriptive ideology”). Some ideologies might be only group-specific or limited in range; other ideologies can characterize larger parts of society. Ideologies of different origin can also interact (see Weber 1905 for the example of religious and economic ideology in his analysis). We address five ideologies and their interactions in our study. There are other ideologies of potential relevance for the study of marketing systems which are not addressed in this paper, such as religious ideology, which has to be considered in the US given the role of religion for the far right and in the Muslim world.7 We assume that the MBM is mainly constituted by five ideologies:

**Political Ideology**

In this paper, we refer to two still important and vibrant strands of political or social philosophy: contemporary liberalism and classical liberalism on the one hand and communitarianism (and criticisms of liberal views which partially have been related to communitarian positions)9 on the other. Classical liberalism (libertarianism) emphasizes the protection of “individual rights – especially the rights to liberty and property – through strict limits on governmental power” (Etzioni 2013, 1) while contemporary liberalism “seeks to protect and enhance personal autonomy and individual rights in part through the activity of government” (Etzioni 2013, 1; our emphasis). German ordoliberalism, premised on a strong state that guarantees economic freedom, relates to the latter view (Bonefeld 2012).

Liberalism underlies the development of political and economic theory (Lodge 1982), and is thus a source of those ideas which we link with political and economic ideology (Figure 1). They highlight the role of individual agency and the market in regard to the solution of individual as well as social problems, compared to the part the state is assumed or granted to play. Compared with communitarianism,10 liberalism devalues the community and prefers shedding light on individual actors able to impinge their will on the world (Bell 2012, 6).

**Economic Ideology**

Misinterpreted self-interest generates misleading beliefs about the ends of economic activity, in particular the idea that the end of economic activity is to gain as much as possible for oneself.11 The economic practices established or supported by these ideas have nourished the idea (originating from

---

7 See Kozinets and Handelman (2004, 702) for a hint to the threat of religious fundamentalism for consumerist ideology.
8 Communitarianism arose in the 1980s (Etzioni 2013, 1)
9 As Bell (2012, 1) points to, political philosophers have criticized Rawls’s (1971) view “that the principal task of government is to secure and distribute fairly the liberties and economic resources individuals need to lead freely chosen lives.”
10 Like liberalism and libertarianism, communitarianism is no monolithic approach. See Etzioni (2013).
11 “… it is not good to imagine that there are no laws to which men and groups of men are responsible other than the law of getting all they can” (Clark 1916, 220).
the ideology of domesticity) that particularly socially “sensitive” areas should not be governed by the market. The rule quid pro quo (something of value is given in exchange for something of value), that characterizes economic exchange, does not work adequately in social relationships (Bagozzi 1975, 33) or in types of social relationships with different mooring than exchange (Bagozzi 1974, 64). In his characterization of social relationships, Bagozzi (1975, 38) draws on the distinction of the private and the public, on the one hand and the economic and the social, on the other: “Social relationships (as opposed to economic relationships) are those such as family planning agent-client, welfare agent-indigent, social worker-poor person, and so on.” According to Bagozzi (1975, 38) the juxtaposition of economic and social relationships constitutes the domain of social marketing.

At the intersection of the ideology of domesticity and economic ideology, one also can locate the belief that particular, “sensitive” parts of the (socio-)economy (especially those connected with care and human relationships) cannot be managed under the rule of “anonymous” market relationships.

**Ideology of Domesticity, Gender Ideology, and Family Ideology**

The ideology of domesticity has been developed against the background of the industrial revolution. Haddock and Bowling (2001) link the ideology of domesticity with gender ideology: “As the economy moved from subsistence to a monetary base, paid work became distinct from non-paid work at home. This revolution gave rise to the ideology of domesticity – a gender system that justifies and sustains a separation in the ‘public’ and ‘private’ spheres of life” (Haddock and Bowling 2001, 93). The system is characterized by the worker norms based on the distinction between breadwinning and caring, and values characterizing personal identity.

Gender ideology guides the division of responsibility among married (heterosexual) couples; i. e., it links the public sphere with the male sphere and the private sphere with the female sphere. MBI is an outflow of gender ideology and the particular way gender ideology has been linked with the ideology of domesticity.

The ideology of domesticity, however, is not logically bound to gender ideology. For this reason, we maintain the distinction between both ideologies. The “anti-domestic stance” (Baker 2012, 340) of feminism has its origin in the inequitable division of domestic labor among sexes, the way housework and child rearing developed into a service of women for men. An anti-capitalistic stance has been added to the anti-domestic stance because the women’s service “freed them [the men] to pursue more self-interested activities and underpinned the operation of capitalism” (Baker 2012, 339). In consequence, domestic work gave rise to the view that – for women – it “represented something that must be ‘left behind’ in order to achieve emancipation” (Baker 2012, 341).  

That notwithstanding, the ideology of domesticity has a potential to break free from that type of gender ideology underlying the MBI. Närvi (2012, 454) conjectures that “(h)aving small children to take care of and to provide for might underpin home-centeredness, and not just in case of women.” New models of the division of labor addressing the balance of the time spent by family members or couples for work-life and family-life point in this direction. One idea is that families or couples with young

---

12 Homosexual couples often maintain role-specific responsibilities accruing from gender ideology.

13 As Baker (2012, 340) refers to a backlash position to the feminist anti-domestic stance reporting that (young) women are encountering a new fascination for the domestic which “cannot simply be dismissed as false consciousness and, as such, understandings of domesticity should be freshly conceptualized in a changing social landscape.”
children should be given the opportunity to work less in this phase of their life and to work more in later phases in which the children have grown up. It can be assumed that the decision negotiated for by individuals, or made by the couple, reflects the particular interplay of individual preferences on the one hand and the pre-existing social structure and culture on the other.

If we look at family ideology from the perspective of liberalism, family ideology might be considered as the flip-side of domesticity. The industrial revolution emptied the social domain from its connection with the market place and gave rise to the impression that the family is a private, non-public sphere. The distinction, however, between the private and the public, or the idea that the government should/should not interfere with the private life, or should/should not become a market actor does not draw on gender ideology but on political and economic ideology. Although “contemporary liberalism is not incompatible with the notion of a socially embedded self” (Etzioni 2013, 2), communitarianism puts particular emphasis on the identification of valued forms of community: communities of place, of memory, and of face-to-face personal interaction (Bell 2012, 10 f.). Communitarian ideology thus provides a starting point for the discussion of the intersection of family ideology and the ideology of domesticity which goes beyond a dichotomic view of the private and the public (Etzioni 1993). Communitarianism has found implicit expression in Lewis’s (2003, 98) discussion of the “collective role of the state.”

Values and Hub Concepts that Link Ideologies

Political science, economics and philosophy share an early common history. From this origin, ideas and values have accrued embodied in concepts such as agency, freedom, justice, equality, or responsibility. The differences between classical and contemporary liberalism are indicative of the leeway given to the interpretation of historical ideas from the perspective of today. New strands of thought, which in part have been developed prior to the emergence of communitarianism, in part under its roof, have added to these interpretations.

Rawls’s (1971) “Theory of Justice” faced criticism because of its universalist stance, especially the western, liberalist perspective embodied in it. On the one hand, this criticism has added to the universalism-versus-particularism debate in ethics (Christman 2009, 12). On the other, it brought to the fore what the critics have called “Asian values,” which express some intersection with so-called “communitarian values” such as the special emphasis on family and social harmony (Bell 2012, 3); the duty children have to care for elderly parents (Bell 2012, 4); or the way social order and freedom are balanced (Etzioni 2013, 1).

Autonomy

As Christman (2009, 1) points to, “autonomy as a central value can be contrasted with alternative frameworks such as an ethic of care, utilitarianism of some kinds, and an ethic of virtue.” Autonomy is central to the Kantian understanding (model) of the person which also underlies Rawls’s theory of justice (1971). The clash between western and “Asian values” mentioned above results from the liberalist concept of the person (Christman 2009, 8 ff.). Freedom, i. e. the ability to act without being subject to internal and external constraints, refers to metaphysical preconditions of human action as well as to the conditions, resources and power which action requires. Personal autonomy is a trait that individuals can show with respect to all aspects in their life; thus, personal autonomy goes beyond moral autonomy. In both cases, autonomy runs contrary to all attempts to paternalistically invent into the decisions of other persons. Note that it is not a particular type of action but the justification given for it
that characterizes paternalism (Christman 2009, 7). Interpersonal paternalism does result from the patriarchal family; legal paternalism from state decisions (Feinberg 1971).

![Figure 1. Frameworks of Ideas and Values in the Field of Study](image)

**Agency**

The concept of agency is of particular importance in political science, economics, and ethics. It has found its way into discussions of gender roles and reflects changes of the life world or social realities which political, economic, or social agents might face. Kleinaltenkamp et al. (2012) point to the prominent role of agency in the context of resource integration. They acknowledge that both individuals and organizations are resource integrators. Human agency is “seen as the ability of self-reflexive actors to act with choice” (Kleinaltenkamp et al. 2012, 194). It needs actors with agency (resource integrators) who make use of resources in order to integrate them (see Kleinaltenkamp et al., 194, Figure 1).

Liberals do not have to deny the assumption that individual choice and action take place within a framework given by society or the impact of culture, respectively (Bell 2012, 7; see Hayek (1976, 15) for the view that individualism is a theory of society). Liberals put emphasis on freedom and individual diversity, assume that choice is intrinsically valuable, and have to choose between freedom and equality (Bell 2012, 6). Compared with the liberalist view, communitarians have to choose among the “many valued forms of communal life in the modern world” (Bell 2012, 10, italics in the original).

---

Responsibility
Responsibility presumes agency and, with it, voluntariness, sciencer, and volition (Eshleman 2009). This paper is not interested in the ethic of responsibility as such. We refer to the definition of the concept of responsibility as an n-digit relation (Höffe 2010). In particular, we refer to the variables in this definition: the subject of responsibility (e.g., the caretaking mother), the object of responsibility (e.g., the care toward family members), the instance of responsibility (specified as differently as exemplified by God, the conscience, nature and history, or stakeholders), and the principle(s) or criteria which specify why somebody is responsible. The concept of responsibility refers to ethical or non-ethical principles or criteria to justify the responsibility of an actor. These principles draw on ethical or non-ethical knowledge which, in case, of the MBI, can be substituted for gender ideology. The view that the female is primarily responsible for household duties and/or child care can be the result of such a substitution.

From the perspective of today, the MBI still delimits the range of responsibility of women to the household. The “mix of ideologies” behind this limitation however has turned into a subject of social change. Whereas feminism has made responsible the impact of “received ideas” (Cheal 1979) for the practice of male breadwinning, post-feminism argues that women often do not decide pro MBI but against the loss of liberty subsequent to the contracts of labor. Whereas bargaining (market) transactions are characterized by a relationship of legally equals, managerial transactions produce wealth (products and services) through the interaction of legal inferiors and superiors (for the distinction of bargaining and managerial transactions, see Commons 1931). The contract of labor allowing the employer to dispose of the working power of the employee is always related with a restriction of the employee’s personal freedom. It is assumed that women facing full agency have voluntarily chosen not to join the labor force. According to this view, women who not join the labor force are not considered to fulfill social expectations, or to realize “received ideas” (Cheal 1979), or to enact a social practice. Another aspect that can be brought to the fore in this regard is the pressure accruing from “ideal worker norms” (Haddock and Bowling 2001) and the wish for maintaining the work-life balance agenda (Baker 2012; Tremblay 2012). Against this backdrop, it can be argued that women have simply (and rationally) chosen the exit option (Hirschman 1970).

Models of family have been discussed in terms of responsibility (see Lewis 2003, 107). Basically, responsibility can be assumed for oneself or shared either among family members or among family and community. For this reason, convictions about the way responsibility is (should be) shared within

---

15 In Germany 1977 the rule of law was repealed that legally prescribed the role division for married heterosexual couples. In her schedule documenting the most important changes in family law and family-related transfers, Gerlach (1996, 207, Table 6) made the entry “abolition of the ideal of house wife marriage in the German Civil Code” (Aufgabe des Leitbildes der Hausfrauenehe im BGB). Note that this rule of law was not applied in the decades prior to its abolition.
16 Today in most of the US it is just accepted that women will work should they so wish, regardless of economic consequences for the large part. It is politically incorrect to not provide opportunity for women to grow and develop in their chosen ways.
17 Cummings (2012) claims that the wage gap among the sexes “is due to the various individual choices that man and women make with regard to compensation and labor-force participation.”
couples or families, or between families and communities, are indicative of the impact of the MBI. They are also an effect of political ideology. Eichler’s (1977) discussion of three models of family is an example for the connection of “responsibility” with both family ideology and political ideology:

(i) Patriarchal family: agency is granted only to men who, consequently, are then also responsible for the consequences of the actions undertaken by them. Women, even if conducting housework, cannot be made responsible for it (or its consequences) because they don’t possess the freedom that agency presupposes.

(ii) Equal responsibility: men and women are assumed to take equal responsibility for economic and care contributions in families.

(iii) Social responsibility: the public shares responsibility with parents for the care of dependents.

Gender ideology in general and the idea of male breadwinning in particular seem to create a patriarchal family. The combination of domesticity and gender ideology creates a primary responsibility of women for household and child-rearing activities which is still found alive in the disproportionate responsibilities among couples (Baker 2012). On the one hand, even if both partners conduct paid labor, women do most of the unpaid labor at home.\(^{18}\) Shared responsibility within couples is thus not tantamount to equally shared responsibility. On the other hand, in the same vein as in the argument above, the conjunction of work-life balance agenda and post-feminism has understood women’s disproportionate responsibility for the majority of housework as a consequence of their personal (rational) choice (Baker 2012, 342 ff.). Therefore, the remainings of gender ideology are still present in self-declared equal-responsibility partnerships.

Political ideology exerts influence on the type of shared responsibility which individuals (or couples) might assume for themselves: What is named “social responsibility” by Eichler implies that agents accept a potential part played by “the public” for the care of dependents. This part might be very different in nature: it may stretch from the idea that the government shall provide facilities for care taking (meaning that the government helps parents who possess full agency to execute their free will) to the acceptance that adequate child care or education cannot be provided by the parents. Note that political ideology might have infiltrated public opinion and shaped social practices in a different way in different countries. In Germany, for example, the MBI is compatible with the acceptance of public schooling whereas public schooling has been put into question in the US to a higher degree.

The Impact of the Male Breadwinner Ideology on Marketing Systems

Actors make choices which are based on both knowledge and ideology, among other grounds not of interest for this paper. The male breadwinner ideology (MBI) has shaped marketing systems with regard to the following aspects:

\(^{18}\) A recent German study conducted by the Allensbach Institute (Allensbach 2012) reports that 70% of women are the only one responsible for homework. Women might feel more comfortable in a situation of “role overload” (Reilly 1982) than in one that delimits their responsibility to the household. “Super moms” who worked while still being the household manager, of which ‘housework’ was but one part, were found to be happier because they were working, which not only means bringing in money but also socializing with adults and developing one’s self intellectually. In Germany, however, the experience of the Müttergenesungswerk tells a story of women who suffer from the additional work load resulting from their participation in the labor market (Heidenreich 2012).
(i) The MBI is related to whether individuals are given the opportunity to get access to resources which can be only achieved through paid labor; with it, the MBI influences the type and number of “players” in markets and in organizations which act on markets.

(ii) The MBI has an impact on the type of offerings wished-for as market offerings (compared with non-market “offerings” resulting from household production). Thus, the MBI plays a part in the discussion about the provision of care for children and elderly. From an economic perspective, the MBI can be translated into a preference for household production over services provided by non-profit organizations (including governments) or for-profit organizations in the field of health and care-related services. In Germany, for example, the two big churches (the Diakonie in case of the Protestant church; the Caritas in case of the Catholic church) have taken over responsibility for the provision of social services which are granted by today’s state or social security system. Both the Caritas and Diakonie do not produce the requested service themselves in all cases, but also subcontract with private suppliers in the market on a regular basis. If the Caritas or Diakonie has chosen the “make option,” the service is offered by itself (a non-profit organization); if the Caritas or Diakonie has chosen the “let make option,” the service is usually offered by a for-profit organization (which is then active in the non-profit sector).

(iii) The MBI plays a part with respect to the type and the degree of governmental contributions which are accepted or wished-for in a marketing system. Thus, the MBI is related to the distinction of private and governmental contributions to the social good, and it is also a public policy issue. As the implementation of the Betreuungsgeld in Germany shows, ideologies are among those issues which influence the design and change of institutions, organizations, and practices. Beginning in August 2013, the Betreuungsgeld (monthly 100 to 150 Euro depending on the age of a child) shall be paid to families who keep their one or two-year old children at home, i.e. are not making use of public kindergartens.

The MBI can be considered as an instance of a traditional but outdated framework of ideas that (at least in the West) has been conceived of as delimiting the development of marketing systems in order to provide market solutions for care-related problems:

- Since the early 1970s, the socio-economic conditions related to the 3Ms (male, manual workers, manufacturing industry, see Brown 1987, 2) are decreasing;
- Short-time employment, poor compensation, and flexibilization of work (Lewis 2003, 107) are not harmonious with the idea that one spouse can guarantee the family income for decades;
- Shortage of skilled labor asks for women’s participation in the labor market;
- Changes in the demographic structure of the population require a professionalization of care (choice of the let-make option from the perspective of the care-demander) or the professional support of families which still provide care-related service to some degree (make and let make);
- The number of elderly who want to maintain their autonomy is increasing; the potential for a market provision of care-related service is increasing as well. In many societies today, especially those based on agricultural, grandparents handle childcare while parents work. It

19 Both organizations were founded in the 17th century and have provided the service for a long time even before the “rule of the law” has begun to grant this.
20 See Kleinaltenkamp (2005) for a detailed discussion of differentiations of the “make-and-buy” decision in the light of property rights theory.
is becoming more common in the US with various generations losing jobs and extended families living together more than pre-2008.

- Education of children from families with migration backgrounds or from other socially weak families requires professional support of the parents by specialized organizations or teachers.

Liberalist views assume that social entities such as marketing systems shall be designed or governed in accordance with the preferences of individuals. In Germany, the Allensbach Institute (Allensbach 2012) has reported that 32% of mothers wish to get (more) support from domestic aid or their partners. Personal autonomy undergirds the view that actors should have a choice between either make or let make on the one hand, and make and let make, on the other. With respect to child care, the make option means that child care is provided within the family. The MBI narrows this down to the single responsibility of the mother or a female household member. The let-make option means that the parents demand professional support for the child-caring activities. This support can be publicly or privately provided. The last option, make and let make, expresses that make and let make are basically non-exclusive, i.e. parents may demand only part-time child care.

The policy of organizations, private as well as public firms and households, plays a part with respect to the amount individuals can realize their preferences. Organizational governance structures might create preconditions which allow both parents to practice equally shared responsibility. A central result of the Allensbach study (Allensbach 2012) is that 50% of males prefer to work less, and 37% of males opt for more flexible time schedules at work. A change of the policy of organizations allowing more flexible working hours can initiate or make possible modified practices not only within organizations but also in families (including social communications) which might lead to a change of the personal experiences (according to Figure 2 a meso-micro level interaction). Such new or additional personal experiences may lead to a change or modification of individual belief systems, the way individuals engage in social communication, and subsequently may lead to a modification of patterns of behavior and ideologies even at the macro level (see Figure 2):

![Figure 2. Social Structure and Individual Choice (see Coleman 1990)]
Values like equality and justice demand that women (and men as well) ought to have a choice based on private or public provision of a service (Lewis 2003, 104). The above-mentioned options can only be chosen if the required infrastructure (marketing system including public and private suppliers) is available, and if the service quality is adequate in all ways of provision. There is probably no general answer to the question if a particular service shall be offered by the government (or its subcontractors) or the private sector (as in the case of the German Caritas or Diakonie, if the agents of the government subcontract with private suppliers, the distinction between public and private supply of a service can begin to blur). Therefore, although it might turn out to be important that the option for the agents is a transactional one, i.e. not coined by legal paternalism, ceteris paribus it might be less important if the provider is a governmental agent or not.

Culture, social practices, and ideologies coin the structure and potential of markets and marketing systems. Liberalist views do not require that marketing systems or economies are designed in a particular, e.g., wealth creating way – if this way is not expressed in the preferences of individuals. Public policy makes “design offers” with regard to the contributions of citizens (taxes, fees), the rules of the game (institutions) and the part it promises to play in the game (as a player and/or ruler). In a democratic political system, the citizens make their decisions concerning the design of marketing systems in a double way: they decide via elections in the political sector and they vote via their choices in the economic sector. Those actors working on the making of marketing systems can build their decisions on information about past behavior of actors and adaptive expectations. However, entrepreneurial spirits and innovation can create the opportunity for actors (customers) to make new experiences and thus to get into touch with modified practical ideas.

The study of ideologies can be used to bring home the message that ideologies unfold their effect in a two-fold manner: 1) as objective mental entities, ideologies are part of the social structure, but 2) as subjective belief systems, they underlie the formation and change of individual value systems and/or preferences. Individualization theories and theories of social structure express no simple dualism (Närvi 2012). As the interactionist strand in sociology has shown, social structures can be transformed if actors learn new patterns of interpretation (Kelle 2005, 113). Based on their beliefs, values, and preferences, individuals may vote for changes in the institutional structure.

Research Design
Our analysis draws on the assumption that there is an interplay of macro-phenomena (structural phenomena) and micro-social processes: ideologies as objective mental phenomena influence the individuals’ interpretation of social reality, the decisions made in the private and public arena, and the activities accruing from these decisions. We are not interested in the explanation of the macro-phenomena per se. We are interested in the presence of particular ideologies, in the way these are linked to each other and influence micro processes, on the one hand and the restrictions as well as the potential that these ideologies can unfold for marketing systems. For this reason we aim at the development of a model by means of which data can be investigated which are indicative for the prevalence of particular ideologies, and in their structural influence on micro processes.

As already addressed in the introduction, following Warren (2007) we make a distinction between the phenomena to be represented (MBI) and the presentation (MBM). Warren also distinguishes between objective and subjective dimensions of the concept, pointing out that the most sociological studies have mainly studied its objective dimensions (e.g., the impact of demographic data, income, gender, region of provenance). There is thus a research gap in sociology with respect to the
subjective dimensions of the concept. Our study therefore focuses on them as well as on the interplay of subjective and objective dimensions.

In the next section, we present a research design built on the combination of a pre-study and a subsequent factorial survey (vignette study). The pre-study was thought to identify subjective dimensions of MBI in Germany.

**Pre-study on Male Breadwinner Ideology in Germany**

Based on interviews conducted in a pre-study in summer 2010, we identified a specific set of ideas and values constituting the actual MBI in Germany. In the following, we describe the research methodology, refer to the results and how these provide the “input” for the development of our male breadwinner model (MBM).

Over a period of two years in-depth interviews (Thompson, Locander, and Pollio 1989) have been conducted with 13 heterosexual couples in East and West Germany. Seven couples grew up in the West, five in the in the East and one couple is mixed. The definition of “growing up” was that a person had to have spent at least the first 16 years of his/her life in either West or East Germany (See Table 3, attachment). Every couple has been interviewed at least twice. Using a theoretical sampling approach, the first set of interviews was truly exploratory in the spirit of grounded theory (Glaser and Strauss 1967) eliciting informants’ feelings, experiences and thoughts about family living and family policy in Germany. Upon review of early interviews additional areas of investigation were selected and others dropped. The values behind the traditional MBI as well as couples’ feelings towards actual family policy instruments came into sight as tentative cores.

The second set of interviews was more focused and guided by the tentative core that emerged in the first set. Also, the interviewing process was informed by the relevant literature. In turn, analysis of the data suggested which literature is relevant. This process should facilitate a deep immersion into the area of exploration and find a balance between inductive and deductive reasoning (Clarke 2005; Strauss and Corbin 1998). In order to assure anonymity, which has been promised to all participants, all names have been changed. No incentives were offered for taking part in the interviews. The transcribed interviews were analyzed on the basis of a hermeneutically grounded interpretive framework (Thompson 1997). The verbatim quotes were independently back translated.

The results of the pre-study helped to identify the central values behind the MBI as well as the linkage of male breadwinning with gender, family and policy. In addition, the results pointed to conflicts among the value systems having their origin in different but overlapping ideologies. As the data show, the interviewees seem to hold contradictory values: On the one hand, they opt for more governmental support (financial transfers as well as investments into the infrastructure of child care); on the other they are against governmental interventions into family matters – especially interviewees who grew up in the restrictive political system in the former German Democratic Republic (DDR) were sensitive in this regard. For a detailed presentation of the results of this pre-study, see the attachment. The pre-study’s findings are summarized in the first version of the MBM (Figure 3):
Contradictory values result from the matter of fact that MBI grounds in overlapping ideologies and therefore in the presence of different ideologies. Ideologies do not have to fulfill a consistency condition; therefore, the values underlying ideologies constituting a particular framework such as the MBI can contradict each other. Against the backdrop of our previous analysis, however, it can be shown that the values held by the interviewees are only prima-facie contradictory.

The data point to two value conflicts and they give also a hint to how the agents are trying to solve them. The first one has its origin in the overlapping of political and ethical ideology; the second one a conflict between gender (mother) ideology and political ideology.

- Value conflict 1: Personal autonomy and an anti-paternalistic stance toward the government go hand in hand; “more or less government” is thus a wrong juxtaposition. Governmental support in form of financial transfers does not intervene into personal autonomy (the Elterngeld as well as the Betreuungsgeld fits smoothly in that); the same can be said with respect to infrastructure investments by the state in form of child care centers (in kindergartens, schools, etc.) of which parents can make use on a transactional basis.

- Value conflict 2: Some interviewees have glorified the role of the mother (the mother is the best care taker), on the one hand and called for more child care centers, on the other. Gender
ideology can go hand in hand with the choice of – from the perspective of mother ideology – the second-best option, namely the let-make option with respect to child care. If several values are in play, then individuals need to be able to rank them – otherwise they would lose their ability to act. As the data indicate, cultural differences might have an impact on the values itself as well as on their ranking: Women who grow up up the former DDR seem to show more interest in continuing their careers after their children have reached a particular age.

The data also show that there might be a gap between a particular (measurable) behavior of individuals and the values they hold. This is indicative of a value conflict the solution of which does not only depend on the individuals’ – unconstrained – ranking of values and the occurrence of situations which do not change the order of values in the ranking but the to individuals (or families) available choice options. Of the 21 couples interviewed, there were six where both had full time jobs, eight where one spouse (the male) had a full time job and his partner had a part time job, five where the male was the only income provider, one where both had a part time job, and one where both had no jobs. More interestingly, of the six couples where both had full time jobs, three were – at least in part – supporting some of the values behind the MBI (see the left box in Figure 2). Seven of the eight couples where one spouse (the male) had a full time job and his partner had a part time job were supportive of some of the values behind the MBI. We interpret these (very preliminary) results so that couples who organize their lives in a way that both have jobs might still be supportive of the MBI.

**Model construction**

From the pre-study, and the analysis built on it, results a more specific model of the ideologies constitutive for the male breadwinner ideology:

It is one aim of our theoretical research to identify the ideologies behind the MBI. According to Figure 3, MBI is an outflow of gender ideology. Gender ideology, however, is assumed to be linked with political ideology (which is related with economic ideology) and the ideology of domesticity. The model shall also be used for the identification of overlapping ideologies.

**Factorial Survey and Data Analysis**

Based on theoretical assumptions and previously identified values that point to different interacting forms of ideology, the influence of individual beliefs or practical ideas (Cheal 1979) related to MBI is further investigated using a factorial survey or vignette analysis (see Jasso 2006; Rossi and Anderson 1982). Generally, the method combines the advantages of an experimental design, allowing us to study causal effects, with features of a traditional survey. Instead of answering item-based questions respondents are presented with descriptions of hypothetical situations, so-called “vignettes,” which are applicable to study decisions for intentional action as well as the influence of values and norms on decision-making under concrete conditions. Vignettes are composed of different variables (dimensions) which are assumed to influence the judgment. By systematically varying each dimension their independent impact can be estimated. The experimental variation offers the opportunity to isolate the weight of different, over-arching ideas, which we assume to have an influence on male breadwinning behavior and which are basically confounded (not isolated) in reality. The multidimensional descriptions correspond to everyday situations where individuals decide, judge or evaluate on different kinds of information (Wallander 2009).
The operationalization of the independent variables, types of beliefs or practical ideas behind male breadwinning (deduced from theory and the pre-study), is shown in Table 1. To measure the influence of gender, respondents have to evaluate the situation from the viewpoint of the mother (Sandra) and the father (Thomas). One of the parents is offered a part-time employment, while the other parent is working fulltime. The variable is included to see if especially females are expected to take further care of their child and if this evaluation differs among female and male respondents. As an extension of our first pre-study described above, economic incentives and ideas are operationalized as personal fulfillment on one hand, and income benefits for the family on the other. The political dimension refers to the evaluation of public interference and is operationalized as the provision of childcare, offered by a public institution (common in Germany) or a private provider. As a last dimension, the advice of family members and acquaintances is included in the given situation to see if group ideology, or perceived ideas, exerts an influence on the judgment of the vignettes. All independent variables are constructed as dichotomous variables.
The Relevance of Male Breadwinner Ideology for the Analysis and Design of Marketing Systems

Haase et al

Table 1. Operationalization of Independent Variables

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Individual beliefs or practical ideas related to MBI</th>
<th>Operationalization Dimensions</th>
<th>Levels/Attributes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Gender Roles</td>
<td>Sex</td>
<td>(1) female (Sandra) (2) male (Thomas)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Economic Incentives (Individual level)</td>
<td>Personal professional fulfillment</td>
<td>(1) he/she doesn’t really like the position offered (2) he/she likes the position offered a lot</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Economic Incentives (Collective level)</td>
<td>Development of household income</td>
<td>(1) would increase slightly (2) would increase significantly</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Political Interference</td>
<td>Provision of childcare</td>
<td>(1) public kindergarten (2) private kindergarten</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Family Values</td>
<td>Marriage</td>
<td>(1) not married couple (2) married couple</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peer-Group Norms</td>
<td>Influence of family members and acquaintances</td>
<td>Family members and acquaintances think (1) he/she should continue taking care of the child (2) he/she should start working again</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

An example for a vignette is given in Figure 5. Each scenario consists of six dimensions at two levels21, what makes it possible to construct a universe of $2^6 = 64$ vignettes. Since all combinations offer a realistic description, no contradictory scenarios had to be excluded. In order to obtain multiple ratings on each vignette while avoiding overstraining respondents, vignette samples (so-called “decks”) were drawn from the complete universe. Vignettes were randomly assigned to one of eight decks (sampling without replacement), so that each respondent had to rate a total number of eight vignettes, followed by short questions on respondent-specific, individual characteristics, basically in reference to partnership and their current household situation.

---

21 The equal number of 2 levels each reduces the experimental design and allows to avoid that dimensions with higher levels exert a greater influence regardless of the content itself.
(Survey Introduction:) Please try to put yourself into the position of each person. Evaluate how the person should decide under the given circumstances. Varying features of the situations are underlined.

Situation 1
Thomas and Sandra are an unmarried couple. In the last three months Sandra took care of her one-year-old child. Now she is offered a part-time employment. She doesn’t really like the position offered. Thomas, the father, is working fulltime. If Sandra accepts, childcare could be provided by a public kindergarten that the parents don’t know. With the additional money earned minus childcare expenses, their household income would increase significantly. Family members and acquaintances think that Sandra should start working again.

How should Sandra decide given these circumstances?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sandra should continue to raise her child</th>
<th>Sandra should take the job</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>□</td>
<td>□</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>□</td>
<td>□</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>□</td>
<td>□</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>□</td>
<td>□</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 5. Example of a Vignette

Before we started to collect data from parents, the survey had been tested with students in the course of Advanced Lectures in Business Administration and Economics at the Friedrich-Alexander Universität Erlangen-Nürnberg. Out of 56 questionnaires, where all vignettes were evaluated, one had to be dismissed. Thus, 55 students participated, with women overrepresented by 65.5 percent. Each respondent rated eight scenarios, resulting in a total of 440 evaluated vignettes. Most of the students (69.1 percent) found it “very easy” to “partly easy” to assess the different scenarios. In general the means of the vignette judgments revealed a slight tendency toward “start working”, even more distinct for female respondents. A linear regression with robust standard errors showed that particularly “liking the job” and an “increase in household income” had a highly significant effect on the decision to start working again. Slightly significant, the tendency to rate for working increased when the situation of the mother Sandra was displayed. For the sample of students further effects of marriage, childcare provision and the advice of peers failed to reach statistical significance.

The primary aim of this study was not to conduct a representative study based on the proof of hypotheses derived from a model or theory. This study is one step prior to the test of hypotheses. It aims at the estimation of the model, i.e. the assessment of its theoretical assumptions. For this reason, the members of our sample did not have to be representative of the entire population; therefore, a non-probability convenience-sampling was appropriate. Concerning internal validity, the rather homogenous sample of parents – as indicated by the descriptive results in the following section – reduces the
influence of confounding variables: other factors that are not experimentally varied in the vignettes, but affect the relation between the independent and dependent variables.

Until now 37 parents, 27 females and 10 males have been interviewed in public kindergartens in the area of Erlangen and Nuremberg (Bavaria, Germany). Despite the vignette dimensions there is a general tendency towards start working, even more distinct for male (mean 4.55) than female (mean 4.13) respondents. The majority of the parents (91.9 percent) we interviewed are married or in a relationship. Except for three participants, who refused to answer, 34 respondents have at least one child younger than seven years. During the last ten years, all of the respondents lived in urban areas. They grew up in western Germany, the majority of them (72.9 percent) in Bavaria. 73.0 percent of the parents graduated from university. All of the respondents have at least a secondary school certificate. We carefully relate this finding to a prior selection bias: those parents with a higher education or a university degree are most likely to support and take part in scientific research.

Of the sampled population only 13.5 percent found it difficult to evaluate the vignettes. We expect all parents to be familiar with the scenarios described, what is – in terms of external validity – a necessary precondition given the hypothetical nature of vignettes and judgment of intentional action. Even if some methodological studies on external validity could show that under certain circumstances hypothetical judgments on vignettes correspond with actual behavior (see Nisic and Auspurg 2009, Louviere et al. 2000), it is basically argued that the judgments should be “within the competence of the target population” (Wagenaar et al. 2001, p. 347). We address further limitations of the methodology, seen as basis for continuing research, in the final section of this paper.

We estimated the effects of the independent variables (vignette dimensions) by using an ordinary least squares (OLS) regression model. The dependent variable – the intension to work after one year of parental leave – scored from 1 = taking further care of ones child to 8 = reenter the labor market again. The dependent variable was treated as continuous. The application of an ordinal regression model for non-continuous variables did not yield any different results. Because each respondent rated a number of eight vignettes, observations might be correlated, which is why we used Huber-White-Corrections for observations clustered by respondents.\(^{22}\)

To control for individual variables a random intercept model – where a subject-specific intercept represents the combined effects of personal characteristics on the vignette judgments (Abraham et al. 2010; Raudenbush and Bryk 2001; Snijders and Bosker 1999) – was additionally applied. In this case, the individual-specific component is constructed as a random variable (instead of a parameter to be estimated) and becomes part of the error term, which represents the unexplained heterogeneity between respondents (Rabe-Hesketh and Skrondal 2008, 91). Since the sample of parents is relatively homogenous in regard of demographics and social situation (see the descriptive results above), the individual characteristic failed to reach statistic significance. The same significant effects like in the OLS regression were reproduced by the application of the random intercept model.

The results of the OLS regression, effects of the vignette dimensions are shown in Table 2. Positive (negative) coefficients indicate a higher intension to reenter the labor market (to take care of one’s child) as the independent variable increases. The coefficients particularly implicate that parents’

\(^{22}\) An OLS regression would yield biased results with respect to the standard errors due to the multi-level structure of the data.
intension to reenter the labor market significantly increases with a positive evaluation of the position offered and an increase in household income. Both effects support our assumption that economic and professional (work-oriented) incentives are related to MBI. Traditional family values also showed a slightly significant effect on the decision to work. When partners are married the intension to restart working decreases. The reason might be a greater feeling of security related to marriage, thus an important determinant of MBI. The intension to restart working further decreases when a private, instead of a public kindergarten, offers childcare. Although this seems to be in accordance with a greater trust in public institutions and approval for public interference, the effect is not statistically significant. The estimation further indicates that parents’ intension to reenter the labor market decreases when the mother Sandra (in reference to the father Thomas) gets offered a job. Even if gender roles are expected to influence beliefs and practical ideas that underlie male breadwinning behavior, the variable failed to reach statistical significance.

To increase the number of evaluated decks we intent to interview 35 more parents in May 2013. Because we also want to examine, how individual characteristics influence the judgments of vignettes (although being aware that the results aren’t generalizable), we are going to survey more “heterogeneous” parents in regard of their social demographics and family situation. At this point of time the sample of well-trained and highly educated parents is quite similar to the sample of students, who also focused on the quality and earning of the position offered. Future research will concentrate on further beliefs and practical ideas that constitute male breadwinning ideology, by applying more complex experimental designs (more dimensions with a greater number of attributes).

Table 2. Linear Regression Analysis (with Robust Standard Errors) for Variables Predicting the Decision to Reenter the Labor Market, Interviewees: Parents

| Vignette Judgment | Coef. | Robust Std. Err. | P>|t| | [95% Conf. Interval] |
|-------------------|-------|------------------|----------|---------------------|
| Marriage (Ref.: unmarried) | -0.471* | 0.183 | 0.014 | -0.843 -0.099 |
| Gender (Ref: Thomas) | -0.179 | 0.204 | 0.386 | -0.593 0.235 |
| Job (Ref.: dislike) | 2.494*** | 0.329 | 0.000 | 1.826 3.163 |
| Childcare (Ref.: public) | -0.112 | 0.192 | 0.564 | -0.502 0.278 |
| Income (Ref.: slightly) | 0.864*** | 0.220 | 0.000 | 0.417 1.312 |
| Friends (Ref.: working) | 0.37 | 0.211 | 0.087 | -0.056 0.801 |
| Constant | 2.843*** | 0.276 | 0.000 | 2.282 3.404 |
| Observations (37 Interviewees) | 296 |

To account for dependent observations per respondent we used Huber-White-Corrections for observations clustered by respondents. Significance levels: p < .05*, p < .01**, p < .001***
Discussion, Conclusions and Outlook

Gender ideology and the way it overlaps with other ideologies is of interest for the understanding or explanation of market phenomena such as the labor supply of men and women, or the offering of particular services at markets. The design of marketing systems and the potential that these can unfold to the benefit of market actors, communities, or societies depend on knowledge about, or the understanding of, the interaction of macro-level structures and micro processes We assume that objective mental macro-phenomena such as ideologies have an impact on individual beliefs and individual action. Our research shall contribute to the informational “input” required for the design of public policy as well as for agents interested in the making of markets for care-related services.

The model presented in this paper is thought as a measure for the identification and analysis of ideologies at the macro level and their impact on micro processes.

We assume that the model can be improved with respect to the way the ideologies have found their expression in the variables (dimensions). In addition, we plan to conduct cross-country factorial surveys which will probably require taking into account further ideologies such as religious ideology.

There are several limitations to our study related to vignette studies in general. Vignette studies provide information about individual, subjective beliefs; like opinion research, they don’t inform the researcher about the actual actions which might follow belief and opinion. As vignette studies are experimental in type, the results are not assumed as being followed by action or behavior consistent with the expressed answers in the study. The results are thus not generalizable.

Gender ideology (and probably MBI) is a culturally widespread phenomenon; however, there are historical and local differences in the prevailing ideologies and the way they overlap. It needs therefore to be taken into consideration that the scenarios and dimensions which we have chosen particularly apply to the German context. Consequently, it might be necessary to modify the vignettes accordingly for cross-country surveys.
The Nature of Relationships in Market Processes
The Relevance of Male Breadwinner Ideology for the Analysis and Design of Marketing Systems
Haase et al

Attachments

Table 3. Information about Informants

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name, Age, Place of Origin*</th>
<th>Source of Income</th>
<th>Marital Status</th>
<th>Number of Children</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Jutta, 23, E and Lars, 25, E</td>
<td>Dual income, both work part time</td>
<td>Living together</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sabrina 27, E and Holger 33, E</td>
<td>Dual income, both work full time</td>
<td>Married</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gisela 25, E and Rudolf 26, E</td>
<td>Dual income, Rudolf full time, Gisela part time</td>
<td>Married</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ingrid 39, E and Wolfgang 44, E</td>
<td>Dual income, both work full time</td>
<td>Living together</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anette 43, E and Dieter 45, E</td>
<td>Dual income, Dieter full time, Anette part time</td>
<td>Married</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dorit, 33, E and Andi, 40, W</td>
<td>Andi sole breadwinner</td>
<td>Married</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Birgit, 23, W and Werner, 31, W</td>
<td>Dual income, Werner full time, Birgit part time</td>
<td>Married</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lisa 29, W and Bernd 34, W</td>
<td>Bernd sole breadwinner</td>
<td>Living together</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hanni 32, W and Franz 33, W</td>
<td>Franz sole breadwinner</td>
<td>Married</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sabine 30, W and Hans 33, W</td>
<td>Dual income, both work full time</td>
<td>Living together</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gudrun 36, W and Walter 38, W</td>
<td>Dual income, Walter full time, Gudrun part time</td>
<td>Married</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Babsi 40, W and Klaus 45, W</td>
<td>Dual income, both work full time</td>
<td>Married</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ines 38, W and Marcus 46, W</td>
<td>Dual income, Marcus full time, Ines part time</td>
<td>Married</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Place of Origin is whether the person grew up in West Germany (W) or East Germany (E)

Findings

The couples investigated expressed fond feelings towards the fundamental values behind the male breadwinner paradigm. At the same time they were supportive of public policy initiatives that are – at least on the surface - partly inconsistent with and contradictory to those values (see Fig.2).

The belief that government should stay out of family matters was broadly shared by interviewees.

“Our lives are already heavily regulated. As soon as I leave our home, driving to work means watching the speed limit, following all the rules. At work (Werner works at a financial institution) there are more laws and governmental regulations. My home and my family certainly don’t need more government” (Werner)

“I don’t want government telling me how to raise my kids. It is important to me that my kids learn the right things, the right values and so on. I mean it is up to me and Rudolf to teach our kids right from wrong” (Gisela).
“Government has no place in family affairs. Family decisions are personal decisions. I guess I should be free in my private life; and my family is a big part of my private life. We have to be able to do what we want at least when it comes to personal decisions. Government has to stay out of those things” (Franz).

Although informants expressed a strong sentiment against government involvement in family matters, they still were in support of building more child care centers.

“It’s almost ridiculous. First we did not get a place for our daughter at all. Now that we have a place, it is 35 minutes away from our home. More child care centers would really be helpful” (Sabrina).

On the surface, there is a contradiction. The call for more public child care centers indicates more government involvement. The same is also true for couples’ support for more Ganztagsschulen (schools that are open all day versus most public schools that are open only half of the day).

“I would like to take my job more seriously but there is absolutely no time. Marcus is at work at least until 5 or 6pm. So someone has to pick up our kids from school and help them with homework. It would be very helpful if we had more Ganztagsschulen” (Ines).

Apparently, parents hold a glamorized view of a family free of governmental interference. A free family becomes the symbolic antidote to a totalitarian society. Arguably, the shockwaves coming from the nightmares experienced during the Nazi regime can still be felt in couples’ fear of governmental control and their counterfactual romanticization and idealization of the free family.

“Once government starts controlling your family life – just as the Nazi’s did – it’s over. That would be the end of a normal life” (Marcus).

This glamorized view of government that stays out of family matters does not transcend into the requirements and needs of parents’ daily routines. That is, most couples expressed the wish for more governmental help with the daily grind of combining work and family life. The literature (Träger 2009; Dorbritz et al., 2005; Institut für Demoskopie Allensbach 2005) reports that Germans have high – higher in the East than the West – expectations of government to pursue an active family policy. People in West Germany look - beyond financial support - for better ways to combine rearing children and having a career, while people in East Germany are relatively more interested in child care facilities. This call for help - more child care centers and Ganztagsschulen - poses a potential conflict with another value behind the male breadwinner paradigm: The glorification of the mother as caretaker of the children. The mother mythos has been documented in the literature (Rosenbaum and Timm 2008; Kolinsky 1998; Letablier and Jönsson 2003; Kolbe 2002). Accordingly, the mother is irreplaceable in providing the best possible care for children.

“If push comes to shove no one can replace the mother. I am the first person my child interacts with when he wakes up in the morning. I am the last person he is with before going to bed at night. I am the person he shares his joys and grievances with. My love, attention, and support is what he depends upon most” (Lisa).
If the mother is assumed to be the best caretaker for children, the wish to transfer more care to governmental facilities via child care centers and Ganztagsschulen is not necessarily consistent with the wish to provide the best possible care. The mother mythos reflects a quixotic imagination of the ideal care taker. This idealization lost much of its relevance in daily life. Part of the apparent conflict might also be due to economic reasons. That is, even if the mother mythos is espoused from a normative perspective, a family might depend on two incomes.

“I much rather would stay at home and spend more time with my kids. However, without my salary we wouldn’t be able to pay the rent. I only go to work because I have to” (Anette).

While both couples from East and West had fond feelings of the idealized mother as caretaker, in line with the literature (Träger 2009; Rosenbaum and Timm 2008), having a job is potentially more important for East German than for West German females.

“I am staying at home right now with Mariechen until she is at least one year old. I would not feel comfortable having someone else watching her at such a young age. However, once she is older, I do not want to be a homemaker anymore. I want to go back to my job. I need to have other interests than raising a child” (Dorit).

Specifically in East Germany being a homemaker is associated with lower social status than being a breadwinner (Auth 2002). Also, while 37% of West Germans felt that family life is going to suffer if the wife has a job, only 12% of East Germans have the same reservations (Träger 2009). Still, most couples with the exception of some couples from the East felt that the husband should be the primary provider of the family. This basic value behind the male breadwinner paradigm – husband’s role as good provider - has been reported in the literature in Germany as well as in other countries (Träger 2009; Commuri and Gentry 2005).

“As a woman, I cherish and value economic security. It is a good feeling to know that I don’t have to go to work. I like to go to work but it is a relief that survival of my family does not depend on me working” (Gudrun).

“I really liked it when Dorit still brought home money. (Dorit stopped working after having a baby) The more money the better. In the end, I feel it is truly my responsibility to make sure we are fine financially. I would not be a good husband and more importantly, I probably would not be a real man, if our family solely depended on her” (Andi).

The male provider role reflects a deeply seated imagination of an idealized male role in society. This idealized role became in part counterfactual because the male is no longer the chief wage earner in many households.

Couples were supportive of the new Elterngeld. Again, on the surface, embracing the male provider role might be inconsistent with a regulation that mainly benefits dual income households. However, if the role of the good provider is more reflective of a symbolic value than of an actual norm that provides guidance, the apparent inconsistency vanishes.

“Of course I like Elterngeld. It is like a little gift. We get 60% of Dorit’s salary for one year even so she would have stayed home anyway. The basic idea of Elterngeld is to help families. This is a
good idea. However, it is also a big waste. Elterngeld has no impact on people’s decisions to have or not have babies, to work or not to work” (Andi).

In this interpretation the male provider role is not being threatened since Elterngeld is being seen as insignificant – albeit a $5 billion price tag per year – in terms of family decisions. In another more pragmatic interpretation Elterngeld provides helpful financial support for the first year of the baby.

“It is too expensive. The money we get from Elterngeld is needed to pay for the extra expenses of having a baby. Families with kids really need financial help” (Dorit).

There was mixed support – more from Western than Eastern interviewees - for the call for more equalitarian tax laws that do no longer privilege couples with one spouse making substantially less than the other. Some couples felt that the current law should be changed not only because it is genuinely unjust but also because government should not provide incentives for a specific form of living together.

“The tax law should definitely be changed. It is a joke. My husband and I work both very hard and have three children. We are practically subsidizing those stay at home wives. I guess that is what government wants: Couples should get married and the wife should stay at home” (Babsi).

Other couples were more lenient

“I think the tax laws are meant to support the family. I can see that the tax is also somewhat unfair but supporting families is a good and important goal overall” (Gisela).

On the surface, the call for more equalitarian tax laws is not necessarily consistent with the final value behind the male breadwinner paradigm: The ideal family is a married couple with children. Most interviewees had fond feelings towards this definition of an ideal family.

“I guess being married and having a couple of kids is the ideal family. You can live differently and you should be able to do so of course – but traditionally and what comes to mind as an ideal family is being married with kids” (Franz)

Again, the definition of the ideal family does not seem to reflect an actual norm – more than half of Germans live differently – rather it hints to idealized and romanticized form of organizing life together.

References

Books

**Periodicals**


**Online**


Towards a Sustainable Fashion System: Slow Fashion Movement

Zeynep Ozdamar Ertekin, Izmir University of Economics, Turkey
Deniz Atik, Izmir University of Economics, Turkey

Extended Abstract

The economic critiques of consumer society argue that consumers are driven to purchase continuously to keep the capitalist system alive. However, commodities are not only used to support the economic system of capitalism (Fiske 1989). Consumption, is also considered enjoyable and liberatory (Twitchell 1999; Shor and Holt 2000). Consequently, especially in Western societies, people have been spending to the detriment of their families, communities, and the natural environment. These excessive consumption patterns and trends of the 20th century resulted in pollution, waste, global warming, deteriorating environmental conditions and economic well-being (Taylor and Tilford 2000).

Fashion industry is one of the industries that have been related to the exploitation of both resources and people (Wilson 1985; McRobbie 1997; Beard 2008; Fletcher 2008; Morgan and Birtwistle 2009). The current fashion system requires rapid and continual changing of styles leading to frequent renewal of products, so that the market constantly grows (Wilson 1985). Thus, fashion has become a tool to increase sales and deliver economic growth (Fletcher 2010). This fast speed in fashion is the main characteristic of today’s textile and clothing industry. Speed of availability of updated looks, greater variety, and offering latest fashion trends at affordable prices make the industry attractive to many consumers (Joy et al. 2012). Therefore, “fast fashion,” which is pioneered by the Inditex Group and H&M, has become popular among many retailers. However, the current fast fashion system also raises some ethical issues (Aspers and Skov 2006 in Joy et al. 2012).

Fashion industry, especially clothing production, has been criticized for damaging the ecosystem and the environment, for contributing to depletion of natural resources, and for exploitation of garment workers, due to the appalling working conditions (Wilson 1985; McRobbie 1997). Fast fashion has also been related to the increase in textile waste, as it encourages disposability (Fletcher 2008; Morgan and Birtwistle 2009). Therefore, fashion is also criticized for creating artificial newness and obsolescence (Dardis 1974; Fiske 1989; Fletcher 2008). However, over the last thirty years, there has been a growing awareness of the impact of mindless fashion consumption on both people and the environment (Beard 2008). It may be time to re-design the current unsustainable fashion practice (Fletcher 2007; Clark 2008; Cataldi et. al. 2010).

The purpose of this study is to understand how the current fashion system and institution can be challenged and repositioned to become sustainable. Slow fashion has been selected as a context to analyze the emergence of an alternative fashion system and market because it provides a more holistic understanding of sustainable fashion by addressing social, economic and environmental issues (Pears 2006). Even though fashion is not only related to clothing, it has been mostly used to refer to clothing,
dress, and personal adornment (Wilson 1985; Davis 1992). Therefore, the scope of the empirical part of the study will be limited to fashion in clothing. Within this perspective, we examine how slow fashion market has emerged, how it can actually sustain itself, and what is keeping it from mobilizing or encouraging it to mobilize.

Assessing the dark side of fast fashion and alternative approaches to the current fashion system reveal that, awareness of the negative implications of fast fashion has been growing and there are increasing attempts to redesign the current unsustainable fashion practice. Slow fashion is one of these alternative fashion movements. Fletcher coins the term “slow fashion” to refer to this new philosophy of fashion, which is being mindful of the stakeholders’ needs and the impact fashion has on workers, consumers, and eco-systems (Fletcher 2007). Apart from being concerned with garment industry’s impact on the environment and resources, slow fashion also aims to reduce the number of trends and seasons and encourage quality production so that garments will have greater value as opposed to disposable fashion (Cataldi et al. 2010). Slow approach involves identifying sustainable fashion solutions by reformulating strategies of design, production, consumption, use, and reuse (Clark 2008). It incorporates taking a local approach to designing and making fashionable clothes; having transparent production systems with less intermediation between producers and consumers; and making sustainable and sensorial products that are highly valued and have a longer usable life (Clark 2008).

Fashion consumption and sustainability are often considered to be opposing concepts, since one of the role’s of fashion is to create product obsolescence (Dardis 1974). However, fashion can feel pointless now due to the madness in speed of fast fashion (Elgin 1993). People especially in Western industrial countries today, may want to slow down and have more time to enjoy life (Lasn 1999). Therefore, slow culture can be an opportunity to build longer-lasting change towards sustainability in fashion sector by offering more sustainable and ethical ways of approaching fashion (Clark 2008; Cataldi et al. 2010; Fletcher 2010). It may be possible to design a new fashion system that produces beautiful and conscientious garments while respecting workers, society, and environment (Fletcher 2008). Joy and colleagues (2012) further argue that luxury fashion and aesthetics will play a key role in this transition. The consumers who are disappointed with mindless consumption and its impact on society and the environment can now be motivated to support sustainable fashion practices (Beard 2008). It is possible that these consumers will start demanding unique pieces with higher quality that require more realistic production times (LeBlanc 2012). These consumers may be willing to pay a premium for such products (Joy et al. 2012).

It is still not easy to assume that slow fashion movement can eventually challenge the global dominance of fast fashion system, since the globalized fashion industry supply chain has become highly fragmented, complex and less transparent (Mihm 2010). Therefore, it is difficult to ensure that the whole system including the supply of all the components, the labor used to manufacture the garment, transportation of the garment from factory to retail outlet, its aftercare and disposal are according to ethical standards (Beard 2008). Moreover, most of the consumers are not aware that the clothes they make, buy, wear and discard are resource intensive, as they don’t see the carbon or water footprints (Goodwin 2012). Even if some fast fashion consumers share a concern for environmental issues they may still indulge in consumer patterns that are against ecological best practices (Joy et al. 2012). Aesthetics, cost, style, quality, color, negative perceptions, distrust, low availability, and desire for new clothes have been stated to be some barriers to supporting eco-fashion (Niinimäki 2010; Joy et al. 2012).
As a result, it may not be possible to label slow fashion as an oxymoron or to trust it to be the future of the fashion system. Creation of new markets and systems is much more complicated. It may be motivated by new philosophies that can create social changes and social structures. Similarly, based on the reviewed literature, it can be said that slow fashion has been driven by philosophical concerns. Furthermore, considering all the slow fashion practices and studies examined, it seems like slow fashion has emerged through institutional structures rather than through consumer practice. However, as the process of fashion entails complex interactions, exchanges, and influences among different people and institutions that are a part of the fashion cycle (Davis 1992), it may be better to consider the interplay between different actors, instead of pursuing a dichotomous view. In this regard, examining the roles of different actors in creation, diffusion, and sustaining the slow fashion movement and the points of conflict between institutions and stakeholders can help us to explain how slow fashion actor network is institutionalized and how slow fashion system can actually sustain itself.

References


Indigenous Business Development from a Network Identity Perspective

Daniel Schepis, University of Western Australia
Sharon Purchase, University of Western Australia
Nick Ellis, Durham University

Extended Abstract
The wellbeing of Indigenous groups and their relationship with the typically larger and more powerful non-Indigenous population remains a major issue in many countries around the world (Imas, Wilson and Weston 2012; Peredo and Anderson 2006). This can present unique managerial challenges for corporations that seek to interact with Indigenous people, some of whom may represent important stakeholders for the company. In Western Australia, the mining industry has taken an active role in engaging Indigenous owned companies and in doing so has implemented strategies to address issues relating to cultural differences and capacity shortfall. The approach taken by mining companies, which can be viewed as a strategic reaction to their perceived corporate social responsibility (CSR), alters the structural and processural characteristics of the network represented by the mining sector. This results in Indigenous businesses becoming embedded within the industrial network, and facilitates their ability to access resources and opportunities. The study of inter-firm relationships in this context offers unique insights from a network perspective as organizations adopt a collaborative approach within a traditionally competitive business network while seeking to satisfy often divergent objectives.

Contextual Background
Indigenous Australians are, on average, the most disadvantaged group in the country across most important socio-economic and quality-of-life indicators. A prevalence of health problems, poor early childhood development, poor living conditions and problems associated with violence and drug abuse in communities have been recognised as the key areas of disadvantage that are faced (SCRGSP 2009). Many Indigenous communities are felt to have become overly dependent on Government supported social security and funded initiatives or support from the philanthropic sector (Pearson 2000; SCRGSP 2009). It is widely agreed that economic development, specifically engagement with the mainstream economy through employment and Indigenous businesses ownership, is a pathway to improving wellbeing and livelihood in Indigenous communities (FaCHSIA 2011; Foley 2008; Martin 2003). While governments, the private sector and NGOs have made commitments to promoting Indigenous-owned businesses, at present, little is known about these Indigenous firms (Hindle and Moroz 2010).

Networks in Entrepreneurship
This research follows an IMP (Industrial Marketing and Purchasing) Group conceptual approach (Anderson, Håkansson and Johanson 1994; Araujo and Easton 1996) in considering entrepreneurial activities and behaviours within networks (Brüderl and Preisendörfer 1998). Entrepreneurship can be seen as embedded within a social context, and a company’s position within particular networks will channel and facilitate, or constrain and inhibit, the degree of this embeddedness (Aldrich and Zimmer 1986). Entrepreneurs utilise their networks to access and obtain the non-redundant resources they
Identity in Networks

Organizational identity as described by Weick (1995) is the collectively held frame through which an organization’s members make sense of their world. The term ‘network identity’ refers to how firms see themselves in the network and more broadly to how they, and the network in which they are embedded, are seen by other network actors and members of other networks (Anderson, Håkansson and Johanson 1994). In this research, we have also adopted the more focused conceptualisation of Huemer, Håkansson and Prenkert (2009, p.56) who coin the term ‘identities in networks’ to capture the combination of external and internal factors at play in the development of what they term a particular firm’s “position and identity”.

Method

Our contextualised study focuses on Indigenous business development within the Western Australian mining industry. Indigenous people are considered to be important stakeholders of this industry, given the connection they have to the land used in mining operations and particular legal rights they hold over development of this land. The research context can be considered rich and complex, including both Indigenous and non-Indigenous participants with diverse affiliations with the network. In total, 27 interviews were completed with 24 representatives of 16 different organizations. A combination of thematic analysis and discourse analysis was utilised to create an understanding of this particular network.

Findings and Discussion

This case indicates that, through the implementation of CSR plans relating to Indigenous stakeholders and specifically Indigenous businesses, the major mining companies have in effect established a distinct sub-network of the broader mining network with a unique structural and processual environment. This sub-network has its own rules and priorities through which Indigenous ‘content’ in tenders becomes more valuable, seemingly aimed at fostering an environment that encourages Indigenous business development and partnership with non-Indigenous companies. Increasing the attractiveness of indigenous firms has encouraged positional change by increasing the centrality of Indigenous companies. This increased centrality of the Indigenous companies and their closeness with major mining companies is also associated with distinct network process behaviour, namely with respect to tie direction and power.

Our analysis also suggests Indigenous companies fulfil a key role in the major mining companies’ CSR and stakeholder management agenda, acting as a bridging tie between the industry and the community. Due to their inherent indigeneity as well as the cultural legitimacy and strong social ties that Indigenous companies possess, they play an important role in connecting diverse sets of actors and facilitating exchange. The Indigenous contracting managers representing the mining company can also be seen to play a similar role, albeit from the other side of the relationship, fostering ties for Indigenous companies within the industry.

Within the overarching contextual environment in which the network operates, an additional layer of identity construction and organizational positioning is identifiable. The interview data revealed two contrasting discourses utilised by Indigenous business managers, one of connection to the
Indigenous community (either a specific group or in general) and the other of distance from the Indigenous community, and connection and affiliation with Western business values and practices. Connection was shown in two main ways; first by showing that they are a part of the Indigenous community and are therefore deserving of the support offered within mining companies' engagement strategies. The second discursive move is to show that they too are supporting economic development in the Indigenous community and in doing so constructing their organizational identity as being driven by altruistic (and inherently Indigenous) motivations of community development. On the other hand, Indigenous companies also show their alignment with the values of non-Indigenous companies by showing that their network position is not solely due to being Indigenous and also engaging in ‘othering’ of the Indigenous community. Indigenous managers seek to distance themselves from the problems associated with the Indigenous community and also elements within it that are in opposition to the models of economic development determined by the mining industry.

The strategies employed by powerful network actors can have a significant impact on the structure and process of the network, as actors engage in the process of identity construction that takes place to affirm the legitimacy of their positions. This research highlights the adaptive behaviour of other actors within this network in seeking to achieve organizational objectives and capitalise on newly created opportunities. The action taken by the mining companies can be considered a CSR strategy that acts to manage stakeholder and reduce the risk they pose to the organisation. By creating support for this development model within the Indigenous community, mining companies are able to amplify the benefits of mining and avoid intervention by the Government by way of regulation and legislation (Kapelus 2002). In taking this critical approach, we wish to present an alternate perspective and propose that these commercial network relationships should not be examined exclusively at the dyadic level as there are many further-reaching implications of corporate CSR that have both positive and negative effects on other network actors.

References


Exploring the Performativity of Marketing II

Abstract/Papers Included

Exploring the performativity of price representation practices in retailing
Johan Hagberg, University of Gothenburg, Sweden
Hans Kjellberg, Stockholm School of Economics, Sweden
Exploring the performativity of price representation practices in retailing

Johan Hagberg, School of Business, Economics & Law at University of Gothenburg
Hans Kjellberg, Dept. of Marketing & Strategy, Stockholm School of Economics

Abstract
Prices are often key aspects in discussion about markets and competition. Although market prices are represented in a multitude of ways, the work involved in generating these representations has so far received little attention. Inspired by the “performativity turn” in market studies, the purpose with this paper is to explore price representation practices and trace their consequences for the enactment of markets. Three empirical examples in the context of retailing are presented: price representations in consumers’ everyday life; a large-scale annual price investigation; and a market court price controversy. These examples illustrate that price representations are widely distributed and involve multiple sources, usages and effects. Further, it is suggested that price representation practices may have effects without being effective. The multiplicity of sources, usages and effects may be conceived as webs of translation, which can be used in order to further explore the performativity of market practices in mundane markets.

Keywords: price representation, market practice, performativity, market studies, retailing
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abstract/Papers Included</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| **International business models: Four electric vehicles cases**  
Morten Rask, Aarhus University, Denmark |
| **The innovation challenge: Achieving market superiority through new product development**  
A. Coskun Samli, University of North Florida, USA |
International business models: Four Electric Vehicles Cases

Morten Rask, Aarhus University, Denmark

Abstract – please mail mra@asb.dk for a full copy

The purpose of this paper to construct a theoretical framework for understanding international business models where location matters by integrating literature on business model innovation, internationalization of the firm, international entrepreneurship, international product strategy, international entry modes and globalization into a conceptual model supported by four electrical vehicle cases. The outcome is four types of international business models with each their specific strategic and entry mode elements.

Discussion, Conclusion and Implications

Location matters in all four types of international business models reflecting different strategy and entry mode elements. 1) The domestic-based business models try to overcome differences by a standardized strategic approach to domestic demand and supply markets through domestic sales, indirect export, direct international sales and local production activities. 2) The export-based business models also rely on domestic production and focus on an adaptive strategic approach to the globalized markets by means of direct export through agents and sales subsidiaries abroad. 3) The import-based business models focus on the domestic markets with a specialized strategic approach through import, contract manufacturing/outsourcing and production subsidiaries abroad. 4) The semi-global business models rely on the globalization of markets and production with coordination as the strategic approach to utilizing licensing, franchising, joint ventures and sales and production subsidiaries abroad.

The paper contributes to the literature about business models by using existing theoretical constructions from the international business field. As mentioned in the introduction, the concept of global business models is a widely used but not substantial concept. Likewise the international perspective on business models is rare in the literature but a common phenomenon in business. In order words, business model in a global setting has to take domestic and global downstream markets and upstream production into account because location matters. The substance of these international business models encompasses strategic as well as entry mode elements. The conceptual model illustrates possible paths in the process of internationalization through business model innovation, which is in line with internationalization of the firm understood as an innovation-decision process (Andersen, 1993; Rogers, 1962).

The models are supported by four illustrative cases from the Danish electric vehicle market to certain extend. All four cases are challenged by the strategy for handling distances, where standardization is difficult for CLEVER, coordination for Better Place, adaption for Renault and
specialization for ECOmove. This should be explored further in order to understand if these strategies are more a kind of strategic challenges than strategic drivers.

References


Christensen, T. B., Wells, P., & LianaCipcigan. (2012). Can innovative business models overcome resistance to electric vehicles?


ECOmove. (2013, March 23). ECOmove powers up the third prototype of the electric vehicle QBEAK. Retrieved April, 2013, from http://ecomove.dk/2013/03/prototype-electric-vehicle/


The innovation challenge: Achieving market superiority through new product development

A. Coskun Samli, University of North Florida, USA

Innovations are extremely critical for companies to maintain their market positions and for countries to generate positive economic growth. Currently, the industrialized countries are having difficulty in generating innovations that would change their economic conditions and enhance the existing quality of life. However, it appears that major corporations are suffering from inertia traps, in addition to not having an innovation culture within themselves as well as in their countries.

It is maintained in this paper that radical innovations, as opposed to incremental innovations, are necessary for companies and countries. It is also emphasized here that this will not happen unless there is major emphasis on industrial education leading to radical innovations. Radical innovation is a new product or service that did not exist before and it is likely to make a major difference in the prevailing quality-of-life. Radical innovations rely on imagination. Organization cultures must make good use of stimulated imagination. This article points out how that can be possible. The paper also makes a statement about the need for a pro innovation national strategy that will facilitate the development of radical innovations at the corporate level.

Key Words: economic growth, new product development, innovation, industrial education, radical innovation.
An Innovation Deficiency

In the 21st century the countries that are committed to reinventing their innovative capabilities are most likely to become economic and political leaders with expanding markets and improving quality of life (Kao 2007). However, this would call for more focus on education and major support for basic research and development which are not quite happening at this point in time (Friedman and Mandelbaum 2011).

Innovation studies in recent years have become a new scientific field (Fagerberg and Verspagen 2009). Much of the recent literature deals with innovation to overcome the global recession. The general idea is related to innovating unique and important products and exporting them, by doing so creating new industries and generating new markets. However, in a constantly changing and globalizing world this mission of innovation is much harder than it ever has been. Global competition, constantly increasing consumer information, global ethics, greening, and production efficiency among other forces are making global innovation more and more difficult but perhaps more and more necessary. Major innovations such as information technology have created many new jobs and facilitated emergence of new industries. The recent literature on innovation emphasized the triple helix i.e. government, education, and industry. The coordination among these three forces is extremely critical for powerful innovation activity to make a major contribution to economic growth. This paper deals primarily with education which is essential for any type information generation and innovation (Etzkowitz et. Al 2005).

Market superiority calls for establishing a competitive advantage which would entail special emphasis on competitiveness, goal achievement, decisiveness, goal orientation, productivity and enhancing market position (Appiah-Adu and Blankson 1998). Successful innovations can generate such superiority. Unfortunately, this is not happening. In recent years the lack of major innovations has created an innovation gap. Much needed market superiority is dissipating in many industries. In this article it is posited that above all negative issues it is totally necessary to develop an innovation culture within the country to meet the challenge of the innovation gap. It is also posited that most educational institutions are falling behind in major innovation related information development. There are a number of reasons for that. Current global recession is perhaps the first factor. Most governments and educational institutions have become most cost oriented in recessions, and many of them consider innovations as a hit or miss proposition (Kandybin 2009). Among other things, in recessions unfortunately most government cut down their R&D expenditures (Scott 2009). When the global economic environment is rather negative, it is even more important than ever before for countries to put strong fundamentals in place so that they can get ahead economically. The U.S. and European economies have lost some of their economic zeal which is translating in their declining innovativeness (WEP 2008). At the same time, BRIC countries (Brazil, Russia, India and China), are making steady progress. It is necessary for the industrialized countries of North America and Europe to develop a strategy to remedy the prevailing innovation challenge they are experiencing. In this article an attempt is made to develop a theoretical process that is more likely to facilitate major innovation in this very challenging atmosphere.

A Brief Look at Some of the Key Global Innovations

Perhaps first of all, it is necessary to make a distinction between incremental innovations versus radical innovation. Incremental innovation implies improving existing products in terms of their functionality, cost, and design among other features (Christensen 2003). For example, incremental...
innovations of typewriters have been standardized keyboards, portable typewriters, electric typewriters, and computer keyboards. This is comparable to Rogers’ (1983) continuous innovation concept.

On the other hand, radical innovation is generating a product that never has been in the market such as: steam engine, iron boat, locomotive or light bulbs among a myriad of others. They are typically based on disruptive technologies (Christensen 2003). This also is consistent with Rogers’ (1983) discontinuous innovation concept.

While incremental innovation may create product superiority, the radical innovation would generate market superiority. Product superiority is more temporary since global competition is very forceful, and strong competition will likely emerge very quickly. On the other hand, market superiority creates longer lasting market benefits since; particularly it carries the first mover advantage for profitability and provides a country the recognition for industrial leadership. But with industrial leadership comes economic growth and enhancement in existing quality of life (Samli 2011).

Although incremental innovation cannot be totally ignored, radical innovation is incomparably more beneficial to strive for. It is therefore maintained here that countries and companies must set up conditions to generate first and foremost radical innovations that will enhance their market powers and economic conditions in general. The author believes that proper industrial education leading to successful radical innovations do not take place without proper emphasis on industrial education and, even perhaps more important, industrial marketing activity.

Radical Innovations

A subjective view of radical innovations may indicate for instance, that the walkman created a new chapter in sports since it made it more enjoyable to run, roller skate and the like. Similarly, Lego created a major movement in children’s entertainment. The monopoly game made major contributions to adult and children entertainment. Better yet, electric motors and computers have made tremendous contributions to the prevailing quality of life. There are many such pace-setting radical innovations that can be named. The critical issue here is how an educational organization could set up the conditions for radical innovations.

In recent decades countries have taken the incremental route. Japan improved the quality and cost of cars, Germany has improved the engineering of technical products, France improved marketing of luxury products and Italy emphasized style of fashions. But none of these countries really introduced a radical innovation that changed life. Similarly, they do not seem to be putting enough emphasis on education that would facilitate a powerful innovation activity development.

Perhaps the U.S. may be credited for having more radical innovations, such as information technology, but these do not seem to be enough. In striving for leadership in the world and getting out of the current very deep recession, radical innovations more than information technology are almost a necessity. It is necessary, therefore, to explore how radical innovations are generated and maintained.

A General Model for Radical Innovations

Exhibit 1 is a simplified version of a very complex issue that would facilitate the development of radical innovations (Samli 2011). It is depicted in the exhibit that radical innovations are a joint product of imagination and creativity. Both of these features begin with proper education. In essence major breakthrough (radical) innovations involve high levels of intelligence without which the innovation gap cannot be eliminated (Glynn 1996). Why the distinction between imagination and creativity? Because it is maintained here that creativity could exist without imagination (Manu 2007). Creativity is managing knowledge as opposed to imagination which is creating the knowledge (Plsek 1997). Based on this
orientation, Exhibit 1 depicts how a radical innovation can be created by combining imagination and creativity. Whereas, just using the present knowledge generated incremental innovation based solely on creativity. Thus, while imagination is thinking out-of-the-box, creativity is thinking within the box. These two different orientations must not be confused because it would take different activities to cultivate imagination as opposed to creativity.

Exhibit 1: The Three Steps

```
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Imagination</th>
<th>Creating Knowledge</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Creativity</td>
<td>Managing Knowledge</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Innovation</td>
<td>Applying Knowledge</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
```

Thinking Out of the Box
Thinking within the Box
Solving the Problem


Provoking Imagination

Perhaps the most important stimulator of imagination is critical thinking, which is an ability to understand a system or a statement and respond to it (Osborn 1953). Here, words, events, social mega trends all can be utilized as a system and perhaps such a system may facilitate thinking of innovational possibilities. If imagination provoked properly it would deliver a question (or questions) the answer to which can be characterized as a radical innovation.

When the imagination generates critical questions, then creativity must take over and thinking becomes an exercise of managing the knowledge within the box. Thus the created knowledge with the efforts of imagination is managed through the constraints of creativity. But creating and managing knowledge are exercises in futility until and unless knowledge is applied (Plsek 1997). This application is in the direction of generating a radical innovation. Understanding electricity was not nearly as important until the development of electric motors. That was a major application of knowledge.

Implementing Innovative Ideas

Exhibit 2 illustrates the critical distinction between incremental and radical innovations. While incremental innovations create short lived product superiority, radical innovations create short lived product superiority, radical innovations help firms to establish market superiority that is likely to last a long time. Cultivating these two concepts and differentiating them from each other are extremely important and difficult educational challenges.
Before a radical innovation is developed, the imagination passed onto the creativity stage of an idea. This idea would lead to a radical innovation. This means that the innovative ideas need to be implemented, which is the application of the created and managed new knowledge.

Just how would an innovative idea be implemented? Hammer and Stanton (1995) proposed five innovation stimulators for that purpose. These are: incentive, information, intervention, indoctrination and involvement.

It is obvious that all of those who are involved in the implementation of the innovation must be given incentives to perform well in this critical undertaking. Those who are involved or need to be involved in a specific project must have the necessary information for that project. In order to manage the implementation of the innovation process moving smoothly and developing critical intervention at certain check points are necessary. Needless to say all who are involved in a specific project must be indoctrinated about the importance of the project and finally all must be fully involved and doing their very best for the success of the implementation of this project.

Exhibit 2: Radical Innovation Development

From Imagination to Action

As can be seen in Exhibit 2, if the innovation process begins with a provoked imagination and activates creativity, there is a good chance of bringing into existence a major innovation that is most likely to be radical and powerful in terms of making a global statement.
Just what would it take to facilitate this process? This author believes that there is much activity and consideration needed before the innovation challenge could be faced. These are pre-innovation activities. The pre-innovation activities can be analyzed in two major stages, societal and managerial. The Societal Stage: it is imperative that the society in some ways can be labeled as an innovative culture, which means it not only encourages innovational explorations but makes innovations possible by basically creating imagination challenges and make them become realities by the society’s growth engine, which is fueled with basic research (Slywotzky 2009). Thus, educational institutions must make an attempt to bring theory and practice together. This research protocol requires not only lots of well trained people with advanced education and deep curiosity, but also proper research infrastructures such as lab support, equipment and instrumentation since innovations do not happen overnight. But more than all of these, an innovation culture will call for open communication among peers, a major tolerance for risk, ability to think, and will attract and reward the best minds (Slywotzky 2009).

Along with many industrialized countries, the U.S is finding it difficult to maintain an innovation culture. For instance Bell Labs, which have generated numerous radical innovations, had 30,000 employees as recently as 2001. Today, however, it has only 1,000 employees. Similarly, in 2000 U.S corporate venture funds that tapped outside innovation was about $16.2 billion, in 2009 that figure went down to $1.3 billion (Bloomberg Business Week 2010). The similar patterns are experienced in E.U with much sharper fluctuations. If radical innovations do not take place, high paying jobs and increased global economic well-being cannot be sustained. Generating technological trends is a long term proposition and without the societal stage that is functioning adequately, it will be impossible to generate radical innovations.

The Managerial Stage: The managerial stage will never materialize without the first societal stage being fully functional. But even if it is fully functional, the managerial stage which takes place at the corporate entity must begin in the labs of higher education, but when they find their way in the corporate entity they must have a basic corporate culture before the radical innovation stream can materialize. Here another educational challenge is identified. However, the great oligopolies of America’s private sector in general do not have much interest in devising fundamentally new ideas (Reich 2007). Similarly, Christensen (2003) maintained that good companies fail not only because of dysfunctional bureaucracies, arrogance, poor planning, inadequate skills, and resources, but primarily because they ignore the disruptive technologies which would generate or enhance radical innovations.

Innovative Strategy Development Process

Christensen and Raynor (2003) distinguish two strategy formulation processes. They coin these: deliberate strategy and emergent strategy. Deliberate strategies are action plans to proceed incrementally. They are carefully detailed up-front to use prevailing technologies, they go with conventional wisdom. This orientation is not geared to creating radical or breakthrough innovations.

Emergent strategy, on the other hand, evolves from without the organization. It is based on changing conditions of the cumulative effect of day-to-day prioritization. Similarly, it is based on anticipated opportunities, problems, and successes. Emergent strategies go with radical innovations by using disruptive technologies. They are more suitable for powerful innovative developments. They typically challenge conventional wisdom. Exhibit 3 presents a six step innovative strategy development that will provide the corporate entity the opportunity of truly powerful innovations.
Exhibit 3: Innovation Strategy Development

Widespread Participation

Emergent Strategy Development

Activating Resource Allocation

Eliminating Inertia Traps

Open to Reframing the Strategy

Facilitating Emergent Strategy

Source: Adopted and revised from Christensen and Raynor (2003).

Innovative Strategy

The first step in Exhibit 3 is based on understanding the need for strategy development. Above all, a major strategic move needs widespread participation. Then there must be an understanding between the distinction between deliberate strategy and emergent strategy. While the first one is much more cut and dried reflecting the company’s conventional wisdom, the second is much more flexible and pro-active. If such a strategy were to be formulated it will be necessary to activate certain financial
resources so that best talent could be obtained and the projection continue (Christensen and Raynor 2003, Samli and Weber 2000).

Even with all good intentions of dynamic outlook, existing companies always run the risk of being subjected to inertia traps (Sull 2005). Among other reasons perhaps the most critical factor is that managers become trapped by previous successes. As the world and conditions change they respond with what worked before, but it may not be applicable now. That creates a trap based on inertia (Sull 2005). That inertia may actually support the incremental set of innovations but would be totally inadequate for radical innovations. Perhaps above all, inertia traps can be very dangerous and costly. It has been shown that IBM’s commitment to the mainframe 360s and ignoring PCs caused the company an estimated $16 billion or Kodak’s ignoring digital photography ended up costing the company approximately $12 billion (Sull 2005). Because of the importance of inertia traps, Exhibit 4 is constructed. As can be seen when a management is deeply involved in implementing a strategy, many of its action ties may become inertia traps. These traps can encourage the development of incremental innovations but they stay in the way of radical innovations and block them. Thus, being cognizant of these traps and as the conditions necessitate, modifying them or eliminating them is necessary if radical innovations is the goal.

### Exhibit 4: Inertia Traps

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Inertia Trap Forces</th>
<th>Implications</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Success Formulas</td>
<td>These formulas become inexorable rules that eventually become dysfunctional</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Old and Strong Past Commitments</td>
<td>In time such commitments eliminate consideration of other viable alternative</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strategic frames become blinding</td>
<td>Doing business in one way that way may become harden and function as blinders</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Resources can be a burden</td>
<td>When market conditions change the company’s existing resources can become definite liabilities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Processes do not change</td>
<td>Successful processes of the past can become routine and very rigid</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Existing relationships</td>
<td>Certain existing relationships become obligations and shackle the company’s activities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Commitment to strong set of values</td>
<td>The company values in time make the management extremely dogmatic</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Based on and revised from Sull (2005).

The next step in Exhibit 3 is being open to reframing the emergent strategy. Being open to change during the implementation of an emergent strategy means that a management is able to respond to evolving realities rather than being enslaved to certain stable fantasies (Mintzberg and Waters 1985). Microprocessors, for instance, were a disruptive technology, but Intel adapted and developed them and made lots of money because of this radical innovation which may be coined as a result of an emergent strategy (Grove 1996). This means the company had to change its main focus and develop the product radically. It is a critical question as to how an institution of higher learning could facilitate thinking in this direction.
Finally, facilitating the emergent strategy is, by definition, a natural step in developing and maintaining an overall innovative strategy. Here effective managers must not recognize the viable pattern of an innovative strategy eventually, but must recognize and support it as quickly as possible. Instead of feeling their way into the marketplace, they should proactively implement and manage the emergent strategy that will generate successful radical innovations (Christensen and Raynor 2003, Samli and Weber 2000). In many ways such an orientation is not quite yet developed in our universities.

**Needed a National Strategy**

It must be reiterated that the corporate attempts, if any, to innovate would not materialize in a most successful manner unless there is a culture of innovation present. For such a culture to be present there must be a national economic strategy that would make such a culture a strong possibility. As Porter (2008), p.39) stated very bluntly: “The stark truth is that the U.S. has no long-term economic strategy-no coherent set of policies to ensure competitiveness over the long haul”. Such a major lack must be avoided by proper educational support. Just what would be included in such a strategy? Exhibit 5 presents some of the key points of such an important strategy. Although the factors in the exhibit are reasonably self-explanatory, a brief description is presented.

**Exhibit 5: Elements of a Pro Innovation National Strategy**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Factors</th>
<th>Implications</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Investment In Research</td>
<td>Making sure that among many failures there will also be outstanding winners</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Improving Public Schools</td>
<td>The educational foundation of a national innovative strategy begins here</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social Progress Must Include Businesses</td>
<td>As a very important group of businesses must be encouraged to innovate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emphasizing changing competition</td>
<td>Past policies and practices must not hold progress back</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ample resources must be allocated powerful research projects</td>
<td>Ability to understand the uniqueness of bold and daring research activity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Development of New Structures</td>
<td>Some special organizations must govern strategically the innovation support programs</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Adopted and revised from Porter (2008).
A national economic strategy without a major focus on research would not be very effective. Just what kind of research? What would be the direction of activities? What are the expected outcomes? Are there extremely critical questions that need to be explored?

Improving public schools is a major foundation for any kind of economic progress. Bok (2006) has asserted that our youth are running short on critical areas such as writing, critical thinking, quantitative skills and moral reasoning. In short, our education system is not delivering what it should.

If there is an innovational strategy for the nation it simply does not mean the business sector must be left out of it. On the contrary such a strategy would materialize only if the business sector functions accordingly. The question perhaps is just how to make the business sector to be so proactive in an ambitious national strategy?

A national strategy must be flexible enough to focus on competitive realities rather than depending on past policies. Past policies, obviously, did not generate the much needed innovation atmosphere.

A national strategy must have ample financial resources which are directed not only at educational assistance and logistics infrastructures, but powerful research projects and marketing all of these successfully.

Finally, a national strategy cannot be developed without having a structural organization such as a national foundation of proactive research. All of the items presented in Exhibit 5 indicate a major commitment to innovation that must be called for (Kao 2007). In other words, an organization that is in charge of national innovation activity must be in a position to see to it that all of the conditions specified in Exhibit 5 are intact and the business sector has the necessary conditions intact to start an innovation adventure. It may be reiterated that without a national culture of innovation, however, corporate cultures are likely to have difficulty in innovating products and services that are real breakthroughs.

Lundvall (2007) suggests that based on the Australian experience, it can be argued that markets left alone do not support innovational efforts well. A national innovation system needs to be present and functional. Perhaps, companies individually and jointly request public authorities to be more actively engaged in the development of a national innovation culture. All of these stem from the basic essence that a proper education system should provide.

Conclusions and Future Research

International innovation deficiency is very real and therefore international innovation challenges must be taken very seriously. Focus on education leading to radical innovations is totally necessary and industrial marketing is essential for these activities. This is a critical way of overcoming the very negative impact of current global recession. This proposition, above all else, is a major educational challenge.

Certainly, countries have different resources, different orientations, and different cultural values; therefore, their innovation efforts will yield substantially different results (Shane and Venkataraman 2000). Countries in their struggle to generate an innovation culture by creating a vibrant entrepreneurial class can open up new possibilities in the international market places. Those possibilities may reach out and penetrate deeper into the global economy (Chan 1992). However, not concentrating on the innovational side and expanding internationally by practicing incrementalism can be a major barrier (Hamil 1995). It is necessary for countries to develop national innovation systems (Nelson 1993). In this article such a concept as national innovation systems which would create the external positive conditions combined with the positive corporate culture are the keys to create an innovational superiority for the countries that are aiming to accomplish such a goal. Clearly, however, each country
will have to find out what would work for it. Thus, it must be forcefully stated that the global innovation challenge cannot be solved by a one size fits all type of orientation.

References


**An Analysis of Kristofian Perspectives on Iran’s Marketing System**

**Panel**
Chair: Clifford J. Shultz, II, Loyola University - Chicago, USA

Panelists:
- Mark Peterson, University of Wyoming - Laramie, USA
- Detlev Zwick, York University, Canada
- Deniz Atik, Izmir University of Economics, Turkey
An Analysis of Kristofian Perspectives on Iran’s Marketing System
Panel
Clifford J. Shultz, II, Loyola University Chicago
Mark Peterson, University of Wyoming
Detlev Zwick, York University
Deniz Atik, Izmir University of Economics

Macromarketing scholars have conducted important marketing system assessments in developing/emerging/recovering/transitioning economies for more than five decades. Among many notable contributions are Alderson’s trek through the Soviet Union (Tadajewski 2009), Slater’s (1968) seminal work in Latin America, Dahringer’s (1983) reverse channel mapping in Lesotho / South Africa, Layton’s (2009), a longitudinal study on food marketing trends in the Balkans (Shultz, Burkink, Grbac and Renko. 2005), field research in several ports of call in developing markets, and, more recently, country-specific compendia on Vietnam (Shultz 2012) and India (Venkatesh 2012). Indeed, a cornerstone of macromarketing research is multi-methodological and nuanced analysis of marketing system complexities and ubiquities. The overarching objective typically is to shed light on systems that often are perceived to be dysfunctional, inefficient, unjust, different, or are simply unknown; the logic being that systemic understanding is not only important for academic purposes, but also to serve as a bridge for cooperation, enhanced efficiencies and efficacies, and ultimately better outcomes for all stakeholders of the system. In an increasingly global economy in which most if not all national marketing systems are interconnected in some capacity, all of us are stakeholders.

Thus, in the trailblazing spirit of macromarketing, the purpose of this special session is to explore the arcane marketing system of Iran, which is not particularly well understood by people outside the country, and perhaps even people residing inside it. Given that field research in Iran - including unfettered access to markets, consumers and policy makers -- is somewhat challenging, we have opted to use a unique approach to begin some analysis and discussion. That approach is to review, dissect and discuss a video. More specifically, a diverse panel was assembled and then instructed to watch “My Iranian Road Trip” (Ellick and Kristof 2012), which remains accessible online: http://www.nytimes.com/video/2012/06/23/opinion/100000001624588/my-iranian-road-trip.html. It was recorded in the spring of 2012, when The New York Times columnist Nicholas Kristof gained access to and toured Iran.

Viewed through macromarketing lenses, Kristof’s exposé enables us to make some inferences about the interactions of policies, markets, marketing processes and mixes, consumers/consumption, brands/products, assortment, geography, communication, culture, religion, globalization, trade sanctions, and other forces that effect and are affected by societal actions and well-being. While it could be argued that a single video -- less than 15 minutes long and produced by Americans chaperoned by Iranian “helpers” -- inevitably would not be representative of the many realities of macromarketing phenomena in Iran, each frame of even a short video can provide rich information about the dynamics of markets, marketing and consumers (Shultz 2011).
The session will begin with a brief introduction to Iran and the panelists. We then will show the video to all conference participants who attend the session. Each panelist subsequently will be allotted approximately 10 minutes to share his or her interpretations and key “takeaways” from the film, vis-à-vis the aforementioned macromarketing themes, and/or any other themes the panelist may consider to be salient to the interactions among markets, marketing and society in Iran and beyond. The remainder of the session will be opened for discussion.

Panelist, listed in order of presentation, include Cliff Shultz (chair), Mark Peterson, Detlev Zwick, and Deniz Atik.

References


Friday June 7, 2013
8:30a-10:00a
Concurrent Session I

Critical Perspectives on Markets and Society

Panel
Chairs: Kean Birch, York University, Canada
       Mark Peacock, York University, Canada

Accounting for intangible assets and intangible value in neoliberal markets
Kean Birch, York University, Canada

Ethical consumption and market processes
Mark Peacock, York University, Canada

Public interest groups, counter-advertising and the social responsibility of the Tobacco Industry
Alberto R. Salazar V., York University, Canada

Open content in Academia: Balancing the Market and the Commons
Richard Wellen, York University, Canada
Critical Perspectives on Markets and Society

Kean Birch, York University, Canada
Mark Peacock, York University, Canada
Alberto R. Salazar V., York University, Canada
Richard Wellen, York University, Canada

Outline

The emperor’s clothes of free market capitalism have been thoroughly stripped bare over the last few years with the ongoing global financial crisis. This has exposed the ethical paucity of monetary valuation and market accountability, leaving room for the emergence of new forms of social, ethical and ecological (e)valuation. The proposed panel will critically examine the extent and impact of market valuation in various spheres of life. The papers will explore alternative forms of valuation and suggest limits to market valuation. It will cover the following issues:

• Critical accounting and market valuation
• Diversities of valuation
• Varieties of marketization
• Impacts of market quantification and accountability
• Accountability of business for ethical value
• Social markets and social values

Abstracts

Accounting for intangible assets and intangible value in neoliberal markets
Kean Birch, York University, Canada

The starting point for this paper is the claim that we have witnessed the assetization of our economies since the ascendance of the neoliberal project in the 1970s. In particular, our economies have been transformed by the growing importance placed on intangible assets and the (intangible) value of these assets, and a corresponding decline in the importance of both tangible assets and commodity production. Advertising and marketing can be seen as classic examples of intangible assets, as suggested by Thorsten Veblen in the early 20th century, but they have now come to represent far more than these two things. For example, today intangible assets cover software, data, intellectual property, brand equity, human and organizational capital, and goodwill. This paper focuses on the valuation and accounting practices that enable the capitalization of such intangible assets, and highlight several problematic issues with the various practices that put a value on intangible assets. It will make the argument that neoliberal assumptions have influenced these accounting and valuation practices, and explore what this neoliberal influence means for how we understand the value of intangible assets.
Ethical Consumption and Market Processes
Mark Peacock, York University, Canada

"Austrian" market process theory celebrates the economy of knowledge in market economies and is deemed to overcome the "epistemological problem" of central planning outlined by Hayek. Assuming the descriptive validity of market process theory, this paper examines the effect of economic actors' relative ignorance of and in market processes on their ability to make ethical economic decisions. Focusing primarily on consumers, I ask how it is possible to consume ethically given our ignorance about the economic activities which lie behind the production, distribution and consumption of the goods and services with regard to which many people strive to make ethical choices. If, as I urge, a "problem of ethical knowledge" is acknowledged, one may ask (i) with whom responsibility for the perpetuation of unethical economic practices lies, and (ii) how the knowledge problem can be remedied or ameliorated in a manner which furthers people's ability to make economic decisions which accord with their ethical views.

Public Interest Groups, Counter-advertising and the Social Responsibility of the Tobacco Industry in Canada
Alberto R. Salazar V., York University, Canada

The activism of civil society groups has become an important factor in shaping the social responsibility of the modern corporation in market capitalism. In particular, anti-smoking groups have engaged in public debate seeking to protect citizen-consumers and promote public health and the social responsibility of the tobacco industry. In Canada, the debate has recently centered on plain packaging of cigarette legislation and anti-smoking groups are urging the government to adopt it following the example of Australia. On the other hand, the tobacco industry has begun a global campaign against plain packaging of cigarette legislation. It seeks to demonstrate the ineffectiveness of such legislation and instead expresses support for other less intrusive tobacco control policies in an effort to portray itself as socially responsible and good corporate citizen. In Canada, subsidiaries and other tobacco companies are replicating such campaigns hoping to repeat the success of their 1994 opposition to similar legislation. Their anti-plain packaging campaign appears to be favored by the implicit support of several Canadian institutional investors that currently have investments in tobacco companies. Surprisingly, the government’s recent funding cuts to anti-smoking groups have eroded their ability to advocate the adoption of plain packaging legislation and the social responsibility of the tobacco industry worsening the imbalances in tobacco control debate. This paper discusses the extent to which freedom of speech and the legal defenses against corporate defamation suits can mitigate such imbalances and re-empower anti-smoking citizen-consumer groups to promote public health and the social responsibility of the tobacco industry through traditional and social media. Particular attention is paid to anti-smoking groups representing the interest of aboriginal communities, youth and low-income citizens, which have the highest rate of tobacco consumption in Canada.

Open Content in Academia: Balancing the Market and the Commons
Richard Wellen, York University, Canada

It is commonly said that higher education and discovery-oriented research rests upon a gift economy where the participants give away their work for free in exchange for recognition rather than money. In recent years the prospect for expanding this academic commons has gained attention because the internet has enabled new open content markets in academic publishing and course delivery. The best
known examples of these are open access scholarly journals and commercial providers of Massive Online Open Courses or ‘MOOCs’. This paper explores the relationship between the market and the commons in the context of emerging business models such as MOOCs and open access megajournals. It is true that the free sharing of content appears to be nicely aligned with the self-definition of the academic commons as a sphere of non-market social production. But some instances of these new academic business models have also been premised on increasing the market relevance of learning and introducing a more direct role for market forces on the provision of publication services. For example, MOOC providers, like Coursera have begun to market university courses as direct services for matching students with employers. The UK’s Finch commission has recently promoted ‘author pays’ publishing as a way of introducing more transparent pricing of academic content. This paper raises questions not only about the future shape of open educational content and open access academic journals but also about the relationship of these developments to the marketization of higher education and research.
### Humanistic Marketing

**Abstract/Papers Included**

**Promoting cycling in urban environments: Implications for social marketing and public policy**  
Marius Claudy, University College Dublin, Ireland  
Mark Peterson, University of Wyoming - Laramie, USA  
Aidan O’Driscoll, Dublin Institute of Technology, Ireland

**Authenticity: Macro-marketing perspective**  
Djavlonbek Kadirov, Eastern Institute of Technology, New Zealand  
Richard J. Varey, University of Waikato, New Zealand  
Ben Wooliscroft, University of Otago, New Zealand

**Reconstructing Macromarketing Management: The building blocks**  
Christine Domegan, National University of Ireland Galway, Ireland  
Stanley J. Shapiro, Simon Fraser University, Canada

**Trends in recent sustainable marketing research: Progress, gaps and research opportunities**  
Robert Mitchell, University of Otago, New Zealand  
Ben Wooliscroft, University of Otago, New Zealand

**Aldersonian sustainability**  
Ben Wooliscroft, University of Otago, New Zealand
Promoting cycling in urban environments: Implications for social marketing and public policy

Marius Claudy, University College Dublin, Ireland
Mark Peterson, University of Wyoming, USA
Aidan O’Driscoll, Dublin Institute of Technology, Ireland

Introduction

In 2011 about half the world’s population lived in urban environments and predictions show that this share will rise to approximately 70 percent by 2050 (UN 2012). Private car use is a major threat to humans living in urban areas. For many years, scientists have highlighted the negative externalities of excessive car use for humans (e.g. levels of noise and air pollution), the environment (e.g. CO₂ emission and acid rain) and the economy (e.g. congestion). For example, it is estimated that about 750,000 people die from car crashes annually, while about 130,000 premature deaths and 50-70 million incidents of respiratory illness are attributable to episodes of urban air pollution in developing countries alone (McMichael 2000).

In this context, cycling has received growing attention. Cycling has been described as “an active, environmentally friendly mode of travel that can encompass distances long enough to efficiently cover many urban and suburban trips” (Moudon et al. 2005). For example, findings from the National Household Survey (2001) show that in the U.S. about 40% of total car trips are less than two miles. Trips of this length only equate to about 10-20 minute on the bicycle, yet cycling is still the most underutilized mode of travel. Cycling is also likely to address many challenges associated with increasing physical inactivity, which is a key contributing factor in many cardiovascular diseases and illnesses. According to the World Health Organization (WHO) obesity and inactivity were responsible for 2.8 million and 3.2 million pre-mature deaths worldwide respectively (De Nazelle et al. 2011). Cycling is also likely to reduce costs of absenteeism for businesses, with research showing that cyclist have on average fewer sick-days than non-cyclists (Grous 2011).

In order to encourage cycling, public policy makers and city planners are increasingly drawing on findings from consumer behavior (Bamberg et al. 2011) and social marketing (e.g. Wright and Egan, 2000). In particular, researchers have investigated people’s motivations to cycle (e.g. Cavill and Watkins, 2007; Garrard, Geoffrey, and Kai Lo, 2008), as well as the (physical) barriers that prevent people from using bicycles (Daley and Rissel 2007; Litman 2000). Overall, the available evidence seems to suggest that cycling behavior is an individual choice that is only moderately influenced by environmental factors like land and weather conditions or cycling amenities (e.g. Moudon et al. 2005).

Yet, little is understood about the psychological processes that explain people’s decision to cycle or not (Moudon et al. 2005) and encouraging people to cycle is often tried via top-down information and awareness campaigns (Owens and Drifﬁll 2008). These campaigns are usually based on a rationalist information deﬁcit model, assuming that educating people about the beneﬁts of cycling will result in attitudinal and ultimately behavioral change. However, many people may have good reasons not to cycle and recent ﬁndings in marketing (Chazidakis & Lee, forthcoming) and evolutionary psychology
(Griskevicius, Cantú, and Vugt, 2012) show that campaigns and policy interventions that ignore people’s reasons against sustainable behaviors are unlikely to result in behavioral change.

Drawing upon reasoning theory (BRT; Westaby, Probst, and Lee, 2010; Westaby, 2005), in this study we aim to investigate how values, attitudes and, more importantly, reasons for and against cycling influence people’s decision to commute by bicycle. In order to do so, we collected and analyzed data from 936 commuters in Dublin, Ireland. Commuting to work is of particular interest, as it constitutes a regularly occurring trip, which thus offers great potential for behavioral change.

The following sections provide a brief background to reasoning theory and outline of the proposed model. This is followed by a short description of the methodology and data-analytical steps that were taken to test the model. Finally, we present the initial findings from our analysis and discuss the implications of our results for macromarketers and policy makers.

**Reasoning theory**

Psychological research in transport policy has mainly utilized two theories in order to understand determinants of consumers’ choice of travel-mode: Theory of Planned Behavior (Icek Ajzen 1991; Gaerling, Gillholm, and Gaerling 1998) and Norm-Activation Theory (Nordlund and Garvill 2003; Schwartz 1977)

The TPB has its roots in social psychology and a class of theories commonly referred to as expectancy-value models (Fishbein and Ajzen, 1975). These theories posit that attitudes are a main determinant of behavior, which can be understood as rational-choice-based evaluation of the outcomes of a behavior (i.e. a behavior’s subjective utility), as well as an estimate of the likelihood of these outcomes. According to TPB behavior is further influenced by people’s subjective norms (i.e. perceived expectations of relevant others) and perceived behavioural control (i.e. perceived difficulty of performing the behavior. Generally, the theory predicts that the stronger each factor (i.e. attitude, subjective norm, perceived behavioural control), the higher a person’s likelihood to perform the behavior. VBN on the other hand posits that moral and altruistic considerations are key explanatory variables of sustainable behavior (Schwartz 1977). According to the theory values underlie an individual’s sense of obligation (i.e. personal norm). Marketers and policy makers can activate these norms by making people understand the (adverse) consequences of their actions for things they value, thus triggering behavioral change (Stern 2005).

However, both models have received growing criticism, mainly because of neglecting cognitions and reasons against performing a behavior, which are qualitatively different from reasons for performing the same behavior (e.g. Chazidakis and Lee 2013). For example, people may decide to cycle because they want to “get fit” or “save money”. However, communicating these reasons to non-cyclist may not necessarily result in behavioral change, since reasons for and against behavior are not always opposites, but can be psychologically distinct. In other words, non-cyclists do not drive cars because they want to “stay unfit” or “waste money”. In fact, they are more likely to have other reasons not to cycle like “safety concerns” or “lack of adequate facilities”. The distinct nature of reasons against behaviors might also explain why researchers often find that attitudes are a weak predictor of sustainable behaviors (Claudy, Peterson, and O’Driscoll 2013).

**Hypotheses**

Recent advances in reasoning theory have allowed researchers to differentiate between reasons for and reasons against a behavior, and empirically investigate the relative influence of these two distinct constructs. Behavioral reasoning theory (BRT) in particular has proven a valuable framework (Westaby
BRT has effectively demonstrated that by including reasons against behavior, researchers can explain significantly more variance in people’s behavior than traditional models (Westaby 2005; Westaby Lee and Probst 2010).

Source: Adapted from Westaby (2005)
Figure 1: Conceptual Model of the Study

BRT thus offers a more complete understanding of consumers’ decision making by including context-specific reasons, which serve as important linkages between consumers’ values, attitudes and behavior (Westaby 2005). Figure 1 summarizes the hypothesized relationships in behavioral reasoning theory. In line with related theories, BRT postulates consumer behavior can be predicted by global motives like attitudes. We thus postulate that

\[ H_1 = \text{Commuting by bicycle is influenced by people’s attitudes towards cycling.} \]

However, unlike traditional models, BRT hypothesizes that reasons predict attitudes presumptively “because they help individuals justify and defend their actions, which promotes and protects their self-worth” (Westaby 2005, p. 98). As mentioned above, reasons are theorized to consist of two distinct dimensions: reasons for and reasons against behavior. The reason concept in BRT relates to several other psychological concepts such as sense making (e.g. Thomas et al. 1993), psychological coherence (e.g. Nowak et al. 2000) or functional theorizing (e.g. Snyder 1992), which broadly suggest that people use reasoning to support the acceptability of decision alternatives, defend and justify their actions and pursue particular goals. In the context of cycling, commuters would be expected to search for the strongest set of reasons to justify and defend their decision to cycle or not cycle into work. BRT suggests that reasons influence cycling behavior directly and indirectly via global motives (i.e. attitudes).
Regarding the latter, consumers’ who have strong reasons for (against) cycling will also have positive (negative) attitudes towards it. Accordingly, we make the following propositions in two parts:

\[ H_{2a} = \text{People’s reasons for cycling will positively influence their attitudes towards commuting by bicycle; and} \]

\[ H_{2b} = \text{People’s reasons against cycling will negatively influence their attitudes towards commuting by bicycle.} \]
However, Westaby (2005) argues that reasons also directly influence behavior, without relying on the complete processing of global motives. This direct impact often results from consumers’ strive to simplify decision making by using cognitive short cuts or heuristics (e.g. Tversky and Kahneman 1974). For example, consumers might hold positive attitudes towards cycling (e.g. because it is good for the environment), but might still decide against cycling because of a critical reason like perceived danger of cycling. We thus expect that

$$H_{3a} = \text{People’s reasons for cycling directly (positively) influence their decision to commute by bicycle;}$$

and

$$H_{3b} = \text{People’s reasons against cycling will directly (negatively) influence their decision to commute by bicycle.}$$

Yet, reasoning does not occur in isolation and is expected to be influenced by consumers’ deep-rooted beliefs and values (Westaby 2005, p. 102). In other words, people’s processing of value information directly affects the reasoning for their anticipated behavior. For example, consumers who value “security” might find more reasons against cycling like excessive traffic, or lack of adequate cycle path. On the other hand, people who, for example, value “achievement” might find more reasons in favor of cycling like training and fitness effects. Thus

$$H_{4a,b} = \text{People’s values influence their reasons for and against commuting by bicycle.}$$

However, values and beliefs can also to have a direct, unmediated impact on consumers’ attitudes. This is in line with BRT’s general assumption that “people use different, distinct, and systematic psychological processes, or paths” in decision making (Westaby 2005, p. 103 quoting: Lee et al. 1999, p. 458).

$$H_{5} = \text{People’s values will directly influence their attitudes towards commuting by bicycle.}$$

Researchers have found evidence for the influence of enduring values (what individuals regard as important in life) influencing reasoning and attitudes (E. Briggs et al. 2009). Some of these human values include universalism (understanding, appreciation, tolerance and protection for the welfare of all people and nature). Additionally, security is a human value (representing safety and stability in life for one’s self). Although Schwartz’s value circumplex includes ten values, universalism would be classified as one of the “we” values that includes others, while security would be classified as one of the “me” values. In this way, including universalism and security in this study allows a more complete understanding of how two types of values would be used in the psychological processing of bicycle commuting.

In summary, BRT serves as the theoretical framework to better understand consumers’ decision to commute by bicycle and to draw implications for social marketing and public policy. In the following sections we outline the respective methods and data analytical steps.
Methodology

Research context
The research was conducted with commuters in Dublin, Ireland. The city of Dublin makes an interesting case study, as it has recently highlighted the importance of cycling in its national transport policy. Policy makers and city planners have acknowledged that current transport trends in Dublin are unsustainable. Transport accounts for approximately a quarter of overall emissions, and between 1996 and 2006 greenhouse gas (GHG) emission from transport increased by 88%, while transport related energy requirements doubled in the same period (www.transport.ie). Simultaneously, the share of people commuting to work by bicycle declined from 4.2% to 2%. The National Transport Authority (NTA) has thus recently published its strategy for 2020, in which it aims for 10% of all trips within Dublin to be by bicycle. The NTA has already implemented a number of different policies, aiming to encourage people to cycle (to work) more regularly. Two of most prominent policies include the “Dublin bicycles”¹ and the “Bicycle to work scheme”². The policies appear to be successful, with more recent data suggesting that between 2006 and 2012 the number of cyclists in the city has risen by 42% (National Transport Authority 2012). The importance of cycling in the city of Dublin is therefore likely to increase, and policy makers and city planners will benefit from research into the psychological determinants of cycling behavior.

Data and participants
The data to test the above hypotheses came from a large-scale survey conducted among employees of two major universities (i.e. Dublin Institute of Technology and Dublin City University). A link to an online survey was sent out to all staff via the two internal mailing networks, targeting approximately 4300 academic and non-academic staff across the two institutions. 936 usable questionnaires were filled in, a response rate of 21.8%. Table 1 presents a demographic profile and cycling behavior of the respondents.

Measures
Well-established scales were employed to measure the constructs in this study. The dependent variable (i.e. commuting by bicycle) was measured as a single item measure, asking people “how often do you cycle to work” (1=never; 5=every day). All other constructs were multi-item scales that were measured on 5-point Likert scales (1=strongly disagree; strongly agree). In line with past theory (Ajzen and Fishbein 1980), the global construct attitude was assessed with three items, asking respondents if they agreed or disagreed that cycling to work: “is a great idea”; “offers a lot of advantages over other means of commuting”; and “has an overall positive effect on people’s lives”.

Reasons, however, are context specific and thus needed to be elicited via exploratory interviews prior to this study. In order to do so, we conducted 15 semi-structured interviews with a convenience sample of people living and working in Dublin (Kvale 1996). The sample consisted of an almost equal number of men and woman and was spread across different age groups and income categories. During the interviews, people were asked to name reasons for and against cycling to and from work. Like Westabt, Lee and Probst (2010) we converted the most frequently mentioned reasons for (i.e. cost-savings; well-being; time-saving; better for the environment) and against commuting by bicycle (i.e. inconvenience, safety, weather) into items. It needs to be noted that these reasons were not bundled into an overall reasons for and reasons against scale, but were modeled individually as second-order factor constructs (e.g. Marsh and Hocevar 1985). This way, we were able to assess the relative influence of each reason consumers’ attitudes and cycling behavior. BRT acknowledges that one reason could potentially account for most of the variance in attitudes and/or behavior (Westaby 2005, p. 104).
Table 1: Demographic profile and cycling behavior of respondents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number of responses/total issues</th>
<th>936/approx.4300 (21.8%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Commuters</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gender</td>
<td>49.8% female</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18-24</td>
<td>12.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25-34</td>
<td>22.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35-44</td>
<td>27.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>45-54</td>
<td>28%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>55-64</td>
<td>9.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>65+</td>
<td>0.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Frequency of cycling to work</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Never</td>
<td>61.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Less than 1 day per week</td>
<td>9.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1-2 days per week</td>
<td>5.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3-4 days per week</td>
<td>9.8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Every day</td>
<td>14.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Average annual household income</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&lt; €20,000</td>
<td>3.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>€20,000-€30,000</td>
<td>6.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>€30,001-€40,000</td>
<td>9.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>€40,001-€50,000</td>
<td>10.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>€50,001-€60,000</td>
<td>7.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>€60,001-€70,000</td>
<td>6.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>€70,001-€80,000</td>
<td>8.8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>€80,001-€90,000</td>
<td>8.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&gt;€90,000</td>
<td>17.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prefer not to answer</td>
<td>22.2%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

During the main online survey employees were then asked to agree or disagree whether the respective reasons were relevant to them or not. Economic reasons for commuting to work by bicycle were reflected by three measures, i.e. commuting to work by bicycle would: “be cheaper than running a car”; “help me to save money”; and “would reduce my depend on petrol/diesel”. Wellbeing was another reason cycling, in that commuting to work by bicycle would: “boost my general fitness”; “improve my psychological well-being”. Likewise, time-saving was named by many people as a key reason in that commuting by bicycle: “is the fastest way to get to work”; and “reduced the time it takes me to get to work”; “allows me to spend time on other things than commuting to work”. Finally, the influence of environmental reasons was assessed by asking people if they commuted because “it would reduce harmful emissions”; and “constitute less environmentally damaging mode of transport”.

A main reason against cycling to work was inconvenience in that it would be “a nuisance”; “not convenient”; and that “any other mode of transport is more enjoyable than cycling”. Further, employers posted that cycling to work would not be possible because of the local weather conditions i.e. “Irish weather conditions make cycling a very unpleasant mode of transport”; appearance in work would be...
negatively affected by cycling to work in bad weather”; “local weather patterns do not suit cycling”. Finally, perceived danger was a key reason for not cycling to work, with many commuters worrying that; “cycling in city traffic is too dangerous”; “vehicles often knock cyclists of their bicycles”; and “too many cars do not pay enough attention to cyclists”.

Finally, Schwartz universal values (i.e. universalism and security) were operationalized by using items from the European Social Survey (Bilsky, Janik, and Schwartz 2010). Universalism was measured via three items, asking people whether or not it was important to them that “every person in the world should be treated equally and have equal opportunities in life”; “that people should care for nature and look after the environment”; “to listen to people who are different from you, and even when one disagrees, one should aim to understand them”. Security was measured by asking people whether or not it was important to them “to live in secure surroundings, and to avoid anything that might endanger one’s safety”; “that the government ensures one’s safety against all threats, and to be strong so it can defend its citizens”.

Prior to testing the structural relationships between the above discussed relationships, a confirmatory factors analysis was conducted to establish the reliability, dimensionality and validity of the multi-item scales (Bagozzi and Yi 2012; Gerbing and Anderson 1988)

**Confirmatory factor analysis**
Confirmatory factor analysis was performed using Amos 18. Results suggest that the overall model provides a good fit with $\chi^2/df = 1.938$; CFI=.99; TLI = .98; RMSEA=.032. All factor loading were above .5 and were statistically significant, suggesting the convergent validity of the latent variables (Table 2). Composite reliabilities (CR) and average variance extracted (AVE) exceeded the recommended standard of .7 and .5 for all constructs respectively (Bagozzi and Yi 2012). Results also support the discriminant validity of the measures. First, confidence intervals around the correlation estimates between any two constructs were all significantly different from one (Anderson and Gerbing 1988). Second, the average variance extracted exceeded the squared correlation between all pairs of latent constructs (Fornell and Larcker 1981). Finally, we tested for common method variance by comparing our measurement model to a one-factor model. The one-factor model shows significantly inferior fit statistics in comparison to our measurement model ($\Delta\chi^2 = p<.05$), with CFI=.434; TLI =.371; RMSEA =.173; $\chi^2/df = 5448.345/189 = 28.827$. These results suggest that the likelihood of common method variance is low.

**Results**
In a next step we tested the hypotheses, using the (n) 936 responses from the survey. Overall, the structural model yielded a good fit ($\Delta\chi^2 = <.05$), with CFI=.95; TLI = .94; RMSEA=.052; $\chi^2/df = 3.49$. 


Table 2: Confirmatory factor analysis

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>$\lambda$</th>
<th>$t$</th>
<th>CR</th>
<th>AVE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Attitude</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A1</td>
<td>.87</td>
<td>.01</td>
<td>.90</td>
<td>.76</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A2</td>
<td>.81</td>
<td>.01</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A3</td>
<td>.88</td>
<td>.01</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Reasons for</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cost-savings</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CS1</td>
<td>.78</td>
<td>.01</td>
<td>.81</td>
<td>.58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CS2</td>
<td>.71</td>
<td>.01</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CS3</td>
<td>.73</td>
<td>.01</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Time savings</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TS1</td>
<td>.90</td>
<td>.01</td>
<td>.87</td>
<td>.76</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TS2</td>
<td>.98</td>
<td>.01</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wellbeing</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WB1</td>
<td>.83</td>
<td>.01</td>
<td>.79</td>
<td>.66</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WB2</td>
<td>.75</td>
<td>.01</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Reasons against</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inconvenience</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I1</td>
<td>.84</td>
<td>.01</td>
<td>.75</td>
<td>.60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I2</td>
<td>.76</td>
<td>.01</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Danger</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D1</td>
<td>.82</td>
<td>.01</td>
<td>.84</td>
<td>.72</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D2</td>
<td>.80</td>
<td>.01</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Weather</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>W1</td>
<td>.90</td>
<td>.01</td>
<td>.87</td>
<td>.77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>W2</td>
<td>.91</td>
<td>.01</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Values</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Universalism</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UV1</td>
<td>.75</td>
<td>.01</td>
<td>.85</td>
<td>.65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UV2</td>
<td>.65</td>
<td>.01</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UV3</td>
<td>.71</td>
<td>.01</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Security</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S1</td>
<td>.77</td>
<td>.01</td>
<td>.71</td>
<td>.55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S2</td>
<td>.71</td>
<td>.01</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: $\lambda$=standardized factor loading; $t$=t-value; $\alpha$= Composite Reliability; AVE= average variance extracted.
Table 3: Structural Model Results

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Hypothesized path (first order model)</th>
<th>Standardized Estimates</th>
<th>p values</th>
<th>Hypothesis verification</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>$H_1$ Attitudes $\rightarrow$ Commuting behavior</td>
<td>-.11</td>
<td>n.s.</td>
<td>rejected</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$H_{2a}$ Reasons for behavior $\rightarrow$ Attitude</td>
<td>.50</td>
<td>.001</td>
<td>supported</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$H_{2b}$ Reasons against behavior $\rightarrow$ Attitude</td>
<td>-.32</td>
<td>.001</td>
<td>supported</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$H_{3a}$ Reasons for behavior $\rightarrow$ Commuting behavior</td>
<td>.21</td>
<td>.001</td>
<td>supported</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$H_{3b}$ Reasons against behavior $\rightarrow$ Commuting behavior</td>
<td>-.50</td>
<td>.001</td>
<td>supported</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$H_{4a}$ Universalism $\rightarrow$ Reason for behavior</td>
<td>.15</td>
<td>.001</td>
<td>supported</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$H_{4b}$ Security $\rightarrow$ Reasons against Adoption</td>
<td>.21</td>
<td>.001</td>
<td>supported</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$H_4$ Values $\rightarrow$ Attitude</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Universalism</td>
<td>.10</td>
<td>.001</td>
<td>supported</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Security</td>
<td>-.03</td>
<td>n.s.</td>
<td>rejected</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Second order estimated path

| Reasons for behavior $\rightarrow$ Cost savings                | .73                    | .001     |                        |
| Reasons for behavior $\rightarrow$ Time savings               | .49                    | .001     |                        |
| Reasons for behavior $\rightarrow$ Wellbeing                  | .83                    | .001     |                        |
| Reasons against behavior $\rightarrow$ Inconvenience           | .89                    | .001     |                        |
| Reasons against behavior $\rightarrow$ Danger                 | .52                    | .001     |                        |
| Reasons against behavior $\rightarrow$ Weather                | .77                    | .001     |                        |

More importantly, seven hypotheses were supported by the data, while two had to be rejected. Specifically, findings show that consumers’ attitudes towards cycling have no statistically significant (n.s.; $p > .05$) influence on cycling behavior ($H_1$). Further, findings show that reasons for ($p < .01$) and reasons against cycling ($p < .01$) have a direct influence on consumers’ cycling behavior ($H_{3ab}$). Likewise, reasons for ($p < .01$) and against ($p < .01$) cycling are an important antecedent of people’s attitudes towards commuting to work by bicycle ($H_{2ab}$). Finally, results show that values influence reasons as well as attitudes. In particular, we find that universalism positively influences reasons for cycling ($p < .01$), while security values positively influence reasons against commuting by bike ($p < .01$) thus confirming $H_{4ab}$. However, while universalism seems to be an antecedent of attitudes ($p < .01$), security values have no influence on commuters’ attitudes (n.s.; $p > .05$).
The results also show that reasons against behavior are the strongest predictor of commuting behavior. While perceived road safety (.52) is an important reason for people not to commute to work by bicycle, weather conditions (.73) and inconvenience (.89) appear to be the main reasons for people’s decisions to use alternative modes of transport. On the other hand, people who cycle to work seem to do so because of time- (.49) and cost savings (.73). However, improving one’s wellbeing and level of fitness appears to be the main reason to cycle into work (.83). Finally, we see that consumers’ who value security tend to have more reasons against cycling, while people who hold stronger universalist value appear to have also stronger reasons for cycling. In the following we discuss these findings in greater detail, and highlight implications for social marketing and public policy.

**Discussion of Initial Findings**

City planners, policy makers and, more recently, marketers are interested in plans and strategies, which reduce consumers’ car dependency in urban environments. Generally, these measures are divided into hard and soft transport policies. While hard transport policies are concerned with modifying the physical environment (e.g. building cycling lanes), soft policy measures aim to influence consumers’ decision making by “altering their perception of the objective environment, by altering their judgments of the consequences associated with the use of different travel options, and by motivating and empowering them to switch to alternative travel options” (e.g. Bamberg et al. 2011, p.229). This way soft transport policies aim to discourage car ownership (e.g. vehicle taxes), reduce travel by car (e.g. road pricing or fuel taxes) and/or encourage consumers to switch to alternative modes of transport like car-sharing, public transport, walking or cycling. Soft policies and social marketing campaigns are of particular interest in situations in which there is limited scope or resources to alter existing infrastructure.
Marketing and policy efforts aiming to encourage people to cycle often involve information and awareness campaigns, which aim to change people’s attitudes and educate them about the benefits of cycling (Owens and Driffill 2008). A good example is a campaign that was recently run in the City of London as shown in Figure 3 (adverttolog.com 2013). The ad on the right aims to trigger behavioral change via attitudinal change. However, our findings suggest that when reason constructs are included in the analysis, attitudes have no influence on people’s cycling behavior. Reasons for behavior, however, seem to directly influence behavior. The advert on the left (Figure 3) is thus more likely to trigger behavioral change, as it communicates the health benefits of cycling. Future campaigns could thus continue to highlight other benefits, including time and cost savings, which seem to be strong motivating factors for people to cycle. Yet, our findings suggest that the strongest predictors of commuting by bike are reasons against cycling. Commuters have good reasons not to cycle, most of which are currently not addressed in social marketing campaigns or transport policies.

Figure 3: Awareness campaign that highlights the benefits of cycling

Our research shows that convenience appears to be one of the biggest hurdles that people are facing. Social marketing campaigns that highlight the convenience of cycling over other modes of transport are thus likely to stimulate the greatest behavioral change. An example of such a campaign is the City West Cycle Link campaign, which was run in the city of Sydney, shown in Figure 4. The ad promotes a new, traffic-free cycle path that connects important landmarks within the city center. More
importantly, it addresses the convenience barrier by highlighting that this new route is flat (i.e. less tiresome) and traffic free (i.e. quicker, as well as safer). Consumers who are interested in cycling also find additional information on the website, which compares the new cycling route with the old route in terms of distance (i.e. shorter), intersections (i.e. less), elevation (i.e. less) and maximum grade (i.e. flat).

![City West Cycle Link](image)

Source: [www.bikesydney.org](http://www.bikesydney.org) 2013

Figure 4: Awareness campaign that addresses reasons against cycling (i.e. convenience)

Our results thus suggest that social marketing campaigns that pro-actively address people’s reasons against cycling (which are qualitatively different from reasons for cycling) are likely to have the biggest impact in regard to behavioral change. Future campaigns could communicate the convenience of cycling on key city-center routes (i.e. travel speed, travel time, flatness etc.), and aim to overcome distorted perceptions of road-safety, as well as weather concerns.

Endnotes

1 Dublinbicycles is a self-service bicycle rental system. With 44 stations and 550 bicycles it enables people to travel through the city of Dublin, commute between home and work and enjoy Dublin city at one’s own leisure. Bicycles can be rented at each station via Long Term Hire Card (10 Euro per annum) or a 3 day Ticket (2 Euro). Bicycles can be rented and returned at any of the 44 stations, which are strategically positioned across the city centre. The first 30 minutes of each trip are free. After this first half-hour, a service charge applies. For more information see: [www.dublinbicycles.ie](http://www.dublinbicycles.ie)

2 Through the bicycle to work scheme employees can purchase a bicycle and accessories of up to a maximum cost of €1,000 through their employer. The employer can either bear the full cost of the bicycle or the employee pays for it by way of salary sacrifice agreement, in which the costs of the bicycle are deducted from a 12 months salary. These deductions are tax-free so that employees essentially pay the costs minus their respective tax rate. For more information see: [www.bicycletowork.ie](http://www.bicycletowork.ie)
References


Chazidakis, Andreas, and Michael S.W. Lee (n.d.), “Anti-Consumption as the Study of Reasons against,” Journal of Macromarketing, 0(0), 1–14.


Fornell, Claes, and DF Larcker (1981), “Evaluating structural equation models with unobservable variables and measurement error,” Journal of marketing research, XV(February), 39–50.


Authenticity: Macromarketing Perspective

Djavlonbek Kadirov, Eastern Institute of Technology, New Zealand
Richard Varey, University of Waikato, New Zealand
Ben Wooliscroft, University of Otago, New Zealand

This investigation argues that authenticity is inherently a macromarketing concept that is linked to how marketers and consumers view themselves and their own status in society. We show that authenticity refers to the marketer’s marketplace condition (mindset) that can be best described as sincere concern for another. We argue that micromarketing as a general phenomenon is rooted in inauthenticity due to the fact that micromarketing practices represent (distressed, decomposed) overreaction to the marketers’ self-embraced narrow view of their own social status (as maximiser of self-interest, profit, growth) that is largely irrelevant – even contradictory - to the crucial goals of society.

Authenticity as Sincere Concern for Another

It is a bit of surprise that the ‘normal’ marketing discourse tends to be silent with regard to authenticity to be displayed when marketers engage in marketing. The lack of comprehensive ethical discussion is staggering; it feels as though the notions of authenticity, honesty, and sincerity in market behaviour, and the related notion of genuineness in marketing practice are antithetical to marketing. Although there is much research on how to manipulate various authenticity cues to make brands look more authentic or how to respond to consumers’ authenticity expectations (Beverland, 2009; Beverland, Lindgreen, and Vink, 2008; Grayson and Martinec, 2004; Rose and Wood, 2005), these studies due to their micromarketing orientation completely miss the essence of the issue. To elaborate, the brand authenticity research has almost totally a micromarketing focus and agenda which is expressed in its focus on how to employ the ‘authenticity’ concept to maximise market actors’ self-interest. This perspective is not what we are concerned with here. By taking the macromarketing perspective, we focus on why and how managers should instil authenticity into marketing practices rather than on how to manipulate consumers’ authenticity predilections in order to sell more. We see authenticity as a mode, not a means, for efficient and effective marketing.

To clarify, our investigation is not about identifying factors that might ‘significantly’ influence consumers’ authenticity perceptions so that managers could successfully manipulate market encounters to their benefit. Setting it apart from micromarketing research, the purpose of this investigation is to call researchers towards investigating how marketers should (and also could) sincerely invest their passion, effort, and aspirations (their humanity) in sincere concern for another (benefiting oneself by a means of benefiting the other), the notion that is the real essence of the marketing orientation, albeit uniquely understood from the macromarketing perspective. In particular, we would like to explain why marketers should respond to citizens’ quest for authenticity in the marketplace by a means of constructing authentic existence and practices that in turn imply a task of provisioning society in a harmonious way while avoiding excessive environmental, social, cultural, and intergenerational harm.

Authenticity is now and has always been in demand – it is not a new discovery. Investigations show that consumers actively seek authentic businesses, brands, places, and persons (Alexander, 2009; Beverland, 2009; Cohen, 1988; Holt, 2002). General pursuit for authenticity in the marketplace is reflexive of society’s general macromarketing sensitivity. This is due to the fact that to become authentic (or real) a business must genuinely promote the common good, i.e. community welfare. We realise that
for lay persons’ words such as real, authentic, or genuine might have different meanings in different contexts. Specifically, the word ‘authentic’ might bear a barely perceptible denotation of harmonious existence in society. However, in this research we are going to show that our scrutiny of the authenticity literature led us to believe that most authenticity perceptions refer to a single latent assumption about the marketer’s character: to be able to offer authentic products and services, marketers (or firms) must become an organic part of society. They should genuinely perform their function of provisioning without pretense; they should not aspire to be seen as more than this; they should not manipulate citizens and systems for the sake of disproportionate growth or profit. Furthermore, we argue that real (authentic) businesses are genuine participants of marketing systems in the sense that they can effectively satisfy (authentic) consumer needs while avoiding coercive tactics. By the same token, an inauthentic business is like a tumour, a cancerous attachment, which is indistinguishable from societal fabric yet feeds on society by externalising its costs. Inauthentic businesses tend to create long-term harm to both individual consumers and society as whole, and also, ultimately, themselves. We submit that inauthentic businesses use micro-marketing excessively; the very behaviour which in fact not only functions as a veneer to mask an extreme passion for profit over anything else, but also reveals these businesses’ fundamental misconception about their own status in society.

Seeking Authenticity

Brown, Sherry, and Kozinets (2003, p. 21) declare that the search for authenticity will soon become “one of the cornerstones of contemporary marketing”. Researchers have increasingly realised that consumers, participants in the general tendency to quest for authenticity in society, are increasingly seeking authentic experiences that are enabled by relevant and responsible market offerings and market agents (Alexander 2009; Beverland and Farrelly 2010; Holt 2002; Peñaloza 2000; Seeman 1966). The quest for authenticity is well documented in a wide range of marketing settings: luxury products (Beverland 2005a, 2005b), mundane objects and mass marketed products (Beverland and Farrelly 2010), reality television (Rose and Wood 2005), and tourism sites (Cohen 1988; Grayson and Martinec 2004; MacCannell 1973).

Authenticity that has become an acute problem related to marketers and marketing in recent years, and specific sociocultural conditions undergird the phenomenon. In Holt’s (2002) opinion, the quest for authenticity is a natural reaction of the consumer to mainstream societal mores of modernity. Holt argued that the rise of modern consumer culture circa 1920s-1960s was underpinned by the growth of a wealthy middle class, the introduction of radio and television, and suburbanisation. These factors enabled marketers to successfully engineer a standardised consumer culture. To counteract this tendency, the postmodern consumer culture (developed after 1960s) was driven by non-conformist experimentation based on alternative ways of existence and seeing “the self as a work under construction” (Holt 2002, p. 82). As experimenting with alternative lifestyles and personal freedom have increased, brands that still attempted to impose authority on consumer culture have gradually lost ground and brands which supported and enabled postmodern aspirations have grown in popularity. Holt observed that people were increasingly becoming attuned to the undesirability of significant control exercised by marketers and marketing over their personal lives and identities. The main issue with coercive modern marketing techniques that troubled many was that such tactics were completely antithetical to the American ideal of individual freedom, supremacy, and sovereignty (Holt, 2002). Thus, we think that Holt’s analysis alludes to inadequate application of the marketing orientation (i.e. marketer usurpation of an entrusted role of societal provisioning) as a reason for growing consumer disenchantment with adversarial commerce and thus demand for authenticity (see also Zuboff and Maxmin 2002).
Along similar lines, Arnould and Price (2000) indicate that postmodernity, “an economy dominated by [micro] marketing” (p. 140), is characterised by the loss of a sense of community. The authors show that postmodern market conditions such as globalisation, deterritorialisation, and hyperreality have created a situation where a person experiences life as empty, meaningless, and fragmented. As a result, there arises a strong urgency to bring the sense of community back to personal life, hence, more and more consumers resort to authenticating acts, i.e. practices that help them experience themselves and others as real. In addition, it is known that market players and institutions wholeheartedly embraced postmodern realities that aggravated consumer uncertainty and risk (Brown 1995b). Therefore, we believe that authenticating acts observed by Arnould and Price (2000) represent one of the consumer’s vital concerns in the contemporary marketplace.

In addition, Beverland and Farrelly (2010) demonstrated that authenticity sensitivities in the marketplace spring out from three interrelated consumer goals: sovereignty, connection to the (real) other, and morality. While consumers strive to uphold personal control over their consumption and see their own sovereignty as an important element of market participation, they would like to be connected to real people (whether marketers or fellow consumers) in real (i.e. unstaged) contexts. Beverland and Farrelly show that consumers strive to connect to sincere people who own or represent brands. Also, consumers want to closely experience and observe non-commercial passion, disinterestedness, and dedication to a profession exhibited by others in real life situations, specifically in marketing contexts. Last but not least, the authors show that consumers care about universal virtues that enable them to uphold best moral practices such as selflessness and non-materialism.

In this we see the quest for authenticity in markets that is underscored by consumer aspirations to become someone who does not fit the neoclassical depiction of economic man (Brockway 1995; Henderson 1978). Here, we realise that consumers stand out as active creators rather than being passive recipient utility maximisers. They aspire to exercise sovereignty and struggle to free themselves from imposed ‘consumption codes’ (Murray and Ozanne 1991). Research shows that most consumers reflexively and creatively resist marketer imposed meanings (Holt 2002). The view of the predictable consumer who is driven to maximise self-interest, obsessively pursue desires, and mechanically respond to marketing stimuli appears to be merely an abstraction from the social reality, or a simplistic illusion, that has been very convenient for behavioural modelling purposes (Daly, Cobb, and Cobb 1994). Actually, sovereignty is promised to consumers by the virtue of the marketing concept but at the same time denied by manipulative marketing practices (Brownlie and Saren 1992). Moreover, consumers are not downright egoists (Brockway 1995). There is no denial that people are naturally interested in self-wellbeing. However, they are also interested in the wellbeing, progress, and happiness of others (Daly, et al. 1994), as a sense of relationship and community is at the heart of being human (Arnould and Price 2000).

Authenticity Explained

Authenticity is a complex notion (Beverland 2009). One is likely to find different and in some instances contrasting definitions of the concept in the literature. Although the dictionary definition relates ‘authenticity’ to genuineness, sincerity, truth, and reality, these words can have different meanings to different people in different settings (Grayson and Martinec 2004). Nevertheless, Beverland and Farrelly (2010) say that “… despite the multiplicity of terms and interpretations applied to authenticity, ultimately what is consistent across the literature is that authenticity encapsulates what is genuine, real, and/or true” (p. 839). Although the meanings of the notion ‘authenticity’ used in marketing and/or consumption discourses are contextual and fluid, we believe that various explanations of this concept boil down to a single meta-idea: the marketer’s judgment about their own self-constructed status in
society. Paradoxical micro-managerial marketing techniques that operate in opposition to the original marketing logic have left consumers wondering about whether market offerings are the product of marketers’ self-selected intentionality (i.e. status) underscored by the pure profit motive, or in contrast, by genuine/sincere dedication to customer satisfaction. In other words, consumers are inclined to make judgment about whether marketers’ motivations are purely commercial versus communal or whether they are predominantly driven by economic self-interest over holistic community interest (some historians might invoke the authoritarian master-slave relationship to explain this). By shifting focus from authenticity being a product (brand) attribute to authenticity representing the marketer’s condition and self-understanding, we are moving closer toward the existential definition of the concept (Detmer 2008; Heter 2006; Sartre 1992). This is not an easy claim to make. The following discussion will hopefully lend some weight on our thesis.

Beverland (2005) summarises the literature in which researchers tend to operate along a continuum of degrees of ascribing authenticity to objects: at one of its extremes authenticity is considered to be inherent in an object, while at the other extreme authenticity is considered to be the object’s relation to other elements in the environment (e.g. place, time, history, tradition). In their recent research, Beverland and Farrelly (2010) argue that consumers do not see authenticity as an inherent attribute of a product. Rather consumers are shown to ascribe authenticity to what they observe in the behaviour of the members of a firm that sponsor a brand.

In tourism research, for example, the problem of authenticity is explained in a straightforward way: tourism commodifies the exposed areas of a community’s life that have been governed by benign community-based (i.e. localised) market forces prior to commoditisation and commercialisation (Cohen 1988; MacCannell 1973). Local culture “for sale” is not authentic, rather it becomes a meaningless duplicate (or emulation, perhaps insincere) of what used to be real (Cohen 1988). To make matters worse, a second wave of inauthenticity hits tourism markets, as marketers (this includes both foreigners and local members of society) who expropriate and appropriate local resources stage authenticity in response to tourists’ search for the real (MacCannell 1973). From this perspective, an authentic market offering is defined to be a good/service that has been made for personal or local community consumption. So it is the producer’s intention that makes the product more or less authentic. Taking this idea to a more general marketing level, we see that this is what consumers demand from producers: market offerings must be the result of sincere actions where such sincerity should match the sincerity of making similar products for the self or close community members. The profit motive must not taint the process. Rather profit is to be reward for authenticity in creating value.

Grayson and Martinec (2004) introduce the concepts of indexical and iconic authenticity. A product is considered to be indexically authentic if it is the real thing, the original, something that is free of imitating or copying. Indexically authentic products have a real proven spatial and temporal link to sources (e.g. place, people, events) that produce authenticity. An example is cottage cheese made for local or own consumption in a particular farm following local small-scale production processes. Can Edam cheese made in New Zealand be authentic? In contrast, a product is iconically authentic if it is very similar to what is perceived to be authentic. Here, ‘iconic’ refers to similarity or closeness of the product to the perceived authentic original (Grayson and Martinec 2004). Back to the same example, the local farm’s cottage cheese is iconically authentic if it is made for sale to distant communities following the same unique local production, recipe, and most importantly, the maker’s sincere communal attitude.

In search for indexical and iconic cues to identify the drivers of authenticity, practitioners and researchers seem to miss the forest for the trees, i.e. the ‘macro (big, whole) picture’. It seems that there is too much preoccupation with authenticity cues such as craftsmanship, tradition, performance quality and excellence, history, pedigree, place, etc. (Beverland 2005, 2009; Grayson and Martinec 2004), while most of the rhetoric seems to be focused on objects rather than processes. It is assumed
that if the marketer highlights or even fabricates or contrives a product’s link to relevant cues then the product is going to be perceived as more authentic. The irony here is that such fabrication (an insincere process) is thought to lead to an authentic product (an object). A number of examples given in the literature attest to marketer reliance on a great deal of fabrication including producers creating stylised accounts of actual historical events and personalities (story telling) (Beverland 2005; Peñaloza 2000; Spring 2003). There is much concern about staged authenticity in tourism as well (MacCannell 1973). There is no denial that marketers can manipulate the cues and consumer perceptions of authenticity to attain short-term effects (Beverland, 2009). Indirectly, this is our concern here. The question we should be asking is what is the main underlying reason for why some (though not all) indexical or iconic cues assume a higher status in the eye of consumers. The answer can be found when we look at the issue in the light of the arguments posited in the tourism research. Authentic products are goods made for own or local small community consumption where there is no chrematistic (wealth extraction) agenda (the source of indexical authenticity). Similarly, at a more general level, products can become (iconically) authentic if they are created exactly following the original conditions and procedures that had a communal character and were free from the profit motive. We believe that posited cues such as craftsmanship or production excellence (i.e. quality) are only as good as the producer’s communal intention or communal conditions that driven a value-creation process. Objects become valuable if the process of creation is underlined by passion for excellence, commitment to craftsmanship, and selfless effort coupled with indifference to profit, growth or money hoarding. Holt (2002) states that “... to be authentic, brands must be disinterested; they must be perceived as invented and disseminated by parties without an instrumental economic agenda, by people who are intrinsically motivated by their inherent value. Postmodern consumers perceive modern branding efforts to be inauthentic because they ooze with the commercial intent of their sponsors” (p. 83).

From a different perspective, existentialists explain authenticity through positing what authenticity is not (Detmer 2008; Sartre 1992; Seeman 1966). Existentialists do not use the authenticity concept to mean “being true to one's roots and heritage” (Heter 2006, p. 3). Neither does the concept mean one’s success in conformity to historical, traditional, stereotypical assumptions or patterns. They argue that if an element of history or a particular tradition is fundamentally flawed, then sticking to one’s history does not make an entity authentic (as viewed from the societal perspective).

Heter (2006) claims that the concept of authenticity is deeply linked to moral virtues, therefore researchers must always maintain its positive connotation. Heter goes further explaining why something like ‘authentically evil’ is impossible while stating that terms like ‘authentic Nazi’ are inherently paradoxical. Hence, from Heter’s point of view one cannot be authentic and evil at the same time.

According to Sartre (1992), the guru of existential philosophy, authenticity is the absence of inauthenticity: one can only attain authenticity is s/he can avoid inauthenticity. For Sartre (1992), inauthenticity (which he calls bad faith) is latent self-deception based on a perception that the person is literally fixed to his/her occupational role. Hence, Sartre’s philosophy demonstrates that authenticity and the view of the self (in society) are fundamentally linked. From his point of view, if one’s view of the self is based on a wrong assumption or distinction, then the outcome of his/her behaviour is going to be judged to be more or less inauthentic.

Building on Sartre’s argument, Seeman (1966) notes that inauthenticity arises due to one’s nervousness about his/her status in social relationships: inauthenticity refers to “the individual’s over-reaction to the occupancy of a given status” (p. 68). For example, a black person may act in an unnatural way to project his/her cultured manner to prove anti-black stereotyping wrong. Similarly, Seeman’s (1966) research showed that black children attach greater importance to the colour of skin thereby applying an “irrelevant status criterion”. Seeman says that ‘irrelevant’ means undemonstrated. It is undemonstratable (or even ethically incorrect to consider) that a colour of skin makes a person
better/worse (cultured/uncultured). Thus, there exist two problems that give rise to cases of inauthenticity. First, people accept a given (possibly wrong) social status as crucial to the ways they live their lives and define themselves. Second, based on this perception of a status they act in a manner that is not natural to them (i.e. overreaction) which signals inauthenticity.

Seeman (1966) makes a clear distinction between inauthenticity and other human acts such as dishonesty and dissimulation. In the case of dishonesty, a person is not self-deceived about his own status. For example, a conman is certainly sure about his/her self-identity. Similarly, inauthenticity is not dissimulation where what one says differs from what he does. Following this line of reasoning, existentialists agree that authenticity can be defined as lucid (open) consciousness about one’s status (Detmer 2008; Sartre 1992; Seeman 1966).

**Authenticity of Marketing**

The marketing philosophy is a vision that is in need of authentic and sincere application (Brown 1995a; Varey 2010). Researchers note that marketing will remain an empty ideology if not applied sincerely in the marketplace (Brownlie and Saren 1992). Authentic marketing cannot be achieved if the marketer’s passion is solely invested in making more money (for self or investors), while the marketing concept implies passionate pursuit of the other’s (consumer, stakeholders) interest as a means of attaining goals, which requires genuine commitment to creating solutions for betterment of life.

Ever since Peter Drucker elevated marketing into the status of the paramount function of business in the 1950s and the resulting excessive micromarketing ideologisation and idealisation of the marketing concept has resulted in ensuing marketing conflagration in both academia and practice (Brown 1995a), marketing as a unique system of societal provisioning has faced a profound conundrum. Whether we call it the crisis of representation or a macromarketing paradox, which is deeply embedded in how the marketing concept relates to the assumed ultimate reason for existence of a commercial enterprise, the essence of the conundrum is simple. To be marketing oriented, businesses must exhibit genuine concern for consumer satisfaction and well-being, while the neo-classical interpretation of ultimate marketing objectives, namely unlimited growth, profit-maximisation, unchecked pursuit of self-interest, and rampant commercialisation, do not really fit the proposed prescription (Kilbourne, McDonagh, and Prothero 1997; Varey 2010). Although many companies claim to embrace the marketing orientation that is premised upon giving prevalence to consumer interests over anything else, few companies appear to have sincerely implemented it. Rather, much marketing still involves manipulation and creation of consumer demand instead of expected anticipation and satisfaction of existing real needs (Brownlie and Saren 1992). Genuineness is signalled via the directedness of human passion. As common citizens (in both marketing and other occupations) realise that most marketing passion is in fact invested in self-interest (i.e. meeting company needs first), and self-interest is in conflict with other (e.g. consumer, community-driven) goals more than often, they tend to grow more sceptical about the genuineness of brands and corporate claims that self-deceptively keep driving a standard marketing logic home while pretending to be sincerely concerned with consumer interests, and thereby societal interests. Hence, marketing practitioners by adopting neo-classical prerogatives have cornered themselves in a self-perpetual paradox which is not only underlined by other-deception but also by self-deception (Woodall 2012).

It needs to be emphasised that a holistic analysis of marketing development is more likely to detect a profound link between marketing and authenticity. Holt’s (2002) analysis of the dialectical evolution of market culture is one of the exemplary studies. By studying how marketing has dialectically evolved in response to consumers’ authenticity demands, Holt concludes that ‘authentic marketing’ is the marketing of the future (Table 1).
In the study, Holt offers an operational definition of authenticity: the concept refers to consumers’ judgement of the brand’s distance from the profit motive. In other words, authenticity means disinterestedness (i.e. opposite of self-interest).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Marketing Epochs</th>
<th>Principles</th>
<th>Strategy</th>
<th>Authenticity as defined and assessed by consumers</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Modern (1920s-1960s)</td>
<td>Cultural Engineering</td>
<td>Using science to coerce consumers in to lifestyles that serve business interests</td>
<td>Authenticity refers to disinterestedness; low because of unbalanced emphasis on growth and profit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Postmodern (1960s-to date)</td>
<td>Building ‘authentic’ cultural resources</td>
<td>Using postmodern marketing techniques (e.g. latching onto popular culture) to create ‘real’ brands</td>
<td>Refers to disinterestedness; low because the ‘staged authenticity’ still reveals the profit motive</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Post-postmodern (future)</td>
<td>Citizen-Artist</td>
<td>Brands do not hide the profit motive; Brands become original cultural resources</td>
<td>Refers to the relevance of cultural resources; high because of cultural originality</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Holt argues that in the modern marketing era circa 1920-1960s marketers were implicitly accepted as cultural experts and granted ‘market’ authority to genuinely direct people toward success, happiness, and satisfactory lifestyle as per the marketing concept. As the profit drive has resulted in excessive competitiveness, imitations, mimetic action, and the use of science for manipulative influence, consumers have become disillusioned in supposedly noble aspirations of marketers. Holt argues further that marketers realising the extent of consumer discontent and citizens’ detest of the breach of an implicit social contract have started using postmodern marketing techniques that helped to portray brands and marketers as ‘authentic’. As more and more companies jumped on the bandwagon of crafting (staging) authenticity (still predominantly to so-called “audiences”), it has become evident to consumers that the artifice of claimed authenticity is simply a mask that conceals the thirst for more profits. Marketers got it wrong again, their over-reaction to the desired status made them look ever more inauthentic. Besides, consumer activists’ and countercultural movements were on watch: their ‘sharp eye’ could still penetrate the veneer of carefully crafted ‘genuineness’ that has been put in the service of commercialism and profiteering (Holt 2002). In envisioning the future, Holt was hopeful that there will come time when all businesses will openly admit their profit drive, while offering brands as original cultural resources that would uniquely contribute to consumer identity projects. In expressing this hope, Holt stops short of challenging the status quo of self-interest in the modern market systems. Instead, he thinks that if everyone realised that businesses are there to primarily pursue self-interest, then ‘the standard of disinterestedness’ is going to be replaced by the judgement of original cultural contribution.

Discussion: Micromarketing and Inauthenticity
Based on preceding discussion, we distinguish two sources of inauthenticity:
• Direct inauthenticity. Managers wholeheartedly embrace a narrow view of own role in society that is enforced by existing institutional foundations in society (Kilbourne et al. 1997). Instead of seeing themselves as ‘provisioners’, marketers construct neo-classically biased self-identity, a cynical professional, who is morally obliged to “generate” profit at any cost. This is an incorrect criterion for self-assessment: excellence in profit generation or pursuing self-interest does not make one superior to the others. An analogy is children who think that skin colour is a crucial factor of superiority (Seeman 1966). At least, we now know that the pursuit of self-interest, and the outcome of this process in the form of excess material wealth, will guarantee neither professional self-fulfilment nor ultimate happiness.

• Self-referential inauthenticity. Marketers realise that the focus on self-interest is not what consumers or society want from brands, businesses, and managers. Consumers demand authenticity; they value marketing that genuinely distances itself from the profit motive. As the marketing orientation implies absolute dedication to the cause of the consumer, marketers tend to experience a profound conundrum that leads to latent nervousness about the conflict between own assumed status and what is required from them. Such nervousness is exhibited in marketers’ involvement in manipulative micromarketing practices that focus on being ‘real’. The paradox of self-reference is obvious here: marketing practices initiated to create a veneer of the marketer’s ‘authenticity signal at a macro level that these practices are inauthentic. No wonder that some modern stealth and covert marketing techniques are directed at misleading consumers about the identity of a true information sponsor. It would be of interest to investigate whether mainstream marketing practices are specifically directed at misleading, discouraging, and punishing consumers for macro-thinking (i.e. thinking about marketer’s authenticity).

We believe that micromarketing as a general phenomenon in society is the outcome of marketers’ over-reaction to their assumed irrelevant status in society. Micromarketing practices are simply natural patterns of behaviour that result from introduced biases to understanding marketing from a neo-classical perspective.

At a more general level, society has to decide what is acceptable – no longer adequate ethically to claim that “it’s only business”. A balanced ethical stance on quality of life in terms of resource use and outcomes won’t allow for dog-eat-dog and profit-at-any price thinking, nor allow externalities and we can’t afford to be responsible to each other. The foundational question is what do we want marketing to do for us individually and communally?

References


Daly, H. E., Cobb, J. B., and Cobb, C. (1994), For the Common Good: Redirecting the Economy Toward Community, the Environment, and a Sustainable Future, Boston: Beacon Press.


Reconstructing Macromarketing Management: The Building Blocks

Christine Domegan, National University of Ireland Galway, Ireland
Stanley J. Shapiro, Simon Fraser University, Canada

What follows is an interim report on an effort to see whether intellectual developments over the last third of a century have provided the concepts and perspectives necessary for a reformulation and updating of Zif’s (1980) original discussion of macromarketing management. The paper’s point of departure is Zif’s initial position and the very limited macromarketing literature that directly responded to his 1980 Journal of Marketing article. It is then argued that one preceding but currently underutilized marketing area of thought, Alderson’s concept of the organized behavior system (Alderson 1957, 1965), and three more recent ones: (1)1980s writings on the political economy of marketing and on the “parallel political marketplace” (Hutt, Mokwa and Shapiro 1986); (2) Peterson’s discussion of “Sustainable Enterprise” (2013) and (3) relationship marketing (Marques and Domegan, 2011,) all have some thing important to contribute to a reformulation of macromarketing management though such a reformulation remains a “work in progress”.

Zif on Macromarketing Management

The concept of macromarketing management was aggressively championed by Jehiel Zif in an article published in the Journal of Marketing in the Winter of 1980 (Zif 1980). He argued that the macro literature of the time was too greatly influenced by a “social facts” approach which sought to account for change but not induce it and which did not include managerial intentions among its explanatory factors. Zif notes that Bartels and Jenkins (1978) share the assessment that macromarketing has usually been thought of as unmanaged but they proposed that the concept of macromarketing management be limited to the administration of public policy enforcement of laws and to the regulation of macromarketing behavior.

Zif accepts no such limitation. “I contend that macromarketing management is a viable concept that goes beyond public policy administration. Moreover, the primary variables used to study micromarketing management can be adapted to the macro context to become valuable tools for analysis. Unlike the more common social facts approach, the managerial approach accords a central role to managers’ behavior” (Zif 1980, p.37). He then proceeds to identify a large number of macromanaged marketing institutions throughout the world.

Zif next advocates assigning each such organization to its appropriate place in a 2x2 matrix depending on a) whether or not there is a central marketing authority, and b) if, in either case, the flow of goods and services is actually being directed or merely regulated. In this section Zif observes that “dominant business firms, because of their market position, create through their marketing activities significant social consequences and thus have joint micro/macro responsibilities” (Zif 1980, p 38). This position was taken long before triple bottom line thinking and the concept of stakeholder management had, either in name or in fact, received any significant degree of public or even managerial recognition.
Zif maintains that the types of institutions requiring macromarketing management that he discussed are a significant and growing factor in Western economies. He obviously did not anticipate the very pronounced move toward deregulation so characteristic both of the Reagan years in the United States and the Thatcher era in Great Britain that was to follow. Nevertheless many such institutions still exist and new ones have been established.

After Zif argued for the relatively widespread existence of macromarketing management, he proceeded to discuss what he considered to be the dual tasks of macromarketing managers.

When a comprehensive macromarketing responsibility is created, part of the exchange system is transferred from the marketplace to the political arena. The resulting two kinds of exchanges require two different tasks: managerial control in the product or services markets and cultivation of public support in political markets.

Managerial control is concerned with the functional management of the enterprise. Its key elements are familiar from micromarketing: marketing organization, information systems, investment projects (including R & D), marketing-mix decisions, and product quantity decisions. Public support can be divided into the public-at-large, political intermediaries (i.e., parties, government agents), and special interest groups. While there is interactive influence between the three, their positions and responses are not identical. (Zif 1980, pp. 40-41).

This is followed by the introduction of another 2x2 matrix; high and low degrees of managerial control on one scale, and high and low degrees of public support on the other. Zif then proceeds to classify various types of macromarketing managed organizations as having either a social performance orientation (high on both scales), a primarily political orientation, essentially a business orientation, or, finally, if found low on both scales, a passive orientation.

Table 1, (Zif 1980, p. 44)
Though Zif then proceeded to explore a number of interesting measurement and positioning issues, these are not germane to the task at hand. What is relevant, however, is the comparison he made in the Table that follows of the marked differences in how micromarketing and macromarketing managers should respond to the same marketing factors and concerns.

Zif’s *Journal of Marketing* article, based on a paper previously presented by him at the 1979 Macromarketing Seminar, never made that much of an intellectual impact on the marketing thought that was to follow. Academic marketing’s dominant strain of traditional 4P advocates continued to limit itself to helping individual enterprises prosper though some of those institutions were now not-for-profits or had a social marketing focus. The emerging sub-discipline of macromarketing, on the other hand, devoted most of its time and energy to exploring how well the marketing system did (or could) serve as society’s provisioning technology in both already developed and still developing economies. To the extent that there was, and presumably currently is, a prevailing “mainstream” macromarketing position on the issue of macromarketing management, it is the one taken by Nason in 1988, shortly after he became the third editor of the *Journal of Macromarketing*.

In summary, any analysis related to marketing decisions conducted from the perspective of the organization—private, not-for-profit or government—is classified as micromarketing. The assessment of marketing activities as they relate to society, the understanding of the systems of these activities, and the redesign of the sanction systems within which these activities take place are the domain of macromarketing. ....

The inclusion of managerial functions in the domain of macromarketing has been suggested by Zif (1980). Among them is the management of markets by government organizations. Food marketing boards which set price and allocate supplies to markets illustrate this type of organization. Marketing analysis which identifies the need for such organizations, structures their form and authority, and measures their performance in achieving the objectives of society falls into the macromarketing domain. Marketing analysis which helps the achievement of organizational objectives is micromarketing in level. (Nason 1988, p.3)

Nason obviously promoted a much narrower definition of what would constitute macromarketing management than had Zif. However, in the twenty five years that followed, very little attention was paid even to the areas that Nason did define as falling into the domain of macromarketing management. The remainder of this paper is devoted to exploring intellectual developments and concepts that should prove useful in any meaningful reexamination of the concept of macromarketing management.

**What Alderson’s organized behavior system concept can and does contribute;**

Wroe Alderson implicitly wrote of macromarketing management in 1957 through his concept of an “organized group behavior” or ecological system being the theoretical foundation of marketing. His concern was with human interactions and the explicit inclusion of environmental and macro variables that influence markets and choices. Alderson’s ecological system’s view argues that markets and marketing are affected through numerous group influences, rather than just the restricted effect of
individual psychosocial variables. He further explains that the properties of any system are derived from the relationships between its parts - in marketing’s case, he maintains the focus is on the group’s power and communication subsystem behaviors and actions.

Despite Alderson’s stance that a firm’s exchange behavior is not an independent function, macromarketing management was quickly limited to the Zifian micro-management perspective. As evident in Zif’s interpretation, it became a discourse on planning and control of the 4P’s from the linear, rigid “viewpoint of the individual” (Alderson, 1957, p.20) who knew best at a ‘larger level’ (Bartels and Jenkins, 1977), albeit the individual was, in macromarketing management parlance, the government or industry regulator and not the firm. As presented by Zif, macromarketing management was “management using authoritarian and persuasive techniques, by government regulation and by social convention and custom” (Reidenbach and Oliva, 1983, p. 171). According to Alderson, this has all the hallmarks of a “fully developed power system….in which communication is still at a very rudimentary level” (Alderson, 1957, p.40). Hence Zif’s 2 x 2 matrix, whereby macromarketing management is closed, concentrating on the economically rational and its associated dyad management (Chandler and Vargo, 2011). Macro actors effectively ‘market the desired behavior to’ the subordinate micro levels (Lusch, Vargo and O’Brien, 2007). Not surprisingly Aldersonian thinking suggests Zif’s matrix is an oversimplified suboptimal macromarketing management approach with insufficient time given to the definition and clarification of societal issues or value. In effect, Zif proposed a reductionist macromarketing style with a myopic focus on top-down management strategies where control is about the linearity of communication.

Furthermore, Zif’s marcomarketing marketing, adopting as it does a mechanistic or reductionist marketing system paradigm as defined by Alderson, segregates stakeholders into three contexts – macro, meso and micro environmental levels where, as McHugh and Domegan (in press) explain

Macros stakeholders subsume control and coercive power at the top of the hierarchy. A reductionistic strategy equates to deconstruction managemenr, whereby macro makers confine the deliberation of events to a select group of stakeholders who are functionally necessary to one another (Lewis and Erickson, 1969). This has the effect of inhibiting communications and knowledge flows from multiple levels in society (Jaworski, Kohli and Sahay, 2000).

Value creation under such a reductionism macromarketing management view becomes sequential and unidirectionally transitive as macro social actors create value, and meso and micro level stakeholders consume and destroy value (Ramirez, 1999). Authoritative and competitive strategies create efficient, timely and economic solutions to individual components of the overall societal issue.”

The true essence of macromarketing management envisioned by Alderson, through organized group behavior, is made possible through his sense of integration and ‘co-ordination’. It is an approach no longer reflecting Zif’s mechanistic “Central Marketing Authority” with its “Central Coordination” but rather Alderson’s ecological fluid networks of networks where the bonds are “loose enough to allow for the replacement or addition of components” (Alderson, 1957, p.32). This captures a broader picture still, a synthesis well beyond Zif, focusing on the compound structures, functions, processes and environments in which actors engage.
"The co-integration of multiple stakeholder levels is seen as evolutionary, non-linear and interactive, requiring intensive communication, collaboration and feedback between societal actors from macro, mesco and micro levels (Todtling and Trippl, 2005). This approach to macromarketing management is challenging, in that it is difficult to manage the process of selecting who the stakeholders are, how to bring the groups together, considering the possible outcomes and solutions to complex policy issues and the facilitation of exchanges and interactions between the diverse stakeholder groups" (McHugh and Domegan, in press).

Table 2 below summaries the inherent different between Zif’s Mechanistic view and Alderson’s Ecological stance as regards macromarketing management.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Governance Style</th>
<th>Jif’s Mechanistic Macromarketing System</th>
<th>Alderson’s Ecological Macromarketing system</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>System Structure</td>
<td>Hierarchical</td>
<td>Collaborative</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Focus</td>
<td>Find a solution</td>
<td>Make an improvement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Boundaries between Levels</td>
<td>Boundaries well delineated</td>
<td>Boundaries blurred</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Integration of Values and Facts</td>
<td>Separation of values and facts</td>
<td>Complex mixing of value and facts</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mode of Interaction</td>
<td>Transfer is linear (one-sided)</td>
<td>Transfer is non-linear (two-sided)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Type of Output</td>
<td>Product</td>
<td>Process</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Type of Knowledge Use</td>
<td>Instrumental use</td>
<td>Reflexive use</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Feedback</td>
<td>Closed feedback loops</td>
<td>Double / Triple feedback loops</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 2, Zif vs Alderson, (McHugh and Domegan, in press)

A comparison of Alderson with Zif’s underlying marketing assumptions reveals Zif’s macromarketing centralized data bank thinking as far too limiting. Hastings and Domegan (in press) explain that co-learning - information acquisition, information dissemination and shared interpretation - also has to be part of macromarketing management. Without co-learning, there can be no balance between power and communication subsystems. Furthermore the co-learning is across and within sectors, markets and society levels, this avoiding an oversimplified 4P hierarchical management of markets and marketing. The expanded co-learning view has to include knowledge transfer, exchange and generation with:

“knowledge transfer as the flow of information from knowledge producers to knowledge users, for example from researchers and scholars to policy makers and professionals“ (McHugh and Domegan, in press). “Knowledge exchange is shared learning and communication between problem-solvers with a propensity to act as seen in Healthy Cities where local police, hospitals, health agencies, retailers and resident communities work together to tackle college binge-drinking. Knowledge generation denotes the tacit and explicit knowledge shared continuously by all actors, i.e. the experiential insights“ (Hastings and Domegan, in press).
From this perspective, macromarketing management moves from Zif’s simple, economic rationality to a position reflecting Alderson’s sense of complex, societal co-created exchanges within markets that optimize the overall benefit from the total markets and marketing process. Not just social benefit but long term societal benefit is the objective. No longer is Zif’s mechanistic “Directing the Flow of Goods and Services” the focus, but rather Alderson’s multiple value co-creation levels of networks and, as well, his sense a of an open, ‘plasticity’ marketing. Plasticity does indeed require openness and demands active public participation in decision making and strategy design, formulation, implementation and evaluation.

This is a bottom-up/top-down reflective learning process, premised on Alderson’s marketing concept of ‘organized group behavior’, with its interconnected power and communication networks to co-ordinate markets and marketing. It directly links to internal and external values proposed by Hutt, Mokwa and Shapiro in 1986 for macromarketing management utilizing the Parallel Political Marketplace.

The Parallel Political Marketplace

Cultivating public support was identified by Zif as one of the two major tasks of macromarketing management. However, the complexities of doing that and of operating effectively within a political context are not fully explored by him. In particular he makes no explicit reference to “the politics of distribution”, a topic first examined by Palamountain some twenty five years earlier.(1955).

At approximately the same time that Zif’s article appeared, Arndt (1979, 1981, 1983) was employing political economy perspectives in the analysis of entire marketing systems. Also, a series of Stern, Reeve and Achrol (1980, 1983, 1983) articles were focusing more specifically on the political economy of the distribution channel. A few years later Hutt, Mokwa and Shapiro (1986) introduced the concept of the “parallel political marketplace”. The following extract from Hutt, Mokwa and Shapiro argues that there are external as well as internal dimensions of the political economy of the marketing channel that must be explored.

...political economy analysis of distribution channels has implicitly emphasized economic values, internal structural and process dynamics, and (treated) the external economy and polity as exogenous forces shaping and constraining internal channel dimensions. ..... 

The parallel political marketplace conceptualization extends the political economy framework to include a parallel political network operating in the same organized market domain as the distribution channel. The political economy framework is internally consistent with earlier conceptualizations of markets (Alderson 1957, 1965) and the "politics of marketing" (Palamountain1955, Thorelli 1964). It explicitly demonstrates that economic and political forces coalesce into "organized behavior systems" or "domesticated market domains." Accordingly, market systems can be defined in terms of parties, relationships, and actions which enhance and facilitate both the performance and the prevention or prohibition of marketing exchanges (Goodman 1979, Stidsen 1979). The collective and dual nature, economic and political, of market systems is established and accentuated using the political economy framework.....

As the analysis of the distribution channel conventionally emphasizes economic issues, values, performance, and institutions, the analysis of the parallel political "channel" emphasizes
political issues, values, and performance, as well as a concomitant network of political organizations and actors (Hutt, Mokwa and Shapiro 1986, p. 42, 43).

Hutt, Mokwa and Shapiro then go on to explore in considerable detail first the different dimensions and then the managerial implications of parallel political marketplace thinking. This is done in a way that provides far more direction to prospective marketing managers interested in cultivating public support than Zif did.

In their analysis of exchange dynamics within the parallel political marketplace (or PPM), Hutt, Mokwa and Shapiro discuss, in turn, four dimensions of such inter-organizational networks. First, a number of the power and/or authority issues that emerge in multi-party negotiations receive considerable attention. Next discussed are the “partisan mutual adjustment processes”, the manner in which collective problem solving takes place and decisions are finally made. Though what is revealed is not, from an economic theory or administrative science perspective a pretty picture, it seemed then, and still seems over twenty five years later, to be a realistic one.

Collective problem solving efforts that span diverse organizations in the parallel political marketplace fit the properties of an "organized anarchy" in that individual and collective needs are often inconsistent and poorly defined; means to achieve goals are often unclear, as are the consequences of collective action; and multiple partisan groups--each controlling different amounts of power, information, and competence--enter and leave the decision-making process as their coalitions dictate. (Hutt, Mokwa and Shapiro 1986, p. 45)

Next attention is called, under the heading of “working sentiments”, to the need for a long term perspective during which period a workable relationship or understanding, admittedly often an uneasy and shifting one, develops. Note in this regard the linkage to Aldersonian theory that is made below.

The parallel political marketplace can be conceptualized as an organized behavior system in which norms and customs develop across time through the exchange process of participants (Alderson 1957, Stidsen 1979). Negotiation, bargaining, and partisan mutual adjustment are central to this exchange process. Thus, while each party pursues a partisan interest, working sentiments and, ultimately, rules develop that govern both the nature of interorganizational relations and the manner in which change occurs in the political marketplace. (Hutt, Mokwa and Shapiro 1986, p. 45)

The remainder of this section then discusses the uneasy and shifting balance between conflict and cooperation that characterizes parallel political marketplace behavior.

Change strategies are the final dimension of the PPM concept to be discussed. Particular attention is paid to the differences between the four primary change making (or change forcing) strategies—cooperative, disruptive, authoritative and sequential. Examples of each strategy being used were then provided but these were all specific to the period and need not be mentioned here. However, more contemporary examples could easily be provided.

Next, and finally, explored were PPM’s managerial and public policy implications, with the role of the marketing department operating in such a marketplace being highlighted. Particular attention was paid to the marketing function’s need to coordinate with the firm’s public affairs or public relations
unit. From a public policy perspective, the authors regretfully comment upon the unfortunate fact that the consumer protection legacy of the preceding two decades had been shaped, not by careful analysis of public policy issues and concerns, but rather by “disjointed incrementalism”, legislative action taken in response to particular problems highlighted by consumer advocates and the media (Hutt, Mokwa and Shapiro 1986).

Hopefully, the relevance of parallel political marketplace thinking to Zif’s concept of macromarketing management has been made clear. Macromarketing managers charged with cultivating public support are quite likely to be competing, as well if not primarily, in a parallel political marketplace. That being so, PPM thinking, after being appropriately updated, seems an essential building block component of any revised and revitalized concept of macromarketing management.

**Peterson, Sustainable Enterprise, and Managerial Macromarketing**

Mark Peterson’s *Sustainable Enterprise: A Macromarketing Approach* (2013) makes seminal contributions both to the history of macromarketing thought and to the further development of the concept of the Sustainable Enterprise. It is far closer to being a macromarketing text than any thing else that has been published in the last third of a century. Surprisingly enough, however, familiar macromarketing concepts are presented, not in the context Zif employed, but rather in a way designed to help entrepreneurial managers develop effective marketing strategies. Though this is not always the case, a useful summary of both the intended focus and the uniqueness of this text is provided by descriptive promotional material found on its back cover.

The text goes beyond the internal firm strategies of micromarketing and the “four Ps” to take a broader perspective focused on the interconnectedness of markets, marketing and society. Based on the premise that firms using holistic marketing strategies are better able to assess risks and identify opportunities, this text explains how to create compelling and effective marketing plans designed to benefit the company, key stakeholders, and society at large. The result is a one-of-a-kind book that successfully explores macromarketing for sustainable enterprise (Peterson 2013, back cover).

The publication of *Sustainable Enterprise: A Macromarketing Approach* was considered an important intellectual event that merited more than a traditional *Journal of Macromarketing* book review. Rather, a special, four item section on the Peterson volume is to be found in the December, 2012 issue of that journal. Any number of interesting topics are raised in that special section and a case could be made for its being read in full before the text itself is examined.

Especially noteworthy, is an excerpt from Shelby Hunt’s comparison (2012) in that special JMK section on the Peterson volume with Hutt and Moyer (1978), the last text published with macromarketing in its title.

“Moyer and Hutt’s approach was descriptive and evaluative, but not managerial in thrust. In contrast, Peterson’s approach is described in the Preface as being ‘about managerial macromarketing’. That is, not only does Peterson describe and evaluate. He also offers specific guidance for managing firms from a macromarketing perspective. ... As Peterson puts it in Chapter 1, ‘marketing strategists and entrepreneurs do not have to begin from scratch ... they
can draw upon the accumulated knowledge of more than 30 years of macromarketing research.” (Hunt 2012, p. 406)

*Sustainable Enterprise* is indeed an impressive publication with each of its fifteen chapters providing numerous examples of how exciting, and even inspiring, concepts, some from the macromarketing literature but others not, are being applied by forward looking managers. One of the most interesting of these “new to macromarketing” ideas is that of the Five Capital View of Capitalism that Peterson, building on Amory Lovins (Hopkins 2009), introduces. “Lovins uses a wide lens to view capitalism and does not only see capitalism as the productive use of financial and physical capital (money and goods) but he also sees two additional forms of valuable capital—people and nature (Peterson 2013, p. 22). Lovins goes on to argue, on the basis of his work in thirty different sectors of the economy, that firms which use all four kinds of capital “make more money, do more good, and have more fun”. Further refining the Lovins approach, Peterson (2013) divides the “people dimension” into two kinds of capital—human capital (talents, abilities and focused interests of people) and social capital (the willingness and capacity of people to cooperate with others). This expansion of the more generally accepted concept of “triple bottom line” thinking would appear to deserve careful consideration.

As Reppel correctly notes in his JMK commentary (2012), there is a strong ideological underpinning to Peterson’s approach. It is written, unquestionably and unashamedly, from what has come to be called the developmental perspective and reflects the associated belief that firms operating in the marketplace with a social conscience and a five C focus will collectively help to move us a long way toward the vision of a globally sustainable society. Though this developmental, or perhaps “reformist” view has long been, and likely remains, the prevailing macromarketing mind set, the growing “critical marketing” school of thought within macromarketing is both far less positive and far less optimistic (Reppel 2012).

What can be said of the relationship between Peterson’s view of “managerial macromarketing” as both a required and a highly beneficial private sector activity and Zif’s concept of “macromarketing management”? Zif did recognize that some market dominant corporations had to manage with macro as well as micro considerations in mind but he was prepared to exempt smaller firms from being required to do so.

Similarly, dominant business firms, because of their market position, create through their marketing activities significant societal consequences and thus have joint micro/macro responsibilities. While firms with limited market shares often do assume social responsibilities, these responsibilities are more limited and are, for the most part, optional. Most dominant firms have assumed macro responsibilities on their own, being aware that their freedom of action is restricted by their visibility and potential public action (Zif 1980, p. 38).

However, the major focus of Zif’s work is the macromarketing management responsibilities and processes of crown corporations, quasi-governmental bodies such as marketing boards and regulatory agencies. Obviously, Peterson has gone well beyond this since he assigns major managerial macromarketing responsibilities to any and all private sector organizations. Obviously, his thinking will thus play a major role in any reformulation of “macromarketing management”. On the other hand, it would indeed be helpful to the still further development of that concept if in future editions of *Sustainable Enterprise* Peterson were also to explore managerial macromarketing, as he sees it applying in today’s world, to the far wider range of organizations with which Zif was concerned.
Relationship marketing and its relevance to macromarketing management;

The progression from Alderson’s organised behavior system through PPM thinking to Peterson’s sustainable enterprise also reveals Relationship Marketing as a domain that offers additional foundational concepts useful in reformulating macromarketing management. Attributed to Berry in 1983 and reflecting his service marketing approach, the term, Relationship Marketing (RM) emerged and was embraced as a paradigm shift by many authors. Straddling several sub-disciplines of marketing- business-to-business marketing, marketing channels, retailing, consumer marketing and non-profits--RM has particular characteristics that make it relevant to macromarketing management. These include the absence of the profit motive; the focus on long term decisions; complex and multifaceted behaviors; changes that take a long time; and the relevance of trust and partnerships (Hastings, 2003; Christopher et al, 1991; Grönroos, 2006; 2004 and 2000). As a result, RM is capable of responding to the macromarketing management complexities of Alderson’s Ecological marketing, to Hutt, Mokwa and Shapiro’s PPM and to Peterson’s Sustainable Enterprise as

Relationship marketing is contextualised in society as a whole and defined as the ongoing process of engaging in cooperative and collaborative activities and programmes with......value added activity through mutual interdependence and collaboration (Marques and Domegan, 2011, p.4)

Relationship marketing, in contrast to Zif’s mechanistic macromarketing, and in support of the PPM and 5 C’s reveals

the roles of producers, sellers, buyers and consumers are blurring, compared to traditional marketing where the seller and the buyer (marketing actors) have well defined roles, where they independently create values and there is a place and time of transaction that can be easily articulated for exchange. The relationship is, instead, a process of value creation through cooperative and collaborative effort (Sheth and Parvatiyar, 2000). Therefore RM is an alternative paradigm where \textit{value creation replaces value distribution}; the focus is on the processes of relationship engagement and not on the outcome or consequence of relationship” (Marques and Domegan, 2011, p.6).

Macromarketing management is primarily a form of markets and marketing-oriented management. Hence, relationship building and maintenance is at its core. Marques and Domegan (2011) further point out that such relational exchanges demand innovative ways of thinking about macromarketing issues as

the main contributions of relationship marketing is that it helps to uncover fundamental contradictions in, and challenges to, current marketing thinking. First and foremost, the collaboration is ... co-creation of value....total value.

A key requirement in relationship marketing is that management is defined as being service orientated, that is, a more holistic system offering, one capturing the PPM’s internal and external economic and social value, is demanded. This requires a transition from the product as the dominating element to the management of human resources, technology, knowledge, governance and time and is
clearly in alignment with Peterson’s 5 C call. Furthermore, Peterson’s emphasis on human and social competences and resources is crucial and requires a process macro service management perspective. The whole chain of activities has to be coordinated and managed as one total value process if Zif’s mechanistic macromarketing management, with its sub-optimization of function and elements and its drive towards specialization within its functions, rather than collaboration between functions, is to be avoided. The result is a renewed focus on Alderson’s total value for all in society rather than on Zif’s creation of sub-values for some, notably government, marketing authorities or dominant commercial firms.

What are the core management elements of this RM process perspective? Marques and Domegan (2010) identified three key RM processes most transferable to macromarketing to be communication/dialogue; interaction and value co-creation. With communication and interaction discussed above, the attention here turns to an understanding of individual and collective value creation and interconnections.

“Values are subjective and encompass many meanings. The value rationale invites the marketer to understand each other as ‘feelers’, ‘thinkers’ and ‘doers’ within the context of their lives and social structures. This has been termed value co-creation, and involves value co-discovery, co-design and co-delivery. It acknowledges individual behavior change as an essential part of broader social change.

For any large scale societal benefit to accrue to marketing, there needs to be a cooperative system of values in place – people need to work together to agree on ‘what really matters’. This is macromarketing, organized group behavior system means, expanding the exchange agenda beyond the customer and organisation or government to networks of stakeholders. In this way, and propelled by networked partnerships of shared values, marcomarketing strategies can genuinely start to address the broad challenges of societal change. Above all it provides the necessary complexity and sophistication we need to tackle the great multifactorial problems – most notably global warming – that humankind now faces” (Hastings and Domegan, in press).

For value co-creation, transformational partnerships become central to, and closely aligned with, complex, holistic PPM networks of organised behavior. A partnership study drawing on over 50 years of writings, case studies and research by Duane (2012) found over 15 terms to describe partnerships but more importantly, that study reveals an ecological systems-led partnership is needed for shared values to materialize. This embraces two core constructs, namely, trust and commitment.

For these to grow benefit, shared values and communication are necessary. Mutual benefit signals tangible and intangible gains from participating in the partnership. Partners sharing similar goals and values agree on how the problem is defined. Where shared values exist, organisational values are also thought to be similar leading to partners adopting the same perspective on the problem. Communication, a two-way process incorporating formality, frequency and quality of communications, is associated with trust as an open dialogue process (Hastings and Domegan, in press).

Reconstructing Macromarketing Management: The Building Blocks

Departing from Zif’s 1980 ‘management of markets’, first travelling back to Alderson’s ecological organized group behavior with its power and communication focus, and then onwards through Hutt,
Mokwa and Shapiro’s Parallel Political Marketplace to Peterson’s 5 C’s emphasis combined with relationship thinking, a picture emerges of the potential building blocks of a revitalized concept of macromarketing management. How all these blocks come together is highlighted in Figure 1 below.

![Figure 1, Macromarketing Management: Its 21st Building Blocks](image)

This paper sought to reformulate and expand Zif’s (1980) original discussion of macromarketing management drawing upon intellectual developments pertaining to bigger picture marketing thinking, as shown in Figure 1 above. According to Aldersonian thinking on ecological marketing systems, the potential building blocks to 21st century macromarketing demands top down/bottom up communications, dialogue and interactions by all societal as well as sectoral stakeholders. This requires knowledge management co-ordination - emphases the need for co-ordination of knowledge transfer,
knowledge exchange for innovative thinking with imaginative solutions to problems. Complementing this, the intellectual contribution from Parallel Political Marketplace thinking challenges the macromarketing manager to understand the interconnectedness and central role for negotiation, bargaining, and partisan mutual adjustment. This introduces constructs from Relationship Marketing, to reflect the diversity of actors and their structures and policies in society, and to manage the needed multifaceted focus on the 5 C bottom line for sustainable consumption, in alignment with Peterson’s theoretical stance. Finally, the synthesis of all these intellectual marketing contributions shows the cornerstone for reconstructing 21st macromarketing management to be total value co-creation - understanding what people and society value and genuinely catering for these shared and co-created values through long-term market and marketing processes.

While such a reformulation of macromarketing management clearly remains a “work in progress”, there can be no doubt that the intellectual developments over the last third of a century can provide the necessary concepts and perspectives for a reconstruction of Zif’s (1980) original discussion of macromarketing management. All this being said, the actual reformulation of an operational, early twenty-first century concept of macromarketing management appropriate to the decisions that must be made a world confronted by the challenge of sustainability remains to be undertaken.

References
Arndt, Johan (1979), "Toward a Concept of Domesticated Markets," *Journal of Marketing*, 43 (Fall), 69-75.
Marketing, 32 (December), 404-411.


Stidsen, Bent (1979), “Comment on (‘Toward a Concept of Domesticated Markets’),” *Journal of Marketing*, 43 (Fall), 76-78.


Trends in Recent Sustainable Marketing Research: Progress, Gaps and Research Opportunities

Robert Mitchell, University of Otago, New Zealand
Ben Wooliscroft, University of Otago, New Zealand

Abstract

In the past six decades there has been a remarkable growth in research literature addressing the linkages between the concept of sustainable development and marketing management. This is emphasised by the 2011 paper by Chabowski, Mena, and Gonzalez Padron, which analyses 1,320 articles in 36 journals between 1958 and 2008. This paper surveys the themes and identifies fresh opportunities for researchers. This is complemented by this survey of 47 journal papers, books and media reports published since 2008 that expands on the range of opportunities available for sustainable marketing researchers.

Introduction

There has been growing interest in the application of sustainable development principles in marketing management. This paper reviews important recent literature and identifies research themes and opportunities for further investigation to expand theory and managerial knowledge in this domain.

The imperative for adopting sustainability in political and business management was set out cogently in the Brudtland report (1987). While the question of sustainability oriented marketing is not specifically addressed in the Brundtland Report, its proposals for a society founded on the principles of sustainable development have had a marked flow on effect that has impacted marketing thinking and practice (Hult, 2011).

Since 1916, marketing authorities, including McCarthy (1968) and Kotler (1972), identify the need for markets to understand the macro environment of the firm including: demographic economic, ecological, technological, political and cultural factors (Elliott, 1990). There was a consistent and parallel theme that the market processes supported by advances in technology would be sufficient to correct any ecological imbalances resulting from commercial activities. At the same time, contemporary marketing practice was seen to challenge ecological responsibility (Fisk, 1974). This, together with the conceptualisation of sustainable development stimulated academic interest in application of sustainable development principles in the marketing domain (Sheth & Parvatiyar, 1995; van Dam & Apeldoorn, 1996).

Construction of sustainable development as a management frame, has underlined the need to apply the principles in micro and macro marketing. Sustainable marketing may help address the gap between the ecological and dominant social paradigms in terms of market focussed business management (Dunlap, Buttel, Dickens, & Guijswijt, 2002; van Liere & Dunlap, 1980). Sustainability
oriented marketing is seen to utilise fresh and proactive corporate marketing strategy and active government intervention to encourage “ecological” marketing while simultaneously guiding markets toward environmentally sound production and consumption. Environmentally centred management can energise organisational competitiveness in meeting market and social expectations and provide important cost efficiencies (Sheth & Parvatiyar, 1995). It is therefore important to anchor this paper by citing definitions of sustainability oriented marketing which address the role of marketing in strategy, and its place in the management of products and services. The first is a definition of sustainable market orientation that integrates the principles of sustainable development and market orientation, proposed by Mitchell, Wooliscroft and Higham (Mitchell, Wooliscroft, & Higham, 2010b). A second definition by Hult, proposes long term strategy alignment of institutional market orientation with the economic environmental and social interests of stakeholders (Hult, 2011). A third customer-centric definition centres on its value in the development and promotion of sustainability centred products and services coupled with consideration of consumption management (Sheth, Sethia, & Srinivas, 2011; Sheth & Sisodia, 2012)(See Table 1).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Authority</th>
<th>Definition</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(Mitchell, et al., 2010b)</td>
<td>“Sustainable market orientation (SMO) is a strategic orientation that applies balanced and equitable intergenerational management of environmental, social and economic resources. It offers a management model that incorporates the macro-management principles of sustainability. This is combined with the micro-management of structured intelligence gathering and knowledge integration to create and market profitable products and services for both public and private sector organisations.”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Hult, 2011.)</td>
<td>Strategic market orientation. “An organisation achieves market-based sustainability to the extent that it strategically aligns itself with the market oriented product needs and wants of customers and the interests of multiple stakeholders concerned about social issues involving economic, environmental and social dimensions.”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Sheth, et al., 2011)</td>
<td>Product and service marketing. “At the heart of sustainability marketing are sustainable products (and services) which reduce the impact on the natural environment, consider social aspects and satisfy consumer needs better than competing offers do. Sustainable products are defined as products that have a higher socio-ecological efficiency than other products in the same category..... The managerial challenge is to minimise the negative possibilities and pursue positive possibilities... and to consider the full impact of consumption by taking a long term view.”</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Because of growing academic interest in ecologically and socially sustainable marketing management, it is timely to review research themes and identify opportunities for future investigation. Work undertaken by Chabowski, Mena, and Gonzalez Padron (2011) is a valuable platform which allows division of research into sustainability oriented marketing into two phases; before 2008 and more recent theoretical discussion and empirical research between 2008 and 2012.

**Themes Identified in the Chabowski Review 1958 - 2008**

Chabowski et al (2011), analysed 1320 marketing related articles in 36 marketing related academic journals over the period 1958 to 2008. They identified three periods of academic interest in environmental and sustainability oriented marketing research:

- **1950s-1980s**: identifies early exploration of linkages environmental and social aspects of marketing management;
- **1980s-1990s**: observes the impact of corporate environmental crises such as corporate mismanagement associated with Bhopal chemical plant and the sinking of the Exxon Valdez and its stimulus to research into corporate sustainability;
- **Post 1990**: records emergence of longitudinal assessments of sustainability focused marketing management.

Their cluster analysis delineates fields for future sustainability focussed marketing research. Five areas are nominated and we observe a concentration on micro management (Table 1):

- External-internal marketing focus;
- Social-environmental focus;
- Legal-ethical-discretionary intent;
- Marketing assets;
- Financial performance.

Chabowski et al (2011) observe that environmental topics are more likely to influence marketing management more than corporate social projects. This should not however, result in the relegation of social aspects of strategy management to minimal relevance. Indeed they recommend further research to “comprehensively evaluate the mediating influence of environmentally and socially focussed sustainability capabilities and initiatives, on institutional financial performance.”

**Table 2: Sustainability in Corporate Marketing: Future Research**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chabowski et al 2011. Themes</th>
<th>Future Research Recommendations</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>External- Internal Focus</td>
<td>Investigate the capabilities based resources which are developed internally and externally to create marketplace advantage for the firm. Stakeholder activities, stakeholder driven strategies, external risk management, activism-motivated strategies. Internal Research on organizational citizenship with a particular focus on employee behaviour and satisfaction. Examine the interaction effects between the external–internal focus of Sustainability based capabilities and other dimensions</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Social - Environmental Focus

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Source</th>
<th>Research Opportunities</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(Dymond, 1997; Hahn &amp; Scheermesser, 2006; Kolk, 2003; Labuschagne, et al., 2005; Springett, 2003)</td>
<td>Critical appraisal of global institutional marketing management for example in operational management.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Bovaird, 2004; Grindle &amp; Hilderbrand, 1995; Steurer &amp; Martinuzzi, 2005)</td>
<td>Investigation of sustainability focussed marketing in the public sector.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Epstein &amp; Hanson, 2006; Epstein &amp; Roy, 2001; Figge &amp; Hahn, 2004; GRI, 2006)</td>
<td>A comprehensive review of sustainability performance management literature that extends beyond referencing triple bottom line accounting.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Kaplan & Norton, 1992)

| (Clapp, 1998; Laufer, 2003; Lawrence, et al., 2006; Rainey, 2006; Springett, 2003; van Dam & Apeldoorn, 1996) | Investigation of barriers to the adoption of sustainability oriented marketing management in large public sector and private sector organisations and SMEs. |

**Additional Research Opportunities**

While the paper traverses a range of important literature, there are, none the less, significant areas that were not addressed. These include; the critical examination of the Brundtland definition of sustainability oriented management and its practical application; seminal papers by leading marketing academics; significant progress in empirical research in sustainability oriented management; sustainability management in the public sector; sustainability performance metrics and management; and barriers to the application of sustainability in corporate management.

Given the importance of the sustainability principles proposed by the Brundtland Commission in 1987 and accepted by the World Summit on the Environment in 2002 (UNO, 1987, 1992), it is surprising that the review (Chabowski, et al., 2011) did not include more emphasis on literature examining its managerial implications, for example, contributions by Rainey, Gladwin and Jennings and Zandbergen (Gladwin, Kennelly, & Krause, 1995; Jennings & Zandbergen, 1995; 2006) on corporate management, the application of industrial ecology by Ehrenfeld (1997, 2004), the need to apply sustainability in business-society relationship management (Steurer, Langer, Konrad, & Martinuzzi, 2005) and critiques of sustainability for example by Lele (1991).

Equally important there are significant deficiencies in recognising important contributions to marketing thinking. We identify the seminal text by Alderson on the marketing environment and marketing systems management (Alderson, 1957); the paper by Kotler and Levy on the broadened scope of marketing (1969); the widely cited papers by George Fisk on the social and environmental responsibilities of marketing organisations (1973; 1974); the definitive paper on the three dichotomies of marketing by Shelby Hunt that emphasises the relevance of macromarketing (1976, 1977); the emphasis on social relationships in marketing by academics such as Christian Gronroos and Evert Gummesson (1994; 2002); and the value of adopting a service dominant logic (Vargo & Lusch, 2004).

Chabowski et al highlight valuable academic work by North American researchers but omit recognition of the contributions of empirical researchers elsewhere. For example, there has been useful research on sustainable corporate management (Hahn & Scheermer, 2006); management perceptions about applying sustainability principles (Springett, 2003), sustainability-guided operational management (Labuschagne, Brent, & van Erck, 2005); sustainability in the local government management, (Dymond, 1997); and sustainability focussed corporate reporting (Kolk, 2003).

It would also be helpful to give more attention the application of sustainability management in the public sector; for instance examine the contributions of Grindle and Hildebrand (1995); Steurer and Martinuzzi (2005), and also research into the dynamics of public private-sector partnerships - which are an important emerging form of organisation management (Bovaird, 2004).
Turning to sustainability oriented performance management, the work of Elkington in developing the triple bottom line (social environmental and financial) accounting for businesses is acknowledged (Elkington, 1997). However a broader understanding would be gained by identifying of other important research in the field, for example: the defining performance indicators by Epstein (2001; 2006), developing and justifying the Global Reporting Initiative (GRI) criteria for corporate sustainability performance reporting (GRI, 2006); the Balanced Scorecard Balanced Scorecard framework (Kaplan & Norton, 1992, 2001), and the potential for sustainability based management to provide more comprehensive added value to corporate performance (Figge & Hahn, 2004).

Lastly, an important component of management is an understanding the barriers to adoption of new and potentially rewarding concepts. A range of research has explored the challenges of applying sustainability in corporate and marketing management. For example studies by Springett and Lawrence have examined varying levels of understanding by managers of the concept of sustainability and resistance amongst SME managers to adopting sustainability oriented practices (Lawrence, Collins, Pavlovich, & Arunachalam, 2006; Springett, 2003). Other researchers have critically examined the practice of “greenwashing;“ the projection of environmental virtue in marketing (Clapp, 1998; Laufer, 2003; Rainey, 2006) and the lack of regulatory guidelines or incentives for sustainability management (van Dam & Apeldoorn, 1996).

**Significant Trends Identified Since 2008**

This section identifies significant sustainability oriented marketing papers and publications in the period since 2008. Our review of this period 2008-2012 has included a review of the paper content but has not applied cluster analysis. It does however provide a complementary overview of recent research themes and opportunities for future research.

Themes identified in the research papers and publications cover these fields:

- Progress in UN and international application of sustainability management;
- Exploring the implications of recent scientific research including climate change on sustainability management and government social marketing;
- The implications of resource advantage theory;
- Innovation management;
- Sustainable market orientation;
- The significance of stakeholder perspectives;
- Marketing and the issue of sustainable consumption;
- The tension between the micro institutional management and societal macro management of sustainability;
- Other theory grounded research opportunities;
- Green marketing and sustainability and management of the marketing mix;
- Establishing and managing sustainability oriented financial value;
- Performance metrics and reporting.
Table 3: Sustainability in Corporate Marketing: Review of Developments and Implications for Research 2008-2012

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Authority</th>
<th>Research Theme</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(Globescan/SustainAbility, 2012; UNEP, 2010; UNO, 2012)</td>
<td>The United Nations; the persuasiveness of continuing development in international guidelines for sustainability management.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Carter, 2010; Flournay et al., 2010; Giddens, 2008; Gilding, 2011; Jackson, 2009b; Peattie, 2009; Wilson et al., 2009)</td>
<td>Implications for public and private sector marketers of continuing scientific research and social and political debate.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Bos-Brouwers, 2010; Patzelt &amp; Shepherd, 2010)</td>
<td>Significance of innovation and entrepreneurship in sustainability oriented marketing.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Hult, 2011; Mitchell, Wooliscroft, &amp; Higham, 2010a; Mitchell et al., 2012b)</td>
<td>Sustainable market orientation. Conceptualisation and empirical research.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Crittenden et al., 2011; Schwartz &amp; Carroll, 2008)</td>
<td>The implications of sustainability oriented stakeholder relationship management in marketing.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Belz &amp; Peattie, 2012; Kilbourne et al., 2009; Varey, 2010)</td>
<td>Understanding the tension between micromanagement of sustainability and broader macro societal sustainability. Investigation of productive was to resolve this.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Kilbourne et al., 2009; Prothero et al., 2011; Sheth et al., 2011)</td>
<td>The potential of sustainability oriented marketing to help better management of consumption of resources and products.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Connelly et al., 2011)</td>
<td>Other areas for theory related sustainability management research: transaction cost economics, agency theory, institutional theory, organisational ecology, resource dependence theory, resource based view of the firm, upper echelons theory, social network theory and signalling theory.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Leonidu et al., 2012)</td>
<td>Green product and distribution and promotion programmes positively affect market and financial performance.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Kotler, 2011)</td>
<td>Integration of the marketing mix: four p s, in sustainability management.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Hahn &amp; Figge, 2011; Hahn et al., 2010; Sharma et al., 2010)</td>
<td>Sustainability value adding financial strategies and trade-offs.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Gallo &amp; Christensen, 2011; Park &amp; Pavlovsky, 2010)</td>
<td>Increasing managerial knowledge of sustainability oriented strategies, and marketing.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Guthrie et al., 2010)</td>
<td>The need for research in public sector sustainability management to parallel business management.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

It would be useful for researchers to revisit the proposals embodied in the Brundtland Report. Given that it is over two decade since the report was assembled, and the adoption of the report at the UN Earth Summit at Rio in 1992, it is timely to assess the success of the Brundtland proposals, the
progress in management theory and practice since 1987. In addition there is a need to explore options for possible improvements to these a management concepts. The separation and continuing tension between political conceptualisation of sustainability oriented management through the United Nations and the delay in diffusion occurring within national governments and business entities invites further examination. Particular challenges in dealing with the interface between international national and institutional management are identified (Globescan/SustainAbility, 2012; OECD, 2006; UNO, 2012).

For marketers there is a need to review the implications of sustainability management frameworks including the place of environmental management systems and social lifecycle assessments of products and how to help stakeholders engage with institutions to improve institutional social management associated with production, promotion and consumption (UNEP, 2010).

The findings from scientific research into the impact of human activities on the global bio-system have profound implications for sustainability-related corporate and governmental management. Recent publications by Gilding and Jackson for example (2011; 2009a), build on the body of literature by prominent scientists, business social and environmental commentators that has been widely used to justify the application of sustainability in societal management (Carson, 1962; Commoner, 1971; Diamond, 2005; Ehrlich, 1972; Meadows, Meadows, Randers, & Behrens, 1972; van Liere & Dunlap, 1980). The most challenging scientific research centres on the impacts of climate change. The ramifications for marketers include addressing evolving human needs and patterns of product and service supply, for example in the fields of developing and communicating government sustainability policy, and applications of sustainability in the sectors of insurance, agriculture, water management, tourism (Carter, 2010; Giddens, 2008; Peattie, 2009; Stern, 2006).

It will be appreciated that much of theoretical discussion and empirical research into sustainability oriented marketing centres on private sector businesses and not for profit organisations. To date, sustainability management in the public sector has given little attention (Guthrie, Ball, & Farneti, 2010). It is also necessary to address this gap to discover the most effective methods for the sustainability oriented marketing of products and services associated with governmental activities. A more subtle domain is the promotion of consumer behaviour change as part of the diffusion of sustainable values, performance standards and management practice stimulated through government policy initiatives. The future energy of researchers could be directed to investigating the sustainability oriented marketing of public services, and the public promotion of sustainability practices. Confirming earlier discussion, another area of research is the joint public and private sector marketing in public private partnerships (Wilson, Nielsen, & Buultjens, 2009). We also identify the barriers for governments to encourage sustainability oriented management practices through education and regulation. An important challenges for academic researchers is to examine the capabilities of public sector experts to communicate sustainable management values to legislators, businesses and to the total spectrum of voters (Environment, 2010; Flournay et al., 2010; Parliamentary Commissioner for the Environment, 2002). Another important area that is the questionable use of science in businesses to oppose well justified sustainability initiatives by government (Oreskes & Conway, 2010), and the application of sustainability oriented systems thinking in political policy formation (Kirsch, 2010).

Resource advantage (RA) theory in strategy management has been discussed and analysed for more than two decades (Barney, 1991; Peteraf & Barney, 2003) including its applicability in sustainability management (Aragon-Correa & Sharma, 2003; Parnell, 2008; Russo & Fouts, 1997). The linkages between RA theory with marketing theory have been enhanced by two recent papers that explore the
interception; and how their effective management contributes to both institutional and national economic growth (Hunt, 2011, 2012). These papers suggest opportunities for marketing researchers to empirically examine the application of resource advantage theory in sustainability oriented marketing; particularly in product and service design and supply chain management.

Closely related to RA theory is the application of innovation to maximise competitive advantage from available resources. Patzelt and Shepherd (2010) reason that a sustainability oriented mindset enhances knowledge acquisition about the social and natural environment and stimulates entrepreneurial activity. Paradoxically, they found that entrepreneurs place low significance on achieving sustainability goals. Thus there is potential to explore the application of innovation theory in empirical research. Inquiry could include the potential for innovation to produce direct corporate benefits, benefits for external stakeholders, and also the role of networks. This investigation should not only focus on activity in major corporations but also on the application of sustainability principles in SME innovation (Bos-Brouwers, 2010).

Recent papers offer theoretical justification for the integration of market orientation and sustainability management principles as sustainable market orientation (Hult, 2011; Mitchell, et al., 2010b; Sharma, Iyer, Mehotra, & Krishnan, 2010). Empirical research in both public and private sector tourism organisations (Mitchell, Wooliscroft, & Higam, 2012a) indicates support for one management model and provides useful evidence of SMO drivers (managerial knowledge, corporate reputation and competitive advantage), and strategic benefits (customer, regulator and community trust; employee loyalty and motivation). The researchers recommend extended empirical investigation of the potential application of this model in other industry sectors in public sector policy and regulatory management.

Prominent researchers emphasise the tension between micro management in marketing with its weighting on environmental and economic performance, and macro management that incorporates sustainability oriented societal values and mutually rewarding relationship development (Belz & Peattie, 2012; Kilbourne et al., 2009; Varey, 2010). Developing and sustaining a reputation as a competently and sustainably managed institution, has the potential to, not only improve competitiveness and performance, but also enhance long term resilience and survival. Other literature has reinforced the value of green marketing in firm financial performance (Leonidu, Katsikeas, & Morgan, 2012; Sharma, et al., 2010) but raises the question of how an organisation should focus on environmental and financial management should be integrated into with social and long run aspects of sustainability management.

We identify a paucity of recent research into the social aspects of institutional sustainability management, particularly how firms may improve performance through increased consumer and broader societal trust. The Brundtland Report emphasises the need for socially oriented management to be balanced with economic and environmental management. Achieving this balance in practice is proving elusive. Swartz and Carroll (Schwartz & Carroll, 2008) observe that corporate sustainability is too narrowly defined and fails to adequately and explicitly address the ethical components of business beyond taking into account impacts on society and the natural environment. They emphasise that the long term benefits of institutional activity to current society, and to future generations must also be included in the management equation. Further they propose that corporate activity should be governed by the concepts that generate net value to society and and utilitarian value. The concept of balance is also extended to include sustainability in management; assessing ad responding to stakeholder expectations of long term management of environmental quality, social equity and economic prosperity. Further research is suggested to investigate the application of social and stakeholder management
principles in sustainability oriented marketing. Integrating corporate culture of societal engagement, stakeholder involvement and financial performance management in a strategic management model also offers potential to include the aspects of corporate environmental management. A stakeholder framework for performance management proposed by Crittenden, Crittenden, Ferrell, Ferrell and Pinney offers a useful model for future empirical investigation of the role of sustainability marketing management from the perspectives of key business stakeholders (2011).

Drawing on his earlier works, a leading marketing authority, Philip Kotler (2011), emphasises the applicability of the four Ps; product, price, place and promotion to sustainability oriented marketing. He suggests research into consumer weighting of sustainability as a factor in innovation and competitive advantage, the value of sustainability as a factor supporting corporate growth, and examining how government sustainability regulation may impact on product development, pricing, distribution and promotion.

Recent research has investigated the attitudes and behaviours of consumers and the role of individual citizens in society as a prelude to fostering corporate sustainability and public policy implications (Prothero et al., 2011). This builds on earlier research investigating the relationship between a society’s institutional patterns and the acceptance of materialism by society at large (Kilbourne, et al., 2009). In a separate paper, the option of social marketing is explored as a means to reduce consumption and conserve resources (Sheth & Sisodia, 2012). Each of these fields offers fertile grounds for fresh sustainability research into public sector and business management.

Other theoretical areas related sustainability oriented marketing have been proposed. These areas include: transaction cost economics, agency theory, institutional theory, organisational ecology, resource dependence theory, resource based view of the firm, upper echelons theory, social network theory and signalling theory (Connelly, Ketchen, & Slater, 2011).

There is significant literature addressing environmental management theory and performance indicators for (Hart, 1995; Jennings & Zandbergen, 1995; Morhardt, Baird, & Freeman, 2002; Shrivastava, 1995). Recent publications have expanded academic discussion on how to integrate sustainability and marketing practice. Continuing research is required to develop easy-to-apply sustainability performance and reporting standards that will encourage pragmatic sustainability oriented management. In particular we identify a need to move beyond the accounting dominated thinking of triple bottom line and the balanced score card metrics and to integrate qualitative environmental and social performance measures (Gray, 2010; GRI, 2010, 2011). Possible avenues lie through improving sustainability value adding activities. Work by Figge and Hahn and their associates, indicates that further research is warranted to investigate the allied fields of sustainability profitability definition and the management of trade-offs required for effective long run sustainability strategies (Hahn & Figge, 2011; Hahn, Figge, Pinkse, & Preuss, 2010).

Recent literature encourages investigation of how sustainability oriented reporting should progress beyond the accounting dominated thinking of triple bottom line and the balanced score card and to integrate qualitative environmental and social performance measures (Gray, 2010; GRI, 2010, 2011). Literature highlights the continuing variability in the managerial understanding and interpretations of the central components of sustainability oriented management (Park & Pavlovsky, 2010). Listed corporations utilise sustainability reporting to help project corporate social and environmental concern, but there is a significant variability in the acceptance of sustainability principles.
in strategic management. A useful study suggests a need for further investigation into how these principles can foster widespread managerial acceptance, not only in listed corporations, but also in small and medium enterprises that do not have public shareholder reporting obligations (Gallo & Christensen, 2011).

Given the recommendations for government regulation by marketing academics (Sheth & Parvatiyar, 1995; van Dam & Apeldoorn, 1996) and recent media reports of trends in government required sustainability reporting (Economist, 2010), there are grounds for researchers to explore the benefits of formally required sustainability performance reporting. Recent research has justified earlier questioning of the value of voluntary codes used to promote corporate sustainability (Mitchell, Wooliscroft, & Higham, 2012b; Moneva, Archel, & Correa, 2006). Further work is required to critically evaluate the efficacy of sustainability auditing and rating systems or whether their worth is distorted by enhancing the legitimacy of corporate elites (Chelli & Gendron, 2013).

Conclusions

This paper has identified academic papers that suggest opportunities for further research into sustainability oriented marketing management. A meta-study of marketing research literature from 1958 to 2008 provided a basis for discussion of allied research areas. This has been supplemented by a review of recent literature which includes papers by prominent marketing academics to scope areas for fresh research. These fields include: alignment of sustainability oriented management with and resource advantage theory; innovation and entrepreneurship; in sustainability oriented management; development of easy to use sustainability performance indicators, the application of balanced and universally recognised codes of compliance; institutional sustainability reporting by SMEs as well as large business organisations and government agencies.

In public sector management there are opportunities for research in diffusion of sustainability values, policies and practices. Parallel with this is the need for more examination of the benefits of that can be stimulated by sustainability oriented management as well as increasing the understanding needed to over come barriers to national government policy development and regulation.

But the most significant opportunity for sustainability oriented marketing research suggested by this review, lies in examining the social context of marketing; in meeting the growing expectations of consumers and voters for sustainability based strategic and marketing management. The literature emphasises a need to broaden the scope of sustainability oriented marketing management from the current concentration on economic and environmental considerations to effectively, efficiently and profitably, understanding and addressing all stakeholder needs and expectations, not just those stakeholders with direct and short term economic interests. The application of science based knowledge incorporating sustainability principles in resource management and long run quality service and product delivery, therefore offers new avenues to build and sustain organisational competitiveness and resilience.
References

Carter, A. (2010). Government Sustainability Policy in Australia: Moving from Rhetoric to Effective Implementation. Adelaide University of South Australia


Aldersonian Sustainable Marketing

Ben Wooliscroft, University of Otago, New Zealand

(Macro)marketing has realised the importance of sustainability and the environmental impact of commerce, and have rushed to suggest new theories that may guide us towards more sustainable systems (Fuller, 1999; Gordon et al., 2011; Hunt, 2011; Kilbourne and Beckmann, 1998; Martin and Schouten, 2012; Mitchell and Saren, 2008; Murphy, 2008; Peattie, 2001, 2007; Sheth and Parvatiyar, 1995; Van Dam and Apeldoorn, 1996a,b; Winston et al., 1995; Mitchell et al., 2010). There is however a theory of marketing that provides us with a significant departure point for considering sustainability in the market, the work of Alderson (1957; 1965). Discussion will focus on; Systems thinking as the central tenet of understanding market phenomena, the Organized Behavior System (OBS) as the fundamental unit of analysis, potency of assortment, speculation and postponement, cooperation and conflict. This is not to suggest that Alderson provides us with all we need to have a sustainable future, but his contributions form the basis for a theory of sustainable markets that has been largely ignored. Alderson’s contributions have the added benefit of being part of a system of theories of marketing — connecting sustainable thinking to the wider marketing phenomena.

References

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abstract/Papers Included</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A typology of shopping behaviour based on the personality continuum</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Paul J. Albanese, Kent State University, USA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Robert D. Jewell, Kent State University, USA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>50 shades of mobile: The fetishism of mobile devices in contemporary consumptionscapes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ian Reyes, University of Rhode Island, USA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nikhilesh Dholakia, University of Rhode Island, USA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jennifer Bonoff, University of Rhode Island, USA</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
A Typology of Shopping Behavior based on the Personality Continuum

Paul J. Albanese, Kent State University, USA
Robert D. Jewell, Kent State University, USA

There is considerable agreement on the descriptive aspects of the phenomenon of compulsive buying behavior: Compulsive buying is characterized by a chronic pattern of repetitive buying binges resulting in serious financial and interpersonal consequences (O’Guinn and Faber 1989, McElroy et al. 1991, Faber and O’Guinn 1992, McElroy et al. 1994; Lejoyeux and Ades 1994). The purpose of this enquiry into the measurement of compulsive buying behavior is to employ a two-step cluster analysis to identify cluster membership, thereby avoiding an arbitrary choice of the number of clusters, and to provide a theoretical approach that identifies four qualitatively different patterns of shopping behavior. Compulsive buying measurement scales have either been designed as screeners that use arbitrary cut off points to determine whether a subject is categorized as a compulsive buyer or not (Faber and O’Guinn 1992; Valence, d’Astous, Fortier 1988; Edwards 1992; Ridgway, Kukar-Kinney and Monroe 2008), or as a checklist with a dichotomous scale that can be difficult to interpret and may require arbitrary judgments for classification (Lejoyeux and Ades 1994).

What has been missing from the rich literature on compulsive buying behavior is a typology that differentiates between qualitatively different patterns of shopping behavior. The typology of shopping behavior is provided by the Personality Continuum (Albanese 2002, 2006). The Personality Continuum is an integrative framework for the interdisciplinary study of consumer behavior (Albanese 2002, 2006). The Personality Continuum is divided into four qualitatively different levels of personality development that are hierarchically arranged in descending order from highest to lowest level: normal, neurotic, primitive, and psychotic (Albanese 2002).

The four qualitatively different patterns of shopping behavior along the Personality Continuum are the normal shopper, neurotic shopper, compulsive buyer, and manic spender. Normal Shoppers prudently plan their shopping activities, spend less than they earn and save for future purchases they cannot afford in the present. Neurotic Shoppers spend an excessive amount of time shopping for the perfect purchase, exhausting anyone who shops with them, often not buying anything, and when a purchase is made, it is sometimes returned. They typically spend money they have and do not impair family and social relationships. Compulsive Buyers are driven by severe anxiety to spend money they do not have on things they do not need in repetitive buying binges and then hide their purchases away often in the original packaging with the price tags left on. Their shopping behavior impairs family, social and professional relationships, and often results in serious financial problems. Manic Spenders engage in episodic spectacular spending sprees that result in serious financial and legal problems, severely impair family, social, and professional relationships and sometimes result in hospitalization or incarceration.

Only the 19-item Questionnaire about Buying Behavior (Lejoyeux and Ades 1994) modified with the seven point frequency scale yielded three qualitatively different groups that
represent the normal shopper, neurotic shopper, and compulsive buyer. No psychotic subjects completed the survey; therefore, we were unable to assess whether these five measurement scales would capture the manic spender. Because this scale includes items on the more severe consequences of buying behavior, such as legal problems (although not incarceration but that is implied), and because it was developed in a hospital situation, it is highly likely that it is capable of capturing the manic spender. The other four scales divided the subjects into two groups of approximately the same size.

References
50 shades of mobile: The fetishism of mobile devices in contemporary consumptionscapes

Ian Reyes, University of Rhode Island, USA
Nikhilesh Dholakia, University of Rhode Island, USA
Jennifer Bonoff, University of Rhode Island, USA

Introduction

In introducing his book *Fetish: an erotics of culture*, Henry Krips (1999) lays out the case for exploring the difficult and risky – but nonetheless interesting and rewarding – project of linking the psychological and the cultural realms (p. 3):

I... examine the ... claim that cultural artifacts... may take on a constitutive role in psychically structuring their audiences... This project involves considerable intellectual and political risk... Freud himself... issues a stern warning to interpretations that link psychic and cultural realms. Nevertheless, the project of linking the psychic and the cultural is worthwhile. It promises rewards: a new cultural politics that not only breaks with the socialization model characteristic of older style Marxism but also rejects more traditional idealist approaches. In this context the notions of fetishism and the gaze are of central importance... I present the gaze as ideologically constituted in its own right, an object to which ideological meanings attach via a chain of unconscious associations...

For marketers specifically, psychoanalysis offers a way around thinking of consumers as rational actors pursuing their self-interest in the marketplace. Cluely and Dunne (2012) argued that a psychoanalytic account of commodity fetishism is needed to contend with the contradictory ways people consume. According to Cluely and Dunne (2012), narcissism rather than fetishism is truly what is at stake because the commodity form is not merely a masking of social relations of production; it is also, if not more so, a means of identification and self-aggrandizement. Similarly, Bohm and Batta (2010) argued that a psychoanalytic account of commodity fetishism is necessary for understanding enjoyment as the cornerstone of consumer capitalism. Following such observations about the cultural politics of the subject/object relation in consumer society, our research inquires further as to how a psychoanalytic account of consuming subjects might operate, considering especially the relationship between consumption of and identification through mobile media devices.

Drawing from Lacan’s theory of visual subjectivity, we explain, apply, and contrast two psychoanalytic paradigms concerning one root of fetishism, “the gaze,” by way of interpreting non-participant observations of public mobile phone use. These two levels of analysis offer competing, though not irreconcilable, insights into consumers as visual subjects. By using observational data, limiting our interpretive analysis to the most immediate phenomena of a mediated society, this paper theorizes public mobile phone use as an exemplary case of the scopic drive to see-and-be-seen.

Our aim in this paper is to explore the psychic and cultural links of the handheld mobile device, particularly the mobile phone, that has become globally pervasive and an indispensable appendage of contemporary life (Goggins 2006; Ito, Okabe and Matsuda 2005), and is thereby continually reshaping marketplace and cross-consumer interactions (Humphreys 2010). We rely on our readings, on
observations of media, as well as first-hand direct observations pertaining to the use mobile devices in everyday life. Rather than focusing on nuances of the bustling digital terrain, however, this essay examines the physical, brick-and-mortar realm in and through which the digital is integrated with the corporeal.

The primary data component of this research derive from non-participant observations at four different sites in northeastern United States: the food court of an urban mall, the club house of a golf country club, a branch of the U. S Postal Service, and a suburban grocery store.

Psychoanalysis will be used here to help “read” these scenes. The heuristic most germane to the data is Lacan’s theory of “the gaze” as an object of desire and anxiety. Understanding the gaze helps to explain the function of fetish objects in terms of subjectivity and identification, for it is the fetish that helps subjects manage, even enjoy, the otherwise anxiety-producing awareness of the gaze (Bohm and Batta, 2010; Cluey and Dunne 2012). As Zizek (2004) described, what we are dealing with here is the positivization of an impossibility which gives rise to the fetish-object. For example, how does the object-gaze become a fetish? Through the Hegelian reversal from the impossibility to see the object, into an object which gives body to this very impossibility: since the subject cannot directly see that, the true object of fascination, he accomplishes a kind of reflection-into-self by means of which the object that fascinates him becomes the gaze itself. In this sense (although not in an entirely symmetrical way), gaze and voice are "reflective" objects, i.e. objects which give body to an impossibility (263).

In short, the gaze is the libidinal object underwriting these otherwise arbitrary or meaningless distinctions, like individuality/conformism, public/private, etc., that can never be experienced in any direct way, yet which nonetheless comprise social reality. Cell phones serve the function of a fetish insofar as they stand in for the source of these splits at the same time as they render the unseen gaze — a point of anxiety — as a more visible, consumable, and therefore pleasurable object of desire.

Observational Data

Field ethnographic accounts and non-participant observational notes were generated from the four sites mentioned previously. Interpretive qualitative methodologies were employed to explore the ways in which people interact with their mobile devices, and with each other, in public spaces. Over a period of eight weeks, six ethnographic field observation sessions were conducted, culminating in 226 individual observations. These observations and our interpretations of what is happening in the field reveal how users are split, constituted as mobile subjects by virtue of their interpellation across competing planes of significance. Moreover, this tension between planes is ontological, it concerns what it means to be a mobile subject, and the divisions we identify are not mere differences of degree, but antinomic opposites definitive of this mode of subjectivity. From observations of mobile use behaviors in public spaces, we discern five observable antinomies affecting the split (Table 1).

Each side of these antinomies implicates a different level of Lacan’s theory of the gaze, illuminating distinct aspects of the cell phone consumptionscape, and pointing to specific areas of concern for marketers. One level, which we will term “the look,” involves scopic fantasies of self-presentation, seeing-and-being-seen as a social subject in real, brick-and-mortar space. The other, which we will refer to as “the gaze,” entails disruptive moments of disengagement, or disappearance, from that first space. The former level of analysis, we will argue, is most congruent with common Marxist conceptions of commodity fetishism, whereas the latter level of analysis is necessary for contending
with cell phones as more than another fetishized commodity, and coming to terms with their unique position as communications technologies uniting mobile users to an adaptive and locative digital consumptionscape.

The Look

The most common theoretical account of the gaze is likely that of the “male gaze” critiqued by film studies. This account, sometimes referred to as the “screen theory” interpretation of Lacan (Krips 1999, 2010; Copjec 1994), is rooted in Lacan’s (1977) work “Mirror Stage as Formatve of the Function of the I,” wherein he considers how an infant, upon seeing himself in a mirror, internalizes this Other image of himself as whole, which is at odds with his experience of incompleteness. Yet it is important to grasp how the gaze can become an object of desire, displaced onto commodities, and is different from the look, or merely being seen with commodities; here, it is worth recalling Freud’s theory of objects, particularly as evident in his analysis of the fort/da game.

The fort/da game introduced in “Beyond the Pleasure Principle” (1995) is where Freud ruminates on watching his grandson in the cradle playing with a cotton-reel on a string, throwing it over the edge of his crib, out of his sight, saying “fort” (gone) and pulling it back, saying “da” (here). Freud sees this as the child’s effort to manage his anxieties about his mother’s absence. Through this kind of play, the child develops an ego, or imaginary sense of self, vis-à-vis a superego, or the symbolic presence of an authoritative Other, like his mother, that remains present as a guarantor of the ego even under the real absence of the Other — Lacan used this logic in his theory of the gaze as a psychic object marking difference, as opposed to the simple internalization of another’s perspective. The “Mirror Stage” essay explains how visual subjects become subject to “the gaze,” which corresponds not with vision, not with an actual person’s look, but, instead, corresponds with the perception of an absent Other.

The cultural politics of the screen theory accounts derive from the fact that the mirror of society is no mere reflection; it is ideologically inflected (e.g., mainstream cinema represents, and therefore implicates viewers within, the scopic desires of heterosexist patriarchy). For cell phone culture, marketing plays a role in educating consumers on how to see and be seen in public with their mobile devices or, basically, how to use a phone to fetishize the look of an Other.

Despite, or because of, common design sense dictating that smaller is better (and invisible would be perfect) our observations find users making their cell phones more visible, frequently engaging the device even when not interacting through it. Repeated observations illustrate physical attachment of the individual to the mobile device, even while the device is not specifically in use: holding the phones while eating, walking, talking, and engaging in a variety of other, disconnected social activities. Here are observational notes from the mall by one of the authors:

I am immediately struck by the two ladies sitting diagonally across from me. They are eating salads, both are dressed nicely, hair neat. Approximately 35 years of age. They are clearly involved in a very active conversation – faces are animated, hands are waving back and forth. They both have mobile phones present. Lady #1 has the phone resting on the table next to her plate of food. Lady #2 (the most animated/hand-waving of the two) has her mobile phone in her hand. She never uses it or looks at it, but it remains waving around in her hand the entire time. At one point, she passes it into the other hand – but never, ever letting go... I am struck by Lady #2 as her phone seems to be a part of her physicality – attached and moving with her at all times.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Antinomy</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Observation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Individuality/Conformity</td>
<td>Consumers use the mobile device <em>collectively</em> as a means of <em>individual</em> self expression.</td>
<td>Observations illustrate individuals’ efforts to express themselves and their identities with varying cases, ringtones, and other accessories, yet conforming by using common mass-market mobile devices and modifications.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Connected/Disconnected</td>
<td>Physical attachment of the individual to the mobile device, even while the device is not in use.</td>
<td>Repeated observations affirm that many individuals remain physically connected to the devices, holding them while eating, walking, talking, and engaging in a variety of other social activities.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public/Private</td>
<td>Individuals seem to make a very public display of the mobile device, yet the extant literature shows that privacy is a main concern among consumers.</td>
<td>Users cite privacy as a key source of apprehension; however, the paradoxical public spaces abound with mobile users having conversations in public or passing around the mobile phone for others to see, with seemingly no regard for privacy.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Continuity/Fragmentation</td>
<td>Individuals alternate between engagement with technology and engagement with the people or things in the ‘non-digital’ world</td>
<td>Activities that were once smooth, languid and continuous – such as eating lunch while enjoying time with a friend – have now become filled with forms of rapid and fragmented “in-and-out,” behaviors.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Compliant/Defiant</td>
<td>Overall adherence to older, established social norms of interaction and etiquette is in a state of transformation.</td>
<td>Otherwise law-abiding, respectful, well-mannered people are showing complete disregard for traditional social behaviors when utilizing mobile devices in public spaces.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The successful visual integration of cell phones and their users, the look, would be, in Lacan’s (1981) formulation, pleasurable due to its “pacifying” of the gaze, akin to his account of representational art:

The painter gives something to the person who must stand in front of his painting which, in part, at least, of the painting, might be summed up thus—You want to see? Well, take a look at this! He gives something for the eye to feed on, but he invites the person to whom this picture is presented to lay down his gaze there as one lays down one’s weapons. This is the pacifying, Apollonian effect of painting. Something is given not so much to the gaze as to the eye, something that involves the abandonment, the laying down, of the gaze (p. 101).

The variety of “looks” people are giving their devices is astounding. While reading over my notes from several observations, I report mobile device cases that range from tailored and simplistic to brightly colored, bedazzled and even outrageous. The device cases seem to match the attire and overall appearance of their owners. One young adult male, all dressed in black, had a skull and bones case. A teenage girl had a pink case with a large heart in the middle created with rhinestones. A middle-aged man at the golf course had a simple, refined black leather case. Another golf-course observation spotted an older gentleman with an Auburn University Tigers case. Other observations noted cases featuring certain brands or singers. I also notice varying ringtones. Although I could not hear specifically, I could ascertain that some ringtones were pop music lyrics, some instrumental, and others were sounds from nature.

Yet this domain of visibility is a step removed from how Lacan conceived the gaze. The successful visual integration of cell phones and their users, the look, would be, in Lacan’s (1981) formulation, pleasurable due to its “pacifying” of the gaze, akin to his account of representational art:

The painter gives something to the person who must stand in front of his painting which, in part, at least, of the painting, might be summed up thus—You want to see? Well, take a look at this! He gives something for the eye to feed on, but he invites the person to whom this picture is presented to lay down his gaze there as one lays down one’s weapons. This is the pacifying, Apollonian effect of painting. Something is given not so much to the gaze as to the eye, something that involves the abandonment, the laying down, of the gaze (p. 101).

The spectator gives and is given only a look, here at the expense of the gaze. To merely take up the perspective, the desire of another, imagined or not, is pacifying because it relieves the subject of her own gaze, or the responsibility for her own desire.

Further, at this level of analysis, there is nothing special about cell phones as such, nothing particular about them as digital communications devices. They may as well be just another piece of accoutrement in the user’s wardrobe. Still, this level is worth acknowledging because it highlights the ways in which cell phones don’t even need to be used as telecommunications devices in order to fulfill their social function as fetish objects.

The Gaze

In Seminar XI (1981), Lacan turns to mythology to explain how the gaze is an object, and different from mere visual contrivance, or a look. His chosen myth is not what might be expected following the “Mirror Stage.” Rather than turning to Narcissus and his reflection, Lacan refers to the myth of the painters Zeuxis and Parrhasios. The story, in brief, tells of a contest to decide who could
create the most realistic image. Zeuxis painted grapes that attracted birds with their realistic semblance. Yet Parrhasios wins the contest for tricking not animals but his human opponent with a painted veil, acting as a “lure” for the desire of Zeuxis, who marvels at the quality of the painting and loses the contest when he inquires as to what was painted behind the veil.

The moral of this story, in Lacan’s re-telling, is that the kind of image most compelling to humans is not that which best resembles visual realism. If anything is “behind” the curtain, it is the object of the spectator’s desire to see as the Other, to take up its gaze as his own. Lacan uses the story of the painters’ contest to show how a space beyond representation may be inscribed into the picture through the alluring surface of the veil. That is, the visual object supposed to be figured within, or behind, the image is misrecognized by the subject as the Other’s. The gaze Zeuxis experiences is his own—he defeats himself—but his play of vision is enticed by the curtain, which lures the subject by promising something beyond what is visible.

Because the fetishized gaze is the product of an ultimate failure to see, one has to look at the canvas—or screen—as a (w)hole through which viewers project their own desires. More simply, what compels viewers to look and keep looking is the frustration of their scopic drives: not seeing (or being seen) as well as they want.

The gaze is like the moment when the mechanics of image production come into view. By showing the grain of the film, a fly landing on the camera lens, or an actor behaving out of character, the movie affords a glimpse of its own nature as constructed image. In terms of film theory, the gaze is the point at which the illusion of realism wavers. In cognitive terms, it is a point where the visual field breaks out of the symbolic system in which its objects are conceptualized (Krips 1999, p. 102).

This means that the gaze as a symbolic phenomenon is not a thing but a “relational structure poised delicately between a visual object and individual viewers, its effects mediated by their differing positions within their disparate ideological horizons” (Krips 1999, p. 100). The key here is that this relational structure of the gaze is neither universal nor ahistorical: “there is no single transhistorical ‘audience’ all of whom experience the effects of its gaze in a similar way. On the contrary...different viewers have different responses, only some of which fall under the category of the gaze” (Krips 1999, p. 101).

Mobile phones, in our present historical moment, stain scenes of the everyday, reminding viewers of the mediation of those scenes not just by language, fashion, custom, or any other readily observable signifying system, but also by another, imperceptible, digital sphere. In these moments—at the food court, the country club, etc.—cell phones blot the landscape, punctuating the field with inscrutable marks of Otherness. This staining is not because the devices are inherently unnatural or anti-social, it is because within the symbolic order of contemporary life—the systems of meanings, moralities, laws, etc.—the mobile phone has come to represent some of our greatest, and most enduring anxieties.

Sherry Turkle (2006) writes of a world that is always on; a world where individuals tethered to their mobile devices attempt to balance their physical and virtual spaces. UCLA researchers report that this in-and-out behavior is converting humans into superficial and scattered thinkers. University of Alabama professor of anthropology, Christopher Lynn, likens the act of manipulating a mobile device to smoking a cigarette. Languid, solitary moments and periods of ‘down time’ have shifted into an accelerated need to fill each second of time. Lynn states, “When you’re habituated to constant stimulation, when you lack it, you sort of don’t know what to do with yourself... When we aren’t used to having down time, it results in anxiety. ‘Oh my god, I should be doing something.’ And we reach for the smartphone. It’s our omnipresent relief from that” (Gross, 2012).
Sadie Plant argues that mobile phones, in particular, are a disruptive force that upsets the integrity of social spaces and relationships. She posits that “even a silent mobile can make its presence felt as though it were an addition to a social group, and... many people feel that just the knowledge that a call might intervene tends to divert attention from those present at the time” (2002, p. 30). When looking at contemporary professional life, Turkle (2006) highlights examples of individuals “ignoring those they are ‘with’ to give priority to online others who they consider a more relevant audience” (p. 4).

But these problems are not endemic to the digital age. Human societies have and will always worry over how best to raise children, how to maintain social cohesion, how to behave ethically, and so on. This is not say there are no effects correlating to cell phone use, only that the intense attention this technology receives has as much to do with phenomena specific to its technological function as it does with its function as a fetish object used to help people engage as well as avoid more timeless anxieties.

When cell phone users seem to lose themselves from physical space, like stopping and blocking a walkway to answer the phone, or pausing mid-conversation to read and reply to a text message, we see the lure of the cell phone, of the Other, digital space “behind” the analog world, at the same time as we are confronted with its gaze, the fly on the lens, so to speak, when the phone, once a tamed fetish playing to the look, exposes the anxious gaze as the libidinal demands of the apparatus seem to overflow from the phone and engulf the user’s body and mind. That is, the key to understanding how this is a matter of cell phones operating as an alluring veil, and not merely a competing channel of communication, is to understand that witnessing the use of the device itself—the disengaging with and through the device—is the veil, or the frustration of the desire to see as the Other. From our observational perspective, the key issue is not how cell phones distract their users, but how the image of a person distracted by their phone comes to stand for a whole host of anxieties about the digital age. From this perspective, the cell phone as a signifying apparatus cannot be reduced to the hunk of matter comprising the artifact itself. It is more than that. It is also, of course, the data, the software, the network connection, but, above all, the way these material features are embedded in a larger symbolic system through their arrangement and use, and this implicates users of the phone as part of the fetishistic image itself.

Observations indicate that individuals are continually alternating between physical and virtual spaces. Happenings that once occurred through continuous and smooth, languid behavior – such as eating lunch while enjoying time with a friend – have now become filled with forms of rapid and fragmented “in-and-out” behaviors. Individuals oscillating between engagement with digital spaces and engagement with the people or things in the immediate environment illustrate how mobile subjectivity proper resides in the vacillation between antinomic poles. Some more observational notes:

There are four people in the group, and a baby in a stroller next to the table. I am observing one of the males, who appears to be the father of the child. He is holding a mobile device and is constantly engaging with it, then engaging with the people he is dining with, then back to the device. At one point, the baby starts to cry. He (while still holding his phone) reaches into the diaper bag to get a pacifier. He goes back to manipulating his device, then puts the pacifier into the baby’s mouth. This in-and-out, virtual-non-virtual behavior is a repetitive cycle.

I am sitting next to a couple, early 30s. They are sitting across from one another. The woman is holding her phone directly in front of her face and manipulating it, yet she is still carrying on a conversation with her date. I can see her eyes diverting quickly between the device, and the man she is with. Most remarkable is that the phone seems to remain stationary directly in front of her face, and directly in line of vision to her
mate. Her eyes and attention seem to fluctuate rapidly between the device the human sitting across from her.

The phone alone is not merely a fashion accessory easily incorporated into consumer fantasies; it is a consoling and consolidating fetish. The phone in use, however, manifests a challenge to the symbolic order, reminding those around the user of an Other scene affecting social reality, and therefore also the very being of the subject. Here, the gaze re-emerges as a threat to the consolidated imaginary of the look. The body itself and the physical space it inhabits are threatened to become an insignificant remainder as mobile users literally deny their look, the attention that would affirm the existence of others, from the people around them, a reminder that the Other does not see.

**Discussion and Concluding Comments**

The cell phone, as a cultural artifact, both pacifies and bodies-forth the gaze, rendering sensible and manageable an otherwise inaccessible yet essential psychic operation. We identified two ways to approach this matter, one concerning the ways fetishism can, as Lacan (1981) put it, “pacify” the gaze by facilitating the flow of the scopic drive, and another concerning the incitement of the gaze, becoming a flashpoint for anxieties once pacified. But these two levels are intertwined and constantly in flux. The drive to see-and-be-seen flows through and unites the pleasures and displeasures of fetishism, and, as our fieldwork indicated, users move between one mode of interaction and the next fluently. Nonetheless, the separation between these levels of analysis is useful for heuristic purposes, particularly for better articulating these theories of visibility and subjectivity to a broader politics of the contemporary mobile consumptionscape.

The first level of our analysis, the look, highlighted the imaginary function, the level of visual identification, or simply style. The integration of a communication device into a fashion system tends to make style supersede function. The point, here, is that people are not merely interacting with others, they are enacting themselves vis-à-vis the cell phone as fetish object, making the device part of a routine, erotic attachment to one’s own identity. This naturally leads to questions about visual design and marketing, especially for devices that may be technologically inferior to competitors, and can be seen at its highest stakes in recent controversy about whether the size and shape – the very “look-and-feel”, to use the technology design jargon – of Apple’s iPad is protectable intellectual property. But the cultural politics stemming from this level of analysis also imbricates cell phone marketing with one of the more insidious aspects of consumer culture: waste. To paraphrase Raymond Williams, “consumption” is an odd term, since consumers rarely eradicate or transform the object of consumption, so, in that sense, what is it consumers consume? In short, fantasy.

Williams wrote that “it is clear that we have a cultural pattern in which the objects are not enough but must be validated, if only in fantasy, by association with social and personal meanings which in a different cultural pattern might be more directly available” (p. 185). What marketing does is to manipulate fantasy, to make the real object of consumption, the imaginary gaze of the Other, expire, move, or “look” elsewhere. The fact that nearly any consumer good can be made to fulfill this function can be accounted for by the fact that the gaze itself does not correspond with the objects that seem to embody them; rather it is the social relations, including marketing, which surround them and make them possible to fetishize in the first place (Bohm and Batta, 2010). When this all-important fantasy-sustaining commodified object disappears, the old consumer goods become useless embarrassments and liabilities. The eruption of the real at this level, that which disrupts the fetish fantasy, is seen in pawn shops filled with last year’s must-have items, as well as massive fields of electronic waste piling up
in third world countries. Overall, however, this is more of a classic, Marxist dimension of commodity fetishism, not particular to the digital age or mobile communications.

The second level, the gaze, concerns something somewhat deeper, or at least less obvious. This level concerns the symbolic domain, and is only most obvious when it runs aground of the real, or the level of antinomic contradiction, (im)materiality, and dissolution of identity. The fetishism of cell phones through the look is, at this level, seen as a measure against confronting the desire of the Other. The stain of public cell phone use is more than just about changing social mores (Goggin 2006) or the role of social media in constructing identity (Humphreys 2010); it is also about a new colonization by capital. Cell phones and other digital media are unlike other commodities in that they rely largely on consumer interaction in order to create both value and profit, which is why, for example, phones come cheaper with new service plans.

Users intermittently stunned by their mobile phones, body and mind flickering in and out of one, analog symbolic order into another – digital order – these all represent the twinned enjoyment of pacifism and anxiety informing cell phone culture. The overflow of the digital into the analog, the bodily contortions and un-self-conscious exhortations accompanying the eruption of the real in a symbolic sense, are more than evidence of a newly mediated society, they are the visible, material symptoms of becoming subject to the Other desires of a new, digital age of capital. The increasing integration of digital and physical spaces is largely motivated by market concerns, while user interest in adopting these new media are largely social. The gaze of the cell phone, as social stain, points to how the phone is as much a barrier to socialization as it is a channel for it.

The split subjectivity of mobile users is sustained by an erotics stemming from a frisson of the antinomies of today’s mobile consumptionscape. However, our observations also lay the ground for considering more critically the next mediatized consumptionscape on the horizon, involving technologies like ubiquitous computing and Google’s Project Glass – laying the ground for the ultimate prosthetic merger of the technological and the corporeal. Such new media are likely to affect significantly the matters addressed in this paper, because what qualifies them as “new” new media is that they aim to reconcile the antinomies of contemporary mobile subjectivity described here. Building from our observations, one might return to our original analysis to consider how emerging media technologies extend or challenge our theorization. What degree of integration between these planes of existence would have to take place before users could no longer be understood in terms of the antinomies detailed here? What happens if and when mobile technologies become less socially visible? Even if it were possible to better integrate digital media with more immediate reality, is it socially desirable? In the context of the pervasive and still rising mobile and the follow-on embedded technologies, these and other similar questions constitute tilled fields ready for sowing new research ideas, using psychoanalytic approaches.
References
Friday June 7, 2013
10:30a-11:30a
Concurrent Session II

Sustainable Business Models III
A Wider View of Sustainability

Panel
Chair: G. Scott Erickson, Ithaca College, USA

Raymond Benton, Jr., Loyola University - Chicago, USA
Meryl Gardner, University of Delaware - Newark, USA
Pamela Laughland, Network for Business Sustainability, Canada
G. Scott Erickson, Ithaca College, USA
Panel: A Wider View of Sustainability

Raymond Benton, Jr., Loyola University of Chicago, Chicago, IL, USA
Meryl Gardner, University of Delaware, Newark, DE, USA
Pamela Laughland, Managing Director, Network for Business Sustainability, London, Canada
G. Scott Erickson, Ithaca College, Ithaca, NY, USA (chair)

Panel Theme
Marketing and sustainability have always had an obvious relationship but one that is also potentially difficult. Sustainability, as with many corporate social responsibility directions, has the potential to be a differentiator while also allowing the organization to do good in the wider social context. On the other hand, marketing decisions for a more sustainable offering are often made in the same manner as any other aspect (better technology, better quality, better service, etc.), so sometimes it can be hard to see where a sustainable approach to marketing is really different from what has always been done.

This panel will bring a deeper and wider view of sustainability, providing a more substantial foundation for the intersection of sustainability and marketing. The panel brings together three experienced professors who have a lengthy background in applying a broader sustainability context to marketing. Each brings something from the wider study of sustainability that provides more substance to marketing teaching and research. The panel will also potentially include a representative from the Network for Business Sustainability in nearby London, ON, an organization providing invaluable resources and opportunities for teachers and researchers in the field.

Ray has been working on sustainability issues for over twenty years. In addition to his own classes on business and the environment, and global environmental ethics, he has direct experience in trying to create a five-year program with colleagues in environmental science. His presentation would focus on the process of trying to bring an interdisciplinary program to life.

Meryl has been researching sustainability issues for over seven years, incorporating her research into her classes. She has most recently featured sustainability in retailing, combining the nuts and bolts of green supply chain and retail operations with the more marketing-related aspects of educating and persuading consumers about the attractiveness of the offering. Her presentation would reflect the undergraduate experience and bringing the rigor of operations into the sustainability marketing discussion.

Scott has been conducting research into sustainability issues for almost fifteen years. Beyond his own social and non-profit marketing teaching and research, he has also co-developed and co-taught a multi-disciplinary undergraduate course structured around his school’s Climate Action Plan. Course design included faculty from multiple natural sciences, marketing, legal studies, and staff charged with sustainability responsibilities. His presentation will focus on the challenges and rewards of trying to combine such diverse perspectives.

The Network for Business Sustainability (nbs.net) is a Canadian organization that welcomes US members. Designed for academics, it provides updates on scholarly publications concerning sustainability, research findings and data, research opportunities, and a like-minded community and meeting place for those with an interest in sustainability.
Abstracts

Raymond Benton, Jr., Loyola University Chicago

This portion of the panel covers two proposals at Loyola, both for inter-disciplinary programs. A five-year dual degree program combining a BS in Environmental Science and an MBA was initiated in 1998. The initiative was both successful and unsuccessful, the explanation of which makes for the presentation. This environmental management program was succeeded by a proposal, in 2010, for a sustainability program, including a modification of the existing five-year program but adding an undergraduate minor in Sustainability Management housed in the business school. The minor would have included both business courses and arts and sciences courses.

Reflections on the processes involved in these initiatives, what works and what doesn’t work, will form the basis of this presentation. Lessons learned are filtered through the additional experience of teaching specific courses Business and the Environment (since 1988) and Global Environmental Ethics (since 2004), itself a cross-disciplinary offering within Business.

Meryl Paula Gardner, University of Delaware

The environment has moved from being a passive player in the “context” chapter, to assuming its rightful place as a key part of marketing education. In some programs, students can take one or more courses in sustainability, while in others, the topic is addressed within courses which are already “on the books” and attract students who may not have selected a course with the words “sustainability,” “social responsibility,” or “environment” in the title. I teach one of those traditional courses -- retailing -- and have found that such courses can provide a launchpad for developing sustainability mindsets among students who previously had not considered such an approach compatible with a successful professional career. We address ways retailers can mitigate their direct effects on the environment (e.g., store design, heating, waste disposal, composting), ways retailers can help consumers help the environment (e.g., recycling the products they sold, facilitating consumer purchase of direct-from-farm produce), ways retailers can partner with the rest of the supply chain (e.g., co-locating, local and fair trade sourcing, using just-in-time inventory to reduce both costs and waste), as well as the ways retailers can educate consumers (e.g., problems with “quick fashion”, misperceptions of fair trade, obsessive consumption, materialism). My orientation is strategic and tactical because I firmly believe that students need to know both what to do and how to do it. My perspective is grounded in my own interest and work in consumer psychology; where possible, I like to identify the underlying social psychology issues and encourage students to develop user-friendly sustainability solutions. Teaching methods include preparatory assignments, readings, lectures, exam items (both concepts and applications), projects, guest speakers, videos, cases, and student feedback. It should be noted that sustainability is addressed using the same pedagogical tools and assessments as the other topics in the course -- both because they are equally appropriate and to indicate to students that sustainability decisions are organic parts of retailing strategy and tactics - not an add-on or afterthought to be done if there is enough time or money. In addition to providing students with important procedural and conceptual knowledge about critical issues, incorporating sustainability in the retailing course provides them with experience integrating their personal values with the demands of the “real world” and enables them to provide the retailers who are their future employers with sorely needed sustainability approaches.
Pamela Laughland, Network for Business Sustainability, London, Ontario

A Canadian non-profit established in 2005, the Network for Business Sustainability is a powerful and growing network of international academic experts and business leaders. NBS produces authoritative resources on important sustainability issues – with the goal of shaping management practice and research. We connect thousands of researchers and professionals worldwide who are interested in corporate social responsibility (CSR) and who believe in the value of research-based practice and practice-based research.

G. Scott Erickson, Ithaca College
Climate Action Research Teams (CART) is a multi-disciplinary course developed so as to use our institutions climate action plan as a teaching tool. Participants include faculty from Environmental Science, Biology, Physics, Legal Studies, and Marketing, staff including the campus Energy Manager and the Sustainability Manager, and other guests from on- and off-campus. Besides instruction in each area, students work on a particular project or two to advance the climate action plan. The course is very hands-on, including facility tours and explanations of the science and technology behind, for example, the heat exchange system of one of the campus’ LEED platinum buildings. In line with that, projects have included gaining behavioral change from the LEED buildings’ residents, changing dorm behaviors, and evaluating central energy generation options. The course provides a depth and breadth of knowledge of sustainability, besides the application element, that students just don’t get in a straight marketing course. Students see the connection to the science and technology as well as how marketing can make a contribution to making the science and technology work.
Abstract/Papers Included

Books, minds and desires: Theorizing consumer behaviour through a psychoanalytic study of the Great Gatsby and Death of a Salesman
Georgios Patsiaouras, University of Leicester, UK
James Fitchett, University of Leicester, UK
Books, minds and desires: Theorizing consumer behaviour through a psychoanalytic study of the Great Gatsby and Death of a Salesman

Georgios Patsiaouras, University of Leicester, UK
James Fitchett, University of Leicester, UK

Introduction

“In the realm of fiction we find the plurality of lives which we need” (Freud, 1915: 291)

The intersection between the psychoanalytic movement and marketing theory has recently focused on a growing and inspiring interest in the past, existing and future contribution of psychoanalytic theory to the emergence and formation of qualitative marketing methods, interpretive research and consumer culture theory (Stern, 2004; Tadajewski, 2006; Fullerton, 2007; Schwarzkopf and Gries, 2010). These studies not only disclose and critically discuss the seminal role of the intellectual ancestors, originators and fierce critics of a scientific method such as Motivational Research but also reflect, via the prism of psychoanalytic techniques, the passage from the Great Depression to the emergence of the post-war consumer culture and on the background the changing nature of the somehow neglected hero in this story, the American consumer. This paper is based on the premise an almost centenarian amalgamation between psychoanalysis and marketing theory has attributed a - thoroughly deserved - semi-mythical and notorious status to the masters of subliminal advertising by eclipsing or overshadowing the personality and idiosyncratic characters of hundreds individuals who participated in the focus groups and attended in-depth interviews with marketers trained in psychoanalysis, the consumers themselves. Anna O’s hysteria, Rat Man’s obsessions, Doolittle’s distress, Wolf Man’s depression and Lucia Joyce’s schizophrenia have been undoubtedly linked with the work and legacy of Breuer, Freud and Jung. On the other hand, Bernay’s and Dichter’s names have been associated with cigarettes, soap, cars and anthropomorphic animals as well as with their demanding and generous corporate clients, whilst the hordes of middle-class Americans who were interviewed or observed in the Institute of Motivational Research remained and they will remain anonymous. Their scientific observers promised a relief therapy to their suppressed desires via the introduction - or modification - of new commodities and they usually offered a small financial reward for their participation. This study argues that we can disengage our focus from the well-known application of psychoanalysis via motivational research so as to examine and theorize issues related to consumer desire, narcissism, repressions and archetypes via the lens of literature and fiction.

Psychoanalysis, literature and consumer behavior

In a letter to his friend Dr Wilhelm Fliess in 1897 and later on in his book The Interpretation of Dreams (1900), Freud discussed by using the notion of oedipal conflict the interrelationships between audience’s response to Oedipus Rex and Hamlet’s impotence to intervene so as to dive into the abyss of the authorial psyche (Holland, 1994) and discuss the existence of Oedipal guild in Shakespeare’s life. Since Freud’s original remarks, the coupling of literature and psychoanalysis - or let’s say books and minds - has been adopted, developed, expanded and transformed both by psychoanalysts of various schools of thought, critics or academics representing the whole spectrum of social sciences, arts and
Repression, omnipotence and consumer desire

F. Scott Fitzgerald’s *The Great Gatsby* is widely considered as a masterpiece of American literature and author’s best novel. The complexity, lyricism, seductiveness and masterful literary style of the novel prompted economists, management theorists and consumer researchers to examine respectively the parallels between Veblen’s and Fitzgerald’s satirical outlook on the false values of the upper classes (Canterbery, 1999), the text as platform to study business ethics (McAdams, 1993) and the construction of consumption identities in an era of economic boom, indulgence and status competition via display of wealth (Jack in Ellis et al. 2010) amongst innumerable academic references from academics in arts and humanities. A very brief synopsis of our discussion follows below.
Freud elaborated on omnipotence both as a characteristic of neurosis aiming to minimize the importance of external reality and also as outcome of repressed wishes which seek to distort, create or modify facts (Freud, 1919). We argue that Gatsby’s metamorphosis into a wealthy, upper-class entrepreneur discloses not only unconscious desires but also his repressions driven by the sum of his experiences, Gatsby’s efforts to suppress his past. His repression and hallucinatory omnipotence to control time are manifested via the socially acceptable display of status and wealth. As Freud (1915b) reminds us, repression becomes the unconscious mechanism for unacceptable memories but also acts as a ‘substitutive formation’ for extending one’s personal identity (Zepf, 2010). For Gatsby status and images of strength and success can be purchased together with participation in a social class where even love is bought and sold.

Gatsby was overwhelmingly aware of the youth and mystery that wealth imprisons and preserves, of the freshness of many clothes, and of Daisy, gleaming like silver, safe and proud above the hot struggles of the poor. (Fitzgerald, 1925/1960: 90).

In Gatsby’s mind economic prosperity and luxury possessions do not only ‘imprison’ impressions and honorific epithets but also imprison ‘time’, undo history, dilute and replace a past of poverty and through repressive forces eradicate or diminish his existential pain caused by his shame of unworthiness, limitation and denial. Nonetheless, Gatsby’s delusion that lavishness and an ostentatious lifestyle will insulate and immunize him from the past creates a distorted version of reality and his ego-ideals, thus directing his emotions of inferiority and shame towards a self-destructive narcissism.

As Freud suggests in his essay On Narcissism: an Introduction (Freud, 1914/1991), ‘normal’ narcissistic tendencies can be approached as pervasive and universal conditions that assist individuals to direct desires towards the care of themselves, thereupon enhances the instinct for self-preservation. Nonetheless, a condition of healthy self-love can be substituted by a pathological megalomania, egocentrism, excessive self-admiration and an unrealistic sense of the self, whose ego-ideal is continuously mirrored in the possessions, achievements and superficial social relationships they seek to establish (Kohut, 1971; Mollon, 1993; Flanagan, 1996). Following Cluley and Dunne (2012) although Freud’s references to the concept of narcissism and material culture are extremely limited - since the emergence and communication of narcissistic desires can be considered as stigmatic threatening and socially unacceptable - consumer choice and expression become the means which a narcissistic personality employs so as to attach or route his/her desires. We suggest that Gatsby’s narcissistic ego-ideal is filled and supplied firstly by his own idealized image of perfection, success and excess and secondly by Daisy’s image as a symbol of belonging in a particular social class which, simultaneously, annihilates his upbringing in a poor family of peasants and his criminal identity as bootlegger. Fitzgerald describes Gatsby’s exaggerated and semi-divine self-perception of superiority:

“The truth was that Jay Gatsby of West Egg, Long Island, sprang from his Platonic conception of himself. He was a son of God - a phrase which, if it means anything, means just that - and he must be about His Father’s business, the service of a vast, vulgar, and meretricious beauty. So he invented just the sort of Jay Gatsby that a seventeen-year-old boy would be likely to invent, and to this conception he was faithful to the end.” (Fitzgerald, 1925/1960: 99).
In a thorough review on the concept, Rothstein (1985) claims that for the narcissist possessions, objects, partners or individuals in general symbolize and denote a sense of ‘entitlement’ so as to satisfy his/her superior needs, wants and desires. Gatsby’s has methodically and meticulously organized the display of an exhilarating universe of material wealth, leisure and sophistication so as to supply his narcissism with the excitement, compliments, and flattering gossips from freeloading guests, whilst introjecting his desires to ‘the green light’, the light across the bay that embodies his reunification with Daisy. Gatsby dream to cancel the past and his social background via display of wealth was never fulfilled; however since the publication of the novel, contemporary marketing and advertising practices have been repackaging and promoting similar dreams to innumerable conspicuous consumers who seek to feed their narcissistic tendencies.

**Denial and nostalgia in the Death of the Salesman**

When the Miller’s Death of the Salesman play premiered on Broadway in 1949 it was hailed and considered by audience and critics as one of the most successful theatrical plays offering original and forceful insights into human relationships in a post-war American economy and society. Amongst a plethora of interpretations Miller’s work, intentions and ideas have been approached and discussed as [primarily] a failure of the American Dream, the destruction of a salesman by aggressive business tactics, dysfunctional family values and intergenerational conflict, the downfall of a man obsessed with money and social status or a critique of the moral values and ethos produced by American capitalism (Koon, 1983). Perhaps, the variety of interpretations in Miller’s work can be reduced into two main key themes. Firstly, a psychological drama of an ordinary old man who becomes disillusioned by his powerlessness against the passage of time and - foreseeing the arrival of unprecedented consumerism and technological growth during the 1950s - an ideological critique of a capitalistic society and culture. Such competitive polarization between the individual tragedy and the political dimensions of the play have created opposing and seemingly incommensurable camps of interpretation overshadowing the application of psychoanalytic tools so as to elaborate on protagonist’s desires, thoughts and actions (Tyson, 1994).

Following a generic examination of defense mechanisms and unconscious psychological strategies employed by Willy so as to cope with reality and maintain his self-coherence, we attempt to amalgamate the psychological and ideological confusion of the protagonist via the lens of narcissistic theories and Erich Fromm’s humanistic psychoanalysis and ideas on ‘marketing oriented’ characters. We suggest that Loman’s death can’t only be attributed to the power of the American Dream but also to the symptoms of his pathologically narcissistic personality. His own ego and nostalgia for commercial and financial success together with the desire to ‘be liked’ leads to unresolved anger, feelings of guilt and eventually death.

**Conclusions**

From Vienna to New York City, and then to the rest of the world, the intersection between psychoanalytic theory and consumer culture seems to have covered almost a centenarian history of immeasurable psychotherapeutic sessions and vast sales. This paper suggests that apart from examining how psychoanalysis has been used by marketers so as to influence consumer decision making, we can employ the lens of literary analysis and see the world through the psyche of fictional heroes and anti-heroes who act as consumers. Cool hunters can learn a lot from Holden Caulfield’s teenage consumer desires and fantasies in Salinger’s *Catcher in the Rye* and ethnic orientated marketers will be fascinated by the richness and depth in Roth’s and DeLillo’s characters. Thereupon, we can suggest that the seemingly distant domains of psychoanalysis, marketing and literature can offer an interesting synthesis which can reflect and mirror our personal and social realities offering fascinating insights to consumer theory.
References
Delusions and dreams in Jensen's "Gradiva." SE, 9, 1-95.
Freud, S., (1915) Introductory lectures on psycho-analysis: Repression. SE, pp. 141-158
Freud, S., (1919) *Totem and taboo: resemblances between the psychic lives of savages and neurotics*. Harmonsworth : Penguin


The Life and Works of Roger Dickinson

**Panel**
Chair: Mark Peterson, University of Wyoming - Laramie, USA

Ann Veeck, Western Michigan University, USA
Richard Vann, University of Wyoming - Laramie, USA
Melissa Bishop, University of New Hampshire, USA
Roger Layton, University of New South Wales, Australia
John O'Shaughnessy, Columbia University, USA
Clifford J. Shultz, II, Loyola University - Chicago, USA
The Life and Works of Roger Dickinson

Mark Peterson, University of Wyoming - Laramie, USA (Chair)
Ann Veeck, Western Michigan University, USA
Richard Vann, University of Wyoming - Laramie, USA
Melissa Bishop, University of New Hampshire, USA
Roger Layton, University of New South Wales, Australia
John O'Shaughnessy, Columbia University, USA
Clifford J. Shultz, II, Loyola University - Chicago, USA

When Roger Dickinson passed away February 9th, 2012, the Macromarketing Society lost one of its most devoted members. Roger served as the Journal of Macromarketing communications section editor for years and developed this section into one of the most influential of its kind among business journals. He was the first recipient of the Robert Nason Award in 2008 for contributions to the Macromarketing Society “above and beyond the call of duty”.

Roger was also an advocate for empowering consumers by framing their decisions in the marketplace as economic “votes” (Dickinson and Hollander 1991). Within this framework, he eschewed the notion that consumers could not influence a monolithic market system. Instead, the empowered consumer would use their consumption decisions as economic “votes” to voice their support for or against certain market practices (Shaw, Newholm, and Dickinson 2006). Roger and his colleagues proposed the hopeful view that consumers acting in concert with each other can significantly influence the market system through their market behavior.

As evidenced by his scholarship and participation in the field, Roger did not sit on the sidelines during his career. He actively sought to create knowledge about markets and offered an exceptional example of how to sustain one’s edge in scholarship over decades. Whether he was commenting on an article in the Journal of Consumer Research (Dickinson 1982), reminding us of the importance of the Robinson-Patman Act (Dickinson 2003), or reviewing the current state of macromarketing texts (Dickinson 2006), Roger continued to share his insights about markets and macromarketing.

Across the course of his academic career at Rutgers University and the University of Texas at Arlington, Roger displayed a genuine love for academic life. Roger had meaningful relationships with some of the best minds that have ever worked in marketing academia, such as Stan Hollander at Michigan State University, Jim Carman at UC-Berkeley, as well as John O’Shaughnessy and Morris Holbrook at Columbia University. He was a co-laborer with editors of the Journal of Macromarketing, which put him at the center of intellectual life for the macromarketing community. In short, Roger contributed valuably to scholars who considered societal issues suggested by marketing. As macromarketers, we should be encouraged that Roger chose to work with us and thankful that he labored among us for so many years.

This session will begin with a brief overview of Roger Dickinson’s career and his contributions to macromarketing. Each panelist will then have approximately 10 minutes to share key insights about the life and works of Roger Dickinson. Anne Veeck will discuss Rogers’ role as a leader in retailing scholarship for many years. Richard Vann will present Roger’s contributions to research related to consumer issues. Melissa Bishop will share about Roger as a teacher. Mark Peterson will talk about Roger as a colleague and fellow faculty member. Roger Layton will present about Roger
Dickinson as an early and long-time contributor on macromarketing. John O’Shaughnessy will reflect on Roger as a friend and fellow intellectual. The session will conclude with Cliff Shultz talking about Roger as Communications Editor of the Journal of Macromarketing.

Together, this panel of scholars will present the human side of a macromarketing titan—Roger Dickinson, along with the way this titan approached his work as a researcher, teacher, mentor, and servant to many in academia. This session will call macromarketers to pursue their own unique career achievements as Roger did.

A representative selection of Roger Dickinson’s research is included in the references section.

References


### LIST OF CONTRIBUTORS

_(sorted based on last name)_

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>A</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Susan Ainsworth, University of Melbourne, Australia</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Paul J. Albanese, Kent State University, USA</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Melissa Aronczyk, Carleton University, Canada</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adam Arvidsson, University of Milan, Italy</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Deniz Atik, Izmir University of Economics, Turkey</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| **B** |                                      |
| Stefania Barina, Centro Studi Etnografia Digitale, Italy |  
| Willy Barnett, University of Manchester, UK |  
| Marie-Laure Baron, Université du Havre, France |  
| Boris Bartikowski, Euromed School of Management, France |  
| Ingrid Becker, Friedrich-Alexander Universität Erlangen-Nürnberg, Germany |  
| Raymond Benton, Jr., Loyola University - Chicago, USA |  
| Kean Birch, York University, Canada |  
| Melissa Bishop, University of New Hampshire, USA |  
| Sarah Bly, Copenhagen Business School, Denmark |  
| Jennifer Bonoff, University of Rhode Island, USA |  
| Sammy Bonsu, York University, Canada |  
| Steven Brinks, Loyola University Chicago, USA |  

| **C** |                                      |
| Marylouise Caldwell, University of Sydney, Australia |  
| Robert Caruana, University of Nottingham, UK |  
| Cecilia Cassinger, University of Essex, UK |  
| Rodrigo Castilhos, Universidade Federal do Rio Grande do Sul, Brazil |  
| Annette Cerne, Lund University, Sweden |  
| Ronika Chakrabarti, Lancaster University, UK |  
| Sylvain Charlebois, University of Guelph, Canada |  
| Himadri Roy Chaudhuri, IMI-Kolkata, India |  
| Seung-Ho Cho, Soongsil University, South Korea |  
| Derrick Chong, Royal Holloway, University of London, UK |  
| Julia Christensen Hughes, University of Guelph, Canada |  
| Marius Claudy, University College Dublin, Ireland |  
| Robert Culey, University of Nottingham, UK |  
| Laurel A. Cook, The University of Arkansas - Fayetteville, USA |  
| Andrew Crane, York University, Canada |  
| Michael Czinkota, University of Birmingham, UK, and Georgetown University, USA |  

| **D** |                                      |
| Scott Dacko, University of Warwick, UK |  
| John Desmond, University of St Andrews, UK |  
| Nikhilesh Dholakia, University of Rhode Island, USA |  
| Ruby Roy Dholakia, University of Rhode Island, USA |  
| Christine Domegan, National University of Ireland Galway, Ireland |  
| Jingyi Duan, University of Rhode Island, USA |  
| Sarah Duffy, University of New South Wales, Australia |  

426
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Page</th>
<th>Name and Institution</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| E    | Ahmet Ekici, Bilkent University, Turkey  
   Nick Ellis, Durham University, UK  
   G. Scott Erickson, Ithaca College, USA |
| F    | Tina Facca, John Carroll University, USA  
   James Fitchett, University of Leicester, UK  
   Adrienne Foos, University of Manchester, UK  
   Anna Fyrberg Yngfalk, Stockholm University, Sweden |
| G    | Alexandra Ganglmair-Wooliscroft, University of Otago, New Zealand  
   Rosanna Garcia, Northeastern University, USA  
   Meryl Gardner, University of Delaware - Newark, USA  
   James W. Gentry, University of Nebraska - Lincoln, USA  
   Sarah Glozer, University of Nottingham University, UK  
   Thorsten Gruber, Loughborough University, UK  
   Shipra Gupta, University of Nebraska - Lincoln, USA  
   Wencke Gwozdz, Copenhagen Business School, Denmark |
| H    | Michaela Haase, Freie Universität Berlin and Friedrich-Alexander Universität Erlangen-Nürnberg, Germany  
   Johan Hagberg, University of Gothenburg, Sweden  
   Alison Hearn, University of Western Ontario, Canada  
   Paul Henry, University of Sydney, Australia  
   Yuichiro Hidaka, Yamanashi Gakuin University, Japan |
| J    | Robert D. Jewell, Kent State University, USA |
| K    | Djavlonbek Kadirov, Eastern Institute of Technology, New Zealand  
   Debbie Keeling, Loughborough University, UK  
   Kathleen Keeling, University of Manchester, UK  
   William Kilbourne, Clemson University, USA  
   Hans Kjellberg, Stockholm School of Economics, Sweden  
   Thomas Klein, University of Toledo, USA  
   Steven W. Kopp, University of Arkansas - Fayetteville, USA  
   Stefan Kruger, North-West University, South Africa  
   Bipul Kumar, Indian Institute of Management - Ahmedabad, India |
| L    | Mikko Laamanen, Hanken School of Economics, Finland  
   Pamela Laughland, Network for Business Sustainability, Canada  
   Roger Layton, University of New South Wales, Australia  
   Dong-Jin Lee, Yonsei University, South Korea  
   Wen-Ling Liu, University of Hull, UK  
   Chong Hang Loo, Limkokwing University, Malaysia |
Morten Rask, Aarhus University, Denmark
William Redmond, Indiana State University - Terre Haute, USA
Lucia Reisch, Copenhagen Business School, Denmark
Alexander Reppel, Royal Holloway, University of London, UK
Ian Reyes, University of Rhode Island, USA
Terri Rittenburg, University of Wyoming - Laramie, USA
Victoria L. Rodner, King’s College London, UK
Philip Roscoe, University of St. Andrews, UK
Annmarie Ryan, University of Limerick, Ireland

Alberto R. Salazar V., York University, Canada
A. Coskun Samli, University of North Florida, USA
Daniel Schepis, University of Western Australia, Australia
Emma Schroeder, Hamline University, USA
Stefan Schwarzkopf, Copenhagen Business School, Denmark
Clifford Shultz, II, Loyola University - Chicago, USA
Hana Sethi, York University, Canada
Stanley J. Shapiro, Simon Fraser University, Canada
M. Joseph Sirgy, Virginia Polytechnic Institute and State University, USA
Julie V. Stanton, Pennsylvania State University - Media, USA
Lorna Stevens, University of the West of Scotland, UK
Isabelle Szmigin, University of Birmingham, UK

Masaaki Takemura, Meiji University, Japan
Masae Takimoto, Osaka University of Economics and Law, Japan

Muzaffer Uysal, Virginia Polytechnic Institute and State University, USA

Richard Vann, University of Wyoming - Laramie, USA
Richard J. Varey, University of Waikato, New Zealand
Ann Veeck, Western Michigan University, USA
Gregory Veeck, Western Michigan University, USA
Gema Vinuales, University of Rhode Island, USA

Richard Wellen, York University, Canada
Mee-Jin Whang, Yonsei University, South Korea
Sarah J. S. Wilner, Wilfrid Laurier University, Canada
Terrence H. Witkowski, California State University - Long Beach, USA
Ben Wooliscroft, University of Otago, New Zealand
Jeaney Yip, University of Sydney, Australia
Carl Yngfalk, Stockholm University, Sweden
Narimasa Yokoyama, Nihon University, Japan
Hongyan Yu, Sun Yat-Sen University, P.R. China
Fang Yu, Brock University, Canada
Isik Ozge Yumurtaci, Izmir University of Economics, Turkey

Yikun Zhao, York University, Canada
Hong Zhu, Northeast Normal University, P.R. China
Detlev Zwick, York University, Canada